



CITY OF  
**PORTLAND, OREGON**

**OFFICIAL  
MINUTES**

A REGULAR MEETING OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PORTLAND, OREGON WAS HELD THIS **14 DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2018** AT 9:30 A.M.

THOSE PRESENT WERE: Mayor Wheeler, Presiding; Commissioners Eudaly Fish, Fritz and Saltzman, 5.

Commissioner Eudaly arrived at 9:45 am  
Commissioner Fish left at 12:10 pm

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE: Karla Moore-Love, Clerk of the Council; Linly Rees, Chief Deputy City Attorney; and Christopher Alvarez and John Paolazzi, Sergeants at Arms.

On a Y-5 roll call, the Consent Agenda was adopted.

The meeting recessed at 11:21 am and reconvened at 11:22 am  
The meeting recessed at 12:12 pm and reconvened at 12:30 pm

<b>COMMUNICATIONS</b>		
<b>1161</b>	Request of Philip J. Wolfe to address Council regarding an amendment to the caption ordinance (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>1162</b>	Request of Stan Herman to address Council regarding an answer to a question (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>1163</b>	Request of Mike O'Callaghan to address Council regarding update on shelterlessness (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>1164</b>	Request of Terry Parker to address Council regarding NE 60 <sup>th</sup> Ave St lighting (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>1165</b>	Request of Colette DeWitt to address Council regarding impact of rental relocation ordinance (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>TIMES CERTAIN</b>		
<b>*1166</b>	<b>TIME CERTAIN: 9:45 AM</b> – Authorize the purchase of certain real property known as the Westwind Apartments located at 323-327 NW Sixth Ave for purchase price and closing costs in an amount not to exceed \$3,052,056 (Ordinance introduced by Mayor Wheeler) 30 minutes requested <b>Motion to amend directive C to ensure compliance with local budget law:</b> Moved by Wheeler and seconded by Saltzman. (Y-5) (Y-5)	<b>189250</b> AS AMENDED

November 14-15, 2018

<b>1167</b>	<b>TIME CERTAIN: 10:15 AM</b> – Accept Portland Parks Board Annual Report to Council (Report introduced by Commissioner Fish) 5 minutes requested <b>Motion to accept report:</b> Moved by Fish and seconded by Fritz. (Y-5)	<b>ACCEPTED</b>
<b>CONSENT AGENDA – NO DISCUSSION</b>		
<b>Mayor Ted Wheeler</b>		
<b>Office of Community Technology</b>		
<b>1168</b>	Consent to franchise transfer from LCP Oregon Holdings, LLC to Zenith Energy Terminals Holding to transport petroleum and petroleum products within a limited portion of City streets (Ordinance; transfer Ordinance No. 188554)	<b>PASSED TO SECOND READING NOVEMBER 21, 2018 AT 9:30 AM</b>
<b>Office of Management and Finance</b>		
<b>*1169</b>	Pay property damage claim of The Salvation Army in the sum of \$54,730 involving the Portland Bureau of Environmental Services (Ordinance) (Y-5)	<b>189248</b>
<b>Portland Housing Bureau</b>		
<b>*1170</b>	Amend contract with Housing and Development Services, Inc. to extend licensing and maintenance of Portland Housing Bureau core software system for \$355,348 (Ordinance; amend Contract No. 30002366) (Y-5)	<b>189249</b>
<b>Commissioner Amanda Fritz</b>		
<b>Water Bureau</b>		
<b>1171</b>	Update Water code to replace gender-specific language (Ordinance; amend Code Title 21)	<b>PASSED TO SECOND READING NOVEMBER 21, 2018 AT 9:30 AM</b>
<b>City Auditor Mary Hull Caballero</b>		
<b>1172</b>	Approve Council Minutes for July-December 2017 (Report) (Y-5)	<b>ACCEPTED</b>
<b>REGULAR AGENDA</b>		
<b>Mayor Ted Wheeler</b>		
<b>S-1173</b>	Authorize the Commissioner in Charge of the Police Bureau to order content-neutral time, place and manner regulations for demonstrations held in the City (Second Reading Agenda 1160) (Y-2; Saltzman, Wheeler. N-3; Eudaly, Fish, Fritz)	<b>FAILED TO PASS</b>
<b>Portland Housing Bureau</b>		

November 14-15, 2018

<b>1174</b>	Appoint Sarah Stevenson, Molly Rogers and Felicia Tripp Folsom to the Portland Housing Advisory Commission for terms to expire November 30, 2021 (Report) 10 minutes requested <b>Motion to accept report:</b> Moved by Fish and seconded by Saltzman. (Y-5)	<b>CONFIRMED</b>
<b>Commissioner Chloe Eudaly</b> <b>Bureau of Transportation</b>		
<b>*1175</b>	Authorize the Bureau of Transportation to acquire certain permanent and temporary rights necessary for construction of the Connected Cully project, through the exercise of the City's Eminent Domain Authority (Ordinance) 15 minutes requested (Y-4; Fish absent)	<b>189251</b>
<b>Commissioner Amanda Fritz</b> <b>Water Bureau</b>		
<b>1176</b>	Authorize a contract with the lowest responsive bidder and provide payment for the construction component of Road 10R MP 28.77 - 31.85 Project in the Bull Run Watershed at an estimated cost of \$1,540,000 (Ordinance) 10 minutes requested	<b>PASSED TO SECOND READING NOVEMBER 21, 2018 AT 9:30 AM</b>
<b>Commissioner Nick Fish</b> <b>Parks &amp; Recreation</b>		
<b>*1177</b>	Authorize a contract with The Active Network, Inc. for a not-to-exceed amount of \$3,000,000 for a five year term to provide hosted software and online services to support recreation program and class registrations, facility reservations, memberships and payments for point of sale with the option to extend for an additional five years (Ordinance) (Y-5)	<b>189252</b>
<b>*1178</b>	Authorize competitive solicitation and contracting with the lowest responsive and responsible bidder for construction of the Leach Upper Garden Development Project (Ordinance) (Y-5)	<b>189253</b>
<b>FOUR-FIFTHS AGENDA</b> <b>Commissioner Chloe Eudaly</b> <b>Bureau of Transportation</b>		
<b>*1178-1</b>	Authorize an Intergovernmental Agreement with Oregon Department of Transportation for jurisdictional transfer of portions of Pacific Highway 99W/Barbur Blvd (Ordinance) 10 minutes requested (Y-4; Fish absent)	<b>189254</b>

At 12:15 p.m., Council recessed.

November 14-15, 2018

A RECESSED MEETING OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PORTLAND, OREGON WAS HELD THIS **14 DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2018** AT 2:00 P.M.

THOSE PRESENT WERE: Mayor Wheeler, Presiding; Commissioners Eudaly, Fish, Fritz and Saltzman, 5.

Commissioner Fish arrived at 2:04 pm and left at 2:35 pm

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE: Karla Moore-Love, Clerk of the Council; Heidi Brown, Senior Deputy City Attorney; and Christopher Alvarez and John Paolazzi, Sergeants at Arms.

<b>1179</b>	<b>TIME CERTAIN: 2:00 PM</b> – Proclaim November 13 <sup>th</sup> of each year to be Mulugeta Seraw Day (Proclamation introduced by Mayor Wheeler and Commissioner Eudaly) 15 minutes requested	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>1180</b>	<b>TIME CERTAIN: 2:15 PM</b> – Accept the report to develop a strategy and policy to address single-use plastics (Report introduced by Mayor Wheeler) 1 hour requested for items 1180 and 1181 <b>Motion to accept report:</b> Moved by Saltzman and seconded by Eudaly. (Y-4; Fish absent)	<b>ACCEPTED</b>
<b>1181</b>	Repeal Code for Single-use Plastic Checkout Bags and Polystyrene Foam Food Containers and replace with Code Prohibitions and Restrictions on Single-use Plastic (Ordinance; replace Code Chapter 17.103; repeal Code Sections 17.102.300-400)	<b>PASSED TO SECOND READING NOVEMBER 21, 2018 AT 9:30 AM</b>
<b>1182</b>	<b>TIME CERTAIN: 3:15 PM</b> – Proclaim November 16 <sup>th</sup> to be #Rock Your Mocs Day (Proclamation introduced by Mayor Wheeler) 30 minutes requested	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>

At 4:07 p.m., Council recessed.

November 14-15, 2018

A RECESSED MEETING OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PORTLAND, OREGON WAS HELD THIS **15 DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2018** AT 2:00 P.M.

THOSE PRESENT WERE: Commissioner Saltzman, Presiding; Commissioners Eudaly, Fish and Fritz, 4.

Commissioner Fish left at 3:25 pm

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE: Karla Moore-Love, Clerk of the Council; Robert Taylor, Chief Deputy City Attorney; and Ovie Griggs and Jim Wood, Sergeants at Arms.

<p><b>1183</b>      <b>TIME CERTAIN: 2:00 PM</b> – Adopt the Central City in Motion Final Report and Implementation Plan (Resolution introduced by Commissioner Eudaly) 3 hours requested for items 1183 and 1184</p> <p><b>Motion to insert additional language – BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that project design must ensure freight access and convenient loading zones for businesses in the Central Eastside Industrial District:</b> Moved by Fritz and seconded by Saltzman. (Y-3; Fish absent)</p> <p>(Y-3; Fish absent)</p>	<p><b>37395</b> AS AMENDED</p>
<p><b>1184</b>      Adopt the Central City in Motion Parking Supply and Demand Management Strategies Report (Resolution introduced by Commissioner Eudaly)</p> <p>(Y-3; Fish absent)</p>	<p><b>37396</b></p>

At 5:27 p.m., Council adjourned.

**MARY HULL CABALLERO**  
Auditor of the City of Portland



By Karla Moore-Love  
Clerk of the Council

For a discussion of agenda items, please consult the following Closed Caption File.

**This file was produced through the closed captioning process for the televised City Council broadcast and should not be considered a verbatim transcript.**

**Key: \*\*\*\*\* means unidentified speaker.**

**November 14, 2018 9:30 a.m.**

**Wheeler:** We have a pregame announcement. We are joined by former state senator Diane Rosenbaum, who is here today, special Sharon Harmon, who is the executive director of the Oregon Humane Society. They are here in force with happy supporters. We just had a really nice celebration outside talking about the great work of the Oregon Humane Society and the importance of caring for our four-legged friends in our community, and we had the mayoral pet ambassador, Cocoa, who is sitting here in the front row. I would like to read the proclamation, and maybe afterwards, we can come up and get a photo right here in front of the rostrum, so here's the proclamation. Whereas for 150 years, Oregonians have led with their hearts, creating a more humane society where animals are treated with kindness and compassion. And whereas the Oregon Humane Society was the fourth humane society established in the United States and has one of the highest save rates in the country. Loving pets is an Oregon state core value, and Portland has one of the highest pet ownership rates in the nation. Whereas canine companions are an integral part of the life of Portland from dog parks to hiking trails to dog-friendly restaurants and breweries, our fondness for dogs is ubiquitous. And whereas, the city of Portland has been named one of the most dog-friendly cities in the country with an abundance of dog-friendly parks, restaurants, and shopping areas, and whereas, Oregon has some of the toughest animal cruelty laws in the nation, and world ranks as one of the safest cities in America for animal protection. Now therefore I, Ted Wheeler, Mayor of the City of Portland, Oregon, the City of Roses, do hereby proclaim November 14th, 2018 to be Oregon Humane Society Day in Portland and encourage all residents to observe this day. Thank you. [applause] Colleagues, I don't know if you want to say anything about your dogs? Commissioner Fritz? You look like you do.

**Fritz:** I want to speak up on behalf of cats. [laughter]

**Fritz:** We also value our cats and cat owners, thank you, and other support animals.

**Fish:** I want to say, Mayor, that I was misled by the Humane Society. Last week I got a visit by the Humane Society with another dog that I thought was the Mayor, so I spent the entire time sucking up to the Mayor only to find out that they have done a bait and switch at the last minute. I have no built-up reservoir of good will now with this dog.

**Fritz:** My cat who is a rescue cat is bigger than that dog.

**Wheeler:** Why don't we come up here and get a photograph if we could. Legislation and advocacy, to give a voice to those who cannot speak for themselves. Today the welfare of animals is evident in our state laws, our public art work, and our community's nationally renowned life-saving success. For 150 years, the Oregon Humane Society has embodied each generation's determination to save lives, stop suffering, and bring loving best friends to our families. Today the pioneers are now innovators, blazing new trails with record adoptions and life-saving programs. Teaching hospitals for veterinarian students, behavior and spay/neuter resources for the community, and a team of experts that can respond to disasters and new tools and techniques for investigating and fighting animal abuse. And true to our history, OHS is the driving force behind some of the toughest animal cruelty laws in the country making Oregon one of the safest places to be a pet in the country. As each

November 14-15, 2018

new chapter unfolds in the Oregon humane society's history, the quest to do more is unwavering. Fueled by the vision to create a more humane society.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. [applause] thank you for your leadership. We appreciate it. Senator, it's good to see you again. Thank you. All right. Good morning everybody. This is the morning session of the Portland city council. 11-14-2018. Karla, please call the roll. [roll taken] good morning.

**Fritz:** Here. **Fish:** Here. **Saltzman:** Here. **Wheeler:** Here.

**Linly Rees, Chief Deputy City Attorney:** Good morning. Good morning everyone. Welcome to the Portland city council. The city council represents all Portlanders and meets to do the city's business. The presiding officer preserves order and decorum during the city council meetings so everyone can feel welcome, comfortable, respected and safe. To participate in the council meetings you may sign up in advance with the council clerk's office for communications to briefly speak about any subject. You may also sign up for public testimony on resolutions or the first readings of ordinances. Your testimony should address the matter being considered at the time. When testifying please state your name for the record. Your address is not necessary. Please disclose if you are a lobbyist. If you are representing an organization, please identify it. The presiding officer determines the length of testimony. Individuals generally have three minutes to testify unless otherwise stated. When you have 30 seconds left, a yellow light goes on, and when your time done, a red light goes on. If you are in the audience and would like to show your support for something that is said, please feel free to do a thumbs Up. If you want to express you do not support something, please feel free to do a thumb's down. Disruptive conduct such as shouting or interrupting testimony, or council deliberations will not be allowed. If there are disruptions, a warning will be given that further disruption may result in the person being rejected for the remainder of the meeting. After being rejected, a person who fails to leave the meeting is subject to arrest. Thank you for helping your fellow Portlanders feel welcome, comfortable, respected and safe.

**Wheeler:** First up, communications.

**Item 1161.**

**Wheeler:** Good morning.

**Phillip J Wolfe:** Excuse me. Give me just a second. All right. Good morning. Good morning, mayor wheeler, good morning city commissioners, and all our supporters and community members here. Good morning to you, as well. First before I begin I would like to request instead of three minutes, I would like five minutes for my testimony. This is not just a simple, a simple message. This is a true testimony that I would like to really be available to present in full. Thank you. First a bit of history. Amanda, commissioner Fritz, I know that you are actually involved in a champion for the amendment and the captioning that we already have. The ordinance that's in place, So thank you for all of that work. Three years after the ordinance was passed, so some, from 2015 until today I have been around the city of Portland at the dmv and other public places, restaurants and bars included, and I would say that about 80% of our city is in compliance with the captioning ordinance, but still about 20% of our city does not comply. This 20% is an issue, and I wanted to address that lack of compliance with amendments today. For example I saw that there was no captions on the video at the beginning this morning, and then captions were added, but it's an attitude of wanting to add these captions and these accommodations, so the 20% that do not comply with the ada will now have to comply because of the amendments here, so I would love to make a few suggestions, friendly suggestions to amend this ordinance. I assume that all of you have read this. I did send it to all of you before. Wonderful. One crucial thing that I would like to really make sure that everyone understands is about the fonts and the backgrounds of closed captioning. The color of the word, itself should be yellow or white. I have noticed that some tvs have purple or



November 14-15, 2018

sometimes blue, and it's hard to see from a distance, and it blends in with what's going on in the television screen. It's not easy to see. I have asked managers in these Places before to change the backgrounds on there, but they have refused, and I noticed that because the ordinance does not have something specifically stating that, they are not needing to comply. I wanted to add that in. I have also noticed the lack of backgrounds with the captioning, so it's hard to see when you have a thin letter against a tv screen. It's easier to have a dark background on those words. For anyone with vision problems, deaf-blind members of our community, and it's very stressful and tiring to have to depend on captions, so whatever we can do to make that visually easier on anyone that needs to depend on it so that they can casually enjoy whatever programming is on the same way that hearing members of the community are able to. So again, I just wanted to emphasize the importance of that dark background. It doesn't have an impact on our hearing members of the community who are watching, but it's a huge impact on the deaf community. And so there are things that I could expand on more, but for reasons of time I won't do that today. You will find some of that in the information I sent to you. Another example of last thursday actually was here, there are four tvs on the first floor in city hall. There was no background on the closed captioning when. I actually brought a picture as an example. You can see the background Behind the words is clear and makes it unable to for us to read it clearly. Like I said I am sure that you have read this already and are familiar. I would love to be able to review and to bring this to the table for a discussion and possibly a vote to go ahead and amend that ordinance to make sure that we are really providing an equitable opportunity for everybody, and I know that I have about two minutes left, so I am just going to wrap up with one last thought. I have noticed that for a lot of political, government, or emergency service blogs and videos that are uploaded onto social media and to the internet, most of them are not captioned. I have repeatedly asked people who are in charge of these videos to add the captioning to no avail. There is now a change that I have seen, and I do make sure to say thank you whenever I notice these captions, but it seems like that change and that improvement was short-lived. I would like to be able to emphasize the fact that important information should be captioned, and anything regarding political, government, or emergency services or involves powerful decisions needs to be accessible for us, and historically, they are not. I think that it's important for our leaders and for the people in the city hall to keep track of three things, political, government, and emergency services should always, always Be accessible. Hopefully we can become an example for other cities to have videos captioned universally for access. If any of you have any questions about this, I would be happy to answer them at this time now, too.

