



January 18-19, 2023 Council Agenda

5696

City Hall - 1221 SW Fourth Avenue, Portland, OR 97204

In accordance with Portland City Code and state law, City Council will hold hybrid public meetings, which provides for both virtual and in-person attendance. Members of council will elect to attend remotely by video and teleconference, or in-person. The City has made several avenues available for the public to listen to the audio broadcast of this meeting, including the City's YouTube Channel, [eGov PDX](#), the [Open Signal website](#), and Xfinity Channel 30 and 330.

Questions may be directed to councilclerk@portlandoregon.gov

Wednesday, January 18, 2023 9:30 am

Session Status: Recessed

Council in Attendance: Commissioner Carmen Rubio
Commissioner Dan Ryan
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez
Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Commissioner Ryan presided.

Officers in attendance: Anne Milligan, Deputy City Attorney; Keelan McClymont, Council Clerk

The Consent Agenda was adopted on a Y-4 roll call.

Council recessed at 11:15 a.m. and reconvened at 11:22 a.m.

Council recessed at 12:19 p.m.

Communications

34

[Request of Hazel R. Dennis to address Council regarding fraud concerns and homelessness](#) (Communication)

Document number: 34-2023

Disposition: Placed on File

35

[Request of Eli Spevak to address Council regarding ElectrifyPDX home certification and yard sign program](#) (Communication)

Document number: 35-2023

Disposition: Placed on File

36

[Request of Leonard Barrett to address Council regarding ElectrifyPDX home certification and yard sign program](#)
(Communication)

Document number: 36-2023

Disposition: Placed on File

37

[Request of Jane Stackhouse to address Council regarding the need to electrify buildings and homes](#)
(Communication)

Document number: 37-2023

Disposition: Placed on File

38

[Request of Jay Freedman to address Council regarding homelessness and solutions](#) (Communication)

Document number: 38-2023

Disposition: Placed on File

Time Certain

39

[Accept the Police Accountability Commission Quarterly Report for July-September 2022](#) (Report)

Document number: 39-2023

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Community Safety Division

Time certain: 9:45 am

Time requested: 15 minutes

Disposition: Accepted

Motion to accept the report: Moved by Mapps and seconded by Gonzalez.

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

40

[Appoint Cameron Browne to the Police Accountability Commission](#) (Resolution)

Document number: 37606

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Community Safety Division

Time certain: 10:00 am

Time requested: 15 minutes

Disposition: Adopted As Amended

Motion to amend resolution to proceed with appointing only Cameron Browne: Moved by Mapps and seconded by Gonzalez. (Y-4)

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

41

[Align Police Accountability Commission with Timeline Under U.S. Department of Justice Settlement Agreement](#) (Resolution)

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Community Safety Division

Time certain: 10:15 am

Time requested: 15 minutes

Disposition: Referred to Commissioner of Finance and Administration

42

[Declare as surplus City-owned property located at the corner of SW Council Crest Dr and SW McDonnell Terrace and authorize the Director of the Bureau of Environmental Services to proceed with a public sale of the property](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191156

Introduced by: Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Bureau: Environmental Services

Time certain: 10:30 am

Time requested: 20 minutes

Disposition: Passed to second reading

Passed to second reading January 25, 2023 at 9:30 a.m.

Consent Agenda

43

[*Pay settlement of Jason Leonhard's bodily injury lawsuit for the sum of \\$21,500 involving Portland Parks & Recreation](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191132

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Management and Finance; Revenue and Financial Services; Risk Management

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

44

[Update salary grade for Information Systems Manager II, Information Systems Manager III, and Information Security Manager classifications](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191133

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Human Resources; Management and Finance

Second reading agenda item 29.

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

45

[Amend Secondhand Dealers Code related to housekeeping changes \(amend Code Sections 14B.90.020, 14B.90.090 and 14B.90.100\)](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191134

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Management and Finance; Revenue Division

Second reading agenda item 30.

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea
Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea
Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea
Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

46

[Amend Building Regulations Code and Heating and Ventilating Regulations Code to clarify fee provisions and adopt State of Oregon 2022 Editions of the Oregon Structural Specialty Code and the Oregon Mechanical Specialty Code \(amend Code Chapters 24.10 and 27.01\)](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191148

Introduced by: Commissioner Carmen Rubio

Bureau: Development Services (BDS)

Disposition: Passed to second reading

Passed to second reading January 25, 2023 at 9:30 a.m.

47

[*Approve application under the Multiple-Unit Limited Tax Exemption Program under the Inclusionary Housing Program for Foster Flats located at 5631 SE 83rd Ave](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191135

Introduced by: Commissioner Carmen Rubio

Bureau: Housing Bureau

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea
Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea
Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea
Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

48

[*Approve application under the Multiple-Unit Limited Tax Exemption Program under the Inclusionary Housing Program for Sellwood Bridgehead Building 2 located at 551 SE Tacoma St](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191136

Introduced by: Commissioner Carmen Rubio

Bureau: Housing Bureau

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea
Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea
Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea
Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

49

[*Approve application under the Multiple-Unit Limited Tax Exemption Program under the Inclusionary Housing Program for Sellwood Bridgehead Building 3 located at 550 SE Tacoma St](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191137

Introduced by: Commissioner Carmen Rubio

Bureau: Housing Bureau

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea
Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea
Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea
Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

50

[*Amend contract with Bentley Systems, Inc. to increase the value by \\$648,000 for engineering design and drafting software and related support services through December 31, 2025 \(amend Contract No. 30003001\)](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191138

Introduced by: Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Bureau: Transportation

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea
Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea
Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea
Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

51

[*Authorize competitive solicitation and price agreements for ongoing traffic calming projects for the Quick Build Delivery Program for \\$10 million](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191139

Introduced by: Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Bureau: Transportation

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea
Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea
Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea
Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

52

[Amend contract with ISC Applied Systems to purchase and install CCTV and Communication systems for Portland Streetcar and increase compensation not to exceed \\$3,898,573 \(amend contract 30008221\)](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191149

Introduced by: Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Bureau: Transportation

Disposition: Passed to second reading

Passed to second reading January 25, 2023 at 9:30 a.m.

Regular Agenda

53

[*Ratify Letter of Agreement between the City and the Portland Police Command Officers' Association to settle an Unfair Labor Practice Complaint](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191140

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: City Attorney

Time requested: 15 minutes

Disposition: Passed

Motion to accept the Ordinance: Moved by Mapps and seconded by Gonzalez.

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea
Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea
Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea
Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

54

[*Ratify a collective bargaining agreement with American Federation of State, County, Municipal Employees, Local 189 for represented employees within the Office of Independent Police Review for 2022 - 2025](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191141

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Human Resources; Management and Finance

Time requested: 15 minutes

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

55

[*Pay settlement of Dorothy Hart property damage claim for \\$89,105 involving the Portland Water Bureau](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191142

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Management and Finance; Revenue and Financial Services; Risk Management

Time requested: 15 minutes

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

56

[*Pay settlement of Erik Hoofnagle bodily injury lawsuit for \\$75,000 involving the Portland Police Bureau](#)
(Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191143

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Management and Finance; Revenue and Financial Services; Risk Management

Time requested: 15 minutes

Disposition: Passed As Amended

Motion to amend Directive A to read as follows, The Mayor and City Auditor are hereby authorized to draw and deliver a check in the amount of \$75,000 made payable to Client Trust Account of The Albies Stark and Guerriero Firm: Moved by Mapps and seconded by Gonzalez. (Y-4)

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

57

[Amend contract with FacilityForce, Inc. to increase amount by \\$1 million for additional licenses, functionality, and asset data for Enterprise Facilities and Asset Management System \(amend Contract 31002231\)](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191152

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Facilities; Management and Finance

Time requested: 5 minutes

Disposition: Passed to second reading

Passed to second reading January 25, 2023 at 9:30 a.m.

58

[Amend contract with Universal Protection Service, LP dba Allied Universal Security Services to increase amount by \\$661,173 for additional Professional Security Officer Services \(amend Contract 31002159\)](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191153

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Facilities; Management and Finance

Time requested: 5 minutes

Disposition: Passed to second reading

Passed to second reading January 25, 2023 at 9:30 a.m.

59

[Amend Floating Structures Code to replace Floating Structures Board of Appeal with Building Code Board of Appeal and make other changes for clarity and consistency \(amend Code Title 28\)](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191154

Introduced by: Commissioner Carmen Rubio

Bureau: Development Services (BDS)

Time requested: 10 minutes

Disposition: Passed to second reading

Passed to second reading January 25, 2023 at 9:30 a.m.

60

[*Authorize conveyance of City-owned real property located at 1103-1121 SW Harvey Milk St and rehabilitation financing not to exceed \\$8,500,000 to Home Forward or an affiliate for an affordable housing project](#)

(Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191144

Introduced by: Commissioner Carmen Rubio

Bureau: Housing Bureau

Time requested: 20 minutes

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

61

[Authorize competitive solicitation and execution of price agreements for staff augmentation to support the Bureau of Environmental Services Capital Improvement Program with construction management, inspection, and program support services not to exceed \\$18 million over five years](#)

(Ordinance)

Document number: 191155

Introduced by: Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Bureau: Environmental Services

Time requested: 10 minutes

Disposition: Passed to second reading

Passed to second reading January 25, 2023 at 9:30 a.m.

62

[*Authorize competitive solicitation and execution of price agreements for small capital unit-priced construction contracts over three years](#) (Emergency Ordinance)

Document number: 191145

Introduced by: Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Bureau: Transportation

Time requested: 10 minutes

Disposition: Passed

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

63

[Authorize Portland Water Bureau Director to execute certain Intergovernmental, Utility, and Cooperative Improvement Agreements with the Oregon Department of Transportation for projects that have potable water infrastructure services in construction areas](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191157

Introduced by: Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Bureau: Water

Time requested: 15 minutes

Disposition: Passed to second reading

Passed to second reading January 25, 2023 at 9:30 a.m.

Wednesday, January 18, 2023 2:00 pm

Session Status: Recessed

Council in Attendance: Commissioner Carmen Rubio

Commissioner Dan Ryan

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez

Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Commissioner Ryan presided.

Officers in attendance: Linly Rees, Chief Deputy City Attorney; Keelan McClymont, Council Clerk

Council recessed at 2:29 p.m.

Time Certain

64

[Amend the Comprehensive Plan and the Planning and Zoning Code to create the Planning Commission and dissolve the Planning and Sustainability Commission \(amend Code Title 33\)](#) (Ordinance)

Document number: 191150

Introduced by: Commissioner Carmen Rubio

Bureau: Planning and Sustainability (BPS)

Time certain: 2:00 pm

Time requested: 2 hours

Disposition: Passed to second reading as amended

Motion to amend Exhibit A in paragraph 2 of the commission's list of the powers and duties to not delete "the City Council" and to add "As amended" to ordinance Directives A, B, and C: Moved by Rubio and seconded by Ryan. (Y-4)

Passed to second reading January 25, 2023 at 9:45 a.m. Time Certain as amended.

The oral and written record are closed.

Thursday, January 19, 2023 2:00 pm

Session Status: Adjourned

Council in Attendance: Commissioner Carmen Rubio
Commissioner Dan Ryan
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez
Commissioner Mingus Mapps

Commissioner Ryan presided.

Officers in attendance: Maja Haium, Senior Deputy City Attorney; Keelan McClymont, Council Clerk

Council recessed at 3:29 p.m. and reconvened at 3:34 p.m.

Council adjourned at 4:25 p.m.

Time Certain

65

[City Auditor Report to Council on the Charter Commission's Proposed Measures to Voters](#) (Report)

Document number: 65-2023

Introduced by: Auditor Simone Rede

Time certain: 2:00 pm

Time requested: 90 minutes (1 of 2)

Disposition: Placed on File

Vote not called.

[Final Report to Council on the work of the 2020 Charter Commission](#) (Report)

Document number: 66-2023

Introduced by: Mayor Ted Wheeler

Bureau: Management and Finance

Time certain: 2:00 pm

Time requested: 90 minutes (2 of 2)

Disposition: Accepted

Motion to accept the report: Moved by Ryan and seconded by Mapps.

Votes: Commissioner Carmen Rubio Yea

Commissioner Rene Gonzalez Yea

Commissioner Mingus Mapps Yea

Commissioner Dan Ryan Yea

Mayor Ted Wheeler Absent

**Portland City Council Meeting Speaker List
January 18, 2023 - 9:30 a.m.**

Name	Agenda Item
Commissioner Dan Ryan	
Keelan McClymont	
Commissioner Carmen Rubio	
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez	
Commissioner Mingus Mapps	
Anne Milligan	
Hazel Dennis	34
Eli Spevak	35
Leonard Barrett	36
Jane Stackhouse	37
Jay Freedman	38
Sameer Kanal	39, 40
Seemab Hussaini	39
Lovisa Lloyd	39
Faythe Aiken	39
Marc Poris	39, 40, 53, 56
Cameron Browne	40
Virginia Bowers	42
Eli Callison	42
Preetha Krishnan	42
Fred Spada	42
Marietta Spada	42
Pat Wall	42
Mason Van Buren	42
Eric Shaffner	42
Heidi Brown	53
Jerrell Gaddis	54
Ross Caldwell	54
Joseph Jesse	55, 56
Caroline Turco	56
Dan Handelman	56
Maty Sauter	57
Amy Davis	57
John Budke	58
Nancy Thorington	59
Molly Rogers	60
Ivory Matthews	60

Paul Suto	61
Kim Garcia	61
Scott Clement	62
Jodie Inman	63

**Portland City Council Meeting Speaker List
January 18, 2023 - 2:00 p.m.**

Name	Agenda Item
Commissioner Dan Ryan	
Keelan McClymont	
Commissioner Carmen Rubio	
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez	
Commissioner Mingus Mapps	
Linly Rees	
Donnie Oliveira	64
Patricia Diefenerfer	64
Steph Routh	64
Mark Linehan	64
Al Burns	64

**Portland City Council Meeting Speaker List
January 19, 2023 - 2:00 p.m.**

Name	Agenda Item
Commissioner Dan Ryan	
Keelan McClymont	
Commissioner Carmen Rubio	
Commissioner Rene Gonzalez	
Commissioner Mingus Mapps	
Maja Haium	
Auditor Simone Rede	65
Brenda Ketah	65
Debra Porta	65

Portland City Council Meeting Closed Caption File

January 18, 2023

9:30 a.m.

This file was produced through the closed captioning process for the televised city Council broadcast and should not be considered a verbatim transcript. The official vote counts, motions, and names of speakers are included in the official minutes.

Speaker: D. Ryan: the mayor is traveling today. He's at the conference of mayors, u.s. Conference of mayors. I'm commissioner dan Ryan. I will be presiding this morning. Keelan, can you please call the roll.

Speaker: Clerk: good morning. Rubio.

Speaker: C. Rubio: here.

Speaker: Clerk: Ryan.

Speaker: D. Ryan: here.

Speaker: Clerk: Gonzalez.

Speaker: R. Gonzalez: here.

Speaker: Clerk: Mapps.

Speaker: M. Mapps: here.

Speaker: Clerk: Wheeler.

Speaker: D. Ryan: okay. We will now hear from legal counsel on the rules of order and decorum. We have ann in the box today.

Speaker: Legal counsel: thank you, commissioner Ryan. Welcome to the Portland City Council. City Council is holding hybrid public meetings with in-person attendance in addition to electronic attendance. If you wish to testify before council in person or virtually, you must sign up in advance by visiting the council agenda on the council clerk's web page at www.Portland.gov/council/agenda. You may sign up for communications to briefly speak about any subject. You may also sign up for public testimony on resolutions,

reports, or the first readings of ordinances. Written testimony may be submitted to cctestimony@PortlandOregon.gov. Your testimony should address the matter being considered at the time. When testifying, please state your name for the record. Your address is not necessary. Please disclose if you are a lobbyist. If you are representing an organization, please identify it. For testifiers joining virtually, please unmute yourself once the council clerk calls your name. The presiding officer preserves order and decorum during City Council meetings so that everyone can feel welcome, comfortable, respected, and safe. The presiding officer determines the length of testimony. Individuals generally have three minutes to testify unless otherwise stated. A timer will indicate when your time is done. Disruptive conduct such as shouting, refusing to conclude your testimony when your time is up, or interrupting other's testimony or council deliberations will not be allowed. If there are disruptions, a warning will be given that further disruption may result in the person being ejected for the remainder of the meeting. After being ejected, a person who fails to leave the meeting is subject to arrest for trespass. Additionally, council may take a short recess and reconvene virtually.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, ann. First up is communications. Keelan, can you please call the first item, item 34.

Speaker: Clerk: request of hazel r. Dennis to address council regarding fraud concerns and homelessness.

Speaker: D. Ryan: welcome, hazel. It's good to see you here.

Speaker: This is my first time, so you guys all forgive me. I'm coming here from --

Speaker: D. Ryan: it's good to see you, hazel. The green light is on, so go just ahead. Take your time. Speak into the mic. You have three minutes. At the end of three minutes, we'll kindly have you wrap up.

Speaker: Thank you. My name is hazel r. Dennis and I'm concerned about the homelessness and the way they became homeless and so I speak for myself. I'm very concerned about it and I want to know what I can do to help. Give me some guidance because me myself became homeless during this crisis. People are homeless because of

mental illness. They're homeless by scams. They're homeless by fraud. I so happen to be homeless by fraud. And the avenues that I went to get homeless -- we have to create a justice system for the homeless to help me tackle that thing, and that's all I want to say because this is new to me and I'm just trying to figure it out. How did I become homeless? And that's what I want to say because I'm a concern that had two homes, paid bills ahead of time on time, and I still ended up being homeless and I want to know how this is possible. Okay? Anybody want to ask me something? I'm finished. I just want you to know I'm coming. I'm learning. And I want help for people like me who do everything right but still become homeless.

Speaker: D. Ryan: hazel, thank you so much for being here. It's so important to hear the voices of people with lived experience. Appreciate it. Okay. Next item. Item number 34.

Speaker: Clerk: request of eli spevak regarding electrify pdx and yard sign program. Shall I read all of the --

Speaker: D. Ryan: it sounds like, eli, you want to have all three of you bunched together here? Is that you, leonard? And that's you, jane?

Speaker: Clerk: I'm going to read the other two. Item 36, request of leonard barrett to address council regarding electrify pdx and yard sign program, and item 37, request of jane stackhouse to address council regarding the need to electrify buildings and homes.

Speaker: D. Ryan: welcome, eli. Go ahead and start. Nine minutes total. How's that?

Speaker: Good morning, commissioner president Ryan, commissioner maps and Rubio. Name is leonard barrett. We are a nonprofit supporting parents and families to take action to ensure the future of today's youth and generations. Along with eli and jane, here to talk about a new project sponsored by electrify pdx. Eli will provide an overview of the project itself, but I wanted to provide context my family is in the process of going fully electric in our home having transferred from -- only our guests stove to swap out, which is ironic because it's apparent that it's the stove I become most concerned about, and i'll explain why. As you know, methane gas is a pollutant with 80 times the claimant effect of carbon dioxide, but many in our community have only recently learned about the impact

on indoor air quality. Of greatest concern for me personally is children living in helps -- houses with gas stoves -- I encourage you to check out Multnomah County's released a report about the impact of gas stoves. Because of the benefits for pediatric health and public health generally, the cost savings to utility customers, and, of course, the planet, we are excited to support the work that electrify pdx is doing to understand the benefits of an electrified home, as well as programs and resources available to make it accessible to all Portlanders. Electrify pdx complements many programs and policies to make this happen. The Portland clean energy fund is helping to make sure that low income Portlanders contract electric heat pump. To broaden access to electrification via tax credits and rebates. It makes it possible for any utility customer to make sure their electrified home is powered by clean renewable electricity. Additionally under the program, they can reduce their bill by 30%. With these and other programs in place, Portland is poised to be a national leader in the equitable and just transition fully electric abilities. We hope that the city across its various functions across bps housing will support and promote community programs, such as electrified pds that will accelerate electrification and make it available for all. Thank you for the opportunity to share and I will turn it over to eli to talk about the specifics of the program.

Speaker: Good morning, city counselors. My name is eli spevak. As in the shared, Portland is primed for a leap toward 100% clean energy home. We are excited to be this and partner with electrify pdx coalition, community energy project to make the renewable energy transition easier, faster, and more equitable. I've got a couple of slides here. I'll be quick. Share screen. So, a typical home uses electricity from plugs and lights. A car uses gas, and gas furnace, and a gas water heater. If you do the things your grandparents told you about using a sweater and not taking as many showers, you might decrease your greenhouse gases by 20%. If you go to electric, you can source today through community solar utility program or solar panels if you happen to have a roof. Use that electricity to power your car or bike. Use that same electricity for water heater you dropped carbon emissions down to zero. People are doing that today and have been

for a couple of years now, but it's invisible from the street. A typical house goes from 20 tons of CO₂ and \$4000 a year down to 0% CO₂ because gas prices are going up for car and methane gas. Here's the program. We have show and tell. We are going electric for healthy home and planet in English and Spanish. It's modeled after a program where we help you get a plan for a home update if we help you find contractors and incentives, celebrate success, and inspire others to do the same. I'm going to stop sharing here. Can you figure out how to stop sharing? Thanks. Anyone who wants to get these signs, we have these sticker badges for heating system, appliances, water heater, and sourcing electricity renewable. When you're done you get a certification sign, like this. We also have businesses in English and Spanish. Move my notes here. Also applied for a grant to transfer more materials into Spanish and make these free for residents. We do educational presentations to all source of groups for electrified now. Real estate, communication continuing education classes. We have connected with affordable housing nonprofits to make sure their tenants sign up for solar if eligible for it, they are not necessarily signing up. This is the first business certification. An affordable housing project both fully certified. We share contractor referrals so people actually know how to electrify. There are some that don't and they'll try to talk to you about it. We set up a Facebook group over 130 members right now where people are sharing tips and getting answers to their questions. There's a no guilt program and things you can do as City Council, you can sign up today. If you build a converted building to all electric, let us know. I will hand it over to Jane.

Speaker: Thank you, Eli. Commissioner maps, Gonzalez, Rubio, and Ryan. It's nice to be here. I'm Jane Stackhouse. I live in northeast Portland and I live in an owner duplex built in 1945. I'm duplex and, of course, got one in Spanish. My elective occasion history goes back to the 1960s. There are also inground heat pump situations where we can dig into the ground to put pipes and cooling in their and be able to run our heat pumps of the 55° that the ground stays. I keep hoping that the gas company will pick up on that one. So, I ask you, please, to promote this program. We need to electrify. It's hard for me to

tell my neighbors I'm doing this without a sign and I hope the city of Portland will support that because it is good opportunity for heating and cooling for everyone. Thank you so much for the time.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, eli, leonard, and jane.

Speaker: I want to thank our panelists for that compelling presentation and your important work. This very much complements initiatives I see in the city right now. For example, in the coming weeks you will see pbot to add more charging stations in public spaces and I know commissioner Rubio through planning and sustainability and psef also has climate action plans in the works as well. I'm excited to work to make a greener Portland and I thank you for being here today.

Speaker: Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: commissioner Rubio.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, council president. I just want to chime in here. I first heard about this program from eli and I am a huge fan of this. I think it's very needed and I'm very eager to see how the city can partner with you to raise the visibility of this and please keep us updated on your progress with psef and all the other projects and partners you have going on. We'll be in touch to see how we can help bump this up more. My council staff is in chambers on your way out if you have a minute to connect with her we can get some information exchanged. But thanks so much for coming here today. This is really a great thing for the community.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, commissioner Rubio. Maybe you sent it in your comments, but what is the typical question cost of a household to convert?

