

City of Portland, Oregon Bureau of Development Services Land Use Services

STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION TO THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

CASE FILE:	LU 22-112912 HR
	PC # 21-113836
	17 th Avenue Apartments
REVIEW BY:	Historic Landmarks Commission
WHEN:	July 11, 2022 @ 1:30pm
REMOTE ACCESS:	Historic Landmarks Commission Agenda:
	https://www.portlandoregon.gov/bds/42441

This land use hearing will be limited to remote participation via Zoom. Please refer to the instructions included with this notice to observe and participate remotely.

Bureau of Development Services Staff: Arthur Graves 503-865-6517 / Arthur.Graves@portlandoregon.gov

GENERAL INFORMATION

Applicant/ Point of Contact:	Laura Standridge Standridge, Inc 703 Broadway #610 Vancouver, WA 98660 360.597.9240 <u>laura.standridge@standridgeinc.com</u>
Applicant:	Pam Verdadero Stanton Street Builders LLC PO Box 1297 Cannon Beach, OR 97110
Architect:	James Lawler Milbrandt Architects 25 Central Way, Ste 210 Kirkland, WA 98033
Owner:	Monte Shelton Shelton Properties LLC Po Box 5545 Portland OR 97228-5545
Site Address:	SW Corner of Intersection: NW 17^{th} Avenue and NW Couch Steet
Site Address: Legal Description: Tax Account No.: State ID No.: Quarter Section:	

Business District: District Coalition:	Pearl District Business Association, contact at info@explorethepearl.com, Nob Hill, contact Nob Hill at nobhillportland@gmail.com. Neighbors West/Northwest, contact at admin@nwnw.org
Plan District: Other Designations:	Central City (Plan District) - Goose Hollow (Sub-District) Non-Contributing Resource in the Alphabet Historic District, listed in the National Register of Historic Places on November 16, 2000.
Zoning:	CXd: Central Commercial (CX) Base Zone, Design (d) Overlay, and Historic Resource Review Overlay
Case Type:	HR: Historic Resource Review
Procedure:	Type III, with a public hearing before the Landmarks Commission. The decision of the Landmarks Commission can be appealed to City Council.

Proposal:

Type III Historic Resource Review for a new 5-story, 19-unit apartment building on the site of a non-contributing surface parking lot in the Alphabet Historic District. Ground floor programming includes, residential units, bike parking, trash room, and residential lounge. Materials include: "cast stone veneer" base, brick veneer on stories 2-5, and aluminum clad wood windows. No parking is proposed.

The proposal includes non-exempt development within the Alphabet Historic District therefore prompting Historic Resource Review prior to the issuance of building permits.

Relevant Approval Criteria:

In order to be approved, this proposal must comply with the approval criteria of Title 33. The relevant approval criteria are:

- The Central City Fundamental Design Guidelines.
- The Goose Hollow District Design Guidelines.
- Historic Alphabet District: Community Design Guidelines Addendum.

ANALYSIS

Site and Vicinity: The site is a 5,000 square foot lot with street frontage onto NW Couch and NW 17th Avenue. It is located in both the Alphabet Historic District and at the edge of the Central City Plan District and goose Hollow subdistrict, located northwest of the downtown Portland core area. It is currently a paved vacant lot. To its immediate west is a multi-dwelling building, which is a contributing structure in the Alphabet Historic District. The buildings on the south half of the block, backing up to the site, are of commercial use. Across NW Couch is St. Mary's Cathedral and its associated School. To the east, across NW 17th Avenue is a surface parking lot serving a car rental company and a one-story auto mobile service business. The Alphabet Historic District is an area of Portland significant for its concentration of intact late 19th and early 20th Century, mostly middle class, housing stock and smallscale commercial buildings. Of special note are the many mid-sized apartment and institutional buildings. Many of these are in the various Period Revival styles, e.g. Tudor, Spanish Colonial, Byzantine, Jacobean, etc. and this is especially the case in the immediate vicinity of the proposed new development. The area is characterized by a grid of narrower, more treelined, east-west residential streets, named alphabetically after prominent Portlanders of the day, which are crossed by generally more robust northsouth avenues. Two of these, NW 21st Avenue and NW 23rd Avenue are low-scale

business corridors featuring a mix of purpose-built commercial structures and converted houses.

Zoning:

The <u>Central Commercial</u> (CX) zone is intended to provide for commercial development within Portland's most urban and intense areas. A broad range of uses is allowed to reflect Portland's role as a commercial, cultural and governmental center. Development is intended to be very intense with high building coverage, large buildings, and buildings placed close together. Development is intended to be pedestrian-oriented with a strong emphasis on a safe and attractive streetscape.

The <u>Design overlay zone</u> ensures that Portland is both a city designed for people and a city in harmony with nature. The Design overlay zone supports the city's evolution within current and emerging centers of civic life. The overlay promotes design excellence in the built environment through the application of additional design standards and design guidelines that:

- Build on context by enhancing the distinctive physical, natural, historic and cultural qualities of the location while accommodating growth and change;
- Contribute to a public realm that encourages social interaction and fosters inclusivity in people's daily experience; and
- Promotes quality and long-term resilience in the face of changing demographics, climate and economy.

The <u>Historic Resource Protection</u> overlay is comprised of Historic and Conservation Districts, as well as Historic and Conservation Landmarks and protects certain historic resources in the region and preserves significant parts of the region's heritage. The regulations implement Portland's Comprehensive Plan policies that address historic preservation. These policies recognize the role historic resources have in promoting the education and enjoyment of those living in and visiting the region. The regulations foster pride among the region's citizens in their city and its heritage. Historic preservation beautifies the city, promotes the city's economic health, and helps to preserve and enhance the value of historic properties.

Land Use History: City records indicate there are no prior land use reviews for this site.