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fritz.

**Fritz:** Thank you for bringing this forward, mr wolfe. And I took note of your email when you sent it in. As you know the Portland commission on disabilities, which is staffed in the office of equity and human rights is taking a break until the new year so that gives me some time to do some due diligence on your suggestions.

**Wolfe:** I am here to represent myself. I just wanted to clarify that.

**Fritz:** I appreciate that. Since the commission on disabilities was the entity that brought it forward before, I would like to have a review. I also want to mention that the city of Salem is considering a captioning ordinance, so I hope that you and your colleagues here today will contact them and offer your services, and then finally we did pass a regulation that the city emails, I mean the city videos have to be captioned. We don't currently have an enforcement mechanism for that, so if anybody notices that's a video posted on Portland online, Portlandoregon.gov is not captioned. Would you please email [inaudible], who is my constituent services specialist, And we will follow up with the individual bureau until we can figure out a better compliance routine. We do want to make sure that it is successful



November 14-15, 2018

for all kinds of different reasons. I also very much agree, there was an admission in the original ordinance about the background on the captioning. So while many of the establishments that I have visited are technically complying, it is very difficult, especially for those of us with visual impairment, as well to, read the captions. I appreciate them even though when the sound is off on the television I appreciate knowing what's going on, on the screen. There are multiple benefits as we knew when we passed the ordinances before. So thank you for bringing this to our attention, and I am happy to take the leadership in working on your suggestions.

**Wheeler:** On a personal note, Phillip, you and I always don't agree on everything, but I want to thank you for your leadership on this issue. I want to thank you if opening my eyes to the deaf community in our community and our state. I appreciated joining you at the northwest deaf festival for the arts last summer. Captioning is an issue that i, frankly, didn't know very much about until I got here to city hall. You have been very helpful in helping me to understand the importance of not only captioning, but how the captioning is done. So I thank you for that. I appreciate you being here today.

**Wolfe:** Thank you very much. You are welcome. Any other questions from any other commissioners? Nope? Perfect.

**Wheeler:** Thank you, phillip.

**Wolfe:** Thank you very much. Just as a wrap-up I want you to know that I mean well, and I am always here. I have many, many options and many ideas to provide in terms of accessibility, and I would be happy to anticipate with that. So thank you for your time. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. [applause]

**Item 1162.**

**Wheeler:** Good morning, stan.

**Stan Herman:** Here we are again. You know I really respect your position that you have chosen to represent the city of Portland. But again, I must switch this business communication to a political agenda. Our city leaders are paid to voice your opinions and make decisions. I have seen and heard your remarks and your votes on many issues in the city council meetings. I've been asking my city leaders for an opinion starting from my first appearance two years ago, 24 months ago, november 2016. For the record, why are you not giving me an opinion to my question I presented two years ago? I am not asking for a legal answer, rather just please give me your personal understanding On who should enforce or as 830.035. Mr. Mayor, no disrespect but 156 days ago we met, and as of today we have no progress regarding that meeting. On january 20, 2017, I hand-delivered to all of your offices the statue reporting enforcement law for the ors-30.05. I will give you a minute so you can read that. I think that you have it in front of you, do you? Please give me your opinion to my question below. I will try to make this as simple as possible. On the sec page, please reply with an x on this paper stating your opinion regarding my question. The question again, Oregon state statue reporting the enforcement law, ors830.05. Who is responsible to enforce this regulation? Put an x on the yes. I think that the city of Portland, police department is responsible and should have launched an investigator, or you can put an x on no. And I think that the city of Portland department has no responsibility to enforce an investigation regarding Mr. Herman's reported hit and run to his building on 1300 north river street or you can choose the third one. I don't care to comment on mr. Herman's question. I would like to take your information with me and I gave you an extra copy for your reference. The first responder is the bottom note to that accident, Was officer jeff myers, which required by state law, he was supposed to start an investigation, but he did nothing. Any questions that I can answer? Thank you.

**Fritz:** I would like to respond, I have added a number four, and I will give you that with the signature. I have sent you a letter with my response. I would be happy to resend it.

November 14-15, 2018

**Herman:** Okay. Can you respond to my paper there, one way or another?

**Fritz:** I will resend my letter.

**Wheeler:** We will send you the whole file again.

**Wheeler:** Okay. Next individual, please.

**Item 1163.**

**Wheeler:** Good morning.

**Mike O'Callaghan:** Thank you, I am michael o'callaghan, and it's good to hear about the humane society making Portland a more compassionate place for animals. Maybe it would be a good idea to expand their mission to include humans. I would think that they would do a bit better job than the homelessness. Congratulations. I want to start out on a good note, okay, only 79 people died last year on the street. A drop of one from 80. Good deal. The sweeps, now I was here last time, and I asked you the question what the outcome of the sweeps was, and you gave me an answer. It really wasn't an answer, so I would like you to know what the Outcome of the sweeps are. Three days without it sleep, you are certifiably insane. Physiological fact. Another that they have found, which is really quite interesting, is that social isolation causes addiction. Another classic one the rat with the cocaine, take the cocaine until it dies, right, the guy is like let's put them in a cage with other rats and food and see what happens. They don't do that. Okay. So the mythology out on the streets is that they were all mentally ill, alcoholic, drug addicts. Why? Were they all alcoholic, mentally ill drug addicts when they were housed? No, they within. Okay. This is what your sweeps are causing. They are illegal. There's a response that I got to my two-page from your attorneys, okay, about a restraining order to prohibit the sweeps because they are unconstitutional. Two pages I wrote, and this is a response that I got. In this litigation, if you are really familiar with the term, turn, look at my previous litigation up to 9th and back down. See how much churn your attorney's office has put into my case and see how much churn they are going to put into this case. This is an example. Okay. Solutions. I like to orient towards Solutions. Three solutions here. Okay. Villages. You already have -- you have seen the replication, this works. You know that. You need a code to allow small villages 25 or smaller. You can put them on their for 90 days at a time. You can do all kinds of things, okay. And that's number one. This is the doable. And another one, which is really kind of interesting, over here on 6th and division place, they have great big building storage room, and I have got some of my stuff stored in there, and you can go and lease it or buy it for five years. They have 1,00 units, and you can put that in a bigger unit and you can put families in there, and they have got coded security for entrance. You would have to put things on there for, you know, more showers and things like that. One more comment about the roses, I am working the roses in the [inaudible] edition. They came through with a hedge trimmer and cut all of the roses down, okay. Chloe, you know, could you tell them not to use the hedge trimmers on the roses? Okay. You can communicate with the rose gardens about that.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. I appreciate you coming. [applause]

**Item 1164.**

**Wheeler:** I want to remind people, the counselor Rules, are the reason that we don't clap or boo or anything. It's distracting the people, so please just thumbs up or down is sufficient. Good morning, sir.

**Terry Parker:** Thank you for the opportunity to testify, but I am speaking on behalf of the rose city park neighborhood association. Late last year the rose park city neighborhood association through central northeast neighbors applied to install two pedestrian street lamps at the intersection of northeast 60th avenue and halsey street. Planning was underway by pbot to pull together the funding associated with the transit community's program for new sidewalks replacing three to four-foot sidewalks, wide sidewalks on 60th avenue between halsey street and the max station. The grant, which was not awarded,

November 14-15, 2018

was to be a demonstration project with the goal of adding pedestrian streetlights and at all intersections between halsey and max, at the same time the sidewalks are replaced. Since then full funding has been found for the new sidewalks. Pbot advised me if the project came in under budget, some lighting could be included. I am told by experts that the new led streetlights pbot installed deliver the same amount of light as the older vapor lighting. It may be the color of the fact that it's cut off lighting, but it is far more difficult to see the pedestrians crossing the streets with the new lighting. The majority of the area around Northeast -- around 60th avenue max station is currently built up with mostly modest single family residences. The entire area has been up-zoned for higher densities. A number of streets do not have the sidewalks. Within the past year two commercial properties at 60th and halsey have been sold to a developer. The rose city park neighborhood association has maintained that infrastructure needs to be in place before any new development occurs. 60th avenue should be a street with amenities that says it goes somewhere and connects people and places. The rose city park neighborhood has been and always has been since 1907 a working class neighborhood where families have called home for much of their lives. I have lived in the neighborhood for over 60 years. My neighbor to the south lived there under 60 years with others on the street living in their homes for 30 years or more. This type of long-term development is what makes a stable and livable neighborhood. We pay our share of taxes, but like the grant dollars much of the money goes elsewhere. I have been told by pbot that Portland no longer offers place making grants, the needs for those grants still exist. What I am asking for today is to you had a 250 to \$300,000 for the purpose of adding pedestrian scale streetlights, if necessary, from the general fund, which is supported by property taxes. Although the lighting is not mode specific, think vision zero and a street that attracts people walking, especially in to and from max. It makes sense to add the pedestrian scale streetlights when the new sidewalks are constructed so some of the costs can be shared. Just for the record the tri-met letter, which I am reusing, I got permission to from steve whitier to include it in the packet today.

**Wheeler:** Great. Terry, could I ask you one question? In here there is a letter, and it says the cost is approximately \$10,000. Is that per light?

**Parker:** That's per light standard. That was when I was working on the grant from dan, who is a pbot employee.

**Wheeler:** And you proposed approximately 25 lights in the immediate vicinity of the max?

**Parker:** Right, on the street there. A couple at each intersection. I think it's 28, if you had it full. There is a picture in there that shows the proposed lights.

**Wheeler:** I see it. Got it, thank you. I appreciate it. Any other questions?

**Eudaly:** I want to say this predates pbot being in my portfolio but I will follow up on this and try to get an answer back to you this week.

**Parker:** You need me to check in with your office or anything like that?

**Eudaly:** You could talk to marshall, sure, yeah.

Okay. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you, terry. Next individual, please.

#### **Item 1165.**

**Colette DeWitt:** Good morning. I was here this summer to talk to you about returning to Portland after working overseas for five years and needing to pay my renters 4,200 to move out of my apartment or my condo. That's happened. I sold it. I paid the rent, it got taken care of. Now I bought a place that I can afford at my social security out in southeast Portland. I have another issue, which is -- I am living by -- my southern warned me, can you do this? I am like, no problem. There are squatters, and they are criminals. There is criminal activity going on all the time. There is a fire. They started in the backyard trash a couple of weeks ago, and sad it's on the humane society's day. I called about the fire. The fire department came. I warned them that there are these two pit bulls in the yard, and

November 14-15, 2018

anyway, eventually, the dog was shot. Do you remember this? The Portland police had to shoot a dog, so this is my new neighborhood. And I am not complaining, okay. They are going to be gone. They are really saying, given to the police, everything was fine before she got here, so you have miss crab out there, right. But what I don't understand is How, how homeowners, people who have properties, who do -- for instance I had a property manager when I was overseas and took care of my property. I had to pay over 10,000 to improve my place after the renters left in order to sell it. I learned to refinish the cabinet and the countertops, okay. And I did a lot myself. How is it that homeowners are so villified with this rent relocation ordinance? And how can you help homeowners like me who are moving into a place that needs improvement? Also I was by vietnamese, chinese, and young property owners, and first-time buyers. I want this neighborhood to improve. It can. But the reason that no one has called, there was an invalid living in my home, right, so now it's up to a 65-year-old white woman to call, and people are listening. What can be done?

**Eudaly:** It sounds like this is a zombie house, perhaps. Do you know who the owner -- I know it's a strange term.

**DeWitt:** They know the owner.

**Eudaly:** They do know the owner. Yeah.

**DeWitt:** A neighborhood response team precinct robert c. Brown and [inaudible] young. Talked to the coding department. A child protective -- I call all of the time.

**Eudaly:** You described them as squatters but they know the owner. Are they there with permission or not?

**Dewitt:** No. Not that anyone can prove.

**Eudaly:** Okay.

**DeWitt:** I think that they met in jail. Yeah. This has been going on for years. And in fact, their neighbor, I just met him, he put his house on the market. He was practically in tears, and he said I love my home. I can't live by these people any more. My wife won't live here any more with me. So, you know, I am a homeowner. I am going to make it better, but on the other hand I was villified as a homeowner for renting my place out when I went overseas. So we are not all bad people. That's what I think the rental ordinance relocation ordinance switched it over so that all landlords are people trying to -- trying to take money from renters.

**Eudaly:** You may be a good landlord, but we have thousands of landlords taking advantage of a housing crisis, raising rents. Your time is up and you are criticizing my policy, so I get to respond. We didn't vilify homeowners. We told landlords if you are going to, no cause evict or raise your tenants' rent, 10% or more, which by the way is three or four times the average cost, annual cost increase, you will share in the burden that you are creating for your tenants and for the city. Now it does not sound like you Were one of those landlords, and I am sorry that it negatively impacted you, but we had to take action to protect hundreds of thousands of renters who are at risk of displacement and homelessness. That's all that I want to say.

**DeWitt:** Can I say just a little more?

**Eudaly:** This is not an opportunity for a dialogue. Feel free to contact my office.

**Dewitt:** Did you watch my previous testimony?

**Wheeler:** Let me do this. The commissioner is correct. This is communications. This is not a game show. There is more to this. As I was listening to your testimony, there is also a public safety component here, and there is a police component. It sounds like you are in touch with your precinct. Is that correct?

**DeWitt:** Yes.

**Wheeler:** Okay. And if you need me to connect with somebody, let me know.

**DeWitt:** I would like that. Do I just tell someone?



November 14-15, 2018

**Wheeler:** Just talk to michelle and give her your contact information, and I will follow up and get back in contact with you.

**DeWitt:** I wanted to be here last time so you could hear it.

**Wheeler:** Very good. Consent agenda. Have any items been pulled?

**Karla:** I have had no request.

**Wheeler:** Call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Aye.

**Fritz:** I want to note that I am going -- I am going to note the consent agenda includes replacing gender-specific Language in title 21, the water bureau's code, all bureaus were directed to state their codes to remove gender-specific language, and I am really proud that the water bureau is [inaudible]. Aye.

**Fish:** Aye. **Saltzman:** Aye.

**Wheeler:** Aye. [gavel pounded] consent agenda is adopted. First time certain item 1166.

**Wheeler:** Colleagues, we regularly hear during communications that we are either not addressing the homeless crisis, or we are not sufficiently addressing the homeless crisis. I hope that this ordinance goes in some way towards compelling people to understand that we are approaching this with the sense of urgency, that it is a priority. That we are making investments and taking signature risks to be able to address this crisis that we all agree is unfolding on our streets. This ordinance is for the acquisition of the westwind apartments in old town to redevelop under Portland's housing bond, which was supported by the voters in the city of Portland. The west wind represents the fifth property identified for the bond program bringing the total number of units acquired and planned to just over 600. Nearly halfway towards our goal of 1300 units. Currently, the west wind provides 70 low-cost, low barrier, single room occupancy units. This acquisition will preserve a Scarce type of housing that's vital to our efforts to tackling homelessness in the central city for our most vulnerable neighbors and moves us closer towards our goal of 2000 units in ten years with regard to the supportive housing. Future plans to replace the existing building will create new units that are safe, high quality, and permanently affordable homes with services for very low income individuals including permanent, supportive housing units. With that, I will turn it over to our presenter's panel, and we have Shannon callahan from the Portland housing bureau, and mark from the joint office of homeless services. Welcome and thank you both for being here.