Speaker: There is not atypical, unfortunately. If people already have resistance electric, they were going to keep up electric. In fact, is less electricity than they did before. If using gas appliances, the heating system itself could be 12,000 or so. The gas water heater, not a tankless, heat up water heater the tank itself is -- and there's installation charge. Range is about \$1000. The reason people are getting a lot of interest now is the ira program went into effect January 1 with huge tax credits and early in the year there will be

customer decrease in price. There's significant incentives that going electric now is least expensive or at least less extensive than gas.

Speaker: C. Rubio: so, this is on your side?

Speaker: Would provide updates.

Speaker: C. Rubio: the stickers, do they go on the original one and when you get a new one they go on the sign?

Speaker: It's like collecting badges. You take it off.

Speaker: C. Rubio: slap it on the sign. Then you graduate to that sign. Okay. Got it. Thanks so much for being here.

Speaker: D. Ryan: Keelan, please call the next item.

Speaker: Clerk: request for jay freedman to address council regarding homelessness and solution.

Speaker: D. Ryan: jay is in the chambers?

Speaker: Clerk: jay was going to join in person. Doesn't look like they've arrived. Oh, wait a minute.

Speaker: D. Ryan: oh, he's online? Welcome, jay.

Speaker: On mute, okay.

Speaker: D. Ryan: we can hear you. Three minutes, jay. Go ahead.

Speaker: Clerk: it looks like they are moving. They should come back up here in just a moment. Jay, can you hear us?

Speaker: I can hear you. Can you hear me?

Speaker: D. Ryan: yes. Loud and clear, jay.

Speaker: I would like to say thank you for letting me attend your meeting. As you guys know, you have a huge homelessness in Portland. Not as bad as california. We could never eliminate homelessness, but you can limit how many people are out here. You guys have how many of 1000, like thousands of abandoned buildings and thousands that in my opinion could be rented, leased out, and turned into housing programs. People like me, I don't drink, I don't smoke, I'm sober. I street perform to make money and I can't

afford a place to stay. As City Council you guys are in a position for programs. I can offer solutions and, yeah. I have a buddy, for example, he lives out of his car. Certain rv parks will not allow him to be on the property. If we would amend rules like that, I think you would listen how many people would be out here on the streets any thoughts or questions?

Speaker: D. Ryan: we really appreciate your testimony, Jay. Thank you so much for showing up today.

Speaker: Thank you, sir.

Speaker: D. Ryan: have a good one. Bye-bye.

Speaker: Clerk: time certain. Item 39, accept the police accountability commission quarterly report for July through September, 2022.

Speaker: Thank you, council president Ryan. Good to see you. Good to see you commissioner Mapps and Rubio. Nice to meet you, commissioner Gonzalez. I'm joined by the cochairs of the -- which covers July through September, 2022. On zoom we have cochair Levisa Lloyd. I will pass it over to them at this time.

Speaker: Greetings, commissioners Mapps, Ryan, and welcome commissioner Gonzalez. I was the cochair of this phase and, yeah. We'd like to thank you. Thank the City Council for allowing us the opportunity to present the quarterly report of the police accountability commission for July through September, 2022. I am joined by my two cochair colleagues, Levisa Lloyd, who's online with us, and Faith Aiken. We are all members of the police accountability commission appointed by the Portland City Council. We were the cochairs of the police accountability commission during the fact-finding phase of the work. Everything covered by this quarterly report was part of the fact-finding phase. Today, we'll be providing a brief overview with the quarterly report and the work the commission did from July 1 - September 30, 2022. Future quarterly reports will cover more recent activities and members of the commission will return to the present October to December quarterly report in February.

Speaker: Hello. I'm Levisa Lloyd. Can everyone hear me okay?

Speaker: D. Ryan: yes.

Speaker: Fantastic. Thank you so much. Thank you again for having us. In November, 2020, 82% of Portland voters afforded the creation of charter section 210, which creates a new board to both replace the current system administrative accountability and to allow for a greater community voice in changing the policies and directives of Portland police. The police account ability commission was created by the City Council to create the parameters of the community police oversight board authorized under this charter section.

Speaker: Next slide, please.

Speaker: Can we move onto the next slide, please? From December, 2021 through March, 2022, the commission was convened working through its organizational phase, which I think you heard last time. This was addressed previously by -- sorry, by our colleagues who were cochairs at that time. They presented the q1 quarterly report to council last summer. From April to June the commission began its fact-finding phase hearing from experts in affected parties. We reported on that during the presentation of the q2 quarterly report in September. Beginning in July, the commission continued to hear from experts and affected parties, as well as additional parts of the system. The work continued with the developing draft documents, which indicates the commission's assessment of the current system in Portland, practices from other jurisdictions, and proposals from other subject matter experts. The commission also continued to plan community engagement events. All of the subcommittees met 22 times over this three month period, which means they remain -- city government. This also includes several briefings.

Speaker: Slide three. The fact-finding phase resulted in the adoption of three documents. One of which was during this quarter. These documents are not code recommendations, but set shared understandings among members as to what information has been learned and the commission's viewpoints on it. They'll each be an important contribution to the commission's eventual decisions as recommendations to

the City Council. The first document is the areas of agreement on barriers to police accountability and best practices. Best practices in Portland. Barriers to police accountability are the problem that the commission seeks to resolve in its overall work. Therefore, this document is the problem statement of the commission's work. However, the commission also wants to recognize those practices, which are working, and should be retained or replicated in the new system. The document includes best practices as well. The commission approved this document on September 29.

Speaker: Good morning. I'm Faith Aiken. The second document is the areas of agreement on proposals to consider or avoid from subject matter experts. The commission is aware that numerous experts from community based organizations to national organizations to individuals working in other jurisdictions give preliminary impressions of the commission's views on these proposals. The document was drafted in the subcommittee on research and referred to the full commission on this quarter, but had not been approved by the full commission. The third document is the areas of agreement on best practices and practices to avoid from other jurisdictions. By assessing other jurisdiction practices, the commission saw how the work together could create a new system and evaluated their effectiveness at achieving the goals of the commission's new system. This document was close to done by being drafted at the end of September. All three documents will be references to the decision in Portland's new system. The actual condition development began with the next phase of work, which our colleagues will discuss when the Q4 report is presented in February.

Speaker: Next slide, please. During this period, the commission heard from the mental health alliance, which is one of two friends of the court, to the US DOJ -- agreement. We held a briefing with the city attorney's office, which was required of us by council, we received a briefing from other amicus to the settlement agreement, which is the reliance for justice and police reform. Both commissioners Ryan and Rubio were briefed, the commission as well. The Portland police association, which is a larger bargaining unit, and is also an intervener in the settlement unit, briefed the commission. Finally, the US

department of justice briefed the full commission. On behalf of the commission would like to thank all of our briefers for coming today. Commissioners Ryan and Rubio, as well. When we did this last time, you weren't yet on the list because the briefings were in July and our quarterly report was only through June, but we are happy to recognize you now and thank you for coming in to speak with us then. Also, as a side note, we haven't yet hosted a briefing from commissioner Gonzalez and we are looking forward to welcoming you to police accountability soon. And slide five.

Speaker: Thank you. There are many highly trained specialized workers, both professionals and volunteers working in the police accountability system in Portland right now and we do want to recognize the efforts, the good-faith efforts, and the good work of those individuals. There are also many barriers to accountability and both of those things can be true at the same time. It's often the individuals working within the system who have given us the best information to what barriers of accountability exist within this system because they are the most familiar with it and where work can approve. The commission identified several barriers to police accountability in the system. Many were defined by briefers, including police briefers. These were just barriers we identified. Not part of recommendations, which will depart this year. But many that will help perform creation of recommendations. Our report is 14 pages long and I encourage you to read it. I can only give a brief overview of our findings here. The system lacks transparency. In particular, for people who file complaints with the system. I don't think this will come as a big surprise to anyone. The complaint process itself, the investigation into complaint, and reporting of the outcome of the complaint and any outcomes regarding the investigation process. These are all issues where transparency was identified as a barrier to meaningful accountability and meaningful engagement with the system. The crc vice chair described the system as maddeningly okay, which I think it gives you a good idea. It's very -- to get updates of any kind. Commissioner Rubio said no one should have to wait months to receive word from the city on what the progress of their complaint is next, we identified the complexity of the current system as a barrier to accountability.

Again, this will not come as a surprise to anyone. We tried to find a good flowchart and there are multiple flowcharts showing how a complaint is actually addressed. Super complex for complainants. We also heard from both deputy chief and president Aaron Schmelz that the system is incredibly complicated as well. We identified several layers including equity and accessibility issues. For example, the system is significantly less accessible for people who are helpless, disability, and flexible work schedules, and other marginalized and historically excluded groups. Casey from the alliance told us the police accountability system is quote broken from top to bottom. Perception and trust. The public has little faith in the current system and lacks trust in its ability to admit wrongdoing and repair community trust not to interact with the accountability process at all. Current laws and policies. The current system is governed and protected by several intersecting layers of local, state, and federal law policy, including, and especially labor law. This is where complexity comes back into it as well. Notably largely the legacy of many years of collective bargaining by the police collective bargaining units or associations the city and public had very little view into that or input into that process. Effectiveness. It is, frankly, impossible to tell whether the current system meaningfully reduces misconduct. The data simply are not there. At the very least, it's quite clear that the system does not meet its own internally mandated guidelines, and that's a huge issue for complainants. Going back to transparency. On a fundamental level, the current system still largely relies on the police bureau to investigate itself in most cases. Internal affairs investigators, we have heard, give a tremendous difference and wide latitude and the police review board, which is tasked with reviewing investigations and recommending findings always has more members who are representatives of PPD members who are representing the community. So, it is more heavily weighted towards PPD representation. The current culture is, unfortunately, characterized as an adversarial relationship between the police and public. Community groups report encountering retaliation by police when filing reports of misconduct. Inadequate resources for community oversight. Volunteers make up an enormous part of the system. Volunteers, in particular, the citizen

review committee give anna norma's amount of time, resources, and emotional labor. They handle very large caseloads and massive case files, but they receive very little funding, staffing, training, mental health support, or other forms of support. Volunteers often feel like their work is not valued or input is not taken or policy recommendations go unheard. Another source of community oversight is Portland City Council itself, which may hear some cases upon appeal and we are directly from mayor Wheeler that City Council is really not an appropriate venue for most cases of this kind. I believe he compared it to sending circuit court appeals to the dmV. He said it's just not the right venue. It really is better served through bodies that have the technical knowledge and time and energy to focus on these cases because they deserve that focus. Again, there's so much more behind each of these points and I encourage you to read the entire report.

Speaker: The City Council required a pcp to look at police accountability. However, we also want to look at a holistic view and realize there are full components of the system that is working. Can be maintained and we wanted to recognize best practices as we found them. We categorized these best practices into seven categories. If something is listed here, it's important to know the whole system is not good and everything in relation to it, but we found elements in these categories that are working. Thank you. So, first, I know my colleague mentioned that a barrier was transparency. We wanted to highlight that there are elements of transparency that are working. A few things that are best practices, putting the openness of the citizen review committee, meetings, and reports that are issued by both ipr and crc. We wanted to highlight areas that are both equitable. The system does prioritize equity by language access. Many investigators speak in complete intake in multiple languages. There are multiple points of entry and they may make complaints outside of their own chain of command. Civilian staff involvement. The current system has multiple avenues for frontline staff to be involved in the process. For example, ipr staff can go directly to the scene of deadly force incidents. Staff can complete intakes and investigations and civilian staff can mostly do independent investigations and have no to little subpoena power for documents. The

qualifications of investigators. The current system has really experienced investigators. Both ipr and internal investigators work together. They consult and share information. All of these investigators have prior investigative experience. Also, specific experience with sex abuse, homicides, criminal personnel, and administrative investigations. We found that the current system offers opportunity for review and rigor. At any point the investigation can be sent back to the investigator for further examination. And appeal system is in place for both the employee and the community through the crc process. Another element of the system we wanted to highlight is mediation. The system allows for voluntary mediation as an alternative for some complaints and also allows for investigations to continue if mediation fails. Finally, outcomes. Beyond the discipline, or corrective action. The current system has capacity for other outcomes. Supervisory investigations for low-level complaints, and as I mentioned previously, mediation i'll move to slide seven, please.

Speaker: This slide is included to explain how the packs work and is organized and when the pack will get to specific questions. The commission established its phases of work in the scope document. This quarterly report continues newly through the fact-finding phase. The fact-finding phase ended in October and the next will include more on that. Getting in late October, the commission began its powers and duties phase, which the functions of the new oversight board and functions of city staff will be defined. This should be temporary. After that, the pack will determine the structure and details, including membership and appointment of the board. The fifth phase of work will identify a transition plan, as well as how this entire commission will fit into the current structure or chart and relate to other city entities focused on police and policing. In the concluding phases, we will convert into city code text and take additional rounds of input from stakeholders and the community before approving a proposal to send to you, the City Council. Alongside all of these tasks the ongoing work of community engagement, which is a key component of our work and crucial to our success. For anyone watching the slide on video who wants to tell us their story about police and police accountability,

we have many ways to take input. Please go to [www.Portland.gov/police /accountability](http://www.Portland.gov/police/accountability) and click on get involved to ensure your voice as part of the development of Portland's new system.

Speaker: Slide eight, please. Finally, we want to let you know what's happening next. We are currently in our powers and duties phase. We are working on developing how the board can get access to information on how it needs to do its work. Process on administrative officer account ability and policy recommendations. Community engagement events are ongoing. We had one last week and our next one is Tuesday, January 31, on zoom. To give more detail on this, our colleagues serving as cochair after us will come to City Council to report from October to December, 2022 in February. Thank you for giving us the opportunity to brief on the December, 2022. We look forward to continuing our work in creating a new system of account ability, including a new oversight board for Portland police. We are happy to answer any questions the City Council may have.

Speaker: D. Ryan: does that conclude your presentation? Keelan, I understand we have some public testimony. Why don't we take that next?

Speaker: Clerk: first up we have mark porras.

Speaker: Yes. Good morning. Good morning, presiding officer Ryan and commissioners. For the record, my name is mark porras. I use he/him pronouns. The q3 report does a generally with the commission has been working on. However, it takes great pains to describe the meetings held by which people and groups and subcommittees, while skipping over the work the product of the pac, other than to say they created some documents, the report mentions the coming and going of commissioners, references city ordinances, omits who left and who joined. For the record, the three people who were appointed to the pac in q3 were [listing names]. We believe an informative report will summarize some of the main findings and lease document and recommendations rather than focus on the meanings. A substantial report to City Council preferred. We understand why staff of the pac can't summarize the work of the pac because that would

be the job of the pac, which would really be the body supporting the City Council on their work. We appreciate the cochair added he tells today, but in general, the written report should include the members names of the voices.

Speaker: Clerk: next up, we have chris colmcwist. Chris was going to join us in person. Is chris here? That concludes.

Speaker: D. Ryan: okay. Thanks, Keelan. Colleagues, is there any customs or comments you like to make it this time? Commissioner Rubio, good. If there's any more deliberation, can I get motion?

Speaker: So moved.

Speaker: Second.

Speaker: D. Ryan: please call the roll.

Speaker: First I'd like to thank the pac commission for your leadership and work. It's clear how thorough it is and how well you know the material and/or dedication really comes through. I also want to thank sumir for your leadership and work as well. We live in a time where public trust in government is suffering and this presents us with an opportunity to build a system and trust at the same time and overwork is doing this. It's incredibly thorough and transparent and what I want to lift up is how transparent it's been to participate. We are cutting in the right direction and I'm happy to vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: M. Mapps: I want to thank sumir and the commission for this work. This is important work and I'm glad to accept this report.

Speaker: Clerk: Ryan.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thanks to all three cochairs. I think it's also hard to give a report when you're in the rearview mirror so far. I wanted with knowledge how quickly you're catching up in terms of the timeliness. I also want to acknowledge how much time you're putting in. That came up. I intended one meeting in the evening and I think anyone who works all day and goes to a meeting in the evening. You do this weekly? Yeah. The amount of volunteer labor, and was stated by one of the cochairs, emotional labor you're going

through, is a big commitment and passion for our city. Thank you for your service. I also want to big knowledge your hosting 22 meetings. That's a big sacrifice. I look forward to reviewing the documents and practices to avoid. You're digging in and I want to recognize staffer jerry jones, who attends a lot of meetings. I know it's helpful to get real-time as well. With that, I want to say aye. Thanks. Next item, item 40.

Speaker: Clerk: appoint cameron browne --

Speaker: D. Ryan: looks like he wanted to say one more thing.

Speaker: In regards to really appreciate the compliments of stories excessive police accountability commission has been the city and staff support we received. It is immeasurable and hopefully it's a process that really replicates and duplicates itself through other commissions and whatnot. It's already kind of starting to do that in a way, but thank you so much for the support.

Speaker: Clerk: appoint cameron browne and sarah clarke to the police accountability commission.

Speaker: D. Ryan: okay. I think we need to do an amendment on this one first. Colleagues, before we proceed on this item, will need to move to amend we will only be proceeding forward with the appointment of cameron browne. Is that correct? As I understand it, additional documents are necessary for missed cameron browne's appointment. Can the clerk please call and read the amendment? Do you have the amendment? Okay. We'll figure this out.

Speaker: Clerk: the amendment was just to remove sarah clarke from the resolution.

Speaker: D. Ryan: so, they are. We just read the amendment. Colleagues, do we have any comets or questions before we move forward?

Speaker: Do we need a motion on this?

Speaker: D. Ryan: moved by commissioner Mapps and seconded by commissioner Gonzalez. Let's do the vote.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: C. Rubio: I want to thank iva vega and -- for their commission up to this point

and the new commissioner for volunteering for our city and volunteering their time and effort in this way. It's very important. I'm grateful for their service and their care. For these reasons, I vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: D. Ryan: okay. Now we can go ahead with a vote on the appointment. Sumir, you want to give a presentation?

Speaker: Brief one, yeah. The commission again its work in December, 2021. Having active members in field positions is important to the commission to help it achieve its goals on time. You can see in the document someone resigned, which created a vacancy. The commission is working hard on developing powers and duties and is about to shift and is in the process of developing powers duties for City Council review. As you see in February, will have more information on that in the next round of cochairs report. For this vacancy, there were well over 100 members who applied and were reached out to see if they were still interested and eligible for the commission. Council worked very hard and wanted to commend all of the council staff and offices for working together to come to the conclusion of appointment of this individual, which continues a collaboration of all council offices related to this commission. The appointee, cameron browne, is with us on zoom, so I'd like to pass it to cameron to introduce himself.

Speaker: Hi, I'm cameron browne. Lifelong resident of Portland, Oregon. Born and raised in northeast Portland. I'm a freelance photographer. I'm my own little business and I do lots of different work throughout the community in that vein. But, you know, I've tried to be part of the community here in Portland and, you know, interact with, you know, the local community in my neighborhood and beyond. And I'm very excited to be part of this organization.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, cameron. Anything else?

Speaker: That concludes the presentation. Thank you so much.

Speaker: D. Ryan: you're welcome. As any other public testimony?

Speaker: Clerk: yes, we have one more. Mark boris.

Speaker: D. Ryan: let's go ahead and hear from mark. Mark, you there?

Speaker: Good morning again. Presiding officer Ryan and commissioners. I use he/him pronouns. We have no objection to cameron browne for the police accountability commission. We would've had no objection to sarah clarke, however, we noticed last night there would only be one new member added today. The commission has been missing two members, meaning there were only 18 members and court should have been 10 people, but instead, the pac had to wait until 11 members were present to conduct business. We've been asking council for a resolution to allow all city commissions to set their quorum to a majority of seated and active members. Like a bad penny, I'm here asking you to make this happen. The police account ability commission sent you a letter in June last year with this request which would allow the work to continue in the face of membership turnover that occurs on these volunteer boards. Yes, we would love it if the commission was probably restocked when someone resigns. However, when those aren't made properly and meetings are canceled or delayed due to missing quorum, the volunteers are unable to do the missing work they were appointed to do.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thanks, mark.

Speaker: Clerk: that completes testimony.

Speaker: D. Ryan: okay. Now we can go ahead and vote on this item.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: C. Rubio: for all the reasons I said before, I vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: M. Mapps: I want to thank cameron for continuing to serve on this committee. I vote aye.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you for giving a little bit of testimony about your life story here in Portland. It's especially noted that you're a small business owner, which is a great lovers and take to have at the table. I vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: next item 41, online police accountability commission with timeline

under us department of justice settlement agreement.

Speaker: D. Ryan: we are going to refer this to the mayor's office. That concludes those items. Thank you so much.

Speaker: Thank you all for your time.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you for being here. Okay. Let's go to item 42.

Speaker: Clerk: declare as surplus city-owned property located at the corner of sw council crest dr and sw mcdonnell terrace and authorize the director of bureau of environmental services to proceed with the public sale of the property.

Speaker: D. Ryan: it's my pleasure to turn this over to commissioner Mapps.

Speaker: M. Mapps: thank you, presiding officer Ryan. Colleagues, this comes to us from the bureau of environmental services. With this ordinance, it seeks approval of a piece of surplus property located at the corner of sw council crest dr and sw mcdonnell terrace. This property is a vacant lot, which covers about 8000 ft.² of very steep terrain. It was acquired by the city in 2006 with the intent to sell. Environmental services has no use for this land. This property has gone through the city's disposition process and no city borough has expressed interest in this property. The sale of this property is expected to bring in \$60,000. That price is so low because this lot is small and steep, which makes it difficult to build on. I'll close by asking and answering this question, which I'm sure many of you have in your mind right now. Can this property be used for affordable housing? And the answer is no. While it is theoretically possible to build housing on this land, because the terrain is so steep, by the time you pay for the engineering, the housing you create will no longer be affordable. Here to tell us more about this ordinance we have virginia bowers, property coordinator with the bureau of environmental services, and we also have deputy city attorney eric schaffner should we have questions about the legal issues involved with this item. Welcome, virginia and eric.

Speaker: There is a map. Hoping that we can post so you can see the location of the property. As commissioner Mapps mentioned, the property acquired as part of a settlement with intention to recoup settlement costs. Bs doesn't have any use or goals

for this property. There is a storm sewer that runs along the northeast side that will have an easement over it. This is the fourth access property that bs has brought to declare surplus. The other thing I want to mention that come up several times during the public comment period, several folks referred to an agreement which prohibits the city from selling and staff would like to say we have done research and we found no reference to this agreement and in the ordinance itself it clearly states that the city should be authorized to resell the property. With that, here to answer any questions as we go through.

Speaker: Before that we can see if there's any public testimony. Keelan?

Speaker: Clerk: yes, we have some people signed up. First up we have [name]. She's joining us virtually.

Speaker: D. Ryan: if you would make room for testimony, but stay around. Meaning stay in the chamber.

Speaker: Clerk: krishna is online there.

Speaker: Can you guys hear me okay?

Speaker: D. Ryan: we can hear you.

Speaker: I am a little nervous. I have been here right next to that empty lot. I think my concerns are really regarding two aspects. Many of our houses are on stilt foundations and the property next door has already had a landslide and I worry that any develop it there, especially since pile foundations once being drilled will adversely affect the surrounding houses, especially right next door. I also worry that any large structure will have slide potential simply because of the prior slide. I know there's a retaining wall there now and there hasn't been a slide there, but I wonder how much of that is because nothing has been built in that place. The second concern is really regarding the construction. I don't know if detritus is the right word, but all the things that go along with construction. We live on small roads. I worry about how construction equipment will limit access. I worry about how this affects kind of the stability of the roads. And I think, commissioner Rubio, a bit ago you had mentioned, unfortunately, there seems to be this

pervasive lack of trust and I think that extends to many access, including whether or not the city opts to build on this lot, how much ownership will that take? I think I just worry about the safety of our houses. It's my home and it's hard. It's very difficult to think that my home is not safe. And so, I don't know if there's a right or wrong answer here. I'm simply hoping that if you opt to sell this property that you take these concerns and, perhaps, have a compromised or solution there. Thank you so much.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, pritha. I know you said your nervous, but you did fine. Any other testimony?

