

PORTLAND CLEAN ENERGY COMMUNITY BENEFITS FUND (PCEF) COMMITTEE

MEETING SUMMARY

November 16, 2023 • 6:00 PM – 8:00 PM

Hybrid Meeting—Zoom Call & PCC Southeast Campus, Community Hall

Committee Members	Position	Affiliation	Present
Dr. Megan Horst	Co-Chair	Associate Professor, School of Urban Studies & Planning at Portland State University	Yes
Ranfis Giannettino Villatoro	Co-Chair	Oregon State Policy Manager, BlueGreen Alliance	Yes
Alicia Chapman	Member-at-Large	Willamette Technical Fabricators	Yes
DeAngelo Moaning	Member-at-Large	Raimore Construction	Yes
Faith Graham	Member-at-Large	Elevate Energy	Yes
Maria Gabrielle Sipin	Member-at-Large	Community Member	Yes
Paul Lumley	Member-at-Large	Cascade AIDS Project	Yes
Robin Wang	Member-at-Large	Vibrant Future LLC	Yes
Michael Edden Hill	Member-at-Large	Community Member	No
Sam Baraso	Program Manager	PCEF	Yes
Cady Lister	Deputy Program Manager	PCEF	Yes
Jaimes Valdez	Org. Development & Policy Manger	PCEF	Yes
Tracy M. Smith	Facilitator	Inhance LLC	Yes
Camerina Galván	Notetaker	Galvan Consulting LLC	Yes
Ciara Pressler	Consultant	Pregame	No

Others: Dave Ribeiro, Director of Local Policy, American Council for an Energy-Efficient Economy (ACEEE); Roxana Ayala, Research Analyst, ACEEE; Diane Odeh, PSU Nonprofit Institute; and Derron Coles, Former Executive Director, Blueprint Foundation; Gayle, Thrive East PDX; Bayo; Jenni Hall, Energy Trust of Oregon.

INTRODUCTIONS

- Tracy M. Smith called the meeting to order at 6:04 PM.
- The quorum was met.

PUBLIC COMMENTS: TRACY M. SMITH, FACILITATOR

- No public comments.

MEETING MINUTES APPROVAL: SAM BARASO, PCEF

- Paul Lumley moved to approve the September 21, 2023, Meeting Minutes. Faith Graham seconded it.
 - Approved: September 21, 2023, Meeting Summary
 - All committee members voted affirmative except Alicia Chapman, who abstained.

PCEF PROGRAM UPDATE: SAM BARASO, PCEF

- **Community Responsive Grants RFP 3:** PCEF received public comments that will be used to update the language and provide more clarity for prospective grantees. There were many questions regarding whether a project would fit in the RFP or a strategic program, as well as about decarbonization projects related to the Portland Bureau of Transportation. RFP 3 will be released on November 29, 2023, and closes on February 1, 2024. RFP 3 networking events will be hosted during the grant window.
- **The Climate Investment Plan (CIP) Implementation:**
 - Strategic Program #3 has been refined substantially from the feedback received. The City Council will approve the RFP rollout in January 2024. City Council authorizes procurement requests over \$1 million.
 - PCEF has been conversing with city leadership and the Portland Public School District regarding fast-track school infrastructure improvements outlined in CIP in response to the teacher strike.
- **Recruitment:** PCEF will continue to recruit over the next two years. It will onboard 2-8 new employees for the project implementation team. The next batch of recruitments will be posted in January or February 2024, focusing on communication, data systems, community engagement, and operations. PCEF is tracking what is occurring at other bureaus and creating recruitment opportunities.
- **Cooling Portland Program:** The Cooling Portland Program met its annual goal with over 7,000 cooling units and heating pumps installed in 2023 with the help of over a dozen community-based organizations, housing providers, and Earth Advantage. An evaluation of the program will be completed.
- Committee member questions and comments:
 - Can you be more specific about how the lay-off challenges in some bureaus will impact PCEF?
 - Response: There are many unknowns. In the past, when there have been significant contractions in bureaus, HR and the city worked together to place staff in other bureaus based on skill set alignment. PCEF is sensitive to the situation, and it will take the PCEF about 6-9 months to get on its footing as a team.
 - Response: Megan Horst serves as the PCEF Chair on the Budget Advisory Committee.
 - A committee member assured PCEF there will be growing pains as the program expands and is appreciative of the staff. City staff are critical to making city infrastructure work well. He is glad PCEF will help to make schools comfortable for teachers and students. He voiced his support for teachers.

PROJECT AND PROGRAM EVALUATION DISCUSSION: SAM BARASO, DAVE RIBEIRO, ACEEE, ROXANA AYALA, ACEEE, AND DIANE ODEH, NONPROFIT INSTITUTE OF PORTLAND STATE UNIVERSITY