**Shannon Callahan:** Good morning, mayor. Shannon callahan from the Portland housing bureau. I am pleased today to be here to request your authorization to purchase the Westwind apartments located on northwest 6th in the old town neighborhood. We will -- I am also joined by mark jolin, and in a moment you will hear from Andy shah and dana brandon of the central city concern as well as peter buyer of home forward, all of whom are partners in helping us operate, provide services, and provide vouchers, rent support for low income households who will be presiding in the future westwinds. As you heard at the permanent supportive housing briefing that you and Multnomah county held earlier this year, this is a joint project of the Portland's housing bureau, the Portland Housing bond, specifically, and Multnomah county. As the mayor mentioned the westwind has for many years served as low barrier housing for our most vulnerable residents. To our knowledge it's one of the last remaining single room occupancy buildings in private hands within the central city. Many of the single room occupancy buildings we've been able to save are either in the ownership of the Portland housing bureau or our partners, notably as you will hear from the central city concern, who owns many of the single room occupancy buildings left remaining in the central city. The fate of this building has long been on many of our city agencies' radar, including the Portland housing bureau, the bureau of development services, and many of the counties' agencies, including mental health and addiction services, as many of the clients reside in this building and currently receive services from

November 14-15, 2018

the county agencies. When we heard this building last year was -- had the potential for a sale, we all worked together to act to save and preserve this building both for the current tenants and for the future tenants, and we are pleased that after almost a year of working on this building, we are here today to bring you this purchase. As the mayor mentioned, we do plan on replacing this building with 70 units, which is currently the current number of units in the building. We have about 50 of those units that are currently occupied by households, and many of whom have been placed through the county services or nonprofit support partners. This ordinance today asks you to approve approximately 3 million of downtown waterfront urban renewal area, and we will be using those funds to acquire the building, and then in partnership with Multnomah county and the housing bonds, we will be replacing that building. I also would like to note that we are currently exploring the use of low-income tax credits, which to replace this building -- it is made possible to us by the adoption of measure 102 last week, the constitutional amendment. This was not something that was possible before that, but it could bring a signature amount of equity and capital to replace this building and ensure both a safe community for the residents, but also a lively commercial ground floor for the old town neighborhood.

**Fish:** When is 102 go into effective?

**Callahan:** It goes into effect 30 days from the time that it is certified by the secretary of state, and I apologize -- I don't know that has occurred yet. We are working with the bond oversight committee. The first week of December to make plans on how to adapt the rollout of the constitutional amendment as it relates to the Portland housing bond.

**Fish:** Okay.

**Callahan:** As the mayor mentioned, this property is signature to insuring the goals that you set for reaching supportive housing. 2000 new units in the next ten years. As you heard earlier this year we have already programmed or planned for at least 500 of those units. Finally, before I turn it over to mark, I would like to note, as the mayor said, this is the fifth bond project that we have had identified. So far we identified 634 new units or acquired units of housing. I am pleased today to turn it over to mark jolin of the joint office.

**Mark Jolin, Director of Joint Office of Homelessness:** Thank you, Shannon. Mark Jolin, the director of the joint office of homeless services. I just want to take a minute to celebrate the partnership that this project represents. Amongst all of us you will hear from today, but particularly the city and the county. At the time that Wapato was sold last year, the county commission brought forward by commissioner Lori Stegmann directed an exploration of the best uses of the proceeds from that sale. There was quick agreement that the most critical need was to expand permanent, supportive housing. We reached out to Shannon asking where there might be an opportunity to co-invest with the city to add supportive housing particular in particular for people chronically homeless struggling with serious physical and mental health challenges. The West Wind represented the perfect opportunity to acquire a building to prevent the displacement of the tenants and invest in replacing it with 70 new SRO units within intensive on-site support services. The county board voted unanimously to approve the intergovernmental agreement, transferring \$4 million to the Portland housing bureau for use in the redevelopment of the West Wind. As the project moves forward, the joint offers will use city and county supportive housing funds to provide the wrap-around support services that the tenants in the building need. We will also use our coordinated access system to ensure equitable access to the units for the most vulnerable adults in our community. Through a network of more than 27 nonprofits, including seven culturally-specific providers, we have implemented a single assessment support, for supportive housing that can be conducted anywhere in the community. We have trained more than 200 people to conduct those assessments. [inaudible] for the dozens of supportive housing projects in our community, and including both permanent supportive housing and recovery housing. No longer does someone who is extremely vulnerable have to travel all over town



November 14-15, 2018

to be assessed and apply for multiple different supportive housing programs. They do one assessment, and we match it, as they become available in any of the supportive housing projects. Given some people are so vulnerable and isolated that they won't seek out services themselves, we have a whole team of outreach workers in the community conducting assessments on the streets and in people's camps. Right now we have about 1300 chronically homeless people assessed through coordinated access and are waiting to be matched for an appropriate supportive housing unit. The west wind will be a critical addition to the inventory of units available to the vulnerable people in our community, many living unsheltered. The westwind also is a great example of the kind of partnership that will allow us to fulfill the promise of adding at least 2,000 units of supportive housing by 2028. I thank you for your support of the acquisition and of the people in our community who so desperately need this kind of housing opportunity.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Callahan:** With that I would like to invite Andy Shah and Dana Brandon with Central City Concern, as well as Peter Beyer.

**Wheeler:** While they are coming up I would like to add a technical amendment at the request of the housing bureau. It would read as follows: to ensure that we are for compliance with budget what you I move to strike section 1y, which reads the increase appropriation of the Portland housing bureau by 154,000 through the end of the current fiscal year and replace the language with the following, in order ensure sufficient cash flow to operate the subject property for the remainder of the year this ordinance authorizes the transfer of 154,000 from the housing investment fund to the tax increment financing reimbursement fund. Can I get a second? Karla, please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Aye.

**Fritz:** This is a technical amendment, and I can't imagine anybody would object to

**Fish:** Aye. **Saltzman:** Aye.

**Wheeler:** Aye. [gavel pounded] the amendment is adopted. Sorry and welcome. And thank you for being here. We appreciate it.

**Andy Shaw, Director of Housing at Central City Concern:** I am Andy Shaw, the director of housing at Central City Concern. I am here to speak a bit about the historical use of the Westwind as low income housing and talk about the importance of preserving the housing type and benefits of the neighborhood and the city, and how the Westwind, properties like this are also a tremendous asset for service providers. Lastly, I want to talk a bit about CCC experience operating managing low bearing housing for low income individuals. Westwind -- a couple years ago there was a study in San Diego that came out that talked about the correlation between the loss of SRO housing to the rise of the homelessness in that city. I think that since the 1980s about 14,000 units of SRO housing, they started losing 75% of the 14,000, SRO units. Concurrently they saw a rise in homelessness. I think that the city's acquisition of the Westwind is a great step to reversing trends like that in our city. This morning I was there, and just seeing kind of how neglected the property is, there was falling plaster and I think a lot of people, you know, there were hoarding activities and filthy conditions. The city's acquisition is really critical in not only reversing the role of providing more affordable housing, but really kind of helping those who have been most marginalized to get connected to the services. In terms of the assets, as you know, Central City Concern, the three arms, four arms of the organization, health services, behavioral health and employment services and housing and supportive housing services. Issue that in a lot of the SRO's, at least one of the SRO's owned by private owners, we have, in one building, not the Westwind but another, we have at least 20 individuals connected to our health services, and behavioral health arm, so I think that these are very critical because our primary care physician, our behavioral health staff you know, one of the things that they will tell you is health without it housing is impossible because people just get -- their

November 14-15, 2018

wounds open up, and they have no place to stabilize. Finally, our experience operating and managing the low bureau housing, we have about, at least 10 sro properties in the vicinity with the west wind apartments near old down, and We've been doing this since 1979. We are confident that we can go in and properly manage the property for the city until the more long-term plan can be in place. I will turn this over to our director of supportive housing.

**Dana Brandon, Director of Supportive Housing at Central City Concern:** Good morning. Dana brandon, director of supportive housing at central city concern. I will talk briefly about the types of services that we provide in our buildings. We, as you know, provide -- we are up to almost 23 buildings of affordable, low barrier in most cases buildings with recovery housing, as well. We have on-site staff in some of our buildings, 24 hours a day, seven days a week. And we have residents services, support coordinators, who assist our permanent tenants with any variety of needs that they might have. We support them in eviction prevention. We support them in acquiring food. We help to connect them with the health services if they are not connected. So we provide really robust services throughout our portfolio in every building with aren't services, coordinators as well as case management staff in a number of our buildings. We have, I know you all know, great depth and breadth of experience in providing this work and insuring the safety of the buildings that we oversee.

**Fish:** Can I ask a question? One of the things that Discouraged me a bit in an otherwise successful election season was when we are making the case about ballot measures 102 and 26199, there were some people that chose to oppose the regional bond on the grounds that by serving low, low income people with people that had needs beyond just subsidized housing, needed intensive services, we were at risk of creating, and I will put this word in quotation marks because I can't believe in 2018 we are using language like this, but we are going to create ghettos throughout the region. That was a line of argument used in an editorial board meetings and some public meetings. Clearly the public rejected that scare, that fear mongering that happened during campaign. But I think that it is -- I think that it is fair to ask you from your position, what's the most persistent myth that we have to sort of address about why it is nationally it has become a best practice to provide a deeply affordable rental apartment with services to help chronically homeless people get back on their feet?

**Brandon:** I don't know. I really don't know. I certainly -- one of the myths around the homeless is that the homeless want to be on the streets. That they don't want to be in housing. And that's a myth about homelessness that I see as being perpetuated.

**Shaw:** And I can speak to that. I think ccc's approach is to provide services, employment, housing, supportive housing and Mental health and primary care, and I think what we have seen is you know, people who come through our housing, they -- they are desperately want to have safety and security employment. Within our organization, what I see, my staff is, who have come through the latter from homelessness to voluntary, volunteer course to getting employment, what I see is some of our best employees are, actually, people who have come through from homelessness through recovery. And so I think that the myth that, by providing more housing and intensive services, it's going to create more ghettos, and I simply don't see that that's the case. That hasn't been my lived experience with my own staff. And I think that we have one occupational therapist that serves detox and I think that she will tell you they want to get better, and I think that people need ideas on how they can manage their pain, how they can kind of live a more stable life. So I think that the need for services is tremendous. I think people need that navigator, or the people with special expertise to help them to overcome the barriers.

**Fish:** Thank you. Yeah.

November 14-15, 2018

**Peter Beyer:** Good morning, mayor and council members. I am Peter Beyer. I am the chief financial officer and current acting executive director of Home Forward. Home Forward is proud to partner with the city to help acquire, build, and asset management housing funded by the Portland affordable housing bond. We enthusiastically endorse the acquisition and redevelopment of the Westwind Apartments. In connection with the passing of the housing bond, Home Forward utilized the flexibility of our special move-in-to-work designation to commit to pairing up to 400 project-based vouchers with bond funds. From what was envisioned at that early time, the Westwind Apartments represents the perfect example of the value we saw in pairing vouchers with the bond. It is a building that is located in a great neighborhood near amenities, services, and transportation. There are multiple partners working together to ensure the residents will have access to the ongoing services that they need, and because of the vouchers, the property will serve people living with low incomes and help people to transition from homelessness. Beyond the voucher commitment, Home Forward will provide asset management services for the property. We have decades of experience in asset management, and managing properties like the Westwind Apartments, and our team is incredibly skilled, and we will utilize our expertise in the processes that we have spent decades developing to ensure the Westwind is successful. Not just from a physical asset or a financial statement perspective, but from a livability perspective. Housing is at the core of what Home Forward does, but the people are the reason that it matters. I know the members of this council understand the importance of the PSH model, and as was stated, the challenge for our community will be to stay focused and committed to all three words, connected with that acronym. Permanent, supportive, and housing. I would like to take this opportunity to thank the city council and all of our partners for entrusting us with this work. We are excited about the Westwind Apartments. We are looking forward to helping to create a building that will be a long-term and vital resource for Portlanders now and for years to come. Again, thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thanks all three of you. Thanks for your partnership. Public testimony, Karla.

**Karla:** We have four people signed up. The first three are Charles Bridgecrane Johnson, Maggie, and Joe Walsh.

**Wheeler:** Good morning.

**Charles Bridgecrane Johnson:** Good morning, commissioners. It's not fun to be the bearer of bad tidings. So just to be clear this project does nothing to address homelessness. It's a place that has 50 people living in it now, and when you are done, it will have 50 people living in it. So it's a zero net on homelessness. It is changing the status of the units from slumlord operated 500 per month paid by people who only have 700 a month of income to those people now paying 30% of the income and will live in a clean, hygiene building. It is zero gain in the struggle to end homelessness. Period. There is no way around that, no matter. You are welcome to invite them back, but that's the song and dance truth here.

**Wheeler:** Can I ask you a question?

**Johnson:** The other thing is that this is not nothing. What this is taking 2 million, taking 2 million, if you go over there and get a bag of 2 million or a nice check, and we are taking it to Newberg, and giving it to the slumlord that bought this building in 2004. In 2004, a predatory slumlord bought there for 1.1 million, has emotionally and psychologically abused every human being that has lived there since 2004, and now we are giving them a 2 million cash reward. The people that live in this building deserve this project, they deserve to be saved, rescued, helped, and we need permanent supportive housing. This plan, and we have only seen a glimpse, what we are talking about is buying the property for 3 point something. We are not talking about the actual construction cost of replacing the building. That comes next. Then there is the funding of the PSH, the permanent supportive housing. So it's sad, but that's the simple truth. We have a building that has had

November 14-15, 2018

a the times 50 to 70 people in it. We are going to shut it down for a while, like we have done for the joyce. Be great to get an update on the joyce at this time. So people just need to know that that's the truth. No net increase in available beds, roomettes, housing, apartments come from any of the money that will be expended at this address. It is only a change in classification of, from a building that you guys could have had for free. If you had, as miss eudaly pointed out, we need rental inspections. We have people living in substandard, dangerous places with abusive landlords. When I moved to the city in 2011, people have been going in and documenting that.

**Wheeler:** Can I answer your question now? The difference is, it's now permanent. We own it. So in perpetuity, this facility will be available to people, and because we own it, we can, actually, build larger on this site and put more people into permanent, supportive housing. And had we not bought it, somebody else would have. Guess what they would have done? Excuse me. They would have evicted -- no argument. They would have evicted everybody in it. They would have demolished it and built market rate housing with the inclusionary zoning, of Course. If we want permanent, supportive housing for very low to zero income people, many of whom are struggling with very serious issues, whether it's addiction, whether it's mental health, whether they are domestic violence survivors, this is the kind of play that we need to make. The \$2 million, I wish it was free. It's not. The 2 million was the price to get rid of the guy who owned it so that we could own it and do it right for the people who need it the most. Thank you, sir. Commissioner eudaly.

**Eudaly:** Mr. Johnson, while I don't agree it's not a net gain for the city, I do share your frustration. I don't think any property owner providing substandard housing in our city should be allowed to raise rents at all. I would like to see the city get a lot more aggressive with enforcement. It's one of my regrets no longer having bds that we were not able to make headway with that. I will continue to advocate for it.

**Wheeler:** Good morning.

**Maggie:** Good morning. Okay. So they are still kicking people out of hospitals and kicking people out of the shelters. When I say people I mean the elderly, the disabled, and the mentally ill. These people are ending up on the street and then the business owners call, like clean and safe, call clean and safe, and Did you know that Oregon state law says you cannot repeatedly and abusively call the city services like 9-1-1 and your point of contact? It's between a 10 and 25,000 fine when you do that. Now if you are kicking people out of hospitals and you are kicking people out of shelters and they are disabled and they have nowhere to go, guess where they are going to be? It's unfortunate you allowed the bars to buy that alley on 2nd and ankeny because now they are proprietary. When people are legally parked to live in the salvation army, female emergency shelter, they are calling and complaining about their cars when they are legally parked. I know someone in there who gets up every morning, and she would move her car, and then that guy, the business owner from the oyster bar complained. She got three tickets, and they towed her car even though she was moving her car -- she was parking during the legally allowed time, and then she would get up very early in the morning, 5:00 a.m., and she would go down and move her car from what I understand the parking when was between the late night and 7:00 a.m. In the morning was legal to park there. This guy was calling and having her ticketed and towed when she was legally parked. Now why is that? So I would like the city to like give her back her, you know, wipe the tickets off and give her the car back and towing money back, and this happens all the time. Everywhere. These business owners are calling in abusively and repeatedly when nobody is doing anything wrong. So like they will call when people cross the street to smoke, you know, where there is planters, so let's not sugar coat the fact that there is more and more disabled people and elderly ending up on the streets, and there is no housing for them.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Appreciate it. Good morning.