Agency Review: A "Notice of proposal in Your Neighborhood" was mailed **April 19, 2022**. The following Bureaus have responded with no issue or concerns:

- <u>Portland Bureau of Transportation</u>: Fabio de Freitas: April 13, 2022. (Exhibit E-1). With no objections to the proposal.
- <u>Portland Water Bureau</u>: Michael Puckett: April 22, 2022. (Exhibit E-2). With no concerns.
- <u>Parks Bureau, Urban Forestry</u>: Mariano Masolo: April 26, 2022. (Exhibit E-3). With no objections to the proposal.
- <u>Bureau of Development Services Life Safety / Building Code Section</u>: Chanel Horn: April 26, 2022. (Exhibit E-4). With no objections to the proposal.
- Fire Bureaus: Dawn Krantz, April 26, 2022. (Exhibit E-5). With no concerns.

- <u>Bureau of Environmental Services</u>: Ella Indarta: April 26, 2022. (Exhibit E-6). With no objects to approval of the Historic Resource review.
- <u>Bureau of Development Services Site Development</u>: Jed Stoken: April 26, 2022. With no concerns. (Exhibit E-7).

Neighborhood Review: A Notice of Proposal in Your Neighborhood was mailed on **June 17, 2022**.

No written responses have been received from either the Neighborhood Association or notified property owners in response to the proposal.

PROCEDURAL HISTORY

- Early Assistance Pre-Application Conference (PC): EA 21-113836 PC: January 06, 2022.
- <u>Land Use Application LU 21-111639 HRM: Submitted on February 14,</u> 2022:

Deemed complete on March 25, 2022. A hearing with the Historic Landmarks Commission was scheduled for May 09, 2022.

- <u>Hearing Initially Scheduled May 09, 2022</u>: Re-scheduled by the applicant for June 27, 2022.
- <u>Hearing Re-Scheduled June 27, 2022</u>: Re-scheduled due to lack of Commission quorum. Re-scheduled for July 11, 2022.

ZONING CODE APPROVAL CRITERIA

Chapter 33.846.060 - Historic Resource Review

Purpose of Historic Resource Review

Historic Resource Review ensures the conservation and enhancement of the special characteristics of historic resources.

Historic Resource Review Approval Criteria

Requests for Historic Resource Review will be approved if the review body finds the applicant has shown that all of the approval criteria have been met.

Findings: The site is located within the Alphabet Historic District and the proposal is for a non-exempt treatment. Therefore Historic Resource Review approval is required. The approval criteria are the *Historic Alphabet District Community Design Guidelines Addendum*. Because the site is within the Central City Plan District the *Central City Fundamental Design Guidelines* are also approval criteria.

Staff has considered all guidelines and addressed only those applicable to this proposal.

33.846.060 G - Other Approval Criteria

Historic Alphabet District - Community Design Guidelines Addendum

1. Historic Changes. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance will be preserved.

Findings: The existing site is a non-contributing surface parking lot in the Alphabet Historic District and so there are no aspects of the site that have acquired historic significance to be preserved.

Therefore, this criterion does not apply.

2. Differentiate New from Old. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will retain historic materials that characterize a property to the extent practicable. Replacement materials should be reasonable facsimiles of the historic materials they replace. The design of new construction will be compatible with the historic qualities of the district as identified in the Historic Context Statement.
3. Hierarchy of Compatibility. Exterior alterations and additions will be designed to be compatible primarily with the original resource, secondarily with adjacent properties, and finally, if located within a historic or conservation district, with the rest of the District. Where practical, compatibility will be pursued on all three levels. New development will seek to incorporate design themes characteristic of similar buildings in the Historic Alphabet District.

Findings: The proposed new building is designed to be in keeping with the historic character of the Alphabet Historic District with its use of a brick exterior with distinct stone base, quoining and brick detailing, a symmetrical front façade with prominent canopied entrance, regular fenestration with paired and individual hung sash windows, decorative frieze band, regular fenestration patterns, and projecting metal balconies. The proposal also includes some modest landscaping at the front and along the interior lot lines which is common in the district. The introduction of a new multi-dwelling residential building with such features on an infill vacant lot is compatible with the historic qualities of the Alphabet Historic District which is significant for its abundance of historic apartment buildings. While the new building is designed to blend in with the historic buildings in the district, it will be differentiated through its contemporary materials and engineering. *These guidelines are met.*

<u>Goose Hollow District Design Guidelines and Central City Fundamental Design</u> <u>Guidelines</u>

The Goose Hollow District is envisioned to be a predominantly urban residential, transit-oriented community located on the western edge of the Central City between Washington Park and Downtown Portland. When riding light rail through the West Hills tunnel to the Central City, it is the first neighborhood experienced before entering downtown Portland. The Urban Design Vision celebrates the sense of arrival from the west at Jefferson Street Station and Collins Circle, and from the north at the Civic Stadium Station and Fire Fighter's Park. This is done by integrating the history of the community with its special natural and formal (man-made) characteristics.

The Central City Fundamental Design Guidelines and the River District Design Guidelines focus on four general categories. **(A) Portland Personality,** addresses design issues and elements that reinforce and enhance Portland's character. **(B) Pedestrian Emphasis,** addresses design issues and elements that contribute to a successful pedestrian environment. **(C) Project Design,** addresses specific building characteristics and their relationships to the public environment. **(D) Special Areas,** provides design guidelines for the four special areas of the Central City.

Goose Hollow District Design Goals

The Goose Hollow District Design Goals are specific to the Goose Hollow District. These urban design goals and objectives are to:

- Enhance mixed-use, transit-oriented development around the light rail stations to make it a pedestrian-friendly station community.
- Provide open spaces to accommodate active public life.
- Strengthen connections to adjacent neighborhoods through light rail, bike and pedestrian access and assure a safe and pleasant bike/pedestrian environment.
- Preserve and enhance the community's history and architectural character.