- Sam Baraso presented an overview of the program elements that are evaluated. PCEF has been collecting and using data to guide its direction and investments. All projects and grant investments have milestones and outcomes tracked through reporting. CIP will have program outcomes and goals for each strategic program and high-level goals for community-level responsive grants.
- Sam Baraso reviewed the committee's responsibilities in the code, which included recommending the CIP to the mayor and city council, evaluating the program, and achieving program goals.
- Megan Horst shared that as an evaluator and researcher, she cares about evaluations because the code requires them, and she believes in the importance of being fiscally responsible with public money and serving the public. She would like to see an update of the dashboard for accountability paired with high, mid, and high-level evaluations and qualitative data.
- Dave Ribeiro introduced ACEEE, provided an overview of the *City Clean Energy Scorecard*, and presented the theory behind the metric setting, impact tracking, and implications for the PCEF committee.
- Diane Odeh presented the role of the committee in program evaluation.
- Diana Odeh shared their email in the chat: dodeh@pdx.edu. Dave Ribeiro shared their email in the chat: dribeiro@aceee.org.
- Committee member questions and comments:
 - A committee member would like to learn from other cities and have a network of cities doing the same work.
 - Dave Ribeiro's response: He would happily connect the PCEF committee to other cities and committees.
 - How do you set goals to meet legislative directives and program goals?
 - Dave Ribeiro's response: It is hard to weigh in without knowing the city's context. This needs to be resolved sooner than later to know the ultimate goal. You can analyze the synergy between what the program wants to do and what the program must do. It's a matter of setting metrics.
 - How do you categorize goals for such an extensive program?
 - Diane Odeh's response: Different types of evaluations can be conducted. Compartmentalization is essential to determine the type of evaluation needed for each section. Those leading the evaluation process need to run a meta-evaluation of CIP to learn how it aligns with what is happening and develop a plan for how each section will be carried out. There are three types of evaluations:
 1. Performance – How well are you meeting the stated goals?
 2. Process – What process do we need to change based on the data collected?
 3. Summative – A list of program impacts.
 - Dave Ribeiro's response: Evaluating the entirety of a city's clean energy efforts is overwhelming. He recommends mapping the different program areas and how they roll up to the larger goal and then determining the level of detail needed.
 - A committee member is interested in evaluating guiding principles and accountability. They are pleased that ACEEE named participatory budgeting in a toolkit as an avenue for increasing

equity accountability in clean energy. How would ACEEE and PSU elevate the measuring process and impact on people? How can the best outcomes regarding investing in people and shifting power in this work be sustained? We want to learn from cities that have included participatory budgeting in their municipal activities.

- Dave Ribeiro's response: Amanda Dewey led ACCEE's Leading with Equity Initiative, and the document cited is a product of convenings with 20-25 community-based organizations and advocates from around the country tasked with developing recommendations. The document emphasizes the need for equity to be a core component of any program and the importance of process evaluations.
- **ACTION ITEM:** Staff will work with Ranfis Giannettino Villatoro and Megan Horst to determine the next evaluation steps.
- How does this align with the evaluation being done by the auditor's office?
 - Response: As an elected office, the auditor chooses the audit topic. The 2021-2022 audit topic was program systems. The Auditor's Office could audit PCEF again as a follow-up to the original audit. However, Sam Baraso feels this may not be the case. PCEF will likely hire a firm and define the audit's scope.

PROJECT SPOTLIGHT: DERRON COLES, BLUEPRINT FOUNDATION

- Derron Coles, Executive Director of the Blueprint Foundation, gave an overview of the PCEF-funded workforce development program, Change is in the Air, air pollution and urbanization challenges, interventions, outstanding needs, and future efforts.
- Committee member questions and comments:
 - A committee member shared they appreciated the update.
 - Can you describe what the data dashboard will look like and how people can use it practically? What is the utility behind it for different types of users? How do you see it used to its fullest potential?
 - Response: We don't know how the data will be used. An individual could use it to determine if it is okay for a child with asthma to go outside. A community advocate could use the research questions. A person noticing shifts in air quality could use the time series data to speak to the industry or government about spikes in poor air quality. The government can use it to prove that programs improve air quality.
 - Share how PCEF funds are used in combination with other funds. Considering PCEF-funded workforce development grants, did any youth decide to work in this industry?
 - Response: Air quality studies are expensive. We can't rely on a single funding source even when PCEF was very generous. The Blueprint Foundation pieced together funding from different sources. Time dedicated to securing multiple funding sources is time away from students. The change PCEF made to the reporting process was a significant improvement. Streamlining the process is helpful for nonprofits because all funders want a report that is similar but not similar enough.
 - Response: The student who helped Multnomah County analyze wood stove data now works for the Oregon Department of Transportation and is applying the skills learned.

- A committee member appreciated the work The Blueprint Foundation is doing, particularly around digital and environmental infrastructure. He thanked Derron Coles for the presentation.

ACTION ITEM: COMMITTEE MEMBER RECRUITMENT: SAM BARASO, PCEF

- Michael Edden Hill is not renewing his term.
- Sam Baraso reviewed the attributes committee members should have. He asked the committee members to help by contacting possible candidates and volunteering on the Selection Subcommittee. The Selection Subcommittee will meet 3-4 times between January 2024 and March 2024 to review applications and bring a recommendation to the full committee.
- Committee member questions and comments:
 - Can candidates from the last recruitment pool qualify for this round?
 - Response: In the previous round, there was possibly one candidate. We will need to review their credentials.
 - Michael Edden Hill also satisfied the east of 82nd Avenue attribute.
 - Response: The committee must have at least two members living east of 82nd Avenue. The requirement is met. As we outreach, it's important to note that Michael Edden Hill brought experience from the trades and the electrical union.
 - Considering someone with experience in commercial renewal, energy efficiency, and public infrastructure is important.
 - Ranfis Giannettino Villatoro is open to being a backup for the Selection Subcommittee. Faith Graham is not ready to volunteer.
- Paul Lumley moved to direct staff to solicit applications for a new committee member and for committee members to be appointed to the Selection Subcommittee at the January 2024 PCEF Committee Meeting. Ranfis Giannettino Villatoro seconded it.
 - Approved: The motion to direct staff to solicit applications for a new committee member and for committee members to be appointed to the Selection Subcommittee at the January 2024 PCEF Committee Meeting was approved unanimously.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: SAM BARASO, PCEF

- The survey for evaluating the committee and staff support will be shared with committee members.

THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 8:01 PM

NEXT MEETING: The next hybrid meeting will be on Thursday, December 21, 2023, 6:00 PM—8:00 PM

Submitted by Camerina Galván, Notetaker, Galvan Consulting LLC.