Speaker: Clerk: yes, we have fred [name] in person.

Speaker: On the son of the parents you went against in court and I have two signed testimonies that they saw that settlement agreement. Both of them are very credible witnesses. The first one. My name is john's and my specialty is real estate commercial development and construction. I have 50 years experience in those areas. I have known george -- since 1988. After the landslide from the flood, they sought my advice. During the lawsuit, mr. Speda sought my advice during those 10 years of legal hassle. In 2006 when the city approached mr. Speda, mr. Speda contacted me and I told him to put in the settlement agreement beyond no further action legally be pursued between both parties unless I settlement agreement was reached. The property can never be developed or sold. Reason for telling him to do that simplicity will never declare a permit to be sold -- that makes a property worthless, so there is no reason to sell it. I told mr. Speda if the city signs off on this, I want to see the settlement agreement. In late July, 2006, while working on my roof mr. Speda stopped by to show me a copy of the settlement agreement. On the settlement agreement, I specifically remember seeing the language that speda's cannot pursue any further legal action and the city cannot develop the lot. I know the city attorney signed it on behalf of the city because he had the same last name as legendary coach from the boston celtics. From his nephew. I will testify on behalf of of the speda in court. I was with my uncle working on the roof of my property. I remember very vividly mr. Speda stopping by. He handed some documents and -- and

there's more to it, but basically the bottom line is because you guys have lost that document, I contacted the state archives, secretary of state. You are in violation of ORS 166.200 -- subsection 166.020-07 and ORS 162.035. We will pursue a lawsuit because if you even think about selling this property in full agreement as the ways you guys trying to play enforces out of the lot and since we have two testimonial witnesses regarding that I did see this, we will pursue this in court.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you. Commissioner Gonzalez would like to make a comment.

Speaker: R. Gonzalez: I just want to clarify, has been anything recorded against this property or adjoining property in respect to no selling obligation? Come back up here.

Speaker: The only thing you guys sent me is the bill of sale. Any attorney, even a city attorney, once to make sure there is a settlement agreement that we will not pursue any further action on this deal. It already went through the supreme court process by you guys trying to pull an imminent domain and the supreme court said no. You guys pulled all these stunts on us. My parents went through 10 years of hell. You have the gumption to come back and say were not going to grant you a permit because it's unbillable? I have two witnesses say they saw that settlement agreement because one of them is the one that told my dad to put them in there. Now you guys have lost a document you are required by state law to maintain and the state archive told me you guys in the city of Portland have a tendency to bend those rules. Well, going to hold you accountable to those rules, settlement agreement, and these guys will testify in court because the one witness, his name is John Gerdes. Let me give you the credibility of this witness. He and his brother own a company and I'm sure you know all the clinics around town and the grateful -- they treated \$10 million to oh you to build what's called discourteous dental school.

Speaker: D. Ryan: ask for your testimony. Did you get your question answered, commissioner Gonzalez?

Speaker: R. Gonzalez: I want to make sure we review title.

Speaker: This is more than a title. This is a separate agreement.

Speaker: Maybe your office can get in touch

Speaker: D. Ryan: go to the next testimony.

Speaker: Clerk: next we have [name] spada.

Speaker: Hi. Thank you for being here. We were the owners of the lot. This slide was in 1996, the largest slide in Portland. We went through 10 years of litigation. Our attorney contacted us in 2006 and said the city would like to settle because they are ready. We went to the attorney. You said you want to settle and we said, okay. We get the lot. He said, no. [indiscernible][lost audio]

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, marianne.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have [indiscernible]

Speaker: D. Ryan: pat, there you are. You've got a hot mic. Three minutes.

Speaker: My name is [indiscernible] and we have lived in the neighborhood we are talking about for over 40 years. We were in the spada slot on the hill. It happened early in the morning. Prehistoric sound. [indiscernible] I thought it was a garbage truck. It has been pointed out it was only 4:30 in the morning. It couldn't be. Anyway, I wanted to talk about the value of the property in our neighborhood. People who go jogging and are driving, people drive up there and park there because they can still see the city there. There are so many other lots that have been built that you can't see the city. When the landslide came, it was just talking to us and therefore a lot of things going on because we were concerned about the spada's and what happened because that with the lot the replanning to build their dream house on. Under the circumstances since I've been researching this I think it is unconscionable to the city to think about selling this lot and the reason I do is because we also talked about the settlement agreement and we talked to the spada's after this had happened and it was not supposed to be built on and they said never would be built on, that it was unbuildable and they were never grant a permit to build. I think that threatened the spada's. I couldn't do anything about it and I felt they were also told by the city, and I would like for you to tell me if this is right because I was pretty shocked that the city was going to find them \$1000 and a if they didn't go ahead

and improve the lot or do something about it. They declared the property and I took this out of a direct quote that it's dangerous and hazardous. They did not apply then for a building permit because I know in things I read, as the City Councilor stated them, there was no building permit that was even applied for. [indiscernible] if I was told they were never going to be granted a permit. I think that also is an interesting. [indiscernible] it took 10 years and the city, I understand. I wonder if you can tell me this because I was pretty unsure about it. [indiscernible] and I understand that it costs the city over \$2 million in legal fees, correct? [indiscernible] are you aware of that and City Council? I think you should look into it because that's pretty shocking. And I also understand in your court case. [indiscernible] the speda case the city paid further because the city had to pay reimbursement fees for the speda's and then they paid back taxes and if you added all of that up the speda's got very little for their property. But again, they said a building permit would never be [indiscernible] I mentioned before try to get a building permit would be granted --

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, patricia. You're a little overtime.

Speaker: As I was sitting in 41, it was quite interesting, but pretty long. I'll try to speed it up. Anyway, I understand the city also under -- some easements on both sides of the property, and that was in December 6, 2022. That would mean for me the city is trying to set it up to get the property sold, but why would you sell property for \$60,000 when you've already spent \$2 million? It doesn't make any sense. It also doesn't make sense because the water gushes down there and also causes the property to go downhill.

Speaker: D. Ryan: we have to wrap [indiscernible]

Speaker: Pardon?

Speaker: D. Ryan: it's been three minutes and we are at 4 1/2.

Speaker: I came all the way down here. [indiscernible] [lost audio]

Speaker: Hello. My name is mason vanburen. I live in the neighborhood across from this. I represent not only myself, but the neighborhood association itself. I was born into this house that I live in currently still when my parents built it in 1949. We've been there a

long time. So I thought I'd give you a little bit of the history of what we call the dump with the slide lot. Back in the 50s, bob -- and he gave us permission, this is before green buckets on the side of the road. He gave us permission to dump all of all of your greens over the edge of the bank. There was lawn clippings, edge clippings, and anyway. Also what happened during that time was every time a new house was built and they dug out the basement, the dirt from that basement, the clay soil, would be tossed over the edge as well as free dumping. So, you had layers and layers of greens, dirt, greens, dirt, probably which helped make the slide happen where it changed its name from the dump to the slide lot. This area has been kind of a community gathering space. It has a beautiful view of the city. Back in the 50s when you could [indiscernible] I brought a picture [indiscernible] the blues festival fireworks, which we can see. There's a bench sitting out there because it's a place where the schoolkids get off the bus and parents wait for them. Come over to see mount hood to see if they have snow on it so they can go skiing. Numbers of walkers, hikers, people on the 14th trail. Photographers and young lovers all enjoy that space. So, one of the options was to leave it as an open space for the community. It has a very small impact on the city budget to sell this it has a big impact on the neighborhood community and all the citizens of Portland. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you so much. Thanks so much for testifying. Keelan, are there any more? How many more testifying? Oh, that concludes testimony?

Speaker: [indiscernible]

Speaker: Commissioner Mapps, you and the team want to?

Speaker: M. Mapps: let me think everyone who showed up today to speak on this item. He raised a lot of questions today I'd like to invite city staff to address questions raised today if that's okay with you. I'll turn it back over to our panel.

Speaker: I'm hoping eric could address the court decision. Did it go to the supreme court? There's that process be a

Speaker: Good morning, commissioners. City attorney's office. I can address some of what was raised. First of all, again, we have not seen any settlement agreement. He does

not mean it doesn't exist, but we haven't seen it. The evidence that we do have strongly indicates a contrary conclusion. The property is being acquired with the intent to sell. We have an answer to commissioner Gonzalez's question. No deed restrictions. I reviewed the testimony from council hearing date and no one testified one way or the other, so there's no helpful information there. All we have is what we can see if property owners or anyone else has something written we can look at, we are more than happy to see that. I think the bureau's position is that keeping this property longer doesn't benefit the city. So, I think the sale, as a legal matter, I see no impediment moving forward.

Speaker: Have we got a title abstract or general review of title as part of your process?

Speaker: There's a title report.

Speaker: No covenants? No nothing. Just to clarify in terms of where we are in the process, I've only been here a few days, so I want to clarify the process. You have declared a surplus. Where are we at in the property?

Speaker: It was declared access. Let me get the terminology, commissioner Mapps. There's your exhibit I think it is the or something is with the commissioner declared access. At that point we had a 60 day public comment period. That's where we got a lot of this information. We posted a sign. That has since closed. The next step is to bring to council. We delayed that a little bit just because there was so much controversy and looking at the documents we had and doing some research. We did find out that, actually, it was mr. Vanburen told you about all the lawn debris and apparently that is what slid. There is, I think, 14 feet of unconsolidated material is what actually went down the hill. There is one of the [indiscernible] I don't know if you had a chance to read it from one of the neighbors. Present letter from geotech kind of outlining from a geotech report [indiscernible] this letter from the bureau services after the slide saying that they needed to fix that. It wasn't anything to do with building. As it stood, it was a hazardous situation. And that's all we know because then there's the court case that was settled and paid \$450,000 to the speda's and in exchange we ended up with the property. That's my understanding. Since we believe the property has been shored up, I don't know if the city

did not. There's some. [indiscernible] and things like that that stabilized the slope.

Speaker: M. Mapps: just to clarify, the next step in the process is you will market the property. Or what are the next steps?

Speaker: It requires there be a second reading a month and there's 30 days the decision is enacted and from then we can market the property.

Speaker: Go ahead.

Speaker: Follow on to that, we are following the city process, which is category three. Within the process after its declared -- to ensure anybody interested in the site has time to find it. The location right now is asking to declare surplus. Commissioner Mapps -- we determined we don't need it. There's no interest in the site, so we are asking to remove it. There's a 21 day process that other their city bureaus can review the site. We've gone through that step. Nobody was interested in it. After the city staff review it, we go to commentary. After commentary, go to you. We just finished public commentary, so we are asking you. Everybody has seen it and within the city and after if you choose to say yes we move forward with the sale 30 day mandatory period posting it for sale.

Speaker: Extremely helpful. There's nothing that precludes potentially neighbors working together to acquire this piece of property? I would encourage those testifying today to at least think about the scenario, even if the city proceeds in a way that you're unhappy about. There's an opportunity for neighbors to team up and acquire the property. In my legal career, we did this a number of times to reserve property for neighborhood use.

Speaker: [indiscernible]

Speaker: You know, we are relying on our staff review of the record as best they can and determine the facts and the grounds. I'm not going to prejudge how we are going to vote, but I'm just encouraging you to consider that as an option. Happy to reach out -- feel free to reach out to my office and I can kind of give you some guidance on how you can work together as a team to acquire the property should we go forward with this. Leave it at that and appreciate you all for testifying.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you for being here. This will move on to the second reading. Keelan, let's go to the consent agenda, items 53-52.

Speaker: Clerk: for the consent agenda you want to call? Rubio.

Speaker: D. Ryan: we are now voting on the consent agenda, colleagues.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: D. Ryan: okay. Onto item 53. Please read item 53. Back to the regular agenda. Thanks again for your testimony and for being here.

Speaker: Clerk: ratified letter of agreement between the city and the Portland police command officers association to settle in unfair labor practice complaint.

Speaker: Yes, colleagues. This results in unfair labor complaint from the police commanders officers association chief deputy city heidi brown is here to walk us through the ordinance. Welcome to the dais, heidi.

Speaker: Chief deputy city attorney and I'm here on this letter of agreement between the police association command officers association, excuse me, and city of Portland. Briefly, this requires the city to follow the law regarding collective bargaining and in exchange for us agreeing to follow the law regarding collective bargaining and acknowledging that law exists and providing notice to the union when we intend to implement -- a lawsuit before the employment relations board that is currently pending. This language mimics the language that we already have in the collective bargaining agreement between the city and the Portland police association. It's just that the unfair practice complaint filed both by the ppa and ppcoa. This will resolve the complaints that are currently pending. Are there any complaints -- my questions I can answer or would you like more information than what's before you?

Speaker: D. Ryan: first I'd like to look Keelan. Is there any public testimony?

Speaker: Clerk: we have one person signed up. Mark porras.

Speaker: D. Ryan: mark, you there? For the record, I'm mark pouris. I use he/him pronouns. This report for the ppcoa mirrors language in the rank and file Portland police association contract saying please don't agree with the city interpretation of the state law

passed in 2021. That law said the city can establish an oversight board to vote on the charter without negotiation, but it doesn't say the way the board functions does not have to be negotiated quality would be nice to imagine a world where the police would -- 82% of Portlanders to show good faith, it's more likely than not that they're going to demand certain items and visions in the charter are mandatory for bargaining. Portland -- to negotiate for fair working conditions. However, we feel the two police associations have too much power to influence policy that elective officials should be setting. While it's not contemplated in today's vote -- to engage in an ongoing dialogue with the police accountability commission. This ongoing dialogue will help the commission design a system that's fair to police, but also meets the expectations of the community, which in 2020 became aware in vocal about racial injustice and other systemic problems with policing. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thanks, mark. Colleagues, do you have any questions or comments? This is an emergency ordinance and, colleagues, if there's no more deliberation, can I get a motion to accept?

Speaker: So moved.

Speaker: D. Ryan: so moved by commissioner Mapps. Seconded by commissioner Gonzalez. Keelan, please call the roll.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: D. Ryan: onto item [indiscernible]

Speaker: Clerk: ratified a collective bargaining agreement with the American federation of state, county, and municipal [indiscernible] walk us through the ordinance. Welcome.

Speaker: I am here according to [indiscernible] this is bargaining agreement [indiscernible] it originated out of the [indiscernible] became its own bargaining unit. This bargaining unit a classification. [indiscernible] with only currently 11 employees. [indiscernible] is ross caldwell. He assists me in the bargaining of this contract. I'm going to talk about basically the high level wants. This is a three year agreement. Part of this three year agreement, the director caldwell wanted to maintain a consistent staffing and

continuity. A part of that we negotiated an incentive to continue on for the next three years. That incentive was \$3000 for the first year, \$3000 for the second year, and \$4500 for the third year. In addition to that, we removed from a pay range that was established for nonrepresented employees into a step system that was established for this collective bargaining unit. This step system consists of nine steps at the ninth year of being in the classification. The cost of this contract was \$113,000 will be the final cost in fiscal year 24/25. Just to give you rough figures, it was \$35,000 for retention and \$78,000 for change in the classification range and moving it. I will let director caldwell provide any information you would like.

Speaker: Thank you. Good morning, councilmembers I'm the director of independent police review. I want to echo what was said and I think the intent of this is to keep employees working as police accountability commission. I know you heard this morning as you complete the work the new police accountability system is designed. Think this will help keep police working and in compliance with justice settlement agreement. Continued oversight system is -- up and running and fully off the ground. Thank you very much.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you. Okay. Do we have any public testimony?

Speaker: Clerk: we have one person signed up. Mark pouris.

Speaker: D. Ryan: mark, you're back.

Speaker: Yep, I'm back. Good morning, again. For the record, my name is mark pouris, I use pronouns. As noted, Portland, watch fully supports the rights to negotiate workers for fair working conditions. It is notable in our cursory review, the staff at the ipr are not demanding that their labor contract affects the policies of the agency they're working for, nor the city who employs them. These workers are seeking stable hours and guarantees that most any other worker would ask for. -- because until the new review board is in place, ibr stands between the public and complete system were the only people invest getting police or other police. As much as we criticize for ipr for the decision they made, it's important of a civilian oversight committee. Commissioner Gonzalez, when asked this

question about ppa, the police union has historically pushed back on sending nonemergency calls to street response. If you go against pca in that way I didn't know the police union was supposed to have more of those calls going to psr. I don't know of any public safety bureau should have a veto on what makes sense. I want to understand the police opposition to that. The association wrote in a letter of agreement in its 2022-2025 contract that they will have 4 representatives on the 16 member body on what they can and cannot do. They therefore have more representation than any other group on the committee. They don't have time to handle people with metal health crisis. The ppa suddenly took the stance that work is being taken away from them. They don't want psr to approach people in buildings or streets, two places people in mental health crisis are usually found. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, mark. That wraps up public testimony. This is an emergency ordinance. If there's no more deliberation on this item, Keelan, please call the roll.

Speaker: R. Gonzalez: Rubio.

Speaker: C. Rubio: I'm pleased this is coming to agreement. These workers have been waiting a long time and I want to appreciate their patients and continue to serve the city of Portland.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: D. Ryan: motion passes. Let's go on to item 55.

Speaker: Clerk: pay settlement of dorothy hart property damage claim for \$89,105 involving the Portland water bureau.

Speaker: D. Ryan: this ordinance resolves a claim against the city in 2022. Analyst joseph jesse is here to walk us through the ordinance. Welcome, joseph.

Speaker: This ordinance relates to a water service line that cracked on or around August 30, 2022, and began leaking into the claimant's basement. This was about a foot away from the water meter. This is a unique circumstance because typically a water leak would find its way to a catchment system, but due to the location of this line, no system that

would typically indicate the water reaching the residents existed. A company began work on the residence to address the extensive mold and bacteria growth that had occurred over several weeks since the claimant first noticed the leak. The cost will pay for extensive remediation work and damaged items that were in his heart's basement at the time of the incident.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, joseph. Keelan, is there any public testimony?

Speaker: Clerk: no one signed up.

Speaker: D. Ryan: colleagues, you have any comments or questions at this time? This is an emergency ordinance and if there's no questions, Keelan, please call the roll.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: D. Ryan: motion passes. Ordinance passes. Go on to 56.

Speaker: Clerk: pay sediment of erik hoofnagle bodily injury lawsuit of \$75,000 involving the Portland police bureau.

Speaker: D. Ryan: am I reading the same thing or is it just that jesse your back to do this one as well. Yes. Jesse, just take it away.

Speaker: And caroline --

Speaker: D. Ryan: caroline.

Speaker: City attorney's office and shall be reporting on this.

Speaker: This case -- this is on July 4, 2020 in downtown Portland intersection of fourth and Washington. The plaintiff, mr. Hoofnagle, was merging with protesters when a smoke canister rolled past him. He turned around and kicked the smoke canister in the direction of police and when he did that he was fired upon multiple times with multiple different types of munitions. He injured his knee and experienced emotional injuries. Mr. Hoofnagle filed a lawsuit against the city. A Multnomah County officer, kyle smith. The party did mediation with marion county, retired marion county judge, pamela abernathy, and reached mutually agreeable settlement. Under the settlement, the city will pay \$75,000 to mr. Hoofnagle for his injuries and attorney fees.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, caroline. Thank you, joseph. That wraps up your

presentation?

Speaker: Yes.

Speaker: D. Ryan: sounds good. Any public testimony?

Speaker: Clerk: we have two people signed up. First is mark pouris.

Speaker: D. Ryan: welcome back, mark.

Speaker: I'm with the group Portland cop watch. We have no objection to the settlement, which is the result of unconstitutional police violence on July 4, 2020. We do, however, ask you to help the public understand the cost of policing [indiscernible] on police misconduct settlements. And we ask you again to stop using the term encounter in the ordinance language when a cop abuses a community member. Please watch the video of mr. Hoofnagle's video when you see a peaceful protester life being changed. I believe the council clerk can play that video now.

Speaker: D. Ryan: it's coming.

Speaker: Okay. Great. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: give me just a minute. We are checking with our broadcaster.

Speaker: D. Ryan: okay. Keelan's on it.

Speaker: Thanks.

Speaker: D. Ryan: should we go to next testimony and set this up?

Speaker: Mark, you good with that?

Speaker: It's important we show the video.

Speaker: D. Ryan: it's important to get that queued up.

Speaker: Be nice the city's attorney's office display it as well.

Speaker: Clerk: we may need to pause a moment.

Speaker: D. Ryan: I got an idea. It's getting close to that time to take a five minute break. Let's go ahead and do that. Council return in five minutes. Thanks.

Speaker: D. Ryan: January 18, 2023, is back in session. Item 56. Mark pouris, you are on. Round two.

Speaker: I'm assuming you can see my screen.

Speaker: D. Ryan: yes, we see it.

Speaker: Here we go.

Speaker: [video playing]

Speaker: Recording in progress.

Speaker: Thank you. I'm assuming you all caught that. In the video, he saw mr. Hoofnagle walking away in the crowd when officers fired a smoking gas at them. He kicked canister, was shot, fell to the ground, and shot in the back multiple times. This video could be used in an unconstitutional policing 101 course. Mr. Hoofnagle did nothing wrong. He kicked canister away from the crowd and continued on his way. For this he received a shattered knee, multiple impact weapons shot in the back, and a violent takedown. He was arrested and held in jail overnight in the middle of the covid-19 pandemic. What you can't see is how he described the untestable incident in the report where he stated that mr. Hoofnagle was able to retrieve the canister and there would at officers. Also the video and it's quite clear that officer taylor lied in his reports. How can the city continue to employ an officer who lies about it? We bring these issues up despite understanding that the settlements are a done deal in an attempt to get you to engage and discuss the underlying issues around police misconduct. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, mark. Colleagues, any comments or questions? Oh, there's one other testimony.

Speaker: Clerk: one other person for testimony. Dan handelman.

Speaker: Morning. Can you hear me at all?

Speaker: D. Ryan: yes, dan. We can hear you loud and clear.

Speaker: Great. Good morning, chair brian and commissioners. My name is dan handelman. I use he/him pronouns. We realize discussion for council is whether or not the city pays out \$75,000 for injury. However, we encouraged to use -- and dollars cost. We also continually raise the concern that officers are not necessarily applicable for actions that lead to losses and settlements. So far what we can tell from reports to date, covering the 2020 protest at least seven officers have been found out of policy for use of

force, but none of the service sectors matched what happened to mr. Hoofnagle. -- that was reported in the media that hasn't reached council yet, the city will have paid out one point million dollars in incidences. We have heard of a few sediment that came out at \$5001. They should be heard by City Council as anything over \$5000 is required to be heard by you, but don't seem to be on the agenda yet. We learned a new charter amendment will allow the mayor to settle any lawsuit up to \$50 million without council input. We urge you as it were looking at implementation for police actions that cause community harm unintentional -- all settles are in the public interest and perceived council deliberation. Finally, to echo the concerns raised by my colleague, the specific details about this case raises questions about why officers are allowed to use violence against people when there's no threat of harm. Are treated as criminals posing a risk to interest of the state. We are not opposed to council accepting this item, but we hope we'll talk about police policies, including those enforcing crowd control. The directive on crowd control, now known as public order events, goes into effect today. Following a year-long effort to gather public input, conduct research, yet the only mention of the crc is in testimony from cop watch. You should ask the ppd why they ignore this work and thank you for your time.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, dan, and thank you for being here. Keelan, is there an amendment we need to make?

Speaker: Clerk: we had a request from staff to update the payee.