Central City Plan Design Goals

This set of goals are those developed to guide development throughout the Central City. They apply within the River District as well as to the other seven Central City policy areas. The nine goals for design review within the Central City are as follows:

- **1.** Encourage urban design excellence in the Central City;
- **2.** Integrate urban design and preservation of our heritage into the development process;
- **3.** Enhance the character of the Central City's districts;
- **4.** Promote the development of diversity and areas of special character within the Central City;
- **5.** Establish an urban design relationship between the Central City's districts and the Central City as a whole;
- **6.** Provide for a pleasant, rich and diverse pedestrian experience for pedestrians;
- **7.** Provide for the humanization of the Central City through promotion of the arts;
- **8.** Assist in creating a 24-hour Central City which is safe, humane and prosperous;
- **9.** Ensure that new development is at a human scale and that it relates to the scale and desired character of its setting and the Central City as a whole.

Staff has considered all guidelines and has addressed only those guidelines considered applicable to this project.

A1. Integrate the River. Orient architectural and landscape elements including, but not limited to, lobbies, entries, balconies, terraces, and outdoor areas to the Willamette River and greenway. Develop accessways for pedestrians that provide connections to the Willamette River and greenway.

Findings:

The site is approximately seventeen blocks removed from the Willamette River to the east. Although windows and balconies are provided in the eastfacing units, buildings in between block visibility of the river; nonetheless the balconies provide enhanced views east toward the river. *Therefore, this guideline is met.*

- **A2. Emphasize Portland Themes.** When provided, integrate Portland-related themes with the development's overall design concept.
- **A2-1. Recognize the Historic Tanner Creek Theme**. Recognize the course of the historic Tanner Creek and emphasize the District's connection with the Creek on site developments of 20,000 square feet or more, including and immediately adjacent to the historic course of the Creek. This guideline may be accomplished by any or all of the following:
 - a) Exposing the Creek using water features and fountains; or
 - b) Incorporating interpretive trails, artwork, murals or sculptures that describe and symbolize the relation between the district and the history of Tanner Creek.

Findings for A2 and A2-1: Although the site is in the Goose Hollow Sub-

district, the site is not immediately adjacent to Tanner Creek which historically ran approximately two blocks south and one block east of the subject property. *Therefore, this guideline does not apply.*

- **A3. Respect the Portland Block Structures.** Maintain and extend the traditional 200-foot block pattern to preserve the Central City's ratio of open space to built space. Where superblock exist, locate public and/or private rights-of-way in a manner that reflects the 200-foot block pattern, and include landscaping and seating to enhance the pedestrian environment.
- **A7. Establish and Maintain a Sense of Urban Enclosure.** Define public rights-ofway by creating and maintaining a sense of urban enclosure.
- **C3-1.** Locate Buildings to Provide for Future Infill on Surface Parking Areas. Locate and shape buildings to provide for future infill development on surface parking areas.

Findings for A3, A7, and C3-1: The proposal will replace an asphalt-paved surface parking lot at the corner of the block with a new 19-unit brick-clad apartment building, strengthening this corner and providing more definition to the overall block structure. Additionally, this site is located at the eastern edge of the Alphabet Historic District and the northern edge of the Central City Plan District; therefore, infilling this vacant parcel with a new 5-story building strengthens both of these urban districts and provides a stronger sense of urban enclosure at the transition of these districts. *These guidelines are met.*

- **A4. Use Unifying Elements.** Integrate unifying elements and/or develop new features that help unify and connect individual buildings and different areas.
- **A5.** Enhance, Embellish, and Identify Areas. Enhance an area by reflecting the local character within the right-of-way. Embellish an area by integrating elements in new development that build on the area's character. Identify an area's special features or qualities by integrating them into new development.

Findings for A4 and A5: There are no non-standard improvements in the right-of-way included in this proposal. However, the proposed building does feature some elements to help unify it with the Alphabet Historic District as well as the Goose Hollow subdistrict. Both of these areas have an abundance of vintage brick apartment buildings that feature similar characteristics as the proposed building. These features include: a symmetrical front façade with prominent entry, brick cladding on top of a distinct stone base, quoining and brick detailing, decorative frieze band, regular fenestration patterns with paired and individual hung sash windows, and projecting metal balconies. *These guidelines are met.*

- **A5-1.** Strengthen the Identity of the Civic Stadium Station Area. This guideline may be accomplished by any or all of the following:
 - a) Integrating the Civic Stadium and Multnomah Athletic Club into the station area. This can be done by making their ground level street walls more pedestrian-friendly.
 - b) Incorporating the history of the Stadium and Tanner Creek in the form of art work, murals, and other design features.
 - c) Strengthening the neighborhood focal point located within the station area. Street trees, awnings, lighting and other amenities can emphasize pedestrian connections to the focal point (the Park, Plaza/Station). Buildings can orient their openings and entries towards the focal point to create a sense of enclosure and enhance the sense of entry into the District.

d) Using architectural vocabulary and materials that maintain continuity with the existing developments and add to the character of the station area.

Findings: The proposed site is north of the mentioned focal points and unique amenities found in the Civic Stadium Station Area. In addition, the proposed building's orientation is to the north and so the focus of the building is more to the Alphabet Historic District than the Goose Hollow Sub-District. However, the building's clear rectangular tripartite form and red brick cladding are reminiscent of older residential buildings near the Stadium while the proposed balconies are representative of features on newer residential buildings. *This guideline is met.*

- **A5-2.** Strengthen the Identity of the Jefferson Street Station Area. This guideline may be accomplished by any or all of the following:
 - a) Integrating Lincoln High School and the First United Methodist Church into the Jefferson Street Station area by providing pedestrian-friendly treatment along the surrounding streets. Streets lacking the pedestrian-friendly treatment of the light rail alignment can use elements such as street trees, landscaping, street furniture, art work, awnings, seating, special lighting and textured paving to improve the pedestrian environment;
 - b) Recognizing the historic "Goose" theme and incorporating it in projects within the station area, where appropriate, in the form of art work, symbols or other design features;
 - c) Strengthening the neighborhood focal point located in the station area. Arcades, awnings and/or balconies can provide pedestrian scale along all developments facing the Circle and can enhance pedestrian access to the Circle. To emphasize the Circle's importance as a focal point adjacent development can orient their entrances and ground level windows towards the Circle and garage entries can be avoided on the streets fronting it where feasible;
 - d) Orienting buildings around the public plaza to create an enclosed public place and providing seating and other amenities to ensure safety and convenient pedestrian access; or
 - e) Using architectural vocabulary and materials that maintain continuity with existing developments and add to the character of the station area.