November 14-15, 2018

**Joe Walsh:** Good morning. My name is joe walsh. I represent individuals for justice. We take no money from this council. We take no money from the county or the state. I wish that you would require people that give you testimony to tell you how much money that they do take. How much the city concern take from the city. I don't know. In the millions. How much does anybody that testify before you take? That would be something interesting to hear because your testimony is bias, if you take money. If I give you 100, you are not going to tell me that I am a rotten person. If you take no money you may. You may tell that person that they are a rotten person to the core. We can't stop you from doing this because i've been doing it for 50 years. 20 years. 10 years. You buy property. You put people in there. You buy more property. You put people in there. You close down on the original property, and you put people in there: That's why we have 1700 that we know of on the streets, and we can't seem to do anything about it. You had ten years on a ten-year plan, and you blew it: Did you apologize? No: People are dying on the streets. We are going to have people die -- we had 48 die already this year. We had 80 last year. And you keep doing the same things. Would you think outside the box. Come up with creative solutions to the problem. This is not rocket science. Ask the people on the street, can I help you? What is it that you need? Tell me. Don't use psychiatrists. Don't use mark. He doesn't know anything. He is a millionaire. You guys are millionaires, and you know nothing about being broke. Nothing. So ask them. Ask commissioner eudaly. She may be able to tell you. I can't. I have never been on the street. We have people here -- ask them. You keep doing the same thing. We give you money over and over again. And you blow it. Over and over again. Sooner or later people are going to realize --

**Wheeler:** Thanks, mr. Walsh.

**Karla:** The last person who signed up is steve entwistle, sr.

**Wheeler:** Good morning.

**Steve Entwistle, Sr:** I'm steven entwistle. I ran for mayor twice. I am a former golden globes champion. Former homeless, well, actually I am still homeless. Yeah. I live in a place that is called housing. But to me housing is a house. So that's a lie. It's privatized sheltering. That's a correct term and not housing. Unless you want to consider housing warehousing. That will be more the term. But housing in itself, no. Privatized shelter. Why? Freedom. There is no freedom. Because you have to have a manager check to make sure that whoever you bring over is not somebody on a bad list. You can't have anybody over after 10:00, no visitors. The electricity is shut off at 10:00, so you cannot cook. Electricity doesn't come on until 8:00 in the morning so you cannot have coffee or get ready for work. Okay. That's your housing that you are talking about. I am not going to go into the part with the bed bugs and the cock roaches and the contracts that these private property managers just gloat over because They are making some bucks, okay. When you get somebody that's on social security, and they are getting whatever 700, 800, or whatever a month, and you charge through your quote, "housing, one-third. Most people that get ssi or ssd or whatever are only getting a third of what we need to survive to begin with, and you take a third of that. And then you put them in the shelter and say well, they are supposed to be humble and know that they are being taken care of. No. No. That's wrong. You wonder why people don't want for stay in that housing. You wonder why they go back on the street. That's the reason why. Okay. Nobody seems to care about that. We have a shower curtain that's been in there, 40 people that use that every day, you know, it hasn't been changed. It hasn't been -- it's starting to deteriorate. It's moldy and stuff, so a lot of people don't go into the shower. And then I am supposed to bring folks over, homeless folks to help them and bring them in off the street, and I have got to be embarrassed to show them what kind of shower we have. You don't understand. We live in the conservative world. For 50 years. It's wrong. Homelessness is going to increase, okay. You think the presidency going to do anything to help homelessness? What politician have you heard anything talk

November 14-15, 2018

about homelessness at all? In fact, in the last five years, ten years, none. Okay. That's the problem. Conservatives. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you, sir. Good morning.

**Lightning Super Data XX1PDX:** Good morning. My name is lightning. I represent lightning super data xx1 pdx. Again on the bond money as I have always stated I want to see new development for units that will last long-term, basically, outlive us all in here. Now one of the issues that you have on this is you are buying this originally using tiff funds from the downtown waterfront urban development, and you are going to possibly redevelop it using the bond money. I am a little confused why you just didn't buy this with the bond money, and maybe that can be explained. I understand you will preserve this for the next two years, so does that mean that you are going to put a lot of money and preservation and I noticed you did a seismic study, also. I sure hope that you are not going to do a seismic upgrade on a building that you are going to possibly demolish in a few years. Those are some concerns to me. I want to -- I would rather have this building saved, preserved, and keep the costs minimal, and Do your 70 sro's and implement the supportive services into the building currently. So I am not really a fan of seeing this building being demolished. One of the biggest concerns that I have, and it's also referring to the oak leaf mobile home park is that my main focus on these tenants, that if they are not staying in this building, you don't as the city, think you don't have a right to pay their relocation fees. I want you to pay double the amount to these people when they are relocated because in my opinion you think you have a pass on that. You took the pass on the oak leaf mobile home park where you brought all these people in and filled this place up with the idea that there might be a point that they can stay in there and buy their spaces. Guess what, you threw most of those people out and didn't pay any relocation fees. You came in here with these people, and then you threw them out of their place. You paid them nothing, and then you stand there and go well, it just didn't work out. No, that does not work with me. At the very least, you need to pay their relocation fees on that oak leaf mobile home park, sends them a check now in the mail from lightning. Pay the full fee. On this here, if you remove these tenants out, they better all get these relocation fees paid because I am going to monitor this and make sure you treat these people the same way anyone else should be treated. You have no exemptions because you are the city. You pay them and write them that check and let them smile about receiving all that money. Is that going to be done? Can any of you answer me, will they be paid the relocation fees? Can any of you answer me that?

**Wheeler:** Thank you no your testimony.

**Lightning:** That's what I thought. Shame on you.

**Wheeler:** Does that complete the public testimony? Call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Aye.

**Fritz:** Congratulations and thank you to the Portland housing bureau and the acquisition of the property and for the partnership with the joint office and central city concern. 70 units of supportive housing is signature. Congratulations, mayor. Aye.

**Fish:** Again, I want to thank the voters for overwhelmingly passing the ballot measures 102 and 26199. And in concert with the Portland housing bond we will be able to stretch the tax dollar and serve more people. Last year we set an audacious goal of 2,000 units of permanent, supportive housing, it is a national best practice. It is our most effective tool in addressing chronic homelessness, and I am pleased that we continue to make the progress, and this is difficult. This is steeply, affordable subsidized housing with services, and we have not figured the ins and outs of how We are going to cover the costs, but we are making progress. I am also pleased that we are acquiring this particular building, and in time, we will make sure that it is a community resource for the next 100 years. Aye.



November 14-15, 2018

**Saltzman:** This is a great addition to our portfolio of bond funded projects.

Congratulations, mayor. Very much needed. It's my understanding, from the tenant relocation ordinance, I think we made it abundantly clear that the public agencies are responsible just like the private sector landlords are to pay relocation expenses. So I fully expect when this building is renovated, there will be payments made by the city or home forward to the tenants at that time. Aye.

**Wheeler:** So there is a strong disposition in this chamber to not try anything different, to stick to the status quo, to not take any risks. I heard somebody stand up and say why do you guys always do the same thing over and over again and expect something different to happen? Well, this is something different. We are reinventing the sro model. This is just the first of many projects you are going to see like this, and the goal is to connect people who really, truly need a helping hand get inside, out of the elements, into a place where they can get whatever help it is that they need to regain their lives, and How many times have we heard people sit at those microphones and say, that used to be me. And then somebody connected me or someone has connected me to the help that I needed. Now I have got a job, and I have got my family back. More importantly than anything else I have got my sense of dignity and my sense of pride back. These kinds of projects are what it is going to take for this community to be able to make progress against homelessness. Frankly, I find it ridiculous that every time we bring an idea that I believe is a good one, and I believe is a solid one we hear 100 different reasons why we can't do it. Why we shouldn't do it. Why we should stick to what we are doing. That's not where I am going. I am going in a different direction. This project, the westwind is the beginning of a different direction for this administration and for the housing bureau, and I believe that we will look back on this, and we will say this was the right strategy to help a lot of people, not just the people who live in the building, but the people who will live in the building and the people who will live in the successor to this building on this site for many, many years to come. This is the kind of leadership that you asked me to provide when you elected me your mayor. You may have second thoughts about that. That's okay. This is what you asked me to do. This is the kind of leadership that I told you that I would provide as your leader to address the homeless situation in our community. So don't expect less of these. Expect more of these. I vote aye. The ordinance is adopted. Thank you. Thanks to my colleagues. Next item.

**Item 1167.**

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Saltzman. Commissioner Fish, I apologize. Wow.

**Fish:** That's a first. It's always been my honor to be confused with commissioner Fritz.

**Wheeler:** I picked the wrong week to give up coffee.

**Fish:** But what you have highlighted is that we do have the luxury of three former and current park commissioners on this council. I have some brief opening remarks, and we welcome pat -- kendall won't be joining us, so we welcome the chair of the parks board and the interim director of the parks bureau. The Portland parks board was established in 2001 to advise the city, to advocate for high quality park and recreational services for all residents and to provide a forum for discussions about parks related issues. Before we start with the presentations, I would like to thank pat, our chair of the Portland parks board, our vice chair, kendall and their leadership on the board, as well as the other community members who volunteer their time for This important service. We have in your materials the annual report of the parks board. I want to thank commissioner Fritz. She was the commissioner in charge during most of this time, so most of the accomplishments highlighted occurred under her watch. But pat, thank you very much for your leadership, and also thank you for agreeing during this year of budget transitions to serve as the bureau of budget advisory committee. That's a big ask. I appreciate you have taken that on with other community members, and we look forward to getting your recommendations. Ladies, why don't you take it away.

November 14-15, 2018

**Pat Frobes:** Good morning. I am happy to be here representing an energized, informed and involved parks board. We are committed to preserving our legacy of great parks and natural areas and building on that legacy to extend a core central city service to those who have been historically underrepresented and underserved. In the last 18 months, the board has shifted its focus as a board, as a whole to a more strategic system, system-wide issues and decisions that will affect our parks and natural areas for the long-term future including cost recovery policies, level of service, and financial sustainability. We welcome the new budget process. As commissioner Fish said, the Board together with the additional community and labor representatives are acting as the bureau of budget advisory committee. In that capacity, this year, rather than looking at the specific cuts and adds, we are working to align the bureau's total budget with the strategic objectives and ensure the core priorities are adequately funded. We are working to deepen our partnership with the Portland parks foundation, and we very much appreciate the support that the city council gave to one of our key partners several weeks ago. We look forward to assisting in the appointment of a personal parks director and assisting and making his or her transition a smooth one. We are also looking forward to the renewal of the 2020 vision in the form of 2035, which we hope will be a robust community-driven process that will include reimagining our parks and open space to deal with the effects of increased gentrification and density. The members of the parks board focus on these issues because we all have a very passionate belief in the role of parks and natural areas play in building the foundation for a vibrant healthy city and healthy city life. We very much have appreciated the support that we received over the years from commissioner Fritz and now certainly from commissioner Fish. We've been delighted to work with director celie, and we've been honored to serve. I would be happy to answer any questions about the report.

**Fish:** Pat, can I just -- I left one other comment off. Recently you invited the mayor and me to come before the parks board to answer questions that you had structured and then questions from the parks board. I don't know that that is something that is typically done by other oversight bodies where invitations extended to both the mayor and to the commissioner in charge. I know that if it was the normal practice, the mayor would not be getting much sleep. On top of his other obligations. I did very much appreciate the opportunity to have a conversation that you facilitated with both the mayor, who, whose unique powers is to make a budget and present it on the table, and the commissioner in charge. I hope that's a practice that other oversight bodies consider. It certainly facilitates good communication. The mayor had some interesting observations about some of his priorities. We got to have a frank conversation. I think the next time we are going to have a similar conversation if the mayor is not available, we will have a senior member of his staff. I thought it was a good innovation. I appreciated the spirit behind that gathering.

**Frobes:** Good. We certainly appreciated the time of both of you.

**Wheeler:** Could I just second that? I appreciated being invited because as you know we have a squirrely form of government here. Sometimes the walls go up. I, actually, appreciated being asked questions. I appreciated hearing what commissioner Fish had in mind for the parks bureau going forward. The value to me was understanding how to center the next budget and understanding what your priorities are and understanding what my fellow commissioner who happens to be the commissioner in charge of the parks bureau, what his priorities are, what some of his concerns are. I found it to be a valuable exchange. I look forward to more so thank you for including me.

**Frobes:** You are more than welcome. Thank you. And I will note that you also did.

**Fritz:** I would note you also visited the parks board while I was commissioner in charge and responded to their requests to keep coming back. I appreciate knowing you kept your word as expected.

November 14-15, 2018

**Fish:** Since kia is at the table I should say to director selly that you could not ask for a more welcoming transition than I have received from both the interim director and her leadership team, and I think there's light at the end of the tunnel in terms of the briefings we're going to get on the core programs of the bureau. We have done more than I can count, and we have a number to go. But the bureau has been very welcoming and has been working overtime to make sure their newest commissioner in charge is up to speed on their work and has the tools to meaningfully engage in the big policy questions we have to take up. Kia, thank you and your leadership team for the courtesies you extended to me and to my office.

**Kia Selley:** Thank you, commissioner. Mayor wheeler, commissioners, I am kia selly, interim director of parks and rec. I want to take this opportunity to thank the parks board, particularly chair frobes and vice chair clawson, who could not make it here today. They spent countless hours guiding the board as well as guiding staff. The board has provided instrumental work that will continue to make us more financially sustainable as well as to really help us with some of these landmark projects that we have ahead including vision 2035. So I want to thank them for their guidance and for the investment in our parks community. I also want to thank them for their collaboration with Portland parks foundation. That has not happened a lot in the past, and they have really reached across the aisle to make our parks and rec community stronger. So thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Fish:** Thank you very much. Mayor, I make a motion to accept the report.

**Fritz:** Second.

**Wheeler:** Any further discussion? Karla, please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Thank you for the report. I vote aye.

**Fritz:** Very much appreciated reading a summary of the results from the last year. Thank you, commissioner Fish, for acknowledging I had the honor of being commissioner in charge for most of that. Thank you, my park liaisons, and to patricia frobes and kendall clawson, co-commissioner Fish's lauding of interim director kia selly. I hope that you will engage the parks board in the interview process for permanent director. I certainly came to rely on their wisdom and commitment to equity and inclusion. And to having a representative board that covers in its membership all demographics, all backgrounds. It's a phenomenal group that I was honored to work with. Aye.

**Fish:** Let me address that right off the bat. Members of the parks board will be included in the panels that review the final candidates and that help make a recommendation to the commissioner in charge, so I would say it's an inspired suggestion, one that we're going to take. I would also say, commissioner Fritz, in my ten years appearing before a number of parks boards, we have had really the luxury I would say of very committed people with deep roots in this movement serve on the parks board. I don't know that we have ever had top to bottom a stronger parks board. Probably you could say I don't think there's been a time -- this is probably the time we needed the strongest board we have. We face a big question about future leadership. We face a big question about budget and resources to do the job. We have work to do to continue to extend the benefits of our system to people underserved in parts of our community and on and on and on. I think we're very well served. I'm very proud to be the commissioner in charge and pleased to accept your report today. Aye.

**Saltzman:** Thank you for your report. Aye.

**Wheeler:** Excellent work. Appreciate it. Look forward to a lot more. Aye. Report is accepted. Thank you both. Next item. 1173.