Speaker: D. Ryan: can we please here that amendment?

Speaker: Clerk: it was posted to the item on the agenda and included in the agenda updates memo. Would you like me to --

Speaker: D. Ryan: please read it for the record.

Speaker: Clerk: the proposed amendment to directive a would read, the mayor and city auditor authorized to draw and deliver a check in the amount of \$75,000 at the [name] firm.

Speaker: D. Ryan: we need to second that.

Speaker: Clerk: somebody will need to make the motion.

Speaker: D. Ryan: so moved by commissioner Mapps and seconded by commissioner gonzales.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: D. Ryan: now, we will go forward with the item as amended.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: D. Ryan: okay. Ordinance passes. We move on to item 57. Please read the item, Keelan.

Speaker: Clerk: amended contract with facility force incorporated to increase amount by \$1 million for additional licenses, functionality,

Speaker: Dr. Mark t. Gladwin: for information facilities and as set management systems.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: they need to produce additional licenses and facility assessments and equipment inventories and sustaining at 23 locations needed to induct long range renewal planning and manager of the asset management is going to walk us through this item and mati. There you are.

Speaker: Hello! Good morning, commissioners. This is you again my name is maddie sawedder and I oversee the division paper stains all the city's equipment and specialized vehicles and except for buyer drafts and golf carts and also all of a large portion of the city's facilities so not all of them but a lot of the course of the facilities you are familiar with such as city hall, Portland buildings and most of the police facilities, et cetera. I am here today joined by a colleague, amy davis, who is the business systems analyst and the facility organization. I'm acting in the temporary facility director capacity here to support her today. We're request an amendment to a million dollars to help support two pieces of the implementation of a new information system in our organization. The first is that we have some computer stuff that amy knows better than I do. Licenses, incompetent inaugurations, et cetera, that we need to add to the scope so it's half of the request. She's going to explain what that is. I am here to also speak on behalf of the need for condition data that needs to be gathered and can be gathered through this contract

into the system. So with that i'll hand it over to amy.

Speaker: Thank you, so we started the implementation of this system last year and we have identified areas where we can improve operation efficiency and integration with the city's existing financial and procurement system. This computer part of the request has two components to purchase additional licenses for space management and inventory control and is the first one. They will add straight and define and evaluate space data for improved short and long-term capacity planning operations. They will also facilitate implementation of the inventory management program that will help us improve policy compliance and streamline health equipment parts and components are purchased and the second part of this is to to establish strong integration protocols with the city's financial procurement systems and the integration consist of data connectors to cut down on reopportunity ant entries that will reduce hundreds of hours of work helping us meet our goals with accuracy, availability of data leading to improved tracking, planning, management and transparency of costs butts et cetera and schedules. Unless there are questions, i'll give it back to maddie.

Speaker: Maybe we'll take a brief pause if anyone has questions on this portion of the amendment.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you. Before that do we have public testimony.

Speaker: Clerk: no one signed up.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: any questions, colleagues? Great presentation, maddie and amy. This item will move on to a second reading. Thank you.

Speaker: Great, thank you.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: please read idea idea 58.

Speaker: Clerk: contract with universal service lpdæe allied universal service to increase amount by \$661,173 for additional professional security officer services.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you. Colleagues, this contract amendment will provide increased security within city hall. John budkey, business systems analysis for the integrated security program is here to walk us through the idea. Welcome, john. Is john in

the house?

Speaker: There he is.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: yeah. We can hear you, john.

Speaker: Can you hear me now?

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: you are on. Item 58. John, you are muted. You were unmuted a bit ago and now you are muted, john.

Speaker: Clerk: john, can you hear us?

Speaker: Sorry I'm out at pbem and connectivity is weird.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: we can hear you loud and clear.

Speaker: Good morning, I i apologize for not being there with you this morning but I'm at a earthquake workshop. I'm business systems annalist in the security division and this would be brief. We've been working very diligently to expand the integrated securities program by using a proactive approach towards implementing consultant recommendations made in the security master plan of a couple of years back. This ordinance, it's the next step in the planned effort to improve safety and security visiting community members and city staff working in city hall. At that point I'm happy to answer any questions you may have, thank you.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: john, anything else?

Speaker: No, it's pretty straight forward. This is part of a regular scheduled plan. There's a timeline for various stages of security whether it's technology issues and or actually physical on site security and things of that nature and this is just coming up in the timeline, as I can't say proved plan but a general event.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you, john. Is there any public testimony.

Speaker: Clerk: no one signed up.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: any questions? Since this is the first reading, we'll move on to a second reading. Please read the next item.

Speaker: Clerk: item 59 amend floating structures code to replace floating structures board of appeal with building code board of appeal and make other changes for clarity

and consisten.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: great, i'll turn it over to commissioner Rubio.

Speaker: This is the first under our new assignments and I want to say I'm excited today get to work with director esaw and her team on many items to come. By the way, the bureau regulates floating structures and marinas, within the city, through title 28. And on changes to title 28 related to floating structures, bds staff meet regularly with the river committee advisory committee to discuss those changes as well as any issues related to floating structures. The purpose of this ordinance is to incorporate discussions and recommendations of the river community advisory committee but in short, we are eliminating the floating structures code board of appeals. And transferring that work to the building codes board of appeals. The former body has only met once during its existence and that was over 15 years ago. I certainly put this simple move into our collective work to find opportunities to streamline and better deliver services. I also want to acknowledge that the bureau has deleted the term grandfather in the portion of our and I appreciate the thoughtfulness of the origin of this word for our country and it's not something we want to continue forward. So here to explain the changes in more detail is nancy with bds.

Speaker: Thank you, commissioner Rubio and good morning commissioners and welcome commissioner gonial says. I'm nancy with the bureau of development services and I think commissioner Rubio said much of what is in. Basically there's two parts to this ordinance. Title 28 regulates floating structures which is basically floating homes and the related structures that are on flotation systems. The (inaudible) is the language and commission with the term grandfather (inaudible) and we're our term shall based on recommendations from the attorney and the condition of changes and the paper part is to replace the floating structures building code and that both of those boards are what we're external boards and we basically have two levels of appeals and interpretal board meets weekly and then we have the extra board and we want to replace the existing building. I mean, the structure board of appeal and have someone from the river

advisory committees sit in on any appeals that occurred that people aren't on the board and last time they met and it's only met once,, we don't want to put that burden on our community members who care for those boards so that basically summarizes this ordinance and you have questions I'll answer them.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you, Nancy. Anyone sign up for public testimony.

Speaker: Clerk: no one signed up.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: any questions from colleagues. Idea will move on to second reading. Thank you. Item number 60.

Speaker: Clerk: authorized conveyance of city-owned real property located at 1103 Southwest Harvey Milk Street and rehabilitation financing not to exceed eight million \$500,000 to Home Forward or an affiliate for affordable housing project.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: I have the pleasure of turning this over to the housing commissioner, Rubio.

Speaker: Thank you, Council President Ryan. I'm happy it too to introduce the submergence to allow Home Forward to acquire and renovate the Fair Field Apartments which the Portland Housing Bureau has owned and operated since 2010. The Fair Field is an existing residents and downtown Portland serving low income individuals with the ground floor hosting the Roxy restaurant and the proposed funding from the city will use River District tax increment financing and direct allocation of federal housing and urban development funds and this product will average over 27 million you've public and private financing and preserve 75 units of permanent supportive housing for our needy residents. Thank you to develop Home Forward and its partner Urban League of Portland for delivering affordable housing and cultivating (inaudible). I also give sincere thanks (inaudible) --

Speaker: Send them to our office.

Speaker: I have a stack here and they need it to be.

Speaker: We didn't respond, sorry.

Speaker: Ok. Yeah.

Speaker: We will show some slides.

Speaker: Yes.

Speaker: Thank you. I'll let you go ahead and get the item. (inaudible).

Speaker: Yes, we can barely see you and we don't have the slides yet.

Speaker: You don't see the slides yet.

Speaker: No. It's close, there it is. Next slide. Ok, let me get it into can you see it now?

Speaker: Yes.

Speaker: Thank you. We are pleased to present the renovation and preservation of the fair field apartments and the fair field is a single room occupancy building southwest harrish develop being street 11th avenue in downtown Portland. Next slide, jill. The property was built in 1911 and assumed in 2010 by the Portland development division. Next slide. We're only seeing the intro slide just fyi.

Speaker: Sorry. Technical difficulties. Seeing that now.

Speaker: Now we just need the one prior. There we go. This unreinforced masonry structure meets current life, fire and safety roads and increase live ability for its residents. The property is currently home to extremely low income residents of which 96% earn less than 30% of area meaning income and 43% of whom have no income. Next slide. Home forward's renovation of the fair field will preserve 75 supportive housing units helping to prevent the displacement of highly vulnerable individuals in a central location near transit service and neighborhood amenities. All 75 will be designated as permanent supportive housing with rents supported by hud project based section 8 vouchers and services provided by the urban league of Portland. All units will be affordable to individuals earning up to 30% of area income and have rents supported by the section 8 vouchers which of what this means that the residents pay roughly about 30% of their income towards representative, the subsidy pays the difference. The borrower will enter into a regulatory agreement with phb to maintain affordability of the project for 99 years. Construction will start in early 2023 and residents will be moving back during the spring of 2024. Current residents are receiving relocation assistance from

home forward and have the option to return to the fair field after project completion. The rehabilitation scope of work includes seismic and structural improvements, roof and window replacements, plumbing and electrical upgrades, elevator replacement, right now it's original from 1911 and actually is out of service as of last year. Additional 'em improvements while preserving its historic character. Amenities include space for on site residents services and property management as well as 24 hour desk coverage. Home forward has been working with sustainable building consultant to incorporate green building features that include l.e.d. Lighting, energy-efficient appliances and fixtures, high performance windows, energy recovery ventilation, and a focus on sustainable and durable materials. The project team expects to exceed phb's equity and contractors goals of 30%, disadvantaged minority women emerging small business firms and utilization for hard cost and 20% utilization for professional services. The 75 permanent support housing units will receive funding for 10,000 per household per year with homeless services, individuals who are experiencing or at risk of homelessness will be referred to the fair field through the joint offices coordinated access system. And home forward provides this project-based section 8 vouchers for the psh units. The urban league of Portland will provide call choice case management and peer support for psh households. They send their regrets and they were not able to make it today but next slide. Just as a summary they will provide residents services as well as the fair field and focusing on life skills, asset building, health, and housing retention and a suite of services will be provided as listed below on this slide. Next slide. The proposed city funding of \$8.5 million is leverage to 3.3 times raising over \$27 million of other public ex private financing and private financing is contributed by invest or u.s. Bank and lender key bank and public support is from the Oregon housing and community services department and prosper Portland. Including \$2 million in hud, community project funds and set aside by congress for the fair field. We are asking council to authorize conveyance of the city-owned site and funding up to \$8.5 million to home forward and affiliates and authorize phb to execute, amend or modify a document to advance this project. And with that I will

have to turnover to ivory matthews.

Speaker: Thank you, molly. Good morning in ab is sense of mayor Wheeler, commissioner Rubio, commissioner Ryan, it was certainly a pleasure working with you for the short timeframe and also members of Portland City Council. Minimum name is ivory matthews and I use she/her pronouns and I'm the chief executive of home forward. Thank you for the opportunity to present and conveyance of the fair field departments to home forward or anna fill at and authorize the interim director of the Portland housing bureau to execute the documents to advance the project forward. Home forward is the housing authority for the county and the largest housing authority in the state of Oregon and one of the original hud of designated moving to work agencies which allows home forward to be more creative and innovative in-house we serve the community. We own 7,000 units of affordable housing and serve 15,000 households monthly with rent assistance throughout the county and we administer variety of rent assistance programs including 11,000 housing choice vouchers, short term and that can con sal dates funding from several sources in the age through 19 social service providers providing property management services to our 110 housing sites and a robust residents service to support our diverse resident needs. Home forward plays a major role in affordable housing. We have preserved in the county over 1700 homes through major renovation and 596 units are currently under construction, and of which will be complete inside 2023 and 880 units in 23 and supportive units under construction in the pipeline to include fairfield apartments in southeast powell. We also partner with 100 community organizations to make this happen. We have a strong asset management and development department that focuses on preserving our existing portfolio and creating new affordable housing for our community. We have been close jurisdictional partners and the Portland housing bureau by blending out resources and at the fairfield and other projects. To ensure our most vulnerable neighbors are stably and permanently housed, this project has been a partnership with Portland housing bureau since 2018. We are thankful for your partnerships and commitment to rehab in this historic building and so it can be a long-

term asset to our low income community and our downtown core. Thank you to your funding and forethought, we'll be able to preserve commercial space that fronts the vibrant streets of southwest 11th and southwest harvey milk street, preserve and size mat tickly upgrade 75 units of very low income housing for chronically homeless individuals and provide on going culturally appropriate supportive services by the urban league of Portland. The fair field apartments will provide as molly stated, permanent supportive housing for chronically homeless for those who are black Americans residents and those domestic violence and our lgbtq communities and this was something that commissioner Ryan was certainly supportive of so thank you for that. As you all know, these populations are dis port atly impacted by homelessness. We are very excited that our partnerships with the urban league, Portland who will provide these services are going to be truly instrumental in keeping these families stably housed. Lastly, I will share thanks to the ambitious goals and the commitments of our partners, walsh construction, we anticipate exceeding our minority women and emerging small business goals achieve a rate of 35%. Thank you for this opportunity to ensure that our residents of the fair field will remain stably housed. This historic building will be preserved and a collaborative approach will provide wrap around services for our residents. Thank you.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: does that conclude your report? Great. Is there any public testimony.

Speaker: Clerk: no one signed up.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: colleagues any questions?

Speaker: I have a quick one. In terms of the joint office of the homeless commitment to provide services, could you give a high level of how that works? Is it a year-to-year or is it over an extended period of time in terms of the commitment?

Speaker: Yes, we work closely with the joint office when we put together solicitations. Examples like that, he they've been clear that they can provide up to 10,000 per household per year for however their authorization period goes. We work with them on a contractual basis. I'll have to get back to you on this specific term of that contract but the

intention is to continue as long as resources are available. They enter into contracts with service providers that then work with the site staff and work with the owners and to ensure they're providing the services that they set out to do.

Speaker: Got it it. You described the relocation assistance for exiting residents, can you just give general color how that works mechanic leon the grouped to make sure those folks aren't displaced extensively?

Speaker: Absolutely. We've gone through some emergency relocation of residents when the elevator went down. Luckily, we had home forward ready to go and they have an extensive relocation team. I'm sure ivory can speak more on that but just in general, we were able to leverage home forward's existing downtown buildings or other publicly supported buildings that they can move people into for the time period of the construction. The people are paying the same amount in rent as if they were at the fair field. So then they have the ability to move back if they so chose.

Speaker: I think you summed it it up.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you, thank you very much both of you. Colleagues, if there's no more questions, please call the roll.

Speaker: Clerk: Rubio.

Speaker: I want to thank in director rogers for her leadership on this project and also give appreciation to director mathors of home forward and our other partner urban league of Portland. This project is special and it helps to finally address some much needed housing, affordable housing and culturally responsiveness to service to underserved communities so I want to also bank my colleague, commissioner dan Ryan for his stewardship and leadership also on this project. Commissioner, I know this was a special one for you. So, I'm very happy to vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Gonzalez.

Speaker: Aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Mapps.

Speaker: I'd like to thank commissioner Ryan, Rubio, our congressional delegation,

housing bureau, home forward and the urban league for their work on this project. I'm glad to see this project move forward, which is one of the many reasons I vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Ryan.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: yes, I want to actually start off by acknowledging congresswoman Suzanne Bonamichi. Her and her husband were hit by a car on Friday night and they're both doing well but I just want to acknowledge -- she was a champion in Washington D.C. To deliver the rounding up of investments necessary to make this project really go forward and know we can feel comfortable that it was financed to completion. Thank you so much, congresswoman for your steadfast commitment. I really have to also say that this was an item where I dove in deeper. There were two buildings in that area that are going up and we needed to get some storefront activation in at least one of them. It's a really, really popular pedestrian thoroughfare of our downtown area and I wanted activation of life going forward. I appreciate the nimbleness in how the housing bureau made that happen. It's really good to see you, Ivory. When you are in this job for over two years and you've had numerous meetings with someone and they're in little boxes, it's always a little bit of a startedelling, wonderful moment when you get to see someone in-person. Thank you and I'm glad your transition from South Carolina, what's it called, the Pimento State?

Speaker: They're Pimento cheese.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: I hear that now and then and I don't know what it is. Welcome and you lived through a couple rainy seasons. And we appreciate your leadership. Seeing the way you knitted together the partners with the Urban League and I appreciate this historical significance you understand about this area. It's now called Southwest Harvey Milk Street and for the -- it's a historic area for the LGBTQIA community and it says here going back several decades, I can testify it goes back at least four decades and as I used to room those parts in the early 80s so we're activating that part of our city and I really appreciate the way you've brought in the partners that are necessary to deliver the services that are relevant. I also just want to pause to say that I had the

pleasure while I was at the housing bureau of seeing a lot of activation. Since December of 2021 alone, 2,900 affordable units have been in development. The housing bopped was passed successfully and I know there was some challenges because there always are when you build something new and different. It's accelerated over the last couple of years and I know it will continue here in 2023. So this is an exciting step in that process. It will be great to keep collaborating with commissioner Rubio and her amazing team. Your future is in good hands, I vote aye.

Speaker: Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: execution of prior agreement for staff augmentation to support the bureau of environmental services capital improvement program with inspection and program support is services not to exceed \$18 million over five years.

Speaker: Thank you, president Ryan. Colleagues, this item comes to us from the bureau of environmental services, with this ordinance, environmental service seeks council's approval to hire temporary staff to support in-house construction management, inspection and program support on an as-needed basis. This ordinance is necessary because bes is increasing its capital improvement program budget over the next five to 10 years and in order to meet the new regulatory mandates and to keep pace with the needs of a growing city and an aging sewer and stormwater system. This ordinance an important tool that will help bes ensure continuous and efficient service and avoid costly project delays. The average annual cost of these temporary hires is expected to be \$3.6 million. This contract will run for five years so the expected could have of this contract shall not exceed \$18 million. Now, before I turn the floor over to staff, I should be clear on one latch point. This contract does not authorization an increase to utility rates. Instead, the funds for this program will be charged to the bureau of environmental services sewer system operating fund budget. (inaudible).

Speaker: With council's support for five temporary staff position to permanent city full time equipment or ftes in the fiscal 20 fall bump and seven in fiscal year 2021 and fiscal '25 we were able to significantly reduce the plan value of these price agreements and we

want to especially thank commissioner Mapps and michelle rodriguez for their leadership and support for getting the planning and approval done. We planned about \$40 million over five years and up to 35 staff and we cut that in half to about 18 million and about 17 staff so the cost is \$8 million to \$3.6 million. So we had just under -- a little mer than half. This was what we call a win-win situation where we were able to save money and also there's a lot of value in converting the contract employees to city employees for their own professional development because it's typically their end game to be city employees. All right. So, future request, so I guess, the main point here I also want to make is weds approval in the fall bump so the key with our request is to get approval for the future year request that were planned and they will come to you the next year and the year after so we can stay within this contract amount. If those are not approved we may need to come back and request additional for more contract ft.

Speaker: Next slide, please. So, I'm going to talk through why they bes uses staff for the capital improvement plan. It's upgradeing and replacing our aging stormwater and an tori sewer infrastructure and that range from nearing the end of their service life to being beyond these facilities need to be rehabilitated or replaced and we also have in facilities that need to be built to improve service to our community and much it gives us supplemental construction and inspection supports for projects and including storm and sanitary sewers and pump stations, treatment facilities and drain edge way improvements and they have van'ing schedules and require adapting quickly to project changes. Relying on a mix of ftes, consultants and temporary staff to work on these critical as set projects, gives the bureau the flexibility to adapt to changing schedules, resource gaps, and unexpected projects. Temporary staff positions create opportunities for workforce development by allowing contract staff to gain on the job training. So, next slide, please. I think that is everything that we have. So we'll say thank you and open it up for questions.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: great, before that any public testimony?

Speaker: Clerk: no one signed up.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: colleagues, any questions? This is a first reading and this will move on to a second reading. Thank you so much.

Speaker: You are welcome.

Speaker: Thank you. Next item, 62.

Speaker: Clerk: yes, execution of price agreements for small capital unit price construction contracts over three years.

Speaker: Thank you, president Ryan. I'm excited to introduce this ordinance because this is a great example of how good government and valuing equity can compliment each other. It comes from the bureau of transportation services and with this item this council districts reauthorization a price agreement for small capital unit price not contracts. Now, these price agreements allow pbot to do business with small contractors from the city's prime contractor development program. Of course, the purpose of the prime contractor development programs is to create a marketplace for the city of port lapped to purchase goods and services from businesses owned by women and people of color. The primary - - (inaudible). (inaudible).

Speaker: Aspects of this contract and it's described in definite quantities and the city determined what we believe fair market price. And we I am conclude those prices in the bid tab. The contractors then review the prices and based on the costs, they is submit a multiplier. The contract is based on the contractors multiplier. Another unique of this is the time of bid, there's no project specificity and contractors don't know where the work is going to be and nor do we. To enable us to award the bid, the bid is structured so the contractors submit a bid for work and projects not yet defined. Pbot wasn't the first bureau in the city to use this contract method. Our friends at bureau of environmental services were the first in fact that contract came out in November of 2014 and they called that contract peruse. Ex that sands for, the -- where is that? The urge enter repair of sanitary and storm sewers. In the current contract, we have eight bidders. We awarded seven contracts and the multipliers of the awards from 1.15 to 1.35. Today we've completed 20 subjects and completed five million dollars worth of work, and we've

constructed over 250 ramps city wide. Contracts also allowed pbob to quickly create unique projects such as the placement of marine (inaudible) or barriers when you drive to keep vehicles from driving on the levees and allowed us to close down the oak street for the future construction of the plaza and play street on oak street. This contract as mentioned, will enable us to deliver up to \$7 million a year of constructed capital improvement projects. This approach allows pbob to move quickly without going through a lengthy standard procurement process. The contract may be renewed twice and the contract duration of three years and finally, as mentioned, the contract will further the city's efforts to use contractors in the city's prime contractor program. Providing them more experience and all aspects to completing small to medium sized projects for pbob and the city. Thank you.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you. Scott. Let's see if there's public testimony.

Speaker: Clerk: there's none.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: any questions? Ok, this is emergency ordinance and if there's no more deliberation, please call the roll.

Speaker: Clerk: Rubio.

Speaker: I think this is a great project and it's a win-win. And it's contractors will gain valuable experience and will be able to move these projects through more quickly. I vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Gonzalez.

Speaker: Aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Mapps.

Speaker: Aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Ryan.

Speaker: You nailed it, you said good afternoon. Aye.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: passes. Unanimously and on to item 63.

Speaker: Clerk: authorize Portland water bureau director to execute certain utility and co-operative improvement and agreements with the Oregon department of

transportation for projects that have portable water infrastructure services and construction areas.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: ok, commissioner Mapps.