Findings: The subject property is not located within the Jefferson Street Station Area. *Therefore, this guideline does not apply.*

- **A5-3. Enhance West Burnside Street**. Enhance West Burnside Street as a boulevard by extending and improving its boulevard treatment and its environment for pedestrians west of the Park Blocks. This guideline may be accomplished by any or all of the following:
 - a) Buffering and separating the sidewalk from vehicular traffic by introducing street trees, plantings and protective bollards;
 - b) Enhancing the pedestrian promenade along Burnside and making it a linear focus for safe pedestrian activity by widening the space used by pedestrians and locating sidewalk cafes and food vendors in the wider pedestrian space;
 - c) Maintaining visual contact and surveillance between the inside of buildings and the adjacent public right-of-way space of West Burnside Street;
 - d) Punctuating ground floors of buildings with many destination points such as entries for pedestrians and display windows;
 - e) Locating driveways and garage entrances on side streets where feasible, rather than crossing sidewalks along West Burnside; or
 - f) Providing pedestrian scale to buildings fronting the street by using awnings

and/or balconies along the street.

Findings: The subject property is not located adjacent to West Burnside. While the rear portion of the property is within 100' of the West Burnside right-of-way, the building's orientation is to the north and the bulk of the building is shifted to the north property line as the side street (NW 17th) is significantly sloped. Locating the primary pedestrian entrance allows the building to be more compatible with historic buildings in the area and within the Alphabet Historic District. Balconies are proposed on the east and west façades which may provide some limited views toward Burnside. *This guideline is met.*

- **A5-4.** Enhance SW Jefferson Street. Enhance SW Jefferson Street as a boulevard connecting Washington Park on the west to the Park Blocks in downtown. This guideline may be accomplished by any or all of the following:
 - a) Enhancing the pedestrian environment using street furniture, art work and other amenities to make it a pleasant walkway;
 - b) Orienting buildings to have the front entrances facing the street, and punctuating the ground floors with stopping places and display windows;
 - c) Locating driveways and garage entrances on side streets where feasible, rather than across the sidewalks along SW Jefferson Street; or
 - d) Buffering the pedestrian from the traffic on the street by separating the sidewalk from the street, using street trees, plantings or street furniture.

Findings: The subject property is not located adjacent to or near SW Jefferson Street. *Therefore, this guideline does not apply.*

- **A5-5. Incorporate Water Features.** Incorporate water features or water design themes that enhance the quality, character, and image of the Goose Hollow District.
- **A5-6. Incorporate Works of Art.** Incorporate works of art or other special design features that increase the public enjoyment of the District.

Findings for A5-5 and A5-6: The Goose Hollow Design Guidelines are not often applicable in the Alphabet Historic District nor in the King's Hill Historic District, and therefore are somewhat unique in Historic Resource Review. However, they are often applied to new development subject to Design Review. As such, there are a few precedents as to how these guidelines could be met that have been approved through Design Review. Some of the approved Design review proposals have featured actual water through fountains, etc., whereas others feature references to water through design or artistic elements. To meet these guidelines the applicant is proposing a decorative stone seat wall/planter base noted as "Wave Water Wall Tile" on page C.20. The tile design features ripples like is found is moving water. These wall tiles are only proposed at the planters at the front façade to add a hint of interest to this otherwise rather traditionally designed building. *These guidelines are met*.

A6. Reuse/Rehabilitate/Restore Buildings. Where practical, reuse, rehabilitate, and restore buildings and/or building elements.

Findings: The subject property is currently a vacant lot. *Therefore, this guideline does not apply.*

A8. Contribute to a Vibrant Streetscape. Integrate building setbacks with adjacent

sidewalks to increase the space for potential public use. Develop visual and physical connections into buildings' active interior spaces from adjacent sidewalks. Use architectural elements such as atriums, grand entries and large ground-level windows to reveal important interior spaces and activities.

- **B1. Reinforce and Enhance the Pedestrian System.** Maintain a convenient access route for pedestrian travel where a public right-of-way exists or has existed. Develop and define the different zones of a sidewalk: building frontage zone, street furniture zone, movement zone, and the curb. Develop pedestrian access routes to supplement the public right-of-way system through superblocks or other large blocks.
- **B4. Provide Stopping and Viewing Places.** Provide safe, comfortable places where people can stop, view, socialize and rest. Ensure that these places do not conflict with other sidewalk uses.
- **C6. Develop Transitions between Buildings and Public Spaces.** Develop transitions between private development and public open space. Use site design features such as movement zones, landscape element, gathering places, and seating opportunities to develop transition areas where private development directly abuts a dedicated public open space.
- **C7. Design Corners that Build Active Intersections.** Use design elements including, but not limited to, varying building heights, changes in façade plane, large windows, awnings, canopies, marquees, signs and pedestrian entrances to highlight building corners. Locate flexible sidewalk-level retail opportunities at building corners. Locate stairs, elevators, and other upper floor building access points toward the middle of the block.

Findings for A8, B1, B4, C6, and C7: The proposed building is set 6' to 8' back from the front property line. Many of the historic buildings in the district are built to the front property line, though there are others that are set back behind some landscaping. Many of the buildings set at the property line feature raised entries which allow the first level of residential units to be located a few feet above the sidewalk level, thus granting a bit more privacy. Many of these buildings are not easily accessible to all users, thus many contemporary buildings set their first level and primary entries at grade level. By setting the building back a few feet, the first level residential unit at the northeast corner is granted a bit more privacy while the resident lounge at the northwest corner is still visible from the sidewalk. This setback is then landscaped with a planter, seat wall, and paved area to allow the opportunity for residents and passersby to sit and enjoy passive recreational activity adjacent to the sidewalk, but out of the movement zone of the sidewalk. This setback thus encourages a more vibrant streetscape by the welcoming landscape and hardscape at the front of the building. Additionally, the front entrance is located between the two planter/seat walls, thus ensuring pedestrian activity within this area. The entrance is also highlighted with a large canopy that extends over half of the seat wall of each side, thus offering some protection to those who may use the seat. These guidelines are met.