**Item 1173.**

November 14-15, 2018

**Wheeler:** This is the second reading of a nonemergency ordinance. We have heard presentation and taken extensive testimony on this item. Anything else for the good of the order before I call the roll? Chief, anything else you want to say? Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** I want to thank the police chief, her command staff and the city attorney for answering my questions last week. My office received the written responses to these questions yesterday. We have submitted them to the council clerk so they will become a part of the record and we will post them on our website and push the link out through social media so the public can read them as well. For members of the public who were surprised by my line of questioning last week or expressed I guess gratitude that I was finally addressing this issue I want to explain that this was an extremely rare opportunity for us to have a public dialog with the police bureau and the city attorney, that this is nothing new for me. I just haven't had a chance to really speak about it publicly. As I mentioned previously, these questions were generated by myself, my office staff, constituents and advocacy organizations. I asked them with multiple intentions. First and foremost because these are questions that Portland activists have been waiting years and sometimes decades to hear the answer to. Secondly, to illustrate the many concerns I have with this ordinance. Finally, to give the police bureau an opportunity to clarify possible points of misunderstanding with the public. I also want to go on record saying that I believe the mayor and police chief have good intentions with this ordinance even if they can't be as explicit as I can I know that they want to stop right wing extremists from disrupting our city and threatening residents as much as I do. I also know many of our officers are committed to this objective as well. However, because of how existing policies have been and are being applied I cannot vote to expand their powers. We are trapped in a dangerous dynamic between right wing extremists, counter protesters and police with no clear path forward. This poses a threat to public safety and there's a growing frustration among the public that we can't seem to manage these protests effectively. I share their frustrations. I agree that something must change. However, this is not an issue that can be solved by policing alone. We need advocacy organizations to step up to continue to step up and offer us meaningful policy solutions and community support. We need a concerted community effort to shut these right wing extremists down. Yes, they have constitutional rights that must be protected regardless of how repugnant we find their beliefs, but businesses have the choice of who they choose to serve and if these groups don't meet their community standards, they shouldn't be helping them peddle hate, raise money, print tee shirts or publish websites. If they don't meet their community standards we shouldn't support them with our business. Nationalists, bigots, racists and fascists are not protected classes. We need our colleagues at every level of government to speak out against hate and specifically the hate groups who are targeting our city and we need the media to bring an objective and critical eye to these matters to better help the public understand the issues that we're contending with. Our policies -- i'm going to repeat something I said last week because I think it bears repeating. Our policies and police bureau may have to be content neutral but I don't have to remain neutral in my remarks. Right wing extremists pose a greater threat to our national security than isis. This is not my personal opinion, this is a fact known by law enforcement. Counter-protesters are not the problem, they are a byproduct of the problem and i'm grateful to the thousands of residents who have engaged in peaceful protest in opposition to this administration, in opposition to the growth of facism, and false equivalencies between right wing protesters and counter-protesters. There's a tendency to paint all counter-protesters with the same brush based on the worst actors when people committing violence and vandalism are a tiny minority of the over all resistance playing out on our streets. When that behavior is often provoked by the police bureau's crowd control tactics, counter-protesters occupy a broad spectrum of the left from moderates to radicals. The vast majority are peaceful. Yet I often hear them all



November 14-15, 2018

characterized as lawless and anarchists. I would expect a more nuanced understanding than the antiquated characteristics of bomb throwing anarchists. It's based on mutual aid and direct democracy, autonomous individuals working together for the greater good in a nonhierarchical system. It's not an inherently violent belief system, and in fact has a strong tradition of nonviolence and pacifism. I'll take anarchists over fascists any day. [applause] over the past 27 years, since I started attending rallies, marches and protests, I have personally witnessed police brutality and excessive use of force. I have friends who have been victims of it, and have sued the city and won settlements. I was part of a group of activists being illegally surveilled by Portland police in the 1990s. I'm not taking a stroll down memory lane for fun or street credit, i'm painting a picture of my perspective as an activist, observer and now policy maker. We have a policing problem when it comes to protests but it's not just the protesters. We have each taken an oath to uphold the constitutions of the united states, state of Oregon and the city of Portland charter. We have a moral and legal obligation to defend the constitutional rights of everyone regardless of whether we agree with their politics, speech, tactics or strategies. We also have a moral and legal obligation to ensure the public safety. There is a balance to be struck here. Unfortunately, I do not believe this ordinance achieves it. I look forward to continued communication and collaboration with advocates and activists, my colleagues, and the Portland police bureau on how to best achieve our obligations and ensure public safety but with all due respect to the mayor and the police chief, I vote no.

**Fritz:** Thank you to everybody who took time to testify during last week's hearing including representative jenelle bynum, andrew -- steve faulstick of travel Portland, kimberly mccullum, beth wootson, commissioner elect jo ann hardesty and others. Thank you, chief outlaw, for listening to the testimony in person and being here today to hear our comments in person. Thank you to my staff for helping with this response to the proposal, especially cynthia castro and tim crail. Thank you, mayor, for listening to feedback and amending the ordinance to make it much improved from the original proposal. Even so I cannot support this ordinance. Oregon and the pacific northwest have been strongholds of white supremacy for over two centuries. The city of Portland has a long, shameful history of discrimination, hate crimes and racism. This is unacceptable and must end. White supremacists are not welcome in Portland and the city council should make that clear in every decision we make. Violence during demonstrations is a community issue that has threatened public safety, resources, our economy and reputation as a safe and welcoming city. This is a community issue that requires community engagement and buy-in to address. From its very beginning as a state Oregon has normalized hate speech and embolden individuals to act on hostility towards marginalized communities. Now vitriolic rhetoric at the national level is further inciting violence all over our country. We can point to many examples such as the tragedies in pittsburgh and kentucky last month, in charlottesville last year, and in the incident that occurred here in 2017 on the max. It's all too familiar as we remember the murder of ethiopian mulugeta seraw 30 years ago. Thank you to the urban league of Portland for commemorating the anniversary with an inspiring conference yesterday. Thank you, mayor, and commissioner, for joining me there. We must counter hatred and divisiveness with love and unity. With a policy that proposes to tell people how, when and where they can protest the community must be engaged and listened to in forming a proposal. This did not happen before the ordinance was proposed and the ordinance should not be the starting point for these conversations. We need to convene discussions with stakeholders such as business owners, Portland police bureau, and the aclu, to develop reasonable, specific mechanisms to reduce problems at protests. The aclu has already signaled the desire to help as has the western state center, council on american islamic relations of Oregon, and the Oregon justice resource center. There are solutions. We can support counter demonstrations that draw attention away from white

November 14-15, 2018

supremacists rather than feeding into their quest for an audience and a fight. Lawyers will debate whether this ordinance is constitutional. Arguing about restrictions in court when they may not even help much on the ground is not wise use of taxpayer money. The regulations distract attention from the underlying problem. There have already been protests about the protest ordinance and more may happen if it passes. We need unity and compassion in Portland right now, not more arguing amongst ourselves. This ordinance seeks to address the problem of violence at demonstrations by giving the mayor the authority to tell Portlanders and others what to do with Portland police then charged with enforcing those rules as well as existing laws on criminal and misdemeanor behaviors. The problem we're addressing today is not disparate treatment by Portland police. The problem is that white supremacy has been woven to the fabric of our community far too long and we're faced once again with hate speech leading to violence and protests at protests and in our community. That's where we need to focus our energy. As we grapple with the violence on our streets, the nation watches us. The proposed ordinance is not an accurate reflection of who we are as a city. Let us show our community and our nation that we are resilient, that when Portlanders come together we're a force to be reckoned with, that violence will not be tolerated and perpetrators and instigators will be held accountable. We first need to do another thing that Portlanders do well. Talk with each other and listen to each other. I'm confident Portlanders can help the council divine better solutions than this. No.

**Fish:** Mayor, colleagues, after careful consideration I cannot support this ordinance. I want to begin this morning with where we agree. Everyone should be welcome in our public square. Hate, bigotry and violence have no place in our community. It's long overdue that we link arms and say to the proud boys, patriot prayer and those who would bring hate into our community: Stay home. Protecting public safety is one of our basic obligations. Any limits on the rights of free speech and public assembly protected in our state and federal constitution are subject to heightened legal scrutiny. In general government must establish that those limits are last resort. There's been too much violence during recent protests, especially instigated by members of alt-right groups using Portland as a staging ground. These event have taken precious resources out of other neighborhoods leaving east Portland and other areas without the services they like all of us help fund and deserve. They also have a consequence for our goals around community policing. My vote today is based on several factors. First, I have concerns about the constitutionality of the protest ordinance. At the very least it sets us up for a costly and divisive legal battle. Second, I'm not convinced that we have done everything we can with the tools already at our disposal including arresting people who violate our laws. Third, I'm encouraged by the offers we received from civil liberties and civil rights organizations to develop a new approach to address the alt-right violence in our streets. This is a close call for me. The mayor as police commissioner is entitled to a certain amount of deference. I'm grateful to mayor wheeler for beginning this conversation. He's right to focus on solutions to the unacceptable violence on our streets and the rising tide of hate and intolerance of a vocal minority. And he has made real progress pursuing the police reform agenda on which he ran for office. At the same time I cannot ignore the many community voices that have raised fair concerns with this approach and have offered to be part of a different solution. My vote is not a referendum on the job chief outlaw is doing. She has the hardest job in local government and deserves our respect and our support. Nor is it a commentary on the women and men in uniform who serve and protect our city. They too deserve our respect and support. Rather it reflects my sincere ambivalence with this path forward and my belief that other alternatives will be more successful. I am grateful to the many community leaders who shared their perspective during this debate. I'm proud of the conversation we have had among colleagues on this dias, but today I vote no. [applause]



November 14-15, 2018

**Wheeler:** Excuse me, mr. Walsh, you're here a lot. You know the rules.

**Walsh:** I know the rules. [applause]

**Wheeler:** We'll take a recess.

**Saltzman:** I want to associate myself with my colleagues about the remarks they made about our country, our city right now and the predominance of alt-right and hate groups but I come down on this very differently. First i'm no lawyer. I'll leave the legal arguments to the lawyers to decide, but I look at it from a civil matter of how do we best protect Portlanders. I think in many respects I fully -- we all fully respect everybody's right to protest and exercise their rights to free speech, but there's also a public safety factor as mayor wheeler's proposed ordinance does, to provide the mayor the ability to say do your protests but do it a block away from each other so you're not provoking, goading one another, and to the extent that that happens the patriot prayer and proud boys, they are playing us like a fiddle. They know they can come down to Portland because they know they can provoke the response and they know that they can ultimately -- the police -- to my mind they are often caught in the middle. They get provoked too. They are only human. If you insult somebody, throw something at them they are going to respond like any human would, try to protect themselves, they are going to be angry. These are very fundamental, basic human emotions, but I think that we have too much goading and we're being played like a fiddle. I can't help but think this is the 80th anniversary of the krystallnacht, the night nazis played the german people like a fiddle, unleashed their fury on jewish merchants and residents of their country. These groups are doing that to us. I think we need a strong step forward. I think mayor wheeler's proposed ordinance may not be -- may not be constitutional but we need to try things. We need to try solutions. We can't just sit up here and celebrate the first amendment and at the same time express our concerns about the predominance of the alt-right and hate groups without trying to do something about it and protect Portlanders from getting into situations where they are going to be hurt, maimed, god forbid even killed. I see that the current path we're on provides no answers. This is a proposed answer. It's a modest step to protect Portlanders, and I thank mayor wheeler and chief outlaw for bringing this forward. I'm pleased to vote aye.

**Wheeler:** So obviously anybody here can count knows that this is over, but there's a few things I would like to say nonetheless. First of all I would like to start with this. The ordinance, the very first sentence was a reaffirmation of this council's commitment to first amendment rights, to this council's commitment to the right to assembly and the right to speak one's mind. Even if what is being said is considered reprehensible. That was first and foremost in our minds. So those who say that this is an abridgement of the first amendment I want you to know that was not my intention, was never my intention. There are two people in this city who are routinely held accountable for violence on the streets. Both of them are sitting in this chamber. Chief outlaw and myself as the police commissioner. It is our responsibility to maintain the public safety during demonstrations and the safety includes those who are demonstrating. Those who are counter demonstrating. We have seen many instances where people who are peacefully assembled get caught up in a violent situation with an opposing group and that is the kind of thing we don't want to see happen because it actually dampens people's enthusiasm for showing up and being heard. Nobody wants to be put at risk. I asked for this tool as an additional tool, and I was also surprised by some of the testimony you said if you do this that means you're not doing that. No, we're going to do a lot of different things. We're going to continue to enforce the laws with the tools and the resources that we have available. Second of all, we're going to continue to set clear expectations around protests and you've heard me say the mantra over and over again. Don't block the regional transit system. Don't go on the bridges. Don't commit acts of violence or vandalism. There's no circumstance where violence is a justifiable means to a political end. We have made that

November 14-15, 2018

very, very clear. If we're going to enforce the laws, and I heard from a number of the constitutional attorneys who came up and by the way I hope you appreciated the fact I didn't try to run the table. We invited the ACLU and others to come up and speak in opposition, freely speak in opposition for as long as they wanted to against the ordinance that I was proposing because I really wanted us to take a deep dive, to hear the different nuances around constitutionality and the law. What I heard repeatedly is you need to enforce the laws that you have on the books. Great. If we're going to do that, though, I hope we're committed to giving the police bureau the resources, the personnel, the tools, and the training that they need to be able to do that safely. You heard chief outlaw testify that even during that last significant protest, we -- she made the decision or her commanders, her command staff made the decision to pull in resources from north and east Portland. That meant people who are paying their taxes in the city who expect a certain police response did not get it because all of our resources were deployed downtown. And she said as a law professional, a law enforcement professional with several decades of experience, that she believed this ordinance would actually reduce the need for arrests by clarifying in advance what the rules are. Not abridging people's first amendment rights but keeping people separated within a reasonable distance so they could still hear each other, still interact but there would be less of an opportunity for people to commit acts of violence. This ordinance despite what I read in the paper, I was a little surprised to read a couple of times that it gives broad authority to the mayor around crowd control. In fact, it was a very narrowly tailored ordinance and I hope at some point for those of you who didn't actually, a lot of times people don't want to wade through an ordinance. I totally get that. But read it. It's actually very narrowly proscribed and it explains very specific circumstances where the ordinance could be implemented, and it required an unprecedented level of transparency before the ordinance could be enacted. I thought this was a very reasonable, preemptive tool to have in our tool kit along with other tools that we have. Other cities have successfully defended time, place and manner restrictions in court. We heard a lot on the constitutionality, and like commissioner Saltzman, I'm not a constitutional lawyer but I will tell you constitutional lawyers are divided on the constitutionality of this particular ordinance. It maybe came a little bit too late in the game to help shape the narrative. I have learned one thing from this. If you put an ordinance out there and there's any question about its legality make sure your lawyers get to the media first because once that frame is set it's very, very hard to turn that frame around. I wondered why people were jumping before they had even seen the final version of the ordinance and expressing their complete confidence that the ordinance was unconstitutional having not actually read all of the details in the ordinance. Now I know why. It's nearly impossible to turn that narrative, but there was somebody who did chime in near the end, and I want you to know who she was. Her name is Mary McCord, the senior litigator for the Institute for Constitutional Advocacy and Protection. She is a professor at Georgetown University's law center. She was the one who led the successful litigation we heard a lot about on behalf of the city of Charlottesville and local small businesses and neighborhood associations against the alt-right white nationalists and militia organizations and individuals who engaged in paramilitary activity after the August 2017 Unite the Right rally. She said number one, the ordinance on its face is constitutional. She agreed with our city attorney and disagreed with some of the testimony we heard last week. She said on its face the ordinance is constitutional. The second thing she said was that there are other legal strategies that we could pursue in addition to this ordinance. And we had a couple of very good conversations and we heard some testimony around some potential other legal strategies. We heard about educational strategies, training, litigation. All these things were ultimately included in the ordinance. I appreciate that. There were concerns about the mayor in this case actually the police commissioner per the ordinance, sorry, being able to