Speaker: Commissioner Mapps: thank you, colleagues, this item comes to us from the Portland water bureau. This deals with some frankly arcane accounting rules that govern how the water bureau and odot charge each other when we work together on joint infrastructure projects. Today, i'll let staff walk you through the details of this proposal. Today, I want to limit my comments to highlight some high-level issues that I hope council and the public will take from this ordinance. Let me start with background. The water bureau and odot much partner together to build or improve infrastructure and the Portland metro area. When we engage in projects like that, the city is not often obliged to meet deadlines set by the state. And those deadlines are often shorter than the city's bureaucratic processes can accommodate. The ordinance before us today removes a barrier to meeting odot deadlines for smaller infrastructure projects that involve the water bureau. This ordinance does that by authorization the director of water bureau to enter into agreement with odot for projects that cost up to half a million dollars. Now, under the current rules, items like that typically come to council where they usually land on the consent agenda. I'll close by pointing out that there's ample precedent for reforms like the one proposed in this ordinance and for example, the director of the Portland water bureau has authority to sign certain agreements and easements and leases and licenses for the Portland water bureau. However, currently, the director of the water bureau does not have the authority to sign any of the odot type agreements. Which is why this ordinance necessary. Now, here today to tell us more about this proposals we have jody inman, chief engineer with the Portland water bureau. Welcome, jody.

Speaker: Good afternoon, as I was reminded by the previous testifier so good afternoon, thank you commissioner Mapps, good afternoon council members and welcome commissioner gonzales. My name is jody and I'm the chief engineer for the Portland water bureau. As commissioner Mapps always does a great job of introducing

and giving background, we are here today with an ordinance we developed in collaboration with the Oregon department of transportation and I'm happy to say that because we can't always really celebrate where we have collaborated with some of our partner agency and an effort to both meet our mutual goals. So this ordinance is really intended to help expedite the city process for smaller, odot projects. So as you know, the Oregon department of transportation takes on many projects in our community many of which improve safe tease and multi modal transportation option and they impact the water infrastructure under the roads and requiring those water assets be relocated. In order to relocate the water assets, we must enter into an agreement with odot, one of those inner agency agreements or co-operative utility agreements, we very specifically labeled the three that are most common for reimbursing odot for work there contractors do to relocate water assets and if at times we have had ordinances that have come before council, that purely allow the organ department of transportation to pay back the Portland water bureau for work that its crews and staff pursue. It's why we are here today. We would like to simplify and expedite the process to help to get the water bureau reimbursed for the work we're doing. So, often odot is working under these expedited timeframes. As you can imagine, the development of the agreement must go through all of their legal hoops including working at state level with the legal agreements, the department of justice so at times, we do not have these agreements until the timeframe between when they have the agreement we can bring to council and when it needs to be approved is short. Typically it takes us three to four months right now to take an agreement once known and identified and fully ready to be signed by all parties. Through the council process and typically we have 30 to 60 days before odot is letting us know that we are going to delay their project. At times, these have landed on consent agenda or quite much, and I think we've seen this with pbot they come to you as emergency ordinances. So we recognize that there are many projects that are over 500,000 and that you would are interested in and they come to council prior to authorization and it's for the smaller projects that are under \$500,000 and it would also grant the director of the

water bureau disability to authorizing change orders of 25% of that and for a total of \$625,000 and for the director of water bureau to be able to sign those not. This would help support odot's projects and I believe show improvement in our efficiency of process. So with that, i'll answer any questions.

Speaker: Commissioner Mapps: thank you so much. Do we have public testimony. Colleagues any questions for jody? We're not voting on this this is a first reading and it will go to the second reading. Thank you for being here and thank you for your patients. That concludes all our items on our morning agenda and I will see all of you at 2:00 p.m. And this meeting is adjourned.

Portland City Council Meeting Closed Caption File

January 18, 2023

2:00 p.m.

This file was produced through the closed captioning process for the televised city Council broadcast and should not be considered a verbatim transcript. The official vote counts, motions, and names of speakers are included in the official minutes.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: good afternoon everyone.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: okay. Mayor Wheeler is absent.

Speaker: Thank you, commissioner. If you wish to testify before council in person or virtually, you must sign up in advance by visiting the council's agenda on the clerk's web page at www.Portland.council/agenda. You may also sign up for public testimony on resolutions, reports, or the first readings of ordinances. When testifying, please state your name for the record. Please disclose if you are a lobbyist. If you are representing an organization, please identify it. For testifiers joining virtually, please unmute yourself once the council clerk calls your name. Everyone can feel welcomed, comfortable, respected and safe. Individuals generally have three minutes to testify unless otherwise stated. The timer will indicate when your time is done or interrupting others' testimony or council deliberations will not be allowed. If there are disruptions a warning will be given. After being ejected, a person who fails to leave the meeting is subject to arrest for trespass. Council may take a short recess and reconvene *vir dhully*. Thank you.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you. There's just one item this afternoon and it's time certain. Can you please call the first item.

Speaker: Clerk: amend the comprehensive plan and the planning commission and dissolve the planning and sustainability commission.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you. Commissioner Rubio, I'm going to go ahead and turn this over to you.

Speaker: Commissioner Rubio: good afternoon everyone. I'm thrilled to introduce this ordinance as a results of this ordinance means that two big sectors of work will have a dedicated time and space they deserve to deliberate importantly policy development work. More specifically, the ordinance represents the first step for creating two important commissions, one focused on long-range land use planning and the other focused on climate and sustainability. The need for these two commissions is clear as the need for responsibility is related to land use planning and sustainability in Portland have become more than one commission can undertake. This understanding was demonstrated by the report I commissioned in late 2021 which found that the current broad scope of the psc, the Portland sustainability -- planning and sustainability commission threatens its efficacy. In addition, before we start the public hearing and begin deliberating this proposal, I want to make two things clear, one, that the planning commission will continue to take an intersectional approach to this work. I want to correct a misperception that the old psc will be split in two, this is not correct. Economic justice, racial justice, and climate justice will continue to inform decisions made at this commission. And, two, the attention to climate issues has as we've just talked about outgrown the commission. I am deeply commit today creating a new commission focused solely and strictly on climate and sustainability related items. Bps. Is currently recruiting for a coordinator to lead the process to establish that commission and we're excited about getting this moving. I'd also like to thank current and past planning sustainability xhigsz leaders for their invaluable service to Portland and

Portlanders. Their work has been dense and the demands of this work demands much of their time and we're so grateful for their leadership. I look forward to hearing from the public on this matter and we're all excited to begin working with a new planning commission and the imminent work to create the new sustainability commission. Before I pass it on to staff to begin the presentation, I'd like to introduce a minor amendment and I'd like to give testifiers a chance to express their thoughts. As shown on the slide, is there a slide showing?

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: not yet. Here, it's coming. It's up.

Speaker: Commissioner Rubio: as shown as you see on the slide, I am proposing to not delete the words "the City Council" from paragraph two of the commission's list of power and duties. I'm proposing this amendment because it clarifies to whom the commission is providing advice. Providing greater clarity in regards to the xhigsz's scope, per view, and expectations was an issue raised in the evaluation report and I think this amendment will reinforce the relationship between the commission and the City Council. So therefore I move to not delete the words "the City Council" from paragraph 33.710.040.d.2. Can I have a second on that?

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: second.

Speaker: Commissioner Rubio: thank you. So now I will turn it over to bps director donnie olivera.

Speaker: Thank you, commissioner. Donnie olivera. Before we get started, commissioners, I'd like to take a moment to thank the staff on this. Who have worked diligently and with our members of the planning and sustainability commission to craft the amendments that are going to be before you today and as commissioner Rubio mentioned, this proposal has been a result of the process that started two years ago on evaluating the strengths and opportunities addressing land use and climate. As we acknowledge, there's a great opportunity for us to

evaluate as we're doing with our whole city government as we do business with our public. Those will be coming afterwards and the creation of a new sustainability body. The idea here is strengthening the way that the city of Portland does business. I just want to acknowledge this is part of the grander change we're all experiencing. To, again, look at the strengths and the opportunities when we evaluate these bodies. The reality was that the work scope just continued to get more substantial when it came to the climate issues. In truth, when the commission was formed twelve years ago, the strategy was sound at the time the planning commission was the strength of the city of Portland and we were trying to elevate the issue of climate. Today, as the issues continue to expand on each other with the resiliency needs of our city, the truth is one body cannot cover both systems. With that, we did an evaluation and came up with the results which is a planning commission and future sustainability commission. And the planning commission will continue to evaluate the lens of land use through a economic lens that will not stop. We'll just have a new entity that our city's experiencing both in mitigation and adaptation. I also want to take a moment to acknowledge and give a lot of credit to the commissioners on covering such a wide range of issues. The city of Portland continues to be a leader in planning and land use, and sustainability and that has a lot to do with the members that made up the psu over the past years. The last thing I want to acknowledge -- with that, I'd like to hand it over to the chief planner. To provide the items that you'll be taking action on today.

Speaker: Thank you. I'm going to call up the presentation and get started. Apologies for the delay. I think I should have been going. I'm the chief planner of the bureau of planning and sustainability. The project before you is a proposed zoning code amendment to dissolve the planning and sustainability commission and create the planning commission. The new planning commission will focus on

long-range land use planning while continuing to advance the wide-ranging policies in Portland's comprehensive plan including those related to sustainability. Land use planning and the arrangement and the distribution of uses and access to transit and mobile options contributes significantly to the city's sustainability and will continue to be the charge of the new planning commission. You heard some of the background. In 2010, the commission -- the planning commission of the city was combined with the multinomah county sustainable division and that union created the planning and sustainability commission as director olivera mentioned. There's been a significant amount of community involvement related to this project. To gather their perspectives. Numerous city bureaus, directors, staff, and city attorneys. This was in close collaboration of a small group which meant five times over the course of two months. Additional community involvement included getting feedback. Highlighting the project in bpscommunications and holding a public hearing. The current planning and sustainability commission plays an important role in the process. It holds hearings, takes testimony and publicly deliberates on land use plans, policies, and regulations that affect the growth and development of the city. The recommendations it makes to the City Council is part of the legislative process and ensures that these proposals have had public input and discussion prior to their coming to council. The proposed updated powers and duties ensure that the new planning commission will continue this important function. The amendments effect three policies in the plan and the zoning code chapter that is the review body's chapter of the zoning code. The proposed zoning code text amendments generally change the name of the commission to the planning commission and update and revise the planning commission's purpose, powers and duties to reflect land use focus and the changes again address the powers of the planning commission, the number of planning commissioners, and the powers

and duties. Among the things that the amendments do is reduce the number of commissioners from eleven to nine. The numbers were increased from nine to eleven in 2010. So the proposal is to go back to nine members. So the amended purpose statement in addition to specifying the purpose of the planning commission articulates the planning commission's commitment to centering climate and equity in its deliberations of land use plans and proposals as mentioned by commissioner Rubio and director Olivera. The powers and duties -- the amendments that specify the powers and duties to reflect the authority granted by the state and the zoning code as it relates to making recommendations on land use plans and policies and related topics. Some of the other amendments that this proposal involves are updates to the code related to conflicts of interest. To bring it into alignment with state law and to modernize the language deletes the code related to comments on appeals of quasi-judicial land use. Quasi -- judicial amendments. In summary, the planning and sustainability commission recommends that the comprehensive plan and zoning be amended as described in this presentation and the project's recommended draft. We want to give a quick overview or preview of next steps. So, in addition to code amendments, the council will be appointing the commissioners such as City Council hearing February 22nd to make those appointments. The recruitment has been under way and the recruitment period closed January 17th and the appointments will be at council as mentioned February 22nd with the objective of seating the new commission by March 1st. We already discussed the amendments. These -- this is the language that's being amended and that concludes the staff presentation. Staff is available for questions. Thank you.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you Tony and Patricia. Is there anyone signed up for public testimony?

Speaker: Commissioner, if I may interrupt, I would like to ask commissioner Rubio if she would consider modifying her amendment. What staff has identified that in the directives, it's very specific about which dated draft they're adopting. I would proepdz that in directives a, b, and c the words "as amended" be added to each of those directives. So if commissioner Rubio would be willing to identify that and ask that it be added to her amendment and then maybe you could re-second it, it would be great. Commissioner Rubio, does that make sense what I've stated?

Speaker: Commissioner Rubio: yes. So I will move that the addition that you just mentioned be add today my amendment.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: and I second that.

Speaker: Thank you. I appreciate your indulgence on that.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: no. Thank you. Now, can I ask if there's any public testimony?

Speaker: Clerk: we have two people signed up.

Speaker: Commissioner Rubio: great.

Speaker: Clerk: first up, we have mark lennahan.

Speaker: We do have an invited speaker, commissioner steph ralph if we can invite her.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: absolutely. Thank you for telling me?

Speaker: This is mark.

Speaker: Clerk: mark, we're going to pause on the public testimony and then we'll come back to you.

Speaker: Am I up?

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: yes. Welcome to -- this is the invited testimony from the bureau of planning and sustainability. Welcome to the meeting.

Speaker: Thank you.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: please state your name for the record.

Speaker: Absolutely. And thank you for your patience, mark. Mayor Wheeler, commissioner Rubio, and commissioner Gonzalez, Mapps, and Ryan. I have the honor of serving as I'm pretty sure your last chair of Portland's planning and sustainability commission. I'm joining you from the vista of psu's community and organizing change class. They will more than likely be come to go a dais on you. The planning and sustainability commission is pleased to offer its support for the planning commission code amendments project. The commission voted unanimously on November 22nd, 2022, to recommend adoption of the amendment that is will desolve the planning and sustainability commission and create the planning commission. I am grateful to be apart of this process that has called to question of how best to advance our city's goals of equity and sustainability and appreciate commissioner Rubio's statement that that work absolutely continues. It would be easy to simply continue the psc which was established 14 years ago in the office of sustainability and bureau of planning emerged. But some costs are not sufficient reasons to continue when a bet are way is possible. I'm grateful to commissioner Rubio and the staff. Franklin d. Roosevelt insisted on the importance of bold persistent experimentation in his 1932 address to oak I thorp university and I think it holds true here. Members of the City Council, it would be hard to state. The planning commission is set up to realize the benefit of incorporating the lessons we have learned for advancing equity and sustainability through planning to the best of its ability but there's no shortage of work to be done and we're eager to see that process move forward. It will take all of us to meet the moment of our overlapping climate and housing crises for starters. Today on twitter about city wide change, let's get to work! Thank you for I don't your time and consideration

and for any questions you may have. And if there are none, I'm going to go back to teaching this class.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you so much for your leadership. Now we'll go ahead and call the two people that signed up for testimony.

Speaker: Clerk: first up, we have mark henahan.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you.

Speaker: Caller: thank you. I'm connected mostly because I'm disappointed that this split is being done without simultaneously establishing the new sustainability commission. I think it makes Portland look like it doesn't care much about sustainability as it should even though that's claimed to be an ongoing concern for the planning commission and certainly for bps. I think it should be established as quickly as possible. I'm concerned also it may be weak in the sense of not having the kind of budget and staff that the psc currently has and so it won't be able to do its job as well as it should. And I'm also concerned that the planning commission has a responsibility in law at the state level and also in the city level. The sustainability commission will have no responsibility as such and will and certainly not be able to apply any requirements that the law brings up with regard to planning. So it seems to me the sustainability commission will be second class and I don't think that's where the city wants to be with this. So I would like to urge you to make sure you get the sustainability commission going soon, give it adequate staff and give it some level of not just responsibility but ability to actually apply its concerns or advice regarding sustainability in the future as opposed to simply being a second-hand commission that doesn't have any good job to do. So thank you.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you, mark.

Speaker: Clerk: next up, we have al burns.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: welcome, al. You have three minutes.

Speaker: Clerk: al, you're muted.

Speaker: Caller: I'm muted. Sorry. I will turn on the video too. I support the proposed ordinance. In order to be more effective I believe the commission scope needs to be narrowed to taking care of land use matters. They're sometimes mundane, but always important and the commission role as the keeper, the one that maintains, updates, and carries out the planning comprehensive plan through council recommendation is an important role. My only concern is that the role of the commission not be overly narrowed to a view that the commission's only job is to make adjustments to the city's zoning circumference. Much broader than that. And the planning commission was first established by city ordinance in December of 1918. And, first amended January of 1919 and then it was called the city planning commission and I'd like to offer that that's a better name than just planning commission because it emphasizes that this is a commission for the entire city that's not advisory to one bureau or one part of the city and in order to be comprehensive, the commission needs I address things. It might work well with the pending charter amendment which provides a more unified approach to the executive functions of the city. I've got several narrower points. They're small but possibly important. One of them is one of the code sections that talks about energy, economic, and social consequences. By doing that, it adopts three of the four factors that's required for any planning consideration under state planning too. The missing factor is energy. I don't know why it doesn't include. I think it would be a good idea to put it in so all four of the factors are identified in the code. I can't see the reason for just identifying three out of the four state factors. Other consciences and that's (bell dinging) -- other is five guiding principles to two. The current comprehensive plan includes prosperity, equity, and resilience. It's the -- by not quoting all five of the comprehensive plan guiding principles, it seems to

elevate two -- in conclusion, I would say that I would support the amendment made by commissioner Rubio to emphasize the commission advises the City Council. There's also a couple of glitches I've noticed in the curve. The ordinance should probably address the city's acknowledged community involvement program that contains twelve referrals to the planning and sustainability commission.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you, al. We have to wrap it up here.

Speaker: Caller: sure.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: all right. Thanks so much for your testimony.

Speaker: Caller: sure.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: that concludes our public testimony. Okay.

Colleagues, any questions? Any thoughts while we have commissioner Rubio here and the staff. Thanks for coming back up, patricia and donnie. No? You're good? Commissioner Rubio, any thoughts? Okay. So, now we move forward with -- we have to do the amendment, first, vote on that, correct? Is that what you suggest to do right now?

Speaker: Clerk: yes.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: thank you. Okay. So it has been moved and seconded. So, go ahead and please call the roll.

Speaker: Clerk: Rubio.

Speaker: Commissioner Rubio: I want to thank the testifiers who weighed in and as I mentioned before, we're taking this opportunity to reset and this is an exciting time. So I vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Gonzalez.

Speaker: Aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Mapps.

Speaker: Commissioner Mapps: aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Ryan.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: yes. Thank you for coming today. I voted on this 14 years ago. I appreciate the dialog today. I vote aye on the amendment. That moves on. Okay. Madam, please tell us what's next.

Speaker: So at this point, it would be good to acknowledge that the record, if you intend to to close the oral and written record and just move it on to the next reading.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: yes. We have closed the oral record and we will keep the written testimony open until...

Speaker: Clerk: I think you're closing both.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: we can close both today. Often we do one or the other. Both will be closed today? Official. Okay. That's done. All right. What other business do we do today? This goes on to when?

Speaker: Clerk: yeah. This will pass to second reading as amended.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: all right. So this will go on as amended to the second reading and that moves on to January 25th at time certain, 10:25 a.m. Correct?

Speaker: Clerk: that's correct.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: all right.

Speaker: Clerk: no. I'm sorry. It's 9:45 a.m.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: oh, okay.

Speaker: Clerk: is when it's going to return.

Speaker: Commissioner Ryan: so this is a first reading. It now moves on to a second reading which will be on January 25th at 9:45 a.m. Got it. I just had something different here. Okay. Thank you so much. That's it, right. All right. This meeting's adjourned. We'll see you tomorrow afternoon.

Portland City Council Meeting Closed Caption File

January 19, 2023

2:00 p.m.

This file was produced through the closed captioning process for the televised city Council broadcast and should not be considered a verbatim transcript. The official vote counts, motions, and names of speakers are included in the official minutes.

Speaker: Today is the 19th of January, 2023. Keelan, can you please call the roll?

Speaker: Clerk: good afternoon. [roll call]

Speaker: D. Ryan: mayor Wheeler is representing the city at the council of mayors conference in Washington, dc, so that's why they were not here today. Okay, will now hear from legal council on the rule of order and decorum.

Speaker: Welcome to the Portland City Council. City Council is holding hybrid readings in in-person attendance, in addition to electronic attendance. If you was to testify before council in person or virtually, you must sign up in advance by visiting the council agenda on the council clerk's webpage, www.Portland.gov/council/agenda. You may sign up for communications briefly speak about any subject. You may also sign up for public testimony on resolutions, reports, the first readings of ordinances. In person testimony may be submitted at cctestimony@PortlandOregon.gov. Your testimony should address the matter being considered at the time. When testifying, please state your name for the record. Your address is not necessary. Please disclose if you are a lobbyist. If you are representing a lobbyist, please identify it. For testifiers joining virtually, please unmute yourself once the council clerk calls your name. The providing officer preserves order and decorum so everyone can feel welcome, comforted, respected, and safe. The presiding officer determines the length of testimony. Individuals generally have three minutes to testify unless otherwise stated. A timer will indicate when you are done. Disruptive conduct, such as shouting, refusing to conclude your testimony when time is up, or

interrupting others testimony or council deliberations will not be allowed. If there are disruptions, a warning will be given that further disruptions may result in the person being ejected. After being ejected, a person who fails to leave the meeting is subject to arrest for trespass. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you. Colleagues, we have two time certain items today. Given the relationship between the items, we'll have the clerk call them together. Please call items 65 and 66.

Speaker: Clerk: on the proposed measures to voters and items 66, final reports account sale on the work of the 2020 charter commission.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, Keelan. Colleagues, the Portland city charter requires that at least once every 10 years City Council appoint commission to recommend and review changes to the charter. Over the past two years, the charter commission was deeply engaged in research and community engagement to shape recommendations to amendments to the city charter. Under city code, the auditors office is responsible for reporting to the council on the proposed measures to voters after we hear from auditor rede, we will hear from two former cochairs of the commission will provide a report on the conditions overall. Council will vote to accept the charter. A council does not vote on the auditors report. I will now turn this over to madame auditor rede, and welcome to the chamber as your first official meeting in 2023. Welcome

Speaker: Thank you, council president Ryan, and good afternoon, commissioners. My name is simone rede and I am city auditor and sixth elected official. -- which added article 3 to chapter 13. Which provided for periodic charter review. As council president Ryan mentioned, my office is responsible for reporting to City Council on the charter commission proposed changes to voters. The commission voted December 3, 2023, two civic charter amendments to voters on November, 2024 general election ballot. All commitments were supported by m and affirmative vote by 16 members. The amendments would take effect immediately upon adoption. Charter section 13 302 requires all amendments receiving at least 15 votes of commission members to be

submitted to the voters. The report submitted to council for this agenda item outlines the proposed measures to voters and provides a redline version of the charter sections proposed to be amended or deleted. I would like to note that there were a few typographical errors identified by the staff and I will be making certain changes to the report to correct them. Those include correcting references to subsection numbers in subsection 2105 and clarifying the subsection of subsection 206. I will also renumber 205 to clarify the new subsection is not a replacement. That said, there are five proposed measures to voters. Proposed measure one, deletes the prohibition of mandated the weatherization of structures before September 1, 1979. Proposed measure two creates an independent Portland elections commission. Proposed measure three deletes outdated, burdensome, and redundant requirements for franchise agreements. Proposed measure four deletes vague and archaic language. Roaming the streets and unreasonable hours, deletes vague and archaic language offensive businesses. Updates and makes consistent references to protected classes and relates disability with incapacity when referencing and elected officials inability to perform their duties. Finally, proposed measure five clarifies language to reflect the city's existing roles protect recreational and natural resources and to protect and manage water, sewage, and stormwater. After this meeting, my office will forward the measures to the city attorney's office to prepare the ballot titles and explanatory statements for the measures. My office will be responsible for filing the measures with the county to be placed on the November, 2024 general election ballots. We anticipate filing with the county close to the November, 2024 election deadline, which is early September, 2024. The measures are considered referred once the city auditor files and county election officials received the notice of measure election forms. The charter commission also prepared a report that summarizes its work. Exhibit a to both this report and the charter commissions item is the charter commission's ninth and final progress report. With us today are two former cochairs of the commission. Deborah puerta and -- final reports to council. I am going to take a seat, but on here to answer any questions and I understand that additional charter commissioners are also present. I will

now turn it over to commissioner puerta to begin the presentation

Speaker: Actually, I'm going to start.

Speaker: Okay. Commissioner kita.