- **A9.** Strengthen Gateways. Develop and/or strengthen gateway locations.
- **A9-1**. **Provide a Distinct Sense of Entry and Exit**. When developing at gateway locations, provide a distinct sense of entry and exit that relates to the special qualities of an area.

Findings for A9 and A9-1: The subject property is not located at an identified gateway in the Goose Hollow subdistrict of the Central City Plan District. *These guidelines are not applicable.*

- **B1-1**. **Provide Human Scale to Buildings along Walkways**. Provide human scale and interest to buildings along sidewalks and walkways.
- **B6. Develop Weather Protection.** Develop integrated weather protection systems at the sidewalk-level of buildings to mitigate the effects of rain, wind, glare, shadow, reflection, and sunlight on the pedestrian environment.
- **B6-1. Provide Outdoor Lighting at Human Scale**. Provide outdoor lighting at a human scale to encourage evening pedestrian activity.
- **C8. Differentiate the Sidewalk-Level of Buildings.** Differentiate the sidewalk-level of the building from the middle and top by using elements including, but not limited to, different exterior materials, awnings, signs, and large windows.
- **C12. Integrate Exterior Lighting.** Integrate exterior lighting and its staging or structural components with the building's overall design concept. Use exterior lighting to highlight the building's architecture, being sensitive to its impacts on the skyline at night.

Findings for B1-1, B6, B6-1, C8, and C12: The proposed building features a stone base encompassing the first level of the building with brick cladding at the upper levels, thus providing a sense of human scale at the sidewalk level. A large metal canopy above the main entrance provides weather protection at this entry and helps to provide a sense of human scale, as do the planters and seat walls located at either side of the entrance. Additional detailing such as balconies, brick detailing and quoining and the artistic wall tiles at the seat walls also help to add interest and reduce the sense of scale of the building. Pedestrian-scaled lighting is proposed at the front entry, the rear entry, and along the western side walkway which is accessible to residents. Ambient light from residential windows and streetlights across NW 17th Avenue will provide some lighting along 17th. *These guidelines are met.*

B1-2. Orient Building Entries to Facilitate Transit Connections. Orient primary building entries at pedestrian circulation points which conveniently and effectively connect pedestrians with transit services.

Findings: The building's primary entrance faces north and is accessed from NW Couch. The entrance to the bike storage room is located at the lower level on the south façade. Both entries are accessible via NW 17th Avenue which connects to the closest transit stop at Burnside and 17th. *This guideline is met.*

B2. Protect the Pedestrian. Protect the pedestrian environment from vehicular movement. Develop integrated identification, sign, and sidewalk-oriented night-lighting systems that offer safety, interest, and diversity to the pedestrian. Incorporate building equipment, mechanical exhaust routing systems, and/or service areas in a manner that does not detract from the pedestrian environment.

Findings: No parking is proposed on site. Building services such as the electrical room and trash room are located away from the public realm, along the western walkway which is only accessible to residents. An electrical transformer is located underground along NW 17th Avenue. Lighting is proposed at the primary entrance on NW Couch, at the rear entrance to the bike storage room, and along the western private walkway. Vents are minimal and located above the pedestrian realm. *This guideline is met.*

B3. Bridge Pedestrian Obstacles. Bridge across barriers and obstacles to pedestrian movement by connecting the pedestrian system with innovative, well-

marked crossings and consistent sidewalk designs.

B7. Integrate Barrier-Free Design. Integrate access systems for all people with the building's overall design concept.

Findings: Per PBOT requirements, the sidewalk corner ramp will be rebuilt to City standards. The building itself will feature at-grade access at the primary entrance on NW Couch as well as ramp to the rear bike storage entrance off of NW 17th Avenue. An elevator is provided inside to grant barrier-free access to all unit levels. *These guidelines are met.*

- **B5.** Make Plazas, Parks and Open Space Successful. Orient building elements such as main entries, lobbies, windows, and balconies to face public parks, plazas, and open spaces. Where provided, integrate water features and/or public art to enhance the public open space. Develop locally oriented pocket parks that incorporate amenities for nearby patrons.
- **B5-1.** Enhance the Design of Pocket Parks. Design pocket parks in residential areas with a variety of experiences that encourage their use all year round. This guideline may be accomplished by any or all of the following:
 - a) Providing some shaded places protected from the wind and rain as well as generous sunny areas that will allow its use during different times of the day and year;
 - b) Providing seating, trees, grass, flowering plants, paved or textured areas and/or water features; or
 - c) Providing for children's play equipment with protected soft surfaces, seating and water fountains.

Findings for B5 and B5-1: While not a pocket park, the proposal does include shaded and unshaded seating opportunities for residents and passersby along NW Couch. This area is across the street from St. Mary's Cathedral and would thus offer views into the private landscaped courtyard of the Cathedral. *This guideline is met.*

C1. Enhance View Opportunities. Orient windows, entrances, balconies and other building elements to surrounding points of interest and activity. Size and place new buildings to protect existing views and view corridors. Develop building façades that create visual connections to adjacent public spaces.

Findings: Windows are provided on all four sides of the building, offering views in each direction. The buildings to the south and west of the property are contributing resources, each no more than 3-4 stories tall so will have more distant views than the lower levels. Balconies are also provided at the west and east facades for enhanced views, particularly at the east. *This guideline is met.*

- **C1-1. Integrate Parking.** Design surface parking and parking garage exteriors to visually integrate with their surroundings. This guideline may be accomplished by any or all of the following:
 - a) Designing street facing parking garages to not express the sloping floors of the interior parking;
 - b) Designing the sidewalk level of parking structures to accommodate active uses, display windows, public art or other features which enhance the structure's relationship to pedestrians; or
 - c) Accommodating vending booths along sidewalks adjacent to parking facilities when active ground level uses are not possible.