November 14-15, 2018

put into place time, place and manner restrictions. Recently referred to how, when and where a group could protest. Colleagues, we already do that. When you file for a permit with the city of Portland, you are already agreeing to a time, place, and manner restriction. The difference is we know how many police are needed. We know where they are needed, we know if there's conflicts with other events that are taking place. Commissioner Fritz raised a great question last week and I don't think it was very well stated in the ordinance and I want to clarify this. The number of people, people said, well, is ted going to say only 100 people can show up for a demonstration? Number one it would be stricken down as unreasonable on its face if it was a large public space. But we already have restrictions on the number of people. If you filed for a permit and you want to be in a park block and you say I want 10,000 people we're going to tell you no. We'll suggest a different location, maybe waterfront park where more people could congregate safely. Also not damage the facilities that we have. This ordinance only impacted those who choose not to apply for a permit. I want to be very clear. It would have put nonpermitted demonstrations on the same footing with permitted demonstrations under very limited circumstances where we knew two or more groups with either a history of violence or stated intent of violence were coming together. So where does this leave us? This was an approach the chief and I thought could help address what we saw as potentially escalating situation in our community. We put it out there. It has not carried the day. We are still interested in doing something more than the status quo because the status quo is clearly not working for our community. While we are very concerned about the rights of protesters and counter-protesters, we are also concerned about the rights of everybody else who works and lives in this community, and who are increasingly troubled by what they are seeing unfold on the streets of this community. I heard a lot of people at the microphone say last week we have different approaches, we have new approaches. I hope they mean something other than the two year long conversation about the general state of policing. We have plenty of tables already focused on police reform. We already have our directives on crowd control that have been out there to the public. We already have a lot of conversations going about best policing practice, 21st century policing, community policing. The use of technology like body cams around policing. Those conversations are ongoing. If we have more to say on this immediate issue, this urgent issue, that is unfolding on our streets today I will continue to work with anyone who has a good idea. Last but not least I read in my willamette week this morning bob ansing said something. I have to call it out. I believe he mischaracterized the meeting that my staff and I had with him. He did offer three good ideas. Three good ideas around policing. His first idea was that we educate public employees. We educate the community, and we educate the media about the alt-right in our community. I'm all for education. The second thing I told him i'm not supportive of it, it was a whole slough of ideas and discussions and conversations that are already taking place at other tables. I don't want to create more tables. I wanted to engage him and his group at the tables that already exist. The pcep, crc, other areas where we already have that opportunity. The third thing he suggested was that we go to georgetown, we go to mary mccord, the woman who endorsed my ordinance, and work with her and her colleagues to see if there's another strategy to keep militia type organizations out of our community. Commissioner Fish was compelled by that and he added it as an amendment to this ordinance which I appreciated. I think we should continue to take a good, hard look at that strategy as well. That was a little longer than I wanted to be. I apologize. I just wanted you to know this is very important. That i'm sorry there's one more thing and I promise i'll stop. Commissioner Fish said something that resonated with me. That is telling joey gibson and the proud boys and others to stay home. I want to remind you all, I tried that strategy. And I honestly learned from that experience because I heard from many people including many people in this room right now that that was unconstitutional. I asked

November 14-15, 2018

the federal homeland security to cancel the parks permit for proud boys in the days following the max murders. I wasn't saying stay out of Portland forever just don't come this week when our community is angry and it's grieving, and we have limited police to deal with what could be a potentially very, very ugly public safety situation. I thought it was a very reasonable approach to take but I think something like 150 editorial boards around the country described me as an enemy of the first amendment, the ACLU was profoundly upset with me. Others in this community and in this room felt that I really stepped into it and overstepped my bounds as mayor by asking them not to come because after all the first amendment protects all speech, even reprehensible speech. So this ordinance was something else, new direction. I obviously vote aye. I support it. But I will continue to work with you and the chief and anyone else who has good ideas. As a community we got to come together to solve this problem. I vote aye. The ordinance fails. Thank you. [applause]

**Wheeler:** Next item. 1174, please.

**Item 1174.**

**Wheeler:** Good morning, Shannon.

**Callahan:** Good morning, Mayor, Commissioners. Shannon Callahan from the Portland Housing Bureau. I'm pleased to be here today to request your approval for the appointment of three new members to the Portland Housing Advisory Commission. The Portland Housing Advisory Commission advises the Director of the Housing Bureau, Housing Commissioner and City Council on policy, strategy and resource issues. It helps us promote improvements within our own bureau and within the larger housing system. I am honored that each of the appointees today are willing to devote their time and expertise to advise us. They are each respected experts in their field and represent different facets of the work involving affordable housing. Felicia Trip Folsom is Deputy Director of the Portland Housing Center with deep expertise, experience and passion for creating new homeowners. Her particular emphasis is on closing the minority homeownership gap in our region and Felicia was with us this morning but unfortunately had to leave a few moments ago. I'm joined today by Molly Rogers, who is the Director of Asset Management and Housing Policy at Home Forward. She brings to us best practice expertise in successfully managing and operating buildings with appropriate services. Also joining me is Sarah Stevenson, Executive Director of Innovative Housing, Inc., a committed developer of more than 1300 units of affordable housing with emphasis on wrap-around services. What that I would like to turn it over to Sarah and Molly to say a few words. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Welcome.

**Sarah Stevenson, Executive Director Innovative Housing Inc:** Thank you. I'm Sarah. I began working with homeless men and women in Washington D.C. in 1994. For the last 24 years I have dedicated my professional life to creating safe, accessible, affordable housing for low income people. I have done this in D.C., in New York and in Portland where I was born and raised. I feel very strongly that home is a foundation upon which we build our lives and everyone deserves a safe place to live. I would be honored to join the commission to contribute my passion and expertise to the city that I love as we work together to find a path out of our housing crisis. If the last 24 years has taught me anything it's that affordable housing is not easy or fast but we can do better. We have the political will, the professional capacity, voter support and significant resources to get started on our solution. What we need is a comprehensive plan with clear goals and measurable outcomes that moves toward housing for people of all abilities and income levels. It will take time but our leaders, our housing providers, the public, and most importantly those who do not have stable housing need to know that our city has a plan that makes sense and steadfastness to implement it. I think that that is true and that we can do that. I appreciate the opportunity to participate in this critical work with you. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.



November 14-15, 2018

**Molly Rogers, Home Forward:** Good morning. Mayor, commissioners, I'm Molly Rogers, director of asset management and housing policy at Home Forward, the housing authority serving Multnomah County. I have been working in affordable housing development implementation and policy making in Portland for 16 years and prior to that in New York City and Minneapolis. Over this time have had the honor to work on ending homelessness issues, permanent supportive housing policy and implementation, asset management capacity building, fair housing, streamlining compliance, turn-around strategies for assets and long-term housing sustainability. I'm currently co-chair of the Housing Alliance's preservation work group, board chair of the Housing Development Center and member of the Housing Oregon Portland Metro Policy Council. I'm excited about this opportunity to serve on the Portland Housing Advisory Commission because I believe we are poised to take this city to the next level of integration and inclusion with unprecedented resources and tools. I have been particularly interested in inclusionary housing and how to integrate diverse populations within a single community. As the former president of the New Columbia Owners Association, I have seen firsthand the challenges and benefits and vibrancy of a mixed income community, what it can bring. I'm also extremely interested in figuring out how to better align health care with housing starting with systems alignment and ending with improved outcomes for individuals. I have learned over the years that good policy is informed by those affected by those policies and by those asked to implement them. I appreciate this opportunity to join these other leaders on this Portland Housing Advisory Commission. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Callahan:** Thank you, Mayor. That concludes our presentation.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Fish:** Move the report.

**Saltzman:** Second.

**Wheeler:** Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Congratulations and thank you for your willingness to serve the city. I'm really excited to see what you do. Aye.

**Fritz:** This is such an important commission. Thank you so much for your willingness to serve. It's a lot of work. Aye.

**Fish:** I was just reflecting on what a fantastic lineup this is. I'm not one for baseball analogies but I'm sure there's a Yankees team in the '20s that was comparable through the need of the order. These women are big time community leaders around affordable housing and addressing homelessness. I have one special request. So Mayor Adams and I worked on creating the Portland Housing Bureau and when we created the Portland Housing Bureau I worked with Director Van Veto to connect the Portland Housing Advisory Commission. It was our hope at the time that it would be an oversight body that not only helped shape the legislative agenda and priorities of the Housing Bureau but where the Commission disagreed with some action taken or was split in some way, it was our hope that the Council would be the beneficiary of that information. It is actually fairly rare that we get communication from the PHAC. But in my view, to honor its full potential, the Council would welcome the opportunity to hear from the PHAC from time to time. That includes where you have a dissenting view with the Bureau. After all, it's not just about having kumbaya moments. It's this particular body has shown we can handle principle disagreements at a high level. If the PHAC feels that we're on the wrong path, that an investment we're making is not justified, if there's some policy disagreement or if you have comments about how to strengthen an ordinance before Council I know the three nominees are not by nature reluctant to share that information but what I want to encourage you is that was really what was intended when we set up the PHAC, was to have a separate independent body to provide us with guidance. Please, please take full advantage of that

November 14-15, 2018

opportunity if there's a disagreement about something we're doing. Thank you for your service. I'm very proud to support all three candidates. Aye.

**Saltzman:** Thank you, sarah, molly, and felicia, for your willingness to serve. We really appreciate the wealth of expertise that you all three bring to this area of housing. I also want to point out that felicia is also the newest member of the children's levy allocation committee as our citizen representative. She's a busy person in addition to seeing her daughter honored last night for her activities and received a spirit of Portland award. I know felicia says in her bio when she's not working, she's busy carpooling her kids around. We know she's busy. I really appreciate all you've done for our community and all you will contribute as members of the housing advisory commission. Aye.

**Wheeler:** I could not be happier. This is a great panel. I'm very pleased to bring such incredible nominees forward. Yeah, you're already established leaders, you have a great track record. You already have forgotten more than most of us ever knew about these issues. We're all going to benefit from your leadership. Thank you for your commitment. We know there are many, many other things you could be doing and i'm personally really pleased as a resident, not even as the mayor. Just as a resident i'm really happy that we have people like you willing to step up and volunteer your time on an important issue. Thank you so much. I vote aye. The report is adopted. Thank you. Congratulations. Next item, 1175.

**Item 1175.**

**Wheeler:** Commissioner eudaly.

**Eudaly:** Thank you, mayor. This project will provide seamless pedestrian connections on portions of northeast killingsworth and northeast prescott. It will advance our vision zero goals and it's essential to safe routes to schools in the cully neighborhood. We have marty maloney here from pbob to give you more information.

**Marty Mahoney, Bureau of Transportation:** Thank you. Good morning. I'm marty maloney with pbob right of way. The agenda item is to authorize eminent domain authority as well as the ability to offer just compensation to affected property owners for needed permit and temporary rights associated with the connected cully project. All affected property owners have been informed about the city needs for the property rights and were invited to attend the agenda reading. I guess I would be happy to answer any questions council might have at this time.

**Wheeler:** Any further questions?

**Fritz:** Looks like the areas are fairly small. Is that correct?

**Mahoney:** Yeah. Mostly temporary construction easements. We do have a couple permanent acquisitions, but they are minor.

**Fritz:** As far as you know none of the residents have a problem with that?

**Mahoney:** I haven't spoken to everybody. I have sent out mailings but everybody I have spoken to have been on board with the project.

**Fritz:** Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Any public testimony, Karla?

**Karla:** No one signed up.

**Wheeler:** Look at that. You answered everybody's questions and you're totally noncontroversial. That's a good thing. Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Thank you, marty, thank you, everyone who has come together to make this important project happen. I vote aye.

**Fritz:** This is a much needed project in a neighborhood that has a significant lack of sidewalks. If I were a property owner there I would be really excited about having a safe access way on very busy streets so thank you for your work. Aye.

**Saltzman:** Yes, much needed improvements. Thank you, aye.



November 14-15, 2018

**Wheeler:** One more step in connected cully. Thanks. Great work. Thank you, commissioner eudaly. I vote aye. The ordinance is adopted. Next, 1176.

**Item 1176.**

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fritz.

**Fritz:** Thank you, mayor. My staff and I had the opportunity to tour the bull run watershed to look at the water bureau's assets there and I have challenges with motion sickness and I would have to say thank you to russell for driving the van so very carefully. He knows every bump and pothole and curve in the road and had to take much of it at five miles an hour to make it safe and comfortable for us. When we got to the portion of the road that has been improved, I had a sigh of relief. It's particularly important because obviously there are sometimes public safety issues that occur in the watershed that vehicles need to travel faster than five miles an hour. So, this is a project to continue the improvements in the watershed. Here to tell us about them is Teresa elliott, chief engineer.

**Wheeler:** Good morning.

**Teresa Elliott:** Good morning. I think its still morning. I'm Teresa elliott, chief engineer Portland water bureau. Thank you, mayor, commissioners. I too have a lot of motion sickness, so I don't go on those tours any more than I absolutely have to. For me it's the windy roads. Forget the bumps. Thank you. I'm before you, asking for approval to solicit bids for a construction project to authorize payment to do road 10 project. This project will rebuild roughly three miles of the road 10 which is our primary access in the bull run watershed. If approved we will be doing -- we expect to be doing bids this winter, probably in january, february, then construction starting this summer. We will be using the city's formal competitive low bid process. We have an estimated construction cost of about \$1.5 million, and with that i'm certainly willing to take questions.

**Wheeler:** Colleagues, any questions? Very good. Any public testimony on this item?

**Karla:** One person signed up. Charles bridgecrane johnson.

**Wheeler:** Good morning. Barely good morning.

**Johnson:** Still good morning, commissioners. I think we'll make it. I probably will only need three minutes. While we're noting people give perfect testimony unchallenged it's got to be the professional competence and excellence of amanda Fritz that leads us to having only me testify on a water bureau issue, not what nick Fish had to go through during his time.

**Fish:** I remember it a little differently, charles. [laughter] you're entitled to your -- [speaking simultaneously]

**Johnson:** I want to thank the chief engineer for doing the math so we didn't have to subtract and for the water bureau keeping the mile post designations down to the decimal point of the hundreds. I don't know if we can even get the pavers to be that accurate. I would foretell voting yes on this ordinance even if you won't be mailing me at 2105 northeast sunny crest road, newberg, Oregon, 97432, the money for where the other project goes. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Very good.

**Fritz:** I want to acknowledge the great work commissioner Fish has done over the past five years. There would be a time there would be 20 people signed up for a simple road improvement in the watershed. Thank you, commissioner Fish.

**Fish:** Thank you.

**Wheeler:** I feel fortunate because I missed that era. It feels pretty smooth sailing so thank you both. This is first reading of an nonemergency ordinance. It moves to second reading. 1177.

**Item 1177.**

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fish.

**Fish:** Mayor, colleagues, one-way Portland parks and recreation provides excellent customer service is allowing customers to register for classes or to make facility

November 14-15, 2018

reservations on their computer at home or on the phone. Today we'll hear a presentation about this tool from claudio campuzano, parks business operations manager, and david grinstaff --

**Claudio Campuzano:** David can't be with us. We have shelly pendergrass.

**Fish:** Even better. Shelly, welcome. Claudio is a switch hitter, here not only to support this as parks business operations manager but if you would like him to put on his halt as independent budget office he's here to say why he would recommend -- just kidding. Take it away.

**Campuzano:** Good morning. Claudio campuzano, finance and property technology for Portland parks and recreation. I'm joined by shelly pendergrass, our technology manager Portland parks and recreation is responsible for developing and maintaining facilities and places for public recreation and providing coordinating recreation services and programs that contribute to the health and well-being of residents of all ages and abilities. Since 1993 parks has used software to support program and registrations, facility registrations, pass sales, payments by point of sale. Parks has contracted with the active network since 2009 for these services. Since parks has offered online activity registrations starting in 2015 we began reservations of picnic and reservation sites. 15% of customers register for activities online equating to about 100,000 registrations last fiscal year. 30% reserved their picnic or wedding sites online. So in fiscal year 2017-18 we served 85,000 customers with an approximately 300,000 registrations, reservations and pass sales and transactions through active net. Parks offers subscriptions built based on monthly transaction volume as the total volume increases our costs will increase but the requested amount is based on the last three years of transaction history and we feel confident we won't surpass the 3 million over five years. So continuation of the active net software provides continuity for the public and staff. We actually just went through a big transition to their online tool a couple of years ago. That's been a big lift for the bureau, but did require considerable training and effort. We're happy to be continuing with this product for the next five, perhaps ten years. It really allows parks to avoid expensive and time-consuming migration to any new software product and allows efficient, effective support to customers, a key part of meeting our objectives. That's all i've got.

**Wheeler:** Anything further? Any public testimony?

**Karla:** Maggie. She may have left.

**Wheeler:** I think she has departed. Very good. Anything else before we call the roll? Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Aye.

**Fritz:** I remember what a huge undertaking it was to transition from the previous recreation management software class to active net. After utilizing active net for three years and vetting other vendors, there were four others that responded to the request for proposals, I trust parks determination that continuing with active net is the best option at this time. The costs to continue with that are the same as it has been so thank you for your work. Thank you, commissioner Fish. Aye.