Speaker: My name is barbara kita and I served as one of the most recent cochairs. We have a 25-30 minute presentation before we open it up for questions and discussions. To ground us, a city charter is a guiding document that establishes the government structure of the city. It functions as our city constitution. The charter requires that at least once every 10 years City Council appoints a commission to review and recommend changes to the charter. City Council appointed commission in December 2020 and we completed our work in December 2022. This image describes how the commission authority works. If 15 or more commissioners agree to a recommended change -- somebody changing the slides for us?

Speaker: Who has control of the slides?

Speaker: There we go. Thank you. If 15 or more commissioners agree to a regimen to change, those go directly to the ballot for Portlanders to vote on. If 11-14 members agree to a recommended change, and those recommendations go to City Council. City Council must decide whether to refer those regulations to the ballot at is, modify them, or do nothing. If only by a vote of Portlanders that the charter may be changed in summer of 2021 the charter commission decided to approach charter review in two phases. Meaning two reviews and two election cycles. The first phase focused on city government and method of electing city officials resulting in ballot measure 26 to 28 passed by Portland voters in November, 2022. The second phase begin at the summer and ended last month. Next slide.

Speaker: We all know the form required engaging neighborhoods, lived experiences, and backgrounds. The charter commission was commuted – recommended to a process to inform its decision-making and have an equitable, accessible, and transparent community engagement process. Throughout charter review a series of progress reports so Portlanders could follow our work. The ninth report was provided to council with this

agenda item. Partnered with almost 20 based organizations to support the design and implementation of community education, engagement activities to meaningfully engage Portlanders. You can see the engagements through the process. The commission had more than 100 public meetings. He hosted 28 community listening sessions with almost 800 attendees. Received almost 2000 public comments, including almost 20 hours of verbal public comment, and we had almost 4000 survey responses, and held over 30 briefings and presentations on charter review. I want to take this moment to thank that thousands of Portlanders who engaged in charter review. Thank you for taking our surveys, submitting testimony, reading our updates, joining our meetings at hearings, and most importantly, for sharing your lived experiences and commitment to our city. I also want to thank the council for investing in the charter review process. Particularly in dedication of resources and community education and engagement. In June, 2022, the charter commission voted with a super majority to change Portland city government to the November, 2022 ballot.

Speaker: Portlanders overwhelmingly lead with a vote of 58%-42%. The ballot measure will change the city government in significant ways allowing voters to rank candidates in order of their preference using ranked choice voting. You can go to the next slide. 4 geographic districts expanding the City Council to a total of 12 and a City Council that focuses on setting policy and a mayor elected citywide to run the city's day-to-day operations with help of a city administrator. It is the commission's belief that the voter approved charter amendment will make Portland's government more accountable, transparent, efficient and effective, responsive, and representative of every area of our city. Because voters passed the measure, the process to implement the will of the voters began immediately. The independent district commission will be appointed next week. The district map will be appointed by December, 2023. District-based elections using ranked choice voting will be in place for the November, 2024 election. A mayor and new City Council will enter office January 1, 2025, into the new governance rules and responsibilities. The charter commission is committed to an effective and efficient

transition to a new government. It is ultimately City Council's responsibility to implement the will of the voters while keeping true to the intent of the voter amendments. Successful implementation will be crucial for building trust -- should build on the robust public engagement started by the charter commission and continue to engage communities historically left out of city hall decision-making and partner with community-based organizations. City Council must invest in the resources and staff necessary to educate all Portlanders on the new form of government and method of electing new city leaders. As soon as the Portland charter commission completed its phase 1 recommendations, we moved into phase 2. Phase 2 included three focus areas, climate and environmental justice, mention of voting rights, and city bureau and office proposals. Phase 2 concluded last month with the commission voting to advance nine proposals to voters in November, 2024. The nine proposals directly referred to voters were all supported by a super majority 15 or more charter commissioners. Proposal one is to delete the prohibition on mandating the recession of structures built before September 1, 1979. This was initiated by the city's bureau of planning and sustainability. Currently, the city cannot mandate weatherization for any building built before September 1, 1979 unless council refers the weatherization to voters. This limit was added in 1980 via petition and passed with a 56% of the vote. The city will be able to move forward with long-standing climate and energy commitments, which called for Portland to reach communitywide carbon neutrality and eliminate fossil fuels entirely from transportation by 2050. The city budget office determined that there is no direct financial impact. Proposal two is to create an independent Portland elections commission. This proposal was initiated the city's small donors program. Currently, the Portland elections commission exists in Portland city code, which can be amended at any time by City Council. Under the -- would exist in the charter, which can only be amended by the affirmative vote of the majority of Portland voters. Authorizing the commission to implement public financing and other election programs in the charter helps insulate the public financing program from the real and perceived conflict of interest by elected

officials use the program to run for reelection. The city budget office determined that there is no direct financial impact. Proposal three is to delete outdated, burdensome, and outdated -- this was initiated by the city's office for community technology. Currently, City Council approves franchise agreements via ordinance by an outdated, burdensome, and redundant process that includes publication of the proposed franchise, frequently 20+ pages in length, in a local newspaper. Extended time between the first and second reading and requires the franchisee to sign the franchise and submit written acceptance of the franchise. Under the proposed event meant, City Council would approve using a process similar to that of other ordinances. The city budget office determined that there is no direct financial impact. Next slide. Proposal 4 is to delete vague and archaic language roaming the streets at unreasonable hours. This proposal was initiated by the bureau of development services. Currently, council may prohibit persons from roaming the streets at unreasonable hours. The section would be deleted in its entirety and the city budget office determined that there is no direct financial impact. Proposal five is to delete vague and archaic language, offensive businesses. This proposal was initiated by the bureau services. Currently, council may restrain and provide for the exclusion of businesses which are offensive and may constitute a nuisance. If reference -- the reference is vague and archaic. Council would retain authority to regulate, restrain, and provide for the exclusion of businesses which may create or constitute a nuisance. The city budget office determined there is no direct financial impact. Proposal six is to update and make consistent references to protected classes. This proposal was initiated by the office of equity and human rights and the city's bureau of develop mental services. Currently, the charter includes multiple references to protected classes, but always describes the protected classes differently. Under the proposed amendment, all references to protected classes would use the following updated and consistent language. Protected class under local ordinance or state or federal law. The city budget office determined. Is no direct financial impact. Proposal seven is to replace disability with incapacity when referencing elected officials inability to perform their duties. This

proposal was initiated by the city's office of equity and human rights. Currently, the word disability is used to describe situations where an elected official is unable to perform their duties. Under the proposed commitment, the word incapacity would be used in place of disability. An elected official can be or become disabled and still perform their duties. The city budget office determined there is no direct financial impact proposal eight is to clarify language to reflect the city's existing role to protect recreational and natural resources. This proposal was initiated by Portland parks and recreation. Currently, the description of the city's role to establish and protect recreational and natural areas was updated in 1966. The description of the city's role would be clarified and streamlined. The city's budget office determined that there is no direct financial impact. Puzzle nine is to clarify language to protect the city's existing role to protect water, sewage, and stormwater. This proposal was initiated the city's bureau of environmental services. Currently, the description of the city's role to protect the health of the environment by managing sewage and stormwater was last updated in 1966. Under the proposed amendment, the city's role would be clarified with language. The cities office determined there is no direct financial impact. The charter commission voted to refer it's nine proposals has five ballot measures. 4 of the proposals will be consolidated into one ballot measure because they all update outdated language. Two of the proposals will be consolidated because they clarify language. As a reminder, the commission can refer only in general elections, those in even-numbered years, and may choose between the may and November elections. The commission chose the November, 2024 elections because the electorate is large and more reflective of Portlanders city code sets the process for ballot -- after today's report to council, the attorney office drafts ballot statements. The officer will -- based on information from the city's elections office, the city elections official anticipates filing notice with the county near the filing deadline early September, 2024. This also triggers political activities restrictions. The city is responsible for educating Portlanders about the referred measures leading up to the November, 2024 election. The city should build off the voter

education campaign the city lead for ballot measure 26228, which included secretary of state approved educational materials and multiple language is, such as fact sheets, frequent asked questions, presentations, and mailers. Because all the referred proposals were shaded from city bureaus and offices, those bureaus and offices should help engage their constituents. The city should set aside funding for community based organizations to help educate Portlanders on the ballot measures. Finally, some of the ballot measures are more housekeeping in nature. Two measures of more substance, including deleting the prohibition on mandating whether structures built before September 1, 1979 and creating an independent Portland elections commission. More education should be devoted to those ballot measures. I'll now pass it to former commissioner cochair, deborah puerta, to continue the presentation.

Speaker: Thanks, brenda in addition to the proposals directly referred to potent voters, phase 2 concluded with the commission voting to advance six proposals as recognition to City Council. This is the first time during our charter review process that council has discretion over recommendations of the commission. If 11-14 commissioners agree to recommended change, then this recommendations go to City Council. City Council must decide with her to refer the bread of additions to the ballot as is, modify them, or to do nothing. We should note that when the commission voted on phase 2 proposals, there were three vacancies on the commission, leaving only 17 members. Our hope is that council ensures these proposals are considered through open public processes. Proposal one is to remove 5% cap on transient lodgings tax. This was initiated by the cities -- currently the city is limited to assessing a 5% tax on the amount paid for the privilege of occupancy or lodging in hotels, motels, and short-term rentals. Under the proposed amendment, the city would be able to assess a higher tax on transient lodging. It was set at a time where typical transient lodging tax rates were lower in Oregon and across the country. The city budget office determined that while there is no direct financial impact, the eminent may result in the city's ability to collect increased revenue. During the November, 2022 public comment period, we received 19 comments related to this

proposal, which is 11% of comments received. There is general opposition to the proposal suggesting the transient lodging tax cap should not be amended until the tourism industry recovers. They recommended this proposal to vote of 14-3. Proposal two. Is to create a charter article dedicated to environmental issues that includes environment justice as a core value of the city. Requires the city to assess the climate impacts of its decisions and to write to a clean and healthy environment. Currently, there is no language in the charter specific to environmental issues. Under the proposed amendment, one, environment of justice will become a core value of the city in addition to other core values adopted by the City Council. Two, the city will assess and actively manage the decline of fossil fuel use within its boundaries. Three, all residents will have a right to a clean and healthy environment. The city budget office interprets this proposal as requiring the city to provide a proactive climate assessment on all capital projects and major policy, land-use, and zoning changes the budget office estimates that the proposal will likely cost a minimum of \$14.4 million annually to implement. Funds would support staffing in all five major info section bureaus, staffing and the bureau of planning and sustainability, training support, and consultancy support. The budget office was unable to determine a methodology upon which to construct a potential high-end cost estimate in the time allowed. During the November, 2022 public comment period, we received 120 comments related to this proposal, which is 67% of comments received. There was overwhelming support for adding an environment article to the charter and a call for urgent and bold action. There were seven comments that did not express support or opposition, but noted the large cost of the proposal and vague language asking, for example, whether elected officials would be prevented from air travel. There was also significant support for revisions opposed 350 pdx, public employees act for climate emergency, or peace, and sunrise movement pdx. Requested revisions include strengthening the environment justice language, adding additional lens for climate assessments to environment all right and regenerative economy. Adding powers to the city to regulate waste, including air emissions as waste. Adding language that the fossil

fuel is not restricted to seismic resiliency improvements and adding language committing the city to protect Portland's natural systems. The commission voted to recommend this proposal with a vote of 13-2 with one abstention. Proposal three. To establish a meaningful public -- to establish meaningful public engagement as a core value of the city. Currently, the city must comply with Oregon public meetings and records law, but public engagement is not explicitly referenced in the charter. Under the proposed amendment, meaningful public engagement would become a core value of the city in addition to any other core values adopted by the City Council. The city budget office determined that there is no financial impact. During the November, 2022 -- there is general support for the proposal. Some comments requested that meaningful engagement shall be well defined and that the proposal shall have teeth to ensure impact. The commission voted to recommend this proposal with a vote of 11-5. Proposal 4 is to require the city to create by ordinance of participatory budget program open to all residents. Currently, the city has no participatory budget program. Under the proposed amendment, the city would need to create a participatory budget program where Portland residents would be responsible for allocating at least 1% of the city's general fund discretionary ongoing resources. It would be binding. The proposal would require the city to set aside 1% of the fund discretionary resource allocation of city bureaus and resources through a participatory budget process. Using the latest forecast information, a 1% general fund discretionary set aside beginning in fiscal year 2025/2026 would be \$7.5 million during the November, 2022 public comment period, we received 30 comments related to this proposal, which is 20% of comments received. There is general support for the proposal. Only one stated it would not add value to the charter and is likely to create problems. Several commenters suggested changing the resources allocated, including increasing to 1.2% of resources allocating at least \$1 million per 100,000 residents, or basing the allocation on other cities models, such as Seattle. The commission voted to recommend this proposal with a vote of 14-2. Proposal five is to expand the right to vote in city elections to the fullest extent allowed by law. Other than

the requirement to conduct periodic voter education campaigns, the proposed language mirrors the language proposed by the Multnomah County charter review. It was on the November ballot and not pass with a vote of 57%-53%. There were not significant campaigns on either side of the measure. Currently, state law reports that citizens that are 18 years of age or older are registered to vote. Under the proposed amendment, the city would be required to extend the right to vote, including to noncitizens, to the fullest extent of the law. This proposal would require the city to conduct periodic voter education campaign to familiarize voters with eligibility estimated to cost \$100,000 annually or \$200,000 per two election cycle. During November, 2022 public comment period, we received 20 comments, which is 20% of comments received. 13 comments were in opposition and seven were in support. Those opposing the proposal to not believe that noncitizens should have the right to vote. Those supporting the proposal believe it will lead to more democratic elections. The commission voted to recommend this proposal with a vote of 14-2. Finally, proposal 6, to create an office of the transparency advocate. The commission considered this proposal at its final meeting so the city attorney's office did not draft a brief initial narrative or red line and the city budget office did not prepare a financial impact statement. The red line on the slides was offered by community members and is meant as a starting point for City Council -- would create an office of the transparency advocate similar to the states office of the public records advocate. It would provide an in personal office readily available to the public that is authorized to safeguard the rights of the people to know about and participate in the government and provide high standards of efficiency, accountability in the provision of city services. Currently, the city has a -- in the auditors office who investigate complaints and ways to solve them. They investigate complaints related to openness and transparency, but is also responsible for other areas of investigation. The advocate would be singularly focused on transparency and everyone in the city could go to this advocate and be assisted with transparency issues. During the November, 2022 public comment period, we received 20 comments related to this proposal, which represents 83% of

comments received on proposals non-advanced for public comment. There was support in the auditors office modeled after the state of Oregon's -- the commission voted to recommend this proposal with a vote of 12 yes votes and 4 abstentions. With that, I will conclude with a review of the city's next steps. For the phase 1 transition, it is ultimately City Council's responsibility to implement the will of the voters while keeping true to the intent of the voter approved amendments. Successful implementation will be crucial for repairing and building trust with Portlanders. The city shall build on the robust public engagement starting with the charter commission and continue to engage committees historically left out of city hall decision-making and partner with community based organizations. City Council must invest in their resources and staff to educate all Portlanders on the new form of government and method for electing city leaders. For phase 2 puzzles refer to voters the city's or sponsor for educating Portlanders about the measures leading up to the November, 2024 election. This additional buildup of the voter education campaign the city lead for ballot measure 26 228. Which included secretary of state approved educational materials, such as fact sheets, frequent asked questions, presentations, and mailers. More education shall be devoted to the ballot measures that are substantive in nature. The city shall set aside funding for community-based -- finally, phase 2 proposals recommended City Council, council shall ensure the proposals are considered through open public processes. Thank you again for investing in the charter review process and a final thank you to Portlanders who engage with us over the past two years. That concludes our presentation and alternate over to the council president. B1 thank you, brenda and deborah. What I recall hearing is some of you need to leave earlier than listening to all of the public comment, correct? Because we have how many people signed up?

Speaker: Clerk: we have 47 people.

Speaker: D. Ryan: I heard a note that we should go ahead and ask questions prior to public comment. Is that correct? Okay. So I think that's where we're at, right? In the program? Usually we go directly to public comment now, but I just got that note from all

of you. So, you should be happy about all of this, right? Colleagues? Hello, commissioner Rubio. Thank you for that thorough report. It was very helpful. Anyone have any questions on what we just heard from this report? Commissioner Rubio. You good? I think we can just go ahead and move on into public comment. And we made some guidelines. Usually when we go over 20-30 we shave it down to two minutes, is that right? Those of you who are virtual, wrap up your thought. I think you have about 10-20 seconds before this very jarring muted thing happens, so please know that's the rules. If you're in the chamber, we'll have you wrap up your comment at two minutes and after about 10-20 seconds if you go over will ask you to stop. Fair? Keelan, go ahead and read the order.

Speaker: Clerk: thank you, president Ryan. I will call testifiers in groups of three. First up we have [listing name] and you all are welcome to go up and sit at the table if you want.

Speaker: D. Ryan: three at a time. Welcome. The mic is hot, so when you begin, timer will begin.

Speaker: Thank you. I am jim labbe. We worked since 2018 to bring participatory budget to Oregon. We started with the rosewood initiative that brought hope to people partially funded the city. Am here today to support the amendments that strengthen democracy and address climate change, but really to speak specifically to the budget that we worked with on the commission for over 18 months. We've given you materials. We talk to your staff some. We hope we can talk more about this proposal, I wanted to share a story I learned that spring when we were doing the form that really illustrates I think the positive impacts and benefits of participatory budgeting demonstrated around the world across the united states and across the coast. Portland is the only city not to have less process. It's a story of a group of people who come into the process in new york when it with first started and they had this idea to start a community garden in a local school and they get involved in the process they learn about a group of students at the school who are working. Their project is to put bathroom stalls, doors on the bathroom stalls of their bathrooms. They were out of repair and the students were using the bathroom. Basically

all day. This is what they needed and the people basically wanted the community garden shelved their project and got involved and got behind the students to install bathroom doors. And it was successful. It one in the voting phase and actually was and limited. The critical thing to understand about participatory funding is about delegating power to your constituents and letting them wrestle with what you wrestle with. Over a small portion of the budget. And in the process gain skill and knowledge and you get the ideas about and you hear from the people that you're not hearing from because they have reason to participate because they know this is a way they can affect change in their community. We really hope that you'll consider this and work with us. I don't think we have to do the minimum allocation. The boston proposal in 2021 that was a model for this. Please give it your consideration. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: I just want to be consistent with the people do it virtual cut off. Thanks.

Speaker: Good afternoon. I'm melanie billings-yun, a former member of the Portland commission. I'm speaking team today to express my concerns regarding the slow invitation of restructuring our cities election system and form of government. These changes to take effect in less than two years were resoundingly approved by 165,000 Portland voters, a 16 point electoral margin. Stressing accountability and transparency would be the government's top priorities. Prince chief admin strata officer announced that in one week applications would go out to eight transition advisory committee to engage with Portlanders and the city throughout the transition. Then silence. It was two days ago in two months after it was to be released that the application quietly appears, though without a council ordinance even with tight deadlines it will be months or more before this can begin work. Whether justified or not, this delay and the silence around it raise suspicions that are City Council lacks commitment and carrying out the will of the people. At minimum, they reflect a lack of urgency. I'm here today to urge you to move forward with concrete steps to increment the voter mandated changes to our cities government and election system and to keep your commitment to inform and involve

the community throughout this process. I understand that some of you oppose this amendment, but it is now our collective duty to honor the result of the election and to restore public trust by ensuring a smooth and open transition within the timeframe mandated by the charter. Put simply, there is no time to waste. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, melanie.

Speaker: Hello. I'm janice thompson were presenting the league of women voters of Portland. The league wholeheartedly supported the measure to 6228 and testifying today to highlight the strengths of the charter review commission and the importance of prompt and robust limitation of his work. The league commends the appropriate diversity of the charter commission and its commitment to transparency and extensive public engagement. The charter deadline for the independent district commission is on track to be met. More broadly, however, we are very concerned that the City Council is not approaching charter implementation with urgency and public input. The league has requested meetings with each of you to detail our thinking on what constitutes robust form invitation and to discuss the dynamics of the current work under the current, but outgoing system. Right now, we want to register the league's disappointment in the two-month delay in launching the government transition advisory committee. We greatly appreciated the hard-working transition teams timely preparation of last November's ordinance to establish this group and it should have been approved then. Appropriately, such a transition advisory group did not belong in the charter. However, such a group is needed to provide its own advice, but more important, facilitate broad education. An advisory committee is also vital to ensure full transparency of public and stakeholder input. Now, better late than never. Maybe a little bit more low-profile than would be desired. The transition advisory committee is getting off the ground. The league will be monitoring the cities work over the next two years and advocating to ensure timely and thorough implementation of the charter reforms adopted by poland voters. Thank you for your time.

Speaker: Clerk: I were next three testifiers are online. [listing names]

Speaker: Do I need to wait or shall I get started?

Speaker: Clerk: go ahead, debbie.

Speaker: Thank you so much. Good afternoon, city commissioners and mayor Wheeler. I am debbie kaye, president of the league of women voters input and. Join the society of professional journalists, aclu in Oregon, and open Oregon, encouraging you -- in the city charter. The applicant shall be housed in the auditor's office and were close with the city. The city of Portland adopted transparency as one of its core values in 2020. We feel, however, that has far to go in implementing this fundament of value. The trans- -- to assist city employees and with the authority to conduct investigations and issue reports will safeguard our access to information. As an organization that promotes active and informed participation in government, the league needs to fully understand issues before acting. There are times, however, when information that shall be public the information, unfortunate, is not. Last fall we were looking for background information related to a recent deliberation and noticed that no minutes had been posted for the previous 12 months. We followed up with an additional recommendation that they post agendas, meeting materials, and offer community members a link to sign up for meeting notifications. To be helpful, we also provided a copy of open Oregon's guide to public meetings law. The other items are still not available on the website. Transparency is important to the league as a matter of principle and as a practical matter. The availability of full and accurate information improves quality input that we and other community members provide to you, decision-makers, and other parts of government. A transparency advocate position embedded in the charter will ensure there is someone who appreciates the imports of access to information and can assist us in getting that access. Thank you for the opportunity to address this important topic with you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, debbie.

Speaker: Clerk: next up is shannon hiller-webb.

Speaker: Good afternoon, commissioners. My name is shannon hiller-webb and president of the -- association. I will each present part of our testimony. Our pronouns

are she/her. Our testimony is one of six proposals committed by the charter commission. The requirement that is city -- we are convinced that pb is a critical program for ensuring government accountability and transparency that voters continue to demand in Portland. We will share our experience holding accountable just one example for why we need participatory budget. On March 10, 20 -- to permanently cut city funding for neighborhoods. A district coalition known as sweeny. This was based on results of forensic audits at a cost to taxpayers to \$69,000, which found \$107,000 in city mismanagement and other financial loss of \$175,000 of investment that was adjudicated in court. This is a total of nearly -- lost to financial waste, fraud, abuse, and cost of audit. The audit also documents harassment and an attempt to silence anyone seeking transparency and accountability. Forensic auditors noted quote there was evidence those involved in sweeny have been attacked, demeaned, and felt unsafe and those instances were pathological and created a hostile and toxic culture. Had it been in place and time, equity is a key foundation centered in the process and decades long harassment of -- seeking accountability from sweeny. Sweeny also attempted to avoid public screening by refusing to turn over records. In June, 2020, civic life requested public records and sweeny responded with a demand of \$32,000 before they comply. Sweeny was contractually found to provide records for free and the city was the source of 80% annual funding for 40+ years. I let marie take over from here.

Speaker: I'm sorry. Can you hear me?