Findings: No parking is proposed. Therefore, this guideline does not apply.

- **C13. Integrate Signs.** Integrate signs and their associated structural components with the building's overall design concept. Size, place, design, and light signs to not dominate the skyline. Signs should have only a minimal presence in the Portland skyline.
- **C1-2. Integrate Signs and Awnings.** Integrate signs and awnings to be complementary and respectful of a building's architecture. This guideline may be accomplished by any or all of the following:
 - a) Placing signs and awnings to fit with and respect a building's architecture.
 - b) Avoiding large, excessively illuminated or freestanding signs that contribute to visual clutter; or
 - c) Integrating with a building's design an exterior sign program/system for flexible sidewalk level space that accommodates changing tenants.

Findings for C13 and C1-2: No signage is proposed on the building other than a brass project information plaque near the entry. All other signage would be subject to a historic resource review. The proposed canopy is located at the entry and extends over one window to the east and west, thus providing shade on apportion of the seat wall/planter to either side of the main entry. The canopy is of steel tube construction and supported by decorative brackets. The canopy helps to bring down the scale of the building and add some gravitas to the entry. *This guideline is met.*

- **C2. Promote Quality and Permanence in Development.** Use design principles and building materials that promote quality and permanence.
- **C4. Complement the Context of Existing Buildings.** Complement the context of existing buildings by using and adding to the local design vocabulary.
- **C5. Design for Coherency.** Integrate the different building and design elements including, but not limited to, construction materials, roofs, entrances, as well as window, door, sign, and lighting systems, to achieve a coherent composition.

Findings: The proposed building is designed to be compatible with the historic buildings of the Alphabet Historic District through its use of a brick exterior with distinct stone base, quoining and brick detailing, a symmetrical front façade with prominent canopied entrance, regular fenestration with paired and individual hung sash windows, decorative frieze band, regular fenestration patterns, and projecting metal balconies. The overall building expression is coherent, making for a complementary background building. However, staff notes that some of the proposed materials have not been tested in this district and therefore staff has added a condition of approval to revise those materials. Specifically, the proposed cornice band is noted to be constructed of either PVC (polyvinyl chloride) or FRP (fiber-reinforced plastic). While plastics and rigid vinyl may often be used for such building elements as cornice detail, they have not been approved in the Alphabet Historic District. As such, staff has added a condition that the frieze band cornice detail shall be constructed of cast stone to maintain the level of detailing shown.

Additionally, the proposed windows are noted as aluminum-clad wood but the enlarged image provided does not indicate a quality window but rather an aluminum window with a wood interior. This enlarged image on sheet C.20 also does not appear to match the window section detail on sheet C.18. As such, staff has added a condition that the proposed windows shall be molded aluminum-clad wood. Molded aluminum-clad wood windows typically have a more traditional profile as the aluminum is wrapped around the wood window, like a glove on a hand, rather than being attached as a wholly separate element.

Lastly, metal grilles with vertical slats are proposed at the front façade inline with the brick soldier course lintels, thus the vertical lines of the soldier course are mimicked in the grilles to minimize their appearance on the front façade. The same treatment is not shown at the rear façade, thus staff has added a condition of approval that the grilles on the rear façade shall match the design and vertical location of those on the front façade.

With the condition that: the decorative frieze cornice band shall be cast stone; that the proposed windows shall be molded aluminum-clad wood; and that the metal grilles covering the vents at the rear façade shall match those on the front façade in design and vertical location, these guidelines are met.

C3. Respect Architectural Integrity. Respect the original character of an existing building when modifying its exterior. Develop vertical and horizontal additions that are compatible with the existing building, to enhance the overall proposal's architectural integrity.

Findings: No building currently exists on the site. *Therefore, this guideline does not apply.*

C7-1. Reduce the Impact of Residential Unit Garages on Pedestrians. Reduce the impact on pedestrians from cars entering and exiting residential unit garages by locating garage access on alleys, wherever possible, and active spaces on ground floors that abut streets.

Findings: No parking is proposed. Therefore, this guideline does not apply.

C9. Develop Flexible Sidewalk-Level Spaces. Develop flexible spaces at the sidewalk-level of buildings to accommodate a variety of active uses.

Findings: The building is purpose-built for residential use, including at the ground level. However, the ground level of the building does include a residential lounge, in addition to the central lobby, at the front of the building along NW Couch which adds some variety in the ground floor activity. *This guideline is met.*

C10. Integrate Encroachments. Size and place encroachments in the public right-ofway to visually and physically enhance the pedestrian environment. Locate permitted skybridges toward the middle of the block, and where they will be physically unobtrusive. Design skybridges to be visually level and transparent.

Findings: No encroachments as proposed. *Therefore, this guideline does not apply.*

C11. Integrate Roofs and Use Rooftops. Integrate roof function, shape, surface materials, and colors with the building's overall design concept. Size and place rooftop mechanical equipment, penthouses, other components, and related screening elements to enhance views of the Central City's skyline, as well as views from other buildings or vantage points. Develop rooftop terraces, gardens, and associated landscaped areas to be effective stormwater management tools.

Findings: The roof of the building is used solely for the placement of mechanical equipment. This equipment is located toward the center of the roof to minimize its visibility from the adjacent public rights-of-way, thus helping to reduce clutter in the City's skyline. *This guideline is met.*

DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

Unless specifically required in the approval criteria listed above, this proposal does not have to meet the development standards in order to be approved during this review process. The plans submitted for a building or zoning permit must demonstrate that all development standards of Title 33 can be met, or have received an Adjustment or Modification via a land use review prior to the approval of a building or zoning permit.

CONCLUSIONS

The purpose of the Historic Resource Review process is to ensure that additions, new construction, and exterior alterations to historic resources do not compromise their ability to convey historic significance. The proposal seeks to infill a vacant parcel, on a corner at the edge of the Alphabet Historic District with a building designed using many of the same design principles of the district's historic buildings. With the added conditions of approval, this proposal meets the applicable Historic Resource Review criteria and therefore warrants approval.

TENTATIVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION

(May be revised upon receipt of new information at any time to the Landmarks Commission decision)

Staff recommends approval of new 5-story, 19-unit apartment building on the site of a non-contributing surface parking lot in the Alphabet Historic District to include 19 residential units, bike parking, trash room, and residential lounge with exterior materials to include cast stone veneer base, brick veneer on stories 2-5, and aluminum-clad wood windows.

- A. As part of the building permit application submittal, the following developmentrelated conditions (B through F) must be noted on each of the 4 required site plans or included as a sheet in the numbered set of plans. The sheet on which this information appears must be labeled "ZONING COMPLIANCE PAGE - Case File LU 22-112912 HR". All requirements must be graphically represented on the site plan, landscape, or other required plan and must be labeled "REQUIRED."
- B. At the time of building permit submittal, a signed Certificate of Compliance form (<u>https://www.portlandoregon.gov/bds/article/623658</u>) must be submitted to ensure the permit plans comply with the Design/Historic Resource Review decision and approved exhibits.
- C. No field changes allowed.
- D. The decorative frieze cornice band shall be cast stone.
- E. The proposed windows shall be molded aluminum-clad wood.
- F. The metal grilles covering the vents at the rear façade shall match those on the front façade in design and vertical location.

Procedural Information. The application for this land use review was submitted on February 14, 2022, and was determined to be complete on March 25, 2022.

Zoning Code Section 33.700.080 states that Land Use Review applications are reviewed under the regulations in effect at the time the application was submitted, provided that the application is complete at the time of submittal, or complete within 180 days. Therefore this application was reviewed against the Zoning Code in effect on February 14, 2022.

ORS 227.178 states the City must issue a final decision on Land Use Review applications within 120-days of the application being deemed complete. The 120-day review period may be waived or extended at the request of the applicant. In this case, the applicant waived the 120-day review period, as stated with Exhibit (Exhibit A2) Unless further extended by the applicant, **the 120 days will expire on: January 14, 2023.**

Some of the information contained in this report was provided by the applicant. As required by Section 33.800.060 of the Portland Zoning Code, the burden of proof is on the applicant to show that the approval criteria are met. The Bureau of Development Services has independently reviewed the information submitted by the applicant and has included this information only where the Bureau of Development Services has determined the information satisfactorily demonstrates compliance with

the applicable approval criteria. This report is the recommendation of the Bureau of Development Services with input from other City and public agencies.

This report is not a decision. The review body for this proposal is the Landmarks Commission who will make the decision on this case. This report is a recommendation to the Landmarks Commission by the Bureau of Development Services. The review body may adopt, modify, or reject this recommendation. The Landmarks Commission will make a decision about this proposal at the hearing or will grant a continuance. Any new written testimony should be emailed to Art Graves at Arthur.Graves@PortlandOregon.gov. If you cannot email comments and must mail comments via USPS mail, your comments to the Landmarks Commission can be mailed c/o the Landmarks Commission, 1900 SW Fourth Ave., Suite 5000, Portland, OR 97201.

Please note regarding USPS mail: USPS mail is only received a couple times a week, and testimony must be received before the close of the record. Therefore, please mail testimony well in advance of the hearing date.

If you are interested in viewing information in the file, please contact the planner listed on this decision. The planner can provide information over the phone or via email. Please note only digital copies of material in the file are available for viewing. A digital copy of the Portland Zoning Code is available on the internet at http://www.portlandoregon.gov/zoningcode.

You will receive mailed notice of the decision if you write a letter received before the hearing or testify at the hearing, or if you are the property owner or applicant. This Staff Report will be posted on the Bureau of Development Services website. Look at www.portlandonline.com. On the left side of the page use the search box to find Development Services, then click on the Zoning/Land Use section, select Notices and

Hearings. Land use review notices are listed by the District Coalition shown at the beginning of this document. You may review the file on this case at the Development Services Building at 1900 SW Fourth Ave., Suite 5000, Portland, OR 97201.

Appeal of the decision. The decision of the Landmarks Commission may be appealed to City Council, who will hold a public hearing. If you or anyone else appeals the decision of the Landmarks Commission, City Council will hold an evidentiary hearing, one in which new evidence can be submitted to them. Upon submission of their application, the applicant for this land use review chose to waive the 120-day time frame in which the City must render a decision. This additional time allows for any appeal of this proposal to be held as an evidentiary hearing.

Who can appeal: You may appeal the decision only if you write a letter which is received before the close of the record for the hearing, if you testify at the hearing, or if you are the property owner/applicant. **Appeals must be filed within 14 days of the decision.** An appeal fee of \$5,513.00 will be charged.

Additional information on how to file and the deadline for filing an appeal will be included with the decision. Assistance in filing the appeal and information on fee waivers are available from the Bureau of Development Services website: https://www.portlandoregon.gov/bds/article/411635. Neighborhood associations recognized by the Office of Neighborhood Involvement may qualify for a waiver of the appeal fee provided that the association has standing to appeal. The appeal must contain the signature of the Chair person or other person_authorized by the association, confirming the vote to appeal was done in accordance with the organization's bylaws.

Neighborhood associations, who wish to qualify for a fee waiver, must complete the Type III Appeal Fee Waiver Request for Organizations Form and submit it prior to the appeal deadline. The Type III Appeal Fee Waiver Request for Organizations Form contains instructions on how to apply for a fee waiver, including the required vote to appeal.

Recording the final decision.

If this Land Use Review is approved the final decision will be recorded with the Multnomah County Recorder.

• *Unless appealed,* the final decision will be recorded after the end of the appeal period by the Bureau of Development Services.

The applicant, builder, or a representative does not need to record the final decision with the Multnomah County Recorder.

For further information on your recording documents please call the Bureau of Development Services Land Use Services Division at 503-823-0625.

Expiration of this approval. An approval expires three years from the date the final decision is rendered unless a building permit has been issued, or the approved activity has begun.