**Fish:** Aye. **Saltzman:** Aye.

**Wheeler:** Aye. The ordinance is adopted. 1178.

**Item 1178.**

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fish.

**Fish:** Mayor, colleagues, this ordinance is the culmination of five years of planning, design and fund-raising by multiple partners who have a shared vision for improving leach garden an iconic place in east Portland. By having Portland parks and recreation move forward with the leach upper garden development project parks continues its commitment to closing the recreation and open space gaps in east Portland. The project manager is here to give a brief presentation. Good morning. Or good afternoon.

November 14-15, 2018

**Ross Swanson, Parks and Recreation:** Thank you, commissioner Fish. Mayor, council members i'm capital project manager for leach botanical garden here to seek permission to go out to bid for the upper garden development project. It's been in development since 2014 and was a collaborative effort between park and rec, leach garden friends, prosper Portland and metro, a successful partnership between the agencies and nonprofit. Leach gardens has successfully raised 2.6 million as part of a challenge grant put forth by commissioner Fritz. Other comes from metro, prosper Portland, pstrc, total budget of 9.8 million. There's my notes.

**Fritz:** Could you make that larger? Thank you.

**Swanson:** Scope of the work include improved infrastructure and utilities for the garden, an aerial tree walk, community open spaces which includes a fireplace, terrace and gathering green demonstrated above. Habitat and pollinator garden. The project is working its way through permits and is preparing to go to bid this winter. We're here to receive authorization from council. Current cost is approximately \$6.4 million with a moderate level of confidence. I'm here to answer any questions.

**Wheeler:** Public testimony?

**Karla:** No one signed up.

**Wheeler:** Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Well, thank you, commissioner Fritz, and commissioner Fish. I love this garden. This is such an exciting project. I'm just excited to follow it every step of the way. I vote aye.

**Fritz:** Thank you for your presentation and all your work on this project. This is an extremely exciting project and leach botanical garden is a hidden jewel that we hope to become less hidden, more accessible, even more well visited. For decades community members have visited to learn about horticultural and environmental sustainability and find respite from the city. It was what the founders envisioned for the property. This upper garden development project will carry on the legacy and i'm particularly excited about the accessible pathways that will be built. Thanks to leach garden friends, metro and prosper Portland for funding contributions to make this project become a reality. Thanks to Portland parks and recreation. Aye.

**Fish:** You know, as a parent i'm not supposed to favor one child over another. So as a parks commissioner i'm not supposed have one partner that I prefer over another. But I want to join with my colleagues in celebrating the real importance of leach botanical garden not only to our city but to an underserved part of our city in east Portland. We got good news recently. The old phoenix drugstore that is on I guess on foster that had been in disrepair for a long time, which is where the leaches had their drugstore, is now the subject of a preservation effort led by rick Michaelson and others. It's one of my favorite buildings. My colleagues know it, it's the last building before you head over to the firefighters association for your endorsement meeting. [laughter] it's a beautiful building that someday will be restored hopefully to its great glory. There are many ways that we can support leach garden. Colleagues, for example, if you're doing an event or know someone who wants to do an event you can rent space at leach garden. For example, my team has decided that when we do our retreat to make our agenda for next year we're doing it at leach. I see --

**Eudaly:** We're doing that too.

**Fish:** It's a modest fee but also another way of giving back and supporting what they are doing. I want to thank commissioner Fritz who had the great benefit during her tenure of one of the great bull markets on sdc revenue that we have ever seen in the city that go to parks. She invested quite a lot of money in the future success of this vision for leach botanical garden. Just like Washington park is a treasure on the west side of the river and has amenities that are city-wide and focused, this is on the other side of the river and is

November 14-15, 2018

also a citywide treasure. I'm so pleased that we're getting started by taking this action and putting out a solicitation. I thank the staff of Portland parks and rec for their commitment to this project and thank commissioner Fritz for the work she did to get us to this point. I'm proud to vote aye.

**Saltzman:** This is a fantastic master plan for leach botanical garden. Really excited and i'm happy we're getting started on making that a reality. Aye.

**Wheeler:** It's a stunning vision. Thank you, everybody. I vote aye. The ordinance is adopted. We have a four-fifths, 1178-1. Commissioner Eudaly.

**Item 1178-1.**

**Eudaly:** So before us today is the last of three actions for southwest corridor light-rail project that were needed this fall. In September we adopted the equitable housing strategy, two weeks ago we accepted the locally approval alternative. This is a agreement to transfer portions of Barbur boulevard to the city for ownership. This will ensure that when light-rail is added to Barbur boulevard that the street is rebuilt to meet city standards for travel lanes, sidewalks, protected bike lanes, crosswalk spacing and stormwater treatment. We will become the owner and operator of the street. These types of transfers are common between odot and the city. In fact, in 1993 we accepted the north section of highway 99 west in order to add light-rail on interstate avenue. We have also accepted martin luther king, jr., boulevard, portions of naito parkway and sandy boulevard to transform urban heights into urban corridors at city scale. It brings us one giant step closer to our vision of what barbur boulevard could become in the future. In the future I anticipate returning with a transfer agreement for naito parkway so we can build the ross island bridge head improvements. Unfortunately, that will not be happening today. We have teresa boyle here from pbot to address any questions you may have.

**Teresa Boyle, Bureau of Transportation:** Good morning. I was fortunate enough to be able to listen to some of this morning's testimony, so I having changed the background on my power point.

**Eudaly:** Thank you:

**Boyle:** We're here to talk about the jurisdictional transfer of portions of barbur boulevard. As commissioner eudaly noted we have differing standards in terms of what we build and how we operate it. Today the action that we will be taking is intended to facilitate addition of light-rail transit to barbur. So before you is an intergovernmental agreement set up to only be enacted, transfer would only be enacted upon receipt of the full funding grant agreement, federal funds that would bring light-rail to the corridor. That is the thing that would actually build the improvements. This is the portion of barbur that is the subject of today's action. It starts with barbur boulevard at naito parkway and then runs the length of barbur boulevard. This is the crossroads area and that's barbur transit center. It stops just short of the barbur boulevard bridge. The agreement provides \$65 million to replace the viaducts, two viaducts in the woods area. It really sets us up to complete the future transfer should the project be funded. I'm available for any questions.

**Fritz:** It only happens if we get the money and therefore the sidewalks and all the other improvements are guaranteed to be done.

**Boyle:** That's correct.

**Fritz:** Thank you.

**Saltzman:** I was just curious. Not really happy that the viaducts are being replaced. Do they have any historical significance? They are pretty impressive public works projects if you look at them from underneath.

**Boyle:** They are eligible, and they are part of our evaluation of the impacts to historic structures, so we're working our way through landmarks and shpo about those.

**Saltzman:** This is really a major -- great news. Very happy to -- not voting yet. To support this agreement.

November 14-15, 2018

**Wheeler:** Well, there goes the suspense on that. Is there any public testimony?

**Karla:** I did not have a signup sheet.

**Wheeler:** Any further questions? Commissioner Fish was going to be back in one moment. We'll take a 30-second recess.

**Wheeler:** We're back in session. Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Well, thank you, teresa. This is very exciting project. Thank you, commissioner Saltzman, for your support in advance and of course for the work that you've put into this project. I just think it's adorable, the engineer would bring up preserving the historic viaducts. We'll take a close look at that. I vote aye. Of course.

**Fritz:** Thank you, teresa, for your work on this. This is a continuation as commissioner eudaly said of conversations over the past several months. The reason it's a four-fifths is we were waiting for the state to sign the agreement. It needs to be done now so that it can be done before the locally preferred alternative is voiced on by metro. If anyone is wondering did we forget to file it, no, that's just how it had to happen. Thank you. Aye.

**Saltzman:** As I said this really is a big deal. The fact that we're dealing with it in 15 minutes really doesn't do justice to all the work and angst and hand wringing from odot and the city of Portland and whoever else about actually making this a reality. I'm very happy this is happening. Thank you, commissioner eudaly, for bringing this home. Thank you, teresa, for all the work you've done to make this happen too. It's on to the ross island bridge head and probably a few other streets too. 82nd might be one of those. This is great. I'm happy to support it. Aye.

**Wheeler:** Aye. The ordinance is adopted. We are adjourned until 2:00 p.m.

**Council recessed at 12:15 p.m.**



November 14-15, 2018  
**Closed Caption File of Portland City Council Meeting**

This file was produced through the closed captioning process for the televised City Council broadcast and should not be considered a verbatim transcript.

Key: \*\*\*\*\* means unidentified speaker.

**November 14, 2018 2:00 p.m.**

**Fritz:** Here. **Fish:** Here. **Saltzman:** Here. **Wheeler:** Here.

**Wheeler:** Good morning.

**Heidi Brown, Sr Deputy City Attorney:** Good afternoon, mayor, council.

**Wheeler:** Time warp, apparently.

**Brown:** Welcome, everybody, to the Portland city council meeting. The city council represents all Portlanders and meets to do the city's business. Presiding officer preserves order and decorum during city meetings and the purpose is so that everyone can feel welcome, comfortable, respected and safe. You may sign up in advance with the clerk's office for communications to briefly speak about any subject. You may also sign up for public testimony on resolutions or the first readings of ordinances. Your testimony should address the matter being considered at the time. When testifying please state your name for the record. Your address is not necessary. Please disclose if you're a lobbyist, if you're representing an organization please identify it. The presiding officer determines length of testimony. Individuals generally have three minutes to testify unless otherwise stated. When you have 30 seconds left a yellow light goes on. When your time is done a red light goes on. If you're in the audience and would like to show support, feel free to do thumbs up. If you want to express that you do not support something, please feel free to do thumbs down. Disruptive conduct such as shouting or interrupting testimony or council deliberations will not be allowed. If there are disruptions a warning will be given that further disruption may result in the person being ejected for the remainder of the meeting. After being ejected a person who fails to leave is subject to arrest for trespass. Thank you for helping your fellow Portlanders feel comfortable, welcome, respected and safe.

**Wheeler:** Please read the first item.

**Item 1179.**

**Wheeler:** Colleagues, yesterday marked 30 years since the horrific murder of mulugeta seraw who came from Ethiopia in pursuit of American dream. This is long overdue. It's also more than just a proclamation. It's also a call to action. In the words of the urban league of Portland this is a call to remember, learn, and change. Commissioner Fritz and I had the opportunity yesterday to attend a celebration of life and a historical retrospective of mulugeta and his life. We heard from family members including his uncle who had invited him and encouraged him to come to the united states, to come to Portland. We heard from attorneys who were engaged in the case in the prosecution and civil lawsuits against those who perpetrated the murder. And it was a profoundly moving experience. It was an important experience, and as I listened to what the speakers were saying about what happened three decades ago, I couldn't help but think that it's entirely relevant, that the lessons were entirely relevant to the environment in which we find ourselves today. So I'm very honored to be bringing this proclamation with commissioner Eudaly. I would like to give commissioner Eudaly an opportunity to say a few words.

**Eudaly:** Thank you, mayor. Thank you, everyone, for being here today. I gave some remarks at the unveiling of the sign cap on 31st and pine this morning and I'm not going to completely repeat myself. For those of you who were already there, but I do want to say that the murder was a rude awakening to white supremacist organizing and violence for a lot of progressive white Portlanders 30 years ago myself included. It was a pivotal moment

November 14-15, 2018

for me as a young person, and the march preceding trial was one of the first organized political event I ever participated in. I'm pleased to be in a position today to continue working on issues around racial justice and protecting our immigrant and refugee communities. Today by honoring mulugeta we commit to remember, to learn and to change. I want to thank the urban league for the leadership and work commemorating his life. I also attended the event yesterday. I want to thank the PBOT maintenance operations crew for installing the street signs and attending the conference. We had two tables. Just a shout out to my team at PBOT. As well as Portland united against hate southeast uplift and the ethiopian community of Portland for partnership in making this happen. We're also very honored to have members of his family here who helped us honor him this morning. So I want to thank them and once again say the city of Portland remembers him and together we'll strive to prevent another senseless act of violence. Now, I'm going to introduce our invited panelists. I have Harmon Johnson, the president of urban league. I hope. I don't see her. No. Do I have Jackie irbi, from urban league? Thank you. Matose gough from urban league. Imam Hussein from Portland united against hate. Welcome, everybody. Please state your name for the record.

**Jackie Yerby, Urban League of Portland:** Thank you, commissioner Eudaly. Mayor wheeler. Other commissioners. Thank you for being there yesterday. My name is jackie irbi, director of advocacy and urban engagement for the urban league. I'm going to leave my comments brief. Onato was the brains and heart behind this, the conference yesterday and street sign caps. I want her to be the person speaking on behalf of the urban league.

**Ewnetu Tsegaw, Urban League of Portland:** Good afternoon. My name is onatu segaw. I work for the urban league of the city of Portland. I'm really honored to be here. I was born and raised in Ethiopia, born in the part of Ethiopia where mulugeta was born, in 1998, the same year he was murdered here in Portland. He was around my age when he was murdered near his Portland apartment on pine and 31st where we put the street sign markers today. In the early hours of November 13, 1988, he left a friend's farewell party to go home to get rest because he had to be at work in the morning. His family and friends described him as a responsible young man and a peace maker who always had a smile on his face. 30 years later as a black immigrant who calls Portland home i'm well aware of the fact that we still have a lot of work to do to make our city safe for all. I know because I have been a target of unprovoked hate incidents in Portland by random people in the streets who do not know me but see that i'm black. We need to be clear on the fact that he was murdered because he was black. We need to be clear on the fact that there was nothing on his part to deserve a murder like that. Although we have taken steps and progressed in some areas our communities have yet to attain freedom from fear which is a human right and an american ideal. We need to step outside the bubble and hear Portlanders regardless of how they look, how they speak, how they dress, who they love, and how they self-identify. Remembering and honoring his memory is very essential. At the commemoration conference yesterday we heard from his family, attorneys who litigated the case on his family's behalf, and leaders of groups that we need to do better. 30 years later we still have a lot of work to do. Earlier today I was at the unveiling ceremony of the caps at southeast pine and 31st. Until now there was nothing to mark the place and to tell his story. Single street sign caps was very emotional for most of us including his family and members of the ethiopian community. This afternoon we are here for the city of Portland's proclamation of november 13 as mulugeta seraw day. Important not only to acknowledge and remember our history but to commit to learning change for the better. I want to thank commissioner eudaly and mayor ted wheeler for your leadership on this. I also want to pass the appreciation and thanks from the ethiopian community here in Portland and beyond all the way to ethiopia. Finally I want to thank all different groups, agencies and leaders who were part of this commemoration project which includes. [audio not

November 14-15, 2018

understandable] special thanks to commissioner eudaly's policy advisor, Portland bureau of transportation, especially -- southeast uplift neighborhood corporation. Office of equity and human rights, specialist judy morey, trimet, Portland united against hate, travel Portland, u.s. Senator ron wyden and his staff, especially chris stratton, Multnomah county, port of Portland and others who supported this project. Being a part of this project has been an honor and i'm encouraged about the alliance forged through this process. Appreciates owe different groups and organizations worked to make this commemoration happen. It's important that we remember it's important that we learn and it is a must that we change to make Portland safe for all. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Good afternoon.