Speaker: D. Ryan: yes. Loud and clear. You still have two minutes as well.

Speaker: While the city was invest getting we filed a lawsuit asking the court to do declare sweeny -- subject to the public records law. In March 2022 the judge ordered sweeny to turn over records for transparency and accountability. The city ordinance approved that City Council also committed in section see the schedule of future council work sessions so council can work collaboratively on the larger issue of service provision to neighborhood associations and district coalitions to ensure equitable -- and long-standing issues as identified by this the auditor office. To our knowledge, this has not

been taken -- and we believe this can be satisfied by adopting participatory budgeting is a framework for community engagement. Sweeny is one example of the egregious toll on city resources needed to address issues of accountability and transparency. We could have all saved time and valuable resources. In 2019, our team of volunteers spent hundreds of hours document and concerns that a publicly funded organization with a mission to support community engagement with the city was engaging in exclusionary behavior. The decision to defend sweeny likely required hundreds of hours of staff. The office of the city attorney and the mayor's office, as well as the many residents who gave testimony at three separate hearings. This is an example of how we are already paying the cost of not having participatory budgeting in place. In conclusion, we urge you to send an amendment to voters even if it removes a minimum funding allocation. As a purported progressive city, it's regrettable that we are the only west coast city from la to Vancouver does not yet launched participatory budgeting. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, marie.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have [listing names]

Speaker: Can you hear me?

Speaker: D. Ryan: yes, k. We can hear you.

Speaker: Thank you for considering the charter of dates for review on item 66. In addition to being under, I'm here as vice president of the greater Oregon society of journalists. I'm here to speak on creating the office of transparency advocate after -- conducted by the city auditor as proposed coalition including aclu of Oregon, league of women voters of Oregon, and open Oregon. This takes the most substantive shift since its inception -- there will be increased turnover with no officials taking on new roles. More important, or centralized government can allow control of information at the extent of the public's right to know about their government. Forms of government often encounter failure to uphold the legislator intent. We feel strongly that Portland should avoid that pitfall. Transparency advocate would help ensure the public, the council, the mayor, and city administrator all are working with the same information to ensure the best decisions

are made given the voters in office is an important ***democrat extent to improving public trust and set up for success. The auditor charged with ensuring open and accountable government in which public information is available. For that reason, it's important -- thank you for your time.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have maria sipin.

Speaker: I have supported measure 26228 and the work of the charter commission. I may community organizer and board member for participatory budget Oregon working on youth voice youth vote for covid recovery projects. The first budget process in organ happening now in districts 24 and 25, which is east Portland, east Multnomah County. I also serve on the Portland clean energy fund committee. It gives the people power over only a portion of the budget and I support participatory budgeting in the Portland charter, along with other Portlanders who have been urging this in the last five years to take a major step in transparent decision-making. I urge City Council to refer charter amendment to voters. If boston can do it, and can, too. I'm proud of the city of Portland for leading the charge and sharing power with community members and now developing the climate investment fund. Pb citywide and city programs can continue -- pb is a way to and stressed -- prioritizing more response of climate, safety, and public works projects and engaging people in the process have been excluded or not is informed in the past. Bureaus across the city can apply it. I look forward to working with you on all this. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, maria.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have davis.

Speaker: I'm a director and healthy democracy, a democracy nonprofit based here in Portland, but working nationally. There is a crisis in democracy is a concept across the political spectrum across the united states and institutions at every level of government. Most of us don't see ourselves in our democracy. There's a chronic lack of representation at every scale. We also see government as an entity rather than as a tool we can all use and we don't see that her democratic systems trust us to make truly meaningful

contributions. We know of only two key game changing innovations that we believe are transformative on all three of these. One is what we do, is in place of everyday people selected by democratic lottery. The other is participatory budgeting. With the unique power of the purse. First, both of these bring new voices to the table like no other credit reform we know of. Second. These processes create spaces for unusually deep -- and engage in tough trade-offs. They reimagine government as a tool that we can all use. Finally, they build new mutual trust that's necessary for a thriving democratic system. Building trust in any relationship is a two-way street. No one can expect to receive trust and mistrust is also given. What's a better indicator of mutual trust and respect than dedicating dollars to everyday people. Thank you?.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have elexis moyer followed by chanda evans and ben stephenson. Elexis moyer? Doesn't look like they are here. Let's go to chanda evans.

Speaker: Good afternoon. My name is chanda evans. I'm here to advocate for participatory budgeting to be included in the city charter. Today I speak on behalf of pb Oregon and been an advocate for four years. Someone has participated in the pb process as a voter and delicate, I understand real impact that grassroots democracy can have any community. I hope that Portland will look to our sister cities have boston and new york city of success including pb and their charters. Pb can uplift and highlight what policymakers might not see and break down barriers with a focus on equity, inclusion, and access in education, arts and culture, climate justice, safety, and transportation. Pb includes opportunities to a lemonade struggles of some of our most vulnerable and marginalized people face and create a sense of belonging through active civic participation. Pb puts power in the hands of the people to affect real change based on community designs which bring us together to create a more viable and engaged process. Voters see the fruits of their labors through the entire pb process. I urge you to look at new york city and boston, whose residents overwhelmingly supported pb in their city charters. Real change is happening in the cities. Millions of residents are benefiting from pb. Portland, it's time to bring ab to the people. We cannot call ourselves

progressive without the voice of the people. Please vote in favor of including pb in the city charter. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have ben stevenson.

Speaker: D. Ryan: then, welcome. I don't think you were here but we have two minutes and wrap it up. If you were here at home he would be muted at two minutes. I won't take any of your time away.

Speaker: Thank you and good afternoon my commissioners. My name is ben stephenson. I'm a student and speaking on behalf of of the sunrise movement. I urge you to strengthen the climate commitment from proposal to and send it to voters. Sunrise shared our proposals to each of you. A tool you all need to meaningfully combat climate chaos. We have two requests. First, revise the fossil fuel phaseout to empower you to prevent fossil fuel expansion. In line with previous resolutions passed unanimously by this council, a strengthened puzzle two will protect Portland from lawsuits by fossil fuel corporations. You have the public and political backing to build a renewable economy, amend proposal to so you have the legal backing, too. Second, strengthen proposal to to stand up for environmental justice. Our climate commitment confirms affirmative obligations for you to truly remedy past harms and prevent future ones giving weight to 37289. While making environment of justice a core value is a start, you have the president and a moral imperative to affirm a proposal that protects Portlanders and prevents injustice. Commissioner Rubio, commissioner Mapps, commissioner Gonzalez, commissioner Ryan, follow the lead of your predecessors. Follow the lead of cities nationwide from houston to honolulu a little -- sees this opportunity to cement your legacy as climate champions and as an environment a leader. Strengthen the climate commitment. Send it to voters and pass participatory budgeting as well. My generation is watching and I'm 18 and many others are as well, so we'll be voting accordingly. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: things for being here.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have babs vanelli followed by chris palmer and eric lee.

Speaker: Hi.

Speaker: D. Ryan: go ahead, babs.

Speaker: My name is babs vanelli and I lived in Portland for 76 years. I'm passionate about saving the planet and that passion spans generations. The young man you just heard from is a senior in high school and I'm also a senior. I want to take you back for a moment to the 70s, the early stages of the environment will movement. Under the leadership of governor tom mccall, ben clark, Portland was a shining light in that movement culminating with the development of the light rail system in 1986. Fast forward to now. You all have an opportunity to let Portland be a shining light again. You all received emails last week from sunrise pdx from 350 pdx and from peace. All the information that you need within those emails. So I'm here to add my voice to encourage you to act. Finally, I want you to consider for a moment your legacy. Then just mentioned legacy. I want you specifically to think about the legacy that you want to pass on to your children, your grandchildren, and your great-grandchildren. I know in my heart and soul that your grandchildren will be so proud when they learn that you helped to save the planet for them to enjoy. Thank you all for the work you are doing.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have chris palmer.

Speaker: My name is chris palmer. From the volunteer manager for 350 pdx. The world is in climate emergency. I'm grateful taken a once in a decade opportunity to be able to better tackle this issue, namely in changing our city charter. I hope we can little further to make the best of this opportunity. 350 pdx, peace and city movement sent a letter to City Council last week with recommended proposals andaman men's and others here have elaborated more specifically on them. I wanted to come here and testify mainly to show my support and ask that you approve these changes, but also to share why I care about this issue. In the brooklyn neighborhood, a group of neighbors have started getting together so when disaster strikes, we are better prepared to take care of each other. Sheltering from smoke, heat, cold, power outages, and building community so we are more resilient in these emergency moments and moments in between. Efforts like this

can go a long way in a climate emergency, but what we need from you is to pass systemic changes so the city is better prepared to step up. That's one of the things that including environment of justice in every city decision will do. We don't have 10 more years to wait. People for 100 years will look back on the affected -- elected officials and marvel on how we turned the ship around and not despair.

Speaker: Clerk: asked up we have eric lee. His eric lee here. Let's move on to diane meisenhelter followed by guy berliner and matt stevenson.

Speaker: Diane meisenhelter with pdx. We are asking City Council to amend with binding language, specific binding language posed by sunrise and refer this to the voters. On a regular basis, I motormouth my way through countless organs and facts trying to appeal to reason in the face of the climate crisis within the allotted two minutes. Today, I want to appeal more to your hearts. You have loved ones care about. You care about the city, the world, and its people and you care about the legacy while juggling multiple crises and you hold strong personal values and attempt to do the right thing. Everything here is to pass this language the youth of our community who along with our most vulnerable populations would be the most affected by this decision. In your emergency declaration, you claimed you would follow the youth as one of the primary stakeholders. Time and again you have the right words on paper, but city actions are not happening at a rate and way to reach your own stated goals and what the climate science demands in this growing emergency. We all need this. We need it for our communities true health and safety for the economic transition that will create good jobs and clean energy and green info structure. We needed for accountability and climate justice. You need it for the same reasons and more. You need to take off some of the pressure. You need it as a buffer by special interests – back when special interests try to take things off course. Knowing it is binding, community groups and individuals can devote our energy toward working aside you in the task to create this critical transition and get us to where we need to be in the short timeframe facing us all. The metro building is an honor of my late husband and is our dedication there says it all. Know the right thing and do the right thing. At this point

in time we need your current to take this step, this right thing. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up, guy berliner.

Speaker: I'm here to echo the calls sunrise movement and others for participatory budgeting proposal to be included in phase 2 of the charter and for climate resiliency to be incorporated in the charter with concrete measures. In his essay, John Ruskin held up the example of the -- who was born rich but died penniless. After spending his fortune defending his country against repeated military plots by rich overgaard. His funeral honors were paid at -- not to be dishonorable at the higher low born. Although each of us can opt in favor of the federal glamour and public respectability, will tell the real story of what we've been up to even 10,000 years hence. The real question before us is whether we will opt -- real question is whether the outcome will relax their death grips in favor of the well-being of the majority of people, including all future generations. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have Matt Stevenson.

Speaker: Hello. I'm Matt Stevenson. I'm currently a student at Cleveland High School. First of all, I'd like to thank the city for past work and passed resolutions on addressing the climate crisis and I urge the city to pass a fossil fuel policy to add power and teeth to value and resolutions that would help move Portland toward phasing out fossil fuels and give the city power to move towards a clean renewable future. This is a tried and tested method that has worked in countless cities across America from New York to Boston to Houston and we know that this will be successful in Portland as well. It is essential that the City Council today refers a binding fossil fuel phaseout policy to voters as the climate crisis is here. We have already felt its impacts in Oregon from wildfires every year draping our values in cities and toxic smoke. I remember when family members of mine had to fear for their health and safety because of this toxic smoke. We know it because of drought in South Oregon. We know it because of abnormal natural disasters. We need more city action. We need this fossil fuel phaseout and we cannot wait 10 years. Cannot wait for this problem to continue to get worse. Furthermore, this policy has broad public support. Hundreds of comments were submitted in favor and three quarters of all

testimony to the city charter commission was in favor of this policy. Additionally, a letter was sent to the commission signed by over 10 organizations. We see that this policy is supported by Portlanders. I urge you to refer the binding fossil fuel phaseout to voters to give people a say on this issue to act now on the climate crisis and to give power to the values and resolutions the city already holds. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have myong o followed by jeff kleen and jenna kain.

Speaker: Hi, everyone. My name is myong o and I'm a mental health provider and sit on the board of my association. I've lived in Portland for over 20 years and I'm not normally someone who would choose to share my thoughts with a large group of people, but I'm told this is how hearts and minds are changed, so this is why I'm here. I know you've already received it in rhythm additions by organizations like sunrise and peace regarding changes to the city charters. I'd like to share why I think it is of months -- utmost importance that you prioritize climate justice and use it as a framework in every decision you make. As a person who immigrated to the us from korea and someone who has traveled extensively, I've always noticed how all of us humans are far more similar than different, despite what some want us to believe. We all feel happier and we can breathe clean air, eat something tasty, and hang out with people who help us feel like we belong and we all feel the same anger and fear when we see that the selfish and thoughtless actions of some leave us feeling unsafe. Now, more than ever, the choices we make here in our city will not only impact Oregonians, -- little to no agency over what happens to them, like children leaving now, and especially the children of the future. Remember that suffering feels the same for all of us. As an introvert, I was disappointed to realize my individual actions will never be enough to stop the climate crisis. We know that collectively we can have greater impact if we take swifter action. This is why I have begun gathering with my neighbors to create change together and as a way to remind ourselves that we are not alone. I ask you to be courageous and make choices that will allow us all to enjoy a livable planet. May we be safe, may we be healthy, may we be happy, may we live with means, may it be so. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have jeff kleen.

Speaker: Hi. Thanks for allowing me to testify. My name is jeff kleen and I live in southeast Portland. My full-time work addresses poverty and hunger through policy change. My volunteer time is spent on climate justice efforts in my neighborhood. My neighbors and I are learning about climate change and how to support each other all of the time, but especially during severe weather events and other emergencies. I've always been concerned about the environment, but quite frankly I was focused on ending poverty and hunger and raising two children. And thought others would take care of the climate. Now years later I've come to recognize that it's the responsibility of all of us to focus on climate change. That was really made painfully clear when we were stuck in our homes because of wildfire smoke in 2020 and when more than 70 people died during the summer heat dome in 2021. When temperatures reached 116° in Portland. 9° hotter than the previous record. 116 degrees. That caught my attention. Individual actions are great, in terms of their impact pale in comparison to the impact public policy can have. That's what motivates my professional work and what led me to testify today. I know you've received information from the 350 pdx, sunrise pdx, and peace about wreck amended changes to the city charter. I support those changes and urge you to send them to voters. I want to emphasize how critical this opportunity is and how important it is for you and every level of government to take all possible actions to support climate justice. The truth remains we must all act on behalf of every planet, ourselves, our children, and future generations. Time is running out. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up, we have jenna kain.

Speaker: Your honorable City Council members and city charter commissioners. My name is jenna kain and I'm a volunteer with 350 pdx. A group of us worked hard to include amendments to the version that was drafted by the city attorney's office that would ensure that the climate commitment would not only be a name, but actionable and accountable in addressing the climate crisis at the level and scale that is needed. The changes would give the city the power to hold industries available and unify the bureaus

to work toward the public good. A livable planet and protection of green spaces and expanding access to nature, especially for communities that have been adversely affected in the past. We have an opportunity before us that comes once every decade. The pressures that charter commission has had to fix innumerable problems that have been decades in the making is not lost on its advocates. That is why we are appealing to you, the City Council, to take this opportunity to revise and strengthen the proposed commitment with recommended changes and to add provisions to ensure participatory budgeting to address the most pressing concerns that we collectively face. Responding to the climate crisis gives an opportunity to the city to right wrongs and building a firm foundation that works for all of us. To that end, I recommend actionable and thoughtful provisions to strengthen the climate commitment, particularly through the work of 350 pdx, sunrise peace, and establishing a citywide participatory budgeting process. Establishing the office of transparency as well as establishing a meaningful public engagement and expanding the right to vote. The climate crisis is here and we are running out of time. It's not too late. There's things that we can do and we must do that. Thank you so much.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have virginia wiltshire gordon followed by dylan plumber and karol wai.

Speaker: Thank you. My name is virginia wiltshire gordon and I've lived and worked in Portland for the last six years. I'm here today to support climate justice and proposal for, participatory budgeting and ask that you refer both of these by strengthening them and refer them to voters. As a young person, I've grown up knowing that climate change which shape my future. I don't have the luxury of envisioning the future without the realities of heat waves in extreme cold, of flooding in fires and smoke. I know I don't have to explain the climate emergency to us council because you've been taking action, and also you live here. I know you felt impacts. This is an emergency and we have no time to waste. City Council has recently passed a number of resolutions that have been trying to take action on this climate emergency, and I appreciate that. We have a chance to build --

and including a fossil fuel phaseout. This is a chance to give force to the policy equipments that have other been made by you and supported by the community. Other cities are taking steps and we should join them. Cities like boston have environment or rights included in their charter. Houston has provisions that limit gas emissions. New york in 2021 committed to 100% decarbonization as a city. This is an opportunity for appointment to join the momentum in the emergency we are facing. The language should be an accountability and remedying -- environmental burdens, especially because of their identities. A fossil fuel phaseout allows policy and funding to be legally defensible. And I think I noticed on Portland's website and reclaim it action section it says right at the top, legacy of leadership. I encourage you to continue this legacy by strengthening the proposals and referring those to voters. Thank you very much.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have dylan plummer.

Speaker: Commissioner Mapps, Ryan, gonzales, and Rubio. Thank you for this opportunity to testify. On behalf of thousands supporters in Portland and tens of thousands across the city of Oregon, I urge you to amend fossil fuel language to prevent - - ensure that the city undertakes a decline of fossil fuels to net zero. Then please vote to refer this language likely to voters. Climate change is here right now. Our state is currently experiencing heat waves, wildfires, and floods and these will only worsen if we don't take action now. In the face of this crisis, it is critical for local governments to lead the charge to transition into renewable energy as fast as possible. Thankfully, other cities are doing just this and passing progressive policy in Oregon and around the country. The sierra club encourages to transition off of polluting fuels is a strong step to reducing emissions, and addressing disproportionate impacts of fossil fuels on -- and ensure decline of fossil fuels to net zero and refer this language likely to voters. Thank you for your consideration.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have karol wai. Carol, you are muted.

Speaker: Hello. Good evening. My name is karol wai. I am a first-generation burmese immigrant and graduate of the Portland state university's honors college and a lifelong

Oregonian. To even participate in this meeting today such an honor to me just considering that the voices of my immigrant and refugee community have historically been neglected and to go from being treated as an option on the menu through participatory budgeting like we can be seated with decision-makers at this table ourselves and not just through a medium is so empowering. I'm here to urge the council to refer a charter commitment to the voters that went make participatory budgeting is a permanent part in Portland. I'm also a member of the youth voice steering committee and I'm working with 11 other passionate youth from diverse backgrounds to design the first participatory budgeting process in Oregon. Through this work of not only got to learn about pb, but engage youth from historically marginalized communities to give input on what they would like to see in the places they live, learn, pray, or play in. It's been honored to share and made its way to orland -- to empower our youth with a real opportunity to make decisions in real time. What better way to empower the people in our city and to support a process and champion them. Youth voice youth vote is only the beginning. There is a need to institutionalize pb so all communities across Portland can make decisions about public dollars in ways that meet their needs. There's a lot of data, but I don't need research to tell me that. I've lived it and experienced it and participatory budgeting is a way to diversify democracy in our county. It's not here to replace councilors or anything. It's a way to be an extension of democracy in our communities and I'm so proud of that. Thank you so much.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have robin hahnel followed by karen wolfgang and mari hahn.

Speaker: D. Ryan: let's go ahead and do robin and take a five minute break.

Speaker: I'm professor emeritus in Washington dc and a visiting professor at lewis and clark Portland state and Oregon here in the past 16 years. My specialty is an economist for over 40 years has been how to make economic decision-making more democratic and participatory. I'm cocreator of an economic model known widely as a petition for tory economy, but I've also studied and worked with people who designed and implemented

participatory -- in brazil in the 1990s. I consulted in venezuela in 2006 and 2007 have newly created neighborhood assemblies can best carry out participatory budgeting there. As chief of staff for the president of the boston City Council, my son-in-law wrote the enabling legislation for their participatory budgeting legislation, so I'm well-informed about what's going on in boston where they are roughly 2 years of head -- ahead. I am delighted that Portland is considering embracing participatory budgeting. Portland has long been known for our citizens activism. But like young people in many us cities, young people are also demanding to become more involved in how the city spends its money. As a homeowner and taxpayer I know that more residents on greater accountability for how our property taxes are spent before we are willing to increase them. Participatory budgeting -- of both younger and older Portland residents. I urge you to launch that experiment here. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: five-minute break? Okay. [5 minute break]

Speaker: D. Ryan: this session is now back live. Thank you, Keelan, and thank you for your patience those who are testifying.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have karen wolfgang followed by mari hahn. Is karen here? No? Let's go to mari hahn.

Speaker: Neither. My name is mari hahn and I live in southeast Portland. I'm a volunteer with 350 pdx and I am in learning mode. I am learning how the heat wave in June, 2021 impacted people in lent much differently than my heavily treed neighborhood. I'm learning how last July a red oak tree one block from my house, my favorite tree to walk by with my dogs lost a huge limb and had to be taken down. The whole neighborhood lost power for two days and the cause? Extreme heat. I've only lived in Portland for two years. I moved here from indiana in late September, 2020. In fact, we had to delay remove date due to the devastating wildfires all over the west. And the smoke and horrific air quality. I wanted to live in a place where the climate crisis is taken seriously. I want to live in a place with old-growth forests. I want to live in a place where people value getting out in nature for an urban hike. I want to live where people are taking action on climate justice

issues. Portland is all of these things and I'm very grateful to be here at. We know this climate crisis is real and it is upon us. I encourage you to adopt the strongest and most actionable language we can to move forward into the future. The language changes – make changes proposed make this possible, and not just possible, but important and mandatory that Portland city government take the steps to lead us into the future with a healthy and vibrant city and people. This is a time to take action. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have emily harris followed by pat kaczmarek and heather ikeler.

Speaker: Hello, I'm emily harris. Open Oregon is a nonprofit with a single mission to help understand -- people, from all perspectives. Records professionals, journalists, technology experts, and so on. We joined with the aclu of Oregon and the society of professional journalists to propose an impartial and independent transparency advocate for Portland. We heard during charter commission testimony from a number of other supporters as well. We heard from environmental organizations plus a handful of people who are just tired of the city erring on the side of secrecy instead of on the side of openness. The overarching goal is to safeguard people's rights to access information about and participate in their government. With Portland transitioning to a new form of government, the advocacy can play an important role. We don't always stop to think about how building the kind of culture actually happens. It is forward thinking commitments like this that move government from stating transparency is a value to actually governing that way. Other cities, such as atlanta and toronto, found it also increased trust, which is vital for democracy to thrive. We are grateful the commission voted to move this forward and the language be fine-tuned before referring it on to voters. Since then, our coalition has learned the city auditor is to oversee the vetting so the council can refer it to voters. We appreciate your work on this. We appreciate the work of the charter commission and the willingness to make this proposal a reality. We believe it will benefit everyone important and happy to be a resource for all of you moving forward be a thank you so much.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, emily. Welcome from -- pat.