Where a site has received approval for multiple developments, and a building permit is not issued for all of the approved development within three years of the date of the final decision, a new land use review will be required before a permit will be issued for the remaining development, subject to the Zoning Code in effect at that time.

Zone Change and Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment approvals do not expire.

Applying for your permits. A building permit, occupancy permit, or development permit must be obtained before carrying out this project. At the time they apply for a permit, permittees must demonstrate compliance with:

- All conditions imposed here.
- All applicable development standards, unless specifically exempted as part of this land use review.
- All requirements of the building code.
- All provisions of the Municipal Code of the City of Portland, and all other applicable ordinances, provisions and regulations of the city.

The Bureau of Development Services is committed to providing equal access to information and hearings. Please notify us no less than five business days prior to the event if you need special accommodations. Call 503-823-7300 (TTY 503-823-6868).

Arthur Graves July 1, 2022

EXHIBITS – NOT ATTACHED UNLESS INDICATED

(attached)

(attached)

- A. Applicant's Submittal
 - 1. Original Submittal: February 14, 2022 (superseded)
 - 2. Signed Waiver: March 03, 2022
 - 3. Revised Drawings: March 25, 2022
 - 4. Revised Drawings: April 11, 2022
 - 5. Revised Drawings: April 14, 2022
 - 6. Revised Drawings: April 22, 2022
 - 7. Revised Drawings: May 09, 2022
 - 8. Revised Drawings: May 20, 2022
 - 9. Revised Drawings: May 23, 2022
 - 10. Final Submittal: June 20, 2022
- B. Zoning Map (attached)
- C. Plan & Drawings
 - 1. Vicinity Map
 - 2. Site Plan
 - 3. Enlarged Site Plan North
 - 4. Enlarged Site Plan South
 - 5. Floor Plans
 - 6. Elevations North and East
 - 7. Elevations South and West
 - 8. Elevations North and East Rendered (attached)
 - 9. Elevations South and West Rendered (attached)
 - 10. Sections
 - 11. Details Walls and Windows
 - 12. Details Balconies
 - 13. Materials
 - 14. Landscape Plan
 - 15. Lighting Plan
 - 16. Cutsheets
- D. Notification information:
 - 1. Request for Response
 - 2. Posting letter sent to applicant for May 09, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled
 - 3. Notice to be posted for May 09, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled

- 4. Applicant's statement certifying posting for May 09, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled
- 5. Posting letter sent to applicant for June 27, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled
- 6. Notice to be posted for June 27, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled
- 7. Applicant's statement certifying posting for June 27, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled
- 8. Posting letter sent to applicant for July 11, 2022, Hearing
- 9. Notice to be posted for July 11, 2022, Hearing
- 10. Applicant's statement certifying posting for July 11, 2022, Hearing
- 11. Mailed notice May 09, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled
- 12. Mailing list May 09, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled
- 13. Mailed notice June 27, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled
- 14. Mailing list June 27, 2022, Hearing Rescheduled
- 15. Mailed notice July 11, 2022, Hearing
- 16. Mailing list July 11, 2022, Hearing
- F. Agency Responses:
 - 1. Portland Bureau of Transportation: Fabio de Freitas: April 13, 2022.
 - 2. Portland Water Bureau: Michael Puckett: April 22, 2022.
 - 3. Parks Bureau, Urban Forestry: Mariano Masolo: April 26, 2022.
 - 4. Bureau of Development Services Life Safety / Building Code Section: Chanel Horn: April 26, 2022
 - 5. Fire Bureaus: Dawn Krantz, April 26, 2022
 - 6. Bureau of Environmental Services: Ella Indarta: April 26, 2022
 - 7. Bureau of Development Services Site Development: Jed Stoken: April 26, 2022
- G. Correspondences: None received
- H. Other:
 - 1. Original Application
 - 2. Historic Information
 - 3. Incomplete Letter: May 07, 2022



ZONING TH For Zoning Code in effect Post August 1, 2021

CENTRAL CITY PLAN DISTRICT GOOSE HOLLOW SUB DISTRICT ALPHABET HISTORIC DISTRICT



Also Owned Parcels

Historic Landmark

File No.	LU 22 - 112912 HR
1/4 Section	3028
Scale	1 inch = 200 feet
State ID	1N1E33DB 6200
Exhibit	B Feb 14, 2022

COUCH STREET LOOKING SOUTHEAST

StantonS

BUILDING COMPANY

STANDRIDGE PLANNING | ENGINEERING | SURVEYING

ireet



COUCH STREET LOOKING SOUTHWEST



17TH AVENUE LOOKING NORTHWEST



MILBRANDT

ARCHITECTS

17TH AVENUE APARTMENTS SOUTHWEST CORNER OF NW 17TH AVE. & NW COUCH ST. TYPE III HISTORIC RESOURCE REVIEW JULY 11TH, 2022

FILE NUMBER 21-113836

EXISTING SITE CONTEXT IMAGES

SHEET .2



MILBRANDT

ARCHITECTS



Stanton

BUILDING COMPANY

10'

17TH AVENUE APARTMENTS SOUTHWEST CORNER OF NW 17TH AVE. & NW COUCH ST. TYPE III HISTORIC RESOURCE REVIEW JULY 11TH, 2022

ELEVATIONS -BLACK AND WHITE

SHEET 5

FILE NUMBER 21-113836





West-Facing Facade

StantonStreet

BUILDING COMPANY





MILBRANDT

17TH AVENUE APARTMENTS SOUTHWEST CORNER OF NW 17TH AVE. & NW COUCH ST. TYPE III HISTORIC RESOURCE REVIEW JULY 11TH, 2022

ARCHITECTS

Facade Material Keynotes



ELEVATIONS - COLOR









MILBRANDT ARCHITECTS

StantonStreet

BUILDING COMPANY

17TH AVENUE APARTMENTS SOUTHWEST CORNER OF NW 17TH AVE. & NW COUCH ST. TYPE III HISTORIC RESOURCE REVIEW JULY 11TH, 2022



STREET ELEVATION -NW COUCH ST. NOT TO SCALE

FILE NUMBER 21-113836

SHEET

9