Speaker: My name is pat kaczmarek and I'm a 30 year resident of Portland and have been active in environmental protection and restoration organizations for many years. Portland has been a leader in forward thinking initiatives that reduce environmental damage. Examples include early and ongoing support for light rail, developing energy efficient buildings, and expanding bike lanes. To ensure that these efforts continue into an uncertain future, including climate protections and climate justice in our city charter, is crucial. We need to ensure that our charter goes further than stating that environmental justice is a core value. It needs to be a binding policy of the city of Portland to advance environmental justice to the greatest extent practicable and permitted by law. By 2026, the city must not only assess the climate impact of its decisions, but exert its authority to remedy those impacts. The city must state clearly that it has the authority to manage all manner of fossil fuels and actively undertake reductions and prevent the expansion of fossil fuel transport manufacture infrastructure storage and use to achieve net zero. The city must state clearly that it has and exercises its power to regulate waste, including solid, liquid, and air waste and all climate arming pollutants. The city must develop a participatory budgeting process that is inclusive of all community members to help decide how to spend city budget through binding decisions or vote that leads to government action. We cannot wait longer to implement significant change. The city must provide public education on the risks of climate change for both our adult population and in our schools. The city must encourage an active participation by citizens in conserving energy and reducing loss of fossil fuel.

Speaker: D. Ryan: without finish, pat? You were a little over time.

Speaker: I am. We need cohesive and ongoing leadership in the city of Portland to ensure we see solutions and implement actions to protect all we can.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have heather ikeler.

Speaker: Hello. My name is heather ikeler and I'm a volunteer with 350 pdx. Thank you

for allowing me to testify today. I'm in support of the letter that 350 pdx, sunrise, and peace sent to council regarding climate justice and resiliency measures. I moved to Portland in 1976. I went to high school and college and raise my son here. It's always felt come to me and I hope to continue living here the rest of my life in Portland. I like to express my gratitude to the charter commission who gave so much of their time, effort, and care and the Portlanders who voted to pass it. This work will go far toward making Portland city I can live into old age, we need to do more as a city and we need to do it now. The disastrous effects of climate change are happening in the present. 2021's heat dome provided a clear and frightening example of what we will dealing with in the decade to come. Phase 2 is meaningfully and vigorously address the effects of climate change and climate chaos. Again, thank you for the opportunity to submit testimony today.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have blanca gaytan farfan followed by caz swank and -- is blanca here? How about caz? Okay. Let's move on to kimber phillippo. Kimber, you are muted.

Speaker: Is that better?

Speaker: D. Ryan: yes. We can hear you, kimber.

Speaker: Good afternoon. My name is kimber phillippo. I'm a concerned resident and montessori primary teacher. The mother of four adult children and grandmother of two. My passion is advocating on behalf of all children. Originally from arizona, family and I have lived in the Portland area since 2003. I'm here today to urge you that the time is now to comprehensively address the earth's and city's most pressing issue, climate change, without leaving anybody behind. Environmental justice is the framework to meet this moment and correct systemic problems that worsen inequities. The climate change crisis is here. We have harmed and neglected our planet with little action to reverse the damage. Catastrophic weather due to global warming is now the norm. How many lives will be lost before we take the action necessary to make a difference going forward? I don't want my grown children, their children, or all future children to face a worse climate

crisis than what faces us today. We must take drastic actions now. Last spring, I became a 350 pdx.org volunteer. Brooklyn neighborhood residents meet regularly to be part of climate change and climate justice solutions. We get together to protect each other and advocate for action around climate change and climate justice. Our members feel a strong sense of urgency about these issues and I speak for all of us when we expect to see this emergency and limit in our city officials. To know we could've prevented these changes if we had acted years ago instead of waiting until it's almost too late is beyond troubling to me. The terrifying reality I have learned is that earth may survive our wrongs, it's habitants may not be so fortunate. What we need now is immediate action. Thank you for your time and consideration.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have [listing names]

Speaker: Hello. My name is -- and thank you for the work you are doing. I'm a member of the community in southwest Oregon and a member of 350 pdx. 350 pdx, sunrise pdx, and peace sent members to council last week with recommended proposals and amendments and today I wanted to testify to show my support and ask that you approve these changes and send them to voters. I care about these issues because we are currently in a climate crisis and we have growing fear each year from dangerous heat waves, ice storms, and increased wildfires. I know everyone in our community and throughout the world is afraid of what this means for our future, the truth is we are out of time for deliberation. We need to take action now. We need your help to pass systemic change so we are prepared to address these climate emergency. We need your help -- your positions on the City Council allow you the power to make these changes and move them forward. Each of you is in a pivotal moment of our city. With your help, we can move these important climate initiatives forward. I know it feels overwhelming, but each step we take is one in the right direction. We only have one home and we must act now. Thank you for your time.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have --

Speaker: I'm a volunteer with 350 pdx and participatory budgeting in Oregon. I'm here to

urge you to strengthen -- and to pass the climate and participatory budgeting to voters. In regards to strengthening the environment of justice language, that's part of proposal two, I want to know -- existing city regulations, including 37168 in 2014, 37289 in 2017, so all unanimously adopted with unanimous support. Why we care about this being in the charter specifically is a way of binding policy and we want the voters to make that happen. I hope you enact your leadership today giving the people of Portland and opportunity to vote on such things. I work in east Oregon and during the charter review process is Portlanders made up only 5% of the public comment or demographic despite making 24% of the region. Participatory budgeting was born out of the idea to fully engage people in decision-making and elevate the voices that are left out in spaces like the charter review. I hope today you can take a step to ensure eastpointe invoices are available. Much of my organizing recently has been -- popping up left and right in their homes. Companies warehouse after warehouse in the district suffers poor quality and childhood asthma. Imagine tomorrow you could save your supporters. I know so much of this is out of my control, but I'm doing to create a community we want to live in. If you can get excited about the idea of referring these amendments we look forward to seeing them on the 2024 ballot. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up is liam cassels.

Speaker: Commissioners. I name is liam cassels. I'm 18. I use he/him pronouns. I'm here to speak in support of proposal to adding climate commitment to city charter. Usually if I'm testifying or talking with officials or other organizers, I tell them about the bad things happening in Portland. The health effects of gas in homes and greenwashing. I tell him I'm terrified of my future. I'm not here to talk about that. Instead, I want to paint a version of the future. I want you to imagine with an electric transportation system that is faster than a car. I want you to imagine Portland with a green canopy across the city, powered on solar where you can and want to walk across the city. I want you to imagine a Portland with stretches apart across it, like waterfront park. A poland with an excess of green jobs, gardens, committed centers, and community-based disaster relief. A Portland that is

centered on its communities and its people. I talk about this Portland because it's the Portland I personally want to help create and I talk about this Portland now because as attorney as an organizer this is an opportunity to have billed it rather than the opposite. The alternative is scary. They smoke every summer and pollution primarily hurts our most vulnerable community members all of which will eventually hurt -- you have the power to choose differently. I want you to look me in the eyes and tell me you will protect my future because you can build that first future and the next step is to include a fossil fuel phaseout in the city charter. As an individual representing climate strike, I ask you strengthen proposal to include fossil fuel phaseout and refer to voters. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, liam.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have suhani kopolu followed by kristania de leon and mirabai peart.

Speaker: Hi, my name is suhani kopolu. I am 18 years old and a member of the Portland youth policy team. Growing up in the pacific northwest, the outdoors like my second home. I'd spend my summers hiking up wonderful trails and rivers. As I've gotten older, wildfires, which were previously infrequent, became an annual occurrence. Forests that had been through just years before -- it is heartbreaking to see my home in this state. Our forests shouldn't be burning. It shouldn't be a hazard to exit our house. People are dying because of heat because our leaders are not doing enough to combat climate change. The climate justice issue isn't going away. It is our responsibility to do more. To take action, to advocate, to hold corporations accountable, and to listen. And climate organizations have been speaking for years only to be ignored. We are fighting for our planet. Now is the time to take the time to listen to the community, to reduce the barriers associated with voting. They have to power -- the power to listen. Now is the time to realize we have things to say in the government is there to elevate our voices. Prioritize environment of justice when it comes -- to factor in the climate impact for every decision. The climate crisis isn't going away. Today I ask you to strengthen the climate commitment to include fossil fuel phaseout to refer to voters.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have kristania de leon.

Speaker: Afternoon. My name is kristania de leon. I serve as a coexecutive director and I'm here as a national content expert on pb as our constituents urge you to send pb charter amendments. In holding national perspective around pb, we are seeing incredible growth of pb across the united states. Along the west coast of the united states alone just in 2022, we supported active processes in los angeles, marin county, sacramento, Seattle, five unincorporated areas, and a whole range of means is the polities -- municipalities. Portland is no different when it comes to having everything needed to quality pb in your communities and is ahead of the curve and established present process in a benefiting of learning from and decide a network of municipalities and implementing pb as well. Where measures have been brought to voters in cities like boston and new york have been incredibly popular and passed with over two thirds voters in support. Furthermore, the example of boston, which is come up a couple of times, is notable. They introduced participatory budgeting as a youth focused process and are considering updated language to ensure all community members can participate. Success and popularity in building trust, transparency, and facilitate equitable decision-making and outcomes. We are seeing -- pushing them through City Councils and legislative bodies as a testament to how residents have advocated tirelessly for years to implement and protect their vision for pb. Portland has been exemplary. Not only in mobilizing support this eminent, but consistent calls for years to deepen, expand this process. Your community is ready for the democratic process of putting this to your voters as well. We highly support your leadership and urge you to strongly consider the demands.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have mirabai peart.

Speaker: Hello. My name is mirabai peart. I'm a board member of the neighborhood association in the lower socioeconomic area of southeast Portland. I'm here to show my support for the letter 350 pdx, sunrise pdx, and peace sent in consideration for the charter. Climate change is visibly altering our world. We are feeling the effects locally in

our daily lives. I'm originally from start -- australia just before moving support and I lost my dad in a bushfire. I had no idea. Since then being an avid cyclist, I've cycled through landscapes in this region substantively devastated by catastrophic fires that that are unrecognizable. Unbreakable forest fire smoke, ice storms, heat don't, I've become increasingly aware of the issues that stand out in my neighborhood. Those of public safety, infrastructure, housing, access -- to the various effects of climate change. I wholeheartedly support the language proposed by the letter for amendment consideration. It helps create a proposal that speaks to the huge challenges we face together today. It empowers us to more thoroughly do justice to all our communities, including the currently underserved, by steering us toward a resilient and equitable future. It helps for the city of Portland on the right side of history. Thank you for the opportunity to speak and your time.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have ahmed gaya followed by christopher huggins and tyler gilmore.

Speaker: Hello. My name is ahmed gaya. I'm a resident in the fern and neighborhood in northeast Portland. Like many folks, I'm here to speak in support of the environment of justice provisions on recommendations to council to be adopted and in support of the letter sent to council by 350 Portland, sunrise Portland, and peace. Unlike some folks here, I'm not originally to Portland. I came out here 12 years ago and did not time I felt a really deep connection to this place and last year I was privileged enough to buy a home here and I look forward to hopefully living the rest of my life in this city. When I think about the future and my family's future in Portland, the climate crisis is the thing that ways was heavily on my mind. The last few summers for innumerable folks in our city is made aware of how much it threatens our livability. For thousands of Portlanders, more folks than ever are getting involved in climate action. Responding by taking consideration of environmental justice and climate in every small Monday and decision we make in our lives. Talking to our neighbors about heat and fire or upgrading our appliance to testify about complicated and technical policy changes. His charter amendment would ask the

City Council to do exactly the same thing. To consider every one of the decisions you make over the next decade. It's not the most glamorous or sweeping action in one swoop, what it is a critical component to the work of tackling the crisis, of considering it in everything we do as we move forward and we don't have another decade to wait to do this. I encourage the council to take the recommendation seriously and adopt those.

Speaker: Clerk: next up, christopher huggins. Is christopher here? No. Let's move on to tyler gilmore.

Speaker: Hi. First of all, just thank you for the opportunity to testify. You all have very difficult and honorable jobs. Politics is how we organize ourselves as a community. I appreciate your daily work into thoughtfully organizing us. My name is tyler gilmore and I use he/him pronouns. I'm a volunteer coach team lead for the I lived in the Portland area and presently live in southwest Portland. I'm a trail runner, rock climber, music lover, and someone who loves this place we'll find ourselves in. I feel connected to our community simply by being alive. Snails, flowers, berries, ferns, fish, and our own cat and dog friends in our own homes. I'm here today to support the proposed amendments. Humans need to recognize that the earth will go on without us as it has for millions of years. This is an issue of human survival, not the planet. The conversations regarding the climate crisis no longer need to be future oriented. They are present. 60 Portlanders and 50 people across the northwest died during heatwave this June as we reached record-breaking temperatures of 106° with the majority of deaths clustered in low income and racially diverse neighborhoods. These consequences are not and will not be distributed equally and will happily fall on communities burden by unsafe or unstable housing and many other forms of environmental racism and injustice. On that note I wanted to say a quick thank you to commissioner Rubio for your work on urban forestry and I encourage you to continue involving your community and making a equitable as well. The work you've done is very much appreciated and I encourage you to include robust actionable and thoughtful provisions dedicated to environmental issues that includes environmental justice as a core value of the city. Everybody wants to live and your decision affects this.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have lynn handlin followed by jacob apenes and sandy chung. Lynn, you are muted.

Speaker: There we go. Sorry about that. I'm having some technical difficulties here. Okay. I'm lynn handlin. I'm with extension rebellion pdx. I'm here, like so many others, to ask you to amend the fossil fuel phaseout language in the proposal to prevent an expansion of fossil fuel infrastructure and to enhance -- oh, god. To ensure the city -- sorry. I'm really having a day here. Okay. Enhance the city to undertake a decline in fossil fuels to real zero, we need you to do this for real and right now the resolution you have, just, they are nice words, but they are not enforceable and it's time and well past time that we make the no new fossil fuel infrastructure resolution a reality in Portland. The nonbinding aspirational language input forward is unenforceable and in reality kind of useless I'm not sure why this language was chosen instead of something that's enforceable, but the weak language will not lead to real results. Honestly, it's just more greenwashing at this point, which is not what we need. I'm sure you didn't intend for that to be the case, but that's kind of the reality we have right now. We can't afford to wait 10 more years for the next charter review. It's going to be too late. We all know about climate change. We've experienced climate change and it impacts low income communities the worst were the lowest tree canopy is out where I work in east Portland. It's not fun. Seeing my daughter struggle to breathe and turning blue because of the wildfire smoke and wanting the trees die. It's time. It's time to act. You all know that and we need a binding fossil fuel note and no more weak unenforceable resolutions. No more waiting on an expecting the city and industries to do the right thing and act now. Unfortunately, the city has demonstrated their inability to take action. Just look at the expansion of zenith energy unimpeded and the city is trying to allow them to go five more years unimpeded we need clear enforceable language.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have sandy chung.

Speaker: Good afternoon, commissioners my name is sandy chung. My pronouns are she/her. We are nonpartisan nonprofit organization dedicated to the preservation and

enhancement of civil rights with more than 20,000 members statewide. Fundamentally we fight for a healthy and effective democracy. The council hearing today exemplifies democracy in action. People actively speaking and working on behalf of themselves, their community, and families in order to create a better world. We urge you to listen to and support the community members here today. We are asking you to support the charter changes that will support a healthy and effective democracy. On behalf of our partners and allies you spoken to today I'm here to -- aclu of Oregon has fought for greater transparency for a long time. For example, we brought the case where the Oregon supreme court concluded that the transparency of government operations is particularly significant when the information relates to operations, such as police department, that can result in violence and physical harm to people. We are hearing from Portland communities that there continue to be high levels of mistrust by community members for the city and Portland police bureau. Governance require moral authority and legitimacy of government and trust between the government and community. This will help community trust and will allow the community to work effectively with leaders and public bodies. We support the establishment of a transparency advocate. The city auditor is charged with ensuring access to public information, providing an open and accountable government, and under the proposal, housing the transparency advocate. We ask you to support the auditor's office engaging in refinement of the transparency advocate position so that this measure can go toward voters. If you have any questions, please feel free to reach out to us. Thank you.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, sandy.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have deian salazar followed by bonnie mckinlay and thomas

--

Speaker: Thank you. I am deian salazar he/him. I'm 22 years old, latino, autistic, high school graduate, and member of the youth force -- as well as commission on autism and many other organizations. I'm here today to urge you to refer directly to the voters. The proposed -- to establish and sustain pb as a new way of governing and budgeting in

Portland. Critical in revising democratic norms and injecting fresh blood into the democratic process. When we are reliant on candidate centered populism or crisis to inspire community service and involvement and -- pb is a process that showcases firsthand how this budget process is are formed and create a sense of longing -- belonging. It will inspire fresh young diverse leadership that will lead to revival of American value. Research in new york found that people eligible to vote were 70% more likely to vote in general election. This can be alternative to allow generous funding for infrastructure and public projects developed a local community themselves allowing self-governance. Pb combined with the boots on the ground and engagement opportunity allow people of color and youth projects on their own and approve them and if they make an error it allows them to learn how government works and inspire thoughtfulness allowing us to be better informed less susceptible to the dangers of -- hundreds of neighborhoods across the state gather for their annual pb program implementing projects -- this creates more bipartisanship and affordable living. That is a long way away, but a big step in that reality. Out of the darkness we face. We are requesting you to send this amendment to the voters. Over 66% of voters in boston, new york. Portland can and will do this. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have jacob apenes.

Speaker: Hello, Portland City Council. My name is jacob apenes. A member of the Portland committee for human rights in the philippines. Most important, I said important I whole life and I'm concerned these do not do enough to fully protect future, the future of Portland, and future generations. We have seen and felt the smoke from thousands of acres engulfed in flames. We know people who have died from the 2020 heat dome. We know that continued use of fossil fuels will amplify deadly droughts, wildfires, and floods. Because of this, the new language must include language to enjoy the city undertakes decline of fossil fuels to net zero. Once the eminent is updated to include fossil fuel phaseout language, the council should vote to refer directly to voters. This is our last chance to update the charter to include a commitment to outdate fossil fuels. Now is the

time to do something that will protect our future. Thank you for your time.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have bonnie mckinlay followed by thomas lannam.

Speaker: I'm bonnie mckinlay. Thank you for this opportunity to support this amendment calling for immediate action. As a parent and public school teacher, I emphasized the importance of taking responsibility. When we mess up, we apologize and fix the mess. When we see a problem, we deal. Talking today because we have for so long messed up. We have a planetwide climate problem and it certainly time to deal with it. Residents on this matter lacking this -- not much scientific background required. Just some simple memory of the mounting parade of climate triggered events. How charts work. Upward lines mean hotter. Reports are issued. Government representatives can meet at conference and slithered their way into these gatherings to perpetuate their contorted messages. Nine days ago, the new york times reported that nasa and noaa agree that the past eight years are the hardest on record. All respective evidence points to the fact that continued use of fossil fuels is a major cause of temperature rise. I urge you to set a model for the nation in designing carter language that is clearly defined and binding to stop the expansion of fossil fuels in Portland. Thank you.

Speaker: Clerk: next up we have thomas lannam.

Speaker: Good afternoon, City Council, and welcome, commissioner Gonzalez. On your deputy cfo and region director. I'd like to offer some brief remarks on recommended proposal number one to remove the 5% cap on the transient lodging tax. The bureau of financial services make this request to remove the 5% cap, otherwise known as the hotel motel taxes. We made this request for several reasons. It aligns the city code with current practices found in cities and includes only the broadest policy direction as befits a municipal charter. No other municipality we reviewed caps the hotel motel tax or any tax in their charter. Rates are universally governed municipal code. The city's charter does not cap any other taxpayer only the hotel motel tax. This cap was put in place in 1971 and is outdated. The City Council is elected for percentages of the city of Portland shall have the discretion to set tax rates by ordinance without amending the charter. I want to

emphasize that this request is not about increasing the hotel motel attacks. To my knowledge, there is no such proposal and revenue is not making that proposal today. This request is simply to remove the limitation that shall not reside. Revenue division recommends this proposal be referred to voters for consideration. Thank you for your consideration.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you, thomas.

Speaker: Clerk: that completes testimony.

Speaker: D. Ryan: all right. First of all, thank you to all those who testified. Especially those who came down to the council chambers. Thank you for your patience. It's great to be in person again. You know, it really does matter. It helps so much. You can allot females. The dense items sent to you, but it really helps when you have people show up and bring voice to it. It's appreciated by all of us. Before we go on to look at the reports, I want to do some clarification. We are going to look at report 66 looking to vote to accept that report, and then 65, what's the next step with that? I want to make sure legal council in full transparency communicate that to chamber.

Speaker: There is no action required to agenda item 65 and agenda item 66 there has been a request to vote to accept the report and those are just regulations made the charter commission to City Council.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thank you for clarifying. I really officiate that. Colleagues, any deliberation before we go on to the vote? Okay. Keelan, you are calling the role for report on item 66, correct?

Speaker: Clerk: first of all, one someone to make a motion.

Speaker: D. Ryan: i'll accept the report. Motion to accept the report.

Speaker: Second.

Speaker: Clerk: okay. [roll call]

Speaker: Are we voting now?

Speaker: D. Ryan: yes. 66.

Speaker: C. Rubio: I just want to thank everyone for taking time to speak to us on these

proposals. Just a few thoughts and I'll try to go through really quickly. I know it's been a long afternoon. What really resonated with me or one of the things I should say that resonated was the outlying desire outcomes aimed at strengthening democracy. These are strong statements and a crystallized what this work is all about. I want to lift that up and commend you for that. Also what resonates is that thoughtful -- not only to the ballot, but the ones we are hearing about today. In particular, I want to speak to one of the proposal that's been talked a lot about tonight and it's up for consideration. It's really compelling and important that in all the conversations we've had that climate justice was probably discussed at length by the commission, advocates, and members of the public testified. Some may or may not know, but I've been reassigned 4 bureaus that represent - - my focus is number one for business to get our priority efforts off the ground in that area within the remaining years and we are ready for government transition. Climate and environmental justice is at the core of that work. For some of you who don't know, we just hired a chief sustainability officer who had a significant role here and part of their job is to ensure that the city is meaningfully implementing climate and environmental justice policy as it relates to city business and will also be setting up a climate and sustainability initiative. Several actions, and specifically some of the ones we discussed or heard about today will be really central to their purpose and work over the coming year. This proposal has helped reinforce this for me and materially inform this work. More to come from exploration on this proposal and should we have more to share on any of these proposals we will reach back out. I also want to acknowledge what I'm hearing from some who testified today about concerns of transparency and lack of urgency. This is truly concerning to me and I want to really apologize if we had not done enough to externally convey this emergency because, truthfully, we all feel it on this and a number of issues connected and we as a city should always strive to do better and be responsive to community. I want to assure you as people and someone who truly aligned with all the expressed desires for inclusion, access, fully representational democracy, those of us who are charged with the work internally feel urgency to ensure we are optimized for this

transition, that it's successful, and a priority. Please know that we are committed to ensuring the city is moving expeditiously to implement the changes that were approved by voters and to do so thoughtfully, equitably, and transparency. I just thought it was important to acknowledge that and say we heard you and reaffirm our commitment to that. Thank you to all the charter commissioners for every minute of time and energy that went into these proposals and feedback and countless hours of meetings and the work over the last two years and to everyone who took the time to testify today. I vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: [roll call]

Speaker: M. Mapps: I'd just like to thank everybody who testified today. In addition, I really appreciate the presentation from the charter review commission. I look forward to learning more about them over the coming months. I'm glad to accept these reports and I vote aye.

Speaker: Clerk: Ryan.

Speaker: D. Ryan: thanks again for being here today. I heard the themes loud and clear. You will organized well, the climate pledge and participatory budgeting. Those are the two items I've been getting those communications about, so I want to thank all of you for showing up and I will be digging in further and I also want to again thank madam monitor for your presentation and with that I will just say I accept this report. Aye. Okay. Everyone, thanks for being here. That concludes our business today for afternoon session and this meeting is adjourned. [adjourned 4:25p.m.]