**Molly Mayo, SE Uplift Neighborhood Association:** Good afternoon. My name is molly mayo, executive director at southeast uplift neighborhood coalition. Thank you so much for inviting us all to be here today. Southeast uplift is one of the city's seven district coalitions and the 20 neighborhoods in our area have a reputation for being friendly and progressive yet it was in southeast Portland 30 years ago where the east side white pride murdered ethiopian immigrant in a blatant act of racist violence that drew national and international attention to the small apartment complex in the neighborhood near laurelhurst park. Since seraw's death there have bin continued acts of hate and violence from cross burnings to swastikas to harassment to murder. When the Portland united against hate coalition was founded two years ago it was in response to an increase in acts of hate. This network of community groups ready to stand in solidarity to respond to hate account act and crimes has had ample opportunity to act. In southeast Portland alone for a vigil when racist anti-hate graffiti was put up at an elementary school. For taking down anti-semitic posters. And for removing islamophobic flyers from telephone poles all in southeast Portland, all recent. Southeast uplift organize local response to seraw's murder and in recent months has been honored to partner with the urban league, ethiopian community, commissioner eudaly's office and Portland bureau of transportation to coordinate the placement of 17 sign caps at numerous intersections located in the area around the site where he was murdered. While the terrible history of seraw's death in east Portland can never be undone a new era in the neighborhood of his murder is under way. They are the 17 sign caps were unveiled earlier today. They signify the creation of a new sense of place at the site of his murder. A place that let's members of the ethiopian community, the immigrant and refugee community, and the black community know that Portland will remember, learn and change. These sign caps in both english and amharic are a tangible, collaborative step toward a new segment of history. 17 markers of our city values of peace, unity and diversity. Thank you for this proclamation acknowledging his life. The crimes of the east side white pride and white arian resistance and indirectly the many untold stories of trauma, hate and violence that are repeatedly experienced by communities that are marginalized vulnerable. I ask that we keep keep working together to bravely address the systems of discrimination that contribute to where all community members have the basic human right of safety. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Seemab Hussaini, Portland United Against Hate:** Greetings, dear commissioners, mayor. Thank you for having me here. Scott said today my rich and rewarding life is a result of a very ordinary human response to a horrible tragedy. That's the exact same thing that brought me here today before you. I'm sihab husseiny, vice chair to the council on american islamic relations in Oregon, and as a result the coalition member and political advocate to the city's very own Portland united against hate. This month signifies a painful loss, a memoriam to 30 years ago. The murder of mulugeta seraw. Yesterday the urban league of Portland hosted a conference where I was happy to see many of you before me today. There we took a glimpse into the beautiful life of a man we are here to

November 14-15, 2018

commemorate. The heart-wrenching story from jim mcelory describing the violence subjected upon him was reminiscent of one rachel, held in comfort to his last words in her own hands. We lost telesian and rick best. We almost lost micah fletcher. Their sacrifices allowed for the intended victims destiny magnum and malia mohammed to live. Loss of life to the inhuman hands of hate on the max train 1.5 years ago immediately echoed the names of mulugeta seraw. These worlds are connected. The city took quick action to address the rise in hate crimes last year. Allowed a small budget for a community initiated partnership of community based organizations, neighborhood associations and the city working with the office of community and civic life to build a rapid response system that combines reporting and tracking of hateful acts and providing support and protection for our communities. In commemorating this day, in the name of mulugeta seraw, and remembering those who died in the name of hate let us advance together. As the city takes this step in commemorating him, may we also signify action of working with communities that are providing the winning solutions and meeting the efforts to eradicate it from hate. With this I will end with another quote from eric ward. I have never forgotten that it was important that government, businesses, and community leaders successfully outorganized white nationalists in the 1990s. I believe Portland will do this again. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you, all of you.

**Joyce Harris, SE Uplift Neighborhood Coalition:** Good afternoon. I'm joyce harris. I work with a number of organizations. My connection to mulugeta's killing is very personal. The morning after he was beaten savagely I received a phone call about 6:28 in the morning, and I remember the time. It was from a woman in the community, her name was hemisha smith. She said, sister, an ethiopian brother has been beaten and they don't expect him to live, and the community doesn't know what to do. Can you call somebody? Can you call ron herndon. Can you call helene? And I did that. At the time I was running a school, the black educational center, and that monday, I went to school and we would always gather the kids first thing in the morning to see what they had done over the weekend. And it's real important to talk to children no matter how old they are about things that might impact their lives. And so I talked to the children about mulugeta, how he had been beaten to death. Of course these kids kindergarten through 4th grade had questions. Why didn't they like him? So we had a long conversation and one of the little children said, can we make cards for his family? And so we stopped whatever we had planned to do that morning and we let the children make cards, ask more questions, and that afternoon I went over to the apartment and I delivered them. And then let me just share with you the whole imagery that day. First of all, I was afraid to travel down that street because I didn't want to see his blood on the pavement. So I parked around the corner and I wouldn't even look in that direction. When I got to the apartment, it was dark. The blinds were drawn. People were terrified. People in there were crying. I gave them the cards, and I stayed for a while. An then I had to leave because I knew that I was not going to be able to hold it together much longer. Later on that evening I got a call from the same lady who had originally called me and said she had went over there and they had the cards all around the room, and how appreciative they were. One of the reasons why that was important is because sometimes it appears that our communities are divided, and when this happened over in north Portland doesn't have anything to do with me, but during that time it was important for me as a leader in the african-american community to connect with the ethiopian brothers and sisters and let them know they weren't alone. And over the years I have come to realize that of course I was traumatized, always like to admit that, but I was traumatized as was everyone else. We marched and we rallied, we were at the funeral. All of this has come back, you know, with us commemorating and remembering what happened 30 years ago, but the message that I wanted to share today is 30 years ago is



November 14-15, 2018

now. And we need to clearly understand that. And as I was talking to some of my brothers and sisters from the continent today, when people are doing hateful things like that, they see the color of your skin, how you worship, who you love, and they don't ask you questions. They don't say, are you from ethiopia? It's just hatefulness that we all have to address. I also want to say that whenever any of our communities loses someone, regardless of who the shooter is, what the reason is, it traumatizes all of us. And I just want to leave you with a poem by margaret wheatley that I often have to look at when I need to be comforted, when I need to be reaffirmed. It's called turning to one another. And it starts out there's no power greater than a community discovering what it cares about. Ask what's possible, not what's wrong. Keep asking. Notice what you care about, assume that many others share your dreams. Be brave enough to start a conversation that matters. Talk to people you know. Talk to people you don't know. Talk to people you never talk to. Be intrigued by the differences you hear. Expect to be surprised. Treasure curios timor than certainty. Invite in everybody who cares to work on what's possible. Acknowledge that everyone is an expert about something. Know that creative solutions come from new connections. Remember, you don't fear people whose story you know. Real listening always brings people closer together. Trust that meaningful conversations can change your world. Rely on human goodness and stay together. And I would urge the city council as you deal with some of the tough issues that you're dealing with, dealing with issues of police, dealing with protests, keep your ears open, your heart open. Try to work with people, and I would ask people who are coming, demanding that you work with them that they have the same mindset. We have got to change. We must. We have children that are growing up, and we want them to grow up in the community where they feel safe. Where they feel protected, where they feel honored, and where they know that there will be people like all of us who are going to step up and speak out and protect them. So I thank you for this proclamation and just do the work that needs to be done and do it in a principled, caring, healing way. Thank you very much.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Commissioner Fritz.

**Fritz:** First thank you, dr. Harris, thank you, everybody, for helping us all understand better. Thank you to the urban league for the event yesterday and thank you, commissioner eudaly, not only for this proclamation but for your support of that event. There's a lot of people who weren't in Portland 30 years ago. I was newly reminded that it wasn't just a random act of violence. It was a calculated campaign across the country to incite violence. I want you to know I changed my speech that I was going to make this morning about the processed regulations in response to what I learned anew yesterday. White supremacy is not something that just happens. It's not just a mindset or something that people hear the president or somebody else making a speech. It's an organized campaign to instill fear through violence. So that changes what we're going to -- what we need to do, especially what we white people need to do in response to that. I really appreciate the timing in the context of what we were discussing this morning in terms of what do we do about protests because this remembrance of a terrible something that happened 30 years and one day ago, remembering what happened on the max train just last year, it's part of the campaign. Thank you, commissioner Saltzman, for reminding us it was part of a campaign in germany in the 1930s as well. It's a grave and present danger. It's not a history lesson. It's now. So thank you very much for bringing this forward.

**Wheeler:** Very good. With that I will read the proclamation on behalf of the Portland city council and first of all, just thank you to all of you who have testified. That was very thoughtful and heartfelt testimony. I appreciate you bringing it here into the chamber and sharing it with the people of Portland. Whereas the murder led to the conviction of the three perpetrators as well as the bankruptcy of a racist hate group, the white aryan resistance, otherwise known as war. Thus creating a safer Portland for all. And whereas



November 14-15, 2018

this horrific hate crime brought Portlanders together to vocally condemn hate in our city and demand that justice be served. And whereas mulugeta's journey from ethiopia to Portland in pursuit of the american dream is the story of many immigrants today. And whereas mulugeta's family and friends describe him as a kind, hard working man whose life was cut too short by a senseless act of anti-black hate violence. And whereas in the 30 years since his death, Portland has become the whitest major city in america and the southern poverty law center finds that the number of hate groups in Oregon continues to increase. Yet Portland's progressive reputation often hides its lack of diversity. The safe space our demographics create for racial animosity, and the lived experience of people of color in Portland. And whereas the city has launched efforts like the Portland united against hate, the office of equity and human rights, and the new Portlanders policy commission to affirm immigrants, refugee, people of color, are all part of the services and programming, decision making and place making in the city of Portland. And now therefore, i, ted wheeler, mayor of the city of Portland, Oregon, the city of roses, do hereby proclaim november 13 of each year to be mulugeta seraw day and encourage all residents to observe this day. Thank you. [applause] if i'm not mistaken, betsy -- right on target. Why don't we come down in front and maybe we could get a photograph with those who testified and anyone else who would like to join us for a photograph.

**Wheeler:** Will you please read the next otwo items together, 1180 and 1181.

**Item 1180 and 1181.**

**Wheeler:** Colleagues, i'm excited this afternoon to introduce these next two items. 1180 and 1181. The single use plastics resolution passed on june 20th, earlier this year, and it directed the bureau of planning and sustainability to work collaboratively with my office and the community on a comprehensive strategy to address the issue of single use plastics in the city of Portland. I believe this policy is a great first step as we tackle this very large problem of plastic pollution. The ordinance before us today is the result of a lot of hard work and significant engagement with stakeholders from business, ada, and environmental communities as well as the general public. The by request straws aspect of this proposal addresses ada, americans with disability act, concerns by allowing for accessibility for some people with disabilities and people recovering from injury when drinking a glass of water is contingent upon availability of this tool. It works with our mixed compost and recycling programs which do not accept nor have the capability of accepting any small plastics like straws, even compostable ones, as they cause serious problems for end markets all of which do not break down in the marine environments. Because of this, project leads have turned to waste prevention as the best solution to addressing the plastic problem. I'm now happy to turn this over to pete chisholm winfield of the bureau of planning and sustainability and amy from my office. They will tell us more about the city's progress and giving us an overview of the ordinance we'll be hearing today. Thank you.

**Bruce Walker, Planning and Sustainability:** Thank you, mayor wheeler. Members of the council, i'm bruce walker, recycling program manager. I work in the bureau of planning and sustainability. First of all, that was very powerful, and i'm doing my best to keep moving on with the discussion today. Thank you. I appreciate the direction provided by council earlier this year to address the issue plastic pollution. Through adoption of the plastics reduction resolution. We have worked with the mayor's staff and undertaken community engagement efforts that have informed this proposal before you today. The city of Portland and Multnomah county climate action plans prioritize waste prevention of plastics. This report and proposed ordinance identify waste prevention as the highest, best course of action from a marine litter perspective and from a climate perspective. The expectation with this recommendation is to reset the default interaction between businesses and their customers to not expect single use plastics to be automatically delivered with food and drink orders. We are excited to continue the work in collaboration with Multnomah county

November 14-15, 2018

moving forward on this and other issues identified in the climate action plan. One final note, this ordinance reorganizes the city code that includes the existing ban on polystyrene foam, styrofoam, food containers and cups and the plastic bag ban that are currently in two different chapters of code. The new chapter is entitled prohibitions and restrictions on single use plastic, which contains those prior council actions and adds new restrictions on straws, stirrers, utensils and condiment packaging. To provide more details, I'll introduce the top notch team that co-lead this process, Amy Rathfelder from the mayor's office and my colleague Pete Chism-Winfield from BPS.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Amy Rathfelder, Office of the Mayor:** Good afternoon, Mayor, members of city council, I'm Amy Rathfelder with me is my colleague Pete Winfield from the BPS. I really appreciate the opportunity to come before you and present on the work we have done to address the issue of plastic pollution in Portland. So we're here at council today following the unanimous passage of a resolution on June 20th, 2018, which directed the Bureau of Planning and Sustainability to work in collaboration with the Mayor's office to develop a reduction strategy addressing single use plastics in Portland with focus on plastic straw. This included research on outside policy, stakeholder engagement and outreach and a public survey.

**Pete Chism-Winfield, Planning and Sustainability:** What sets Portland apart from other cities that we don't provide a loophole for compostable plastics which those cities do. This is focused on the highest and best way to tackle this problem which is by avoiding plastics altogether. I'm very proud of that. Waste prevention is the stuff that is not used. Consumers do this when they buy an experience like a gift such as tickets to a lecture instead of a power drill. It's also known in the business world as lean thinking. In this case waste prevention is resetting the default beverage order to not include plastics that are not always wanted or needed. We also do not recommend alternatives that claim to be recyclable or compostable. These alternatives pose serious problems to our recycling and composting programs because they jeopardize quality feed stocks that businesses use to make new products and including compost that goes into our gardens. It's a very important. While we support and encourage consumers to reuse things like straws and coffee mugs, I think you remember the resolution Susan brought reusable straws, we want to encourage that but because of the variability of the impacts of reusables versus single use plastic items it was really difficult for us to write that into this policy. A lot of times you'll see the carbon emissions associated with some materials are much higher than plastics, so we're looking at a dynamic that's very different.

**Rathfelder:** Okay. So the outset of this work a small stakeholder work group was formed with the goal of arriving at a policy directive that would address this issue comprehensively. This work group was comprised of representatives from the business and advocate communities. We included a wholesaler, medical facility representative, environment advocates and two straw users supported by the Americans with Disabilities Act around the table. Additionally the group was advised by representatives from Multnomah County, Prosper Portland and the Bureau of Equity and Human Rights, city staff, Pete, myself and Bruce led, coordinated and documented worker feedback.

**Chism-Winfield:** We also developed a community survey asking people about their ideas of reducing plastic. Many of which ended up in this proposal. The one thing I do want to relay, when asked the question from one to 100 how much do you support a city-wide policy to reduce single use plastics, one being least and 100 the most, the average response from over 4,000 people was 86 out of 100, so an overwhelming community response for the city to do something about this.

**Rathfelder:** Additionally, the conclusion of the work group meetings revealed key findings. First, there's a need for government intervention when addressing this issue. Portlanders

November 14-15, 2018

expressed support as Pete just showed for a city taking the lead on reducing their materials. Second, waste prevention or not using as Pete spoke about. And reuse are the highest and best alternatives. Third, there's a continued need for additional considerations and decisions as we continue this work like climate impacts and human health.

**Wheeler:** Amy, could I ask you a question? You say a ban lessens accessibility. Quite frankly, the only criticism I have heard of this policy so far is it doesn't go far enough. So could you spend a little more time talking about why not just an outright ban?

**Rathfelder:** Sure. It's got to do with cost, cost to businesses, accessibility as you mentioned to folks who need the tool to drink, and feasibility of what's accepted and not accepted in Portland's current recycling system. With the cost right now we have got a supply-demand issue which is a great problem to have. There are alternative companies that have made alternative products like straws that are backed up because as social pressure has mounted and we experienced an uptick in people starting to care about this issue, specifically centered around the straw, we're getting to the point where these companies can't make alternative products, paper straws, fast enough. So we're not really at the point yet where we can feasibly implement an alternative product solution. Then the accessibility impact to ADA folks is something that was part of our feedback. We obviously took that very seriously.

**Wheeler:** Maybe I'm asking you to see the future, which isn't really fair, we're clearly on the path to eliminating single use plastics. That's the path we're on, isn't it? How do we manage that path and take into account the needs of our friends and neighbors and family members in the disability community while ultimately getting us toward what is the best strategy for the environment and diverting waste from the waste stream. Isn't that really where we're headed?

**Rathfelder:** I would hope so. I think there are already great alternatives that we haven't reached where they are common place yet. Metal straws with silicone tips, we had a big discussion about alternative products and went back and forth, shared feedback about which products are better, which not as good. We're headed that direction. I think the bottom line is that this policy is we're looking at it as a building block and so this work is obviously still necessary and we'll keep building on it going forward, developing new, creative solutions for addressing the problem of plastic, which is a big problem.

**Wheeler:** I appreciate that. Thank you.

**Rathfelder:** Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Are you still in your presentation?

**Rathfelder:** Yes. We're almost done. After a comprehensive stakeholder and outreach process we have arrived at what we believe is the right step to take. The proposed ordinance in front of you today would implement a by request policy for plastic straws and stirrers upon customer request for situations. What this means is that a customer would no longer receive these items automatically when at a restaurant or sit down food and beverage retailer, they would need to ask for the item if necessary. In a delivery or fast food situation this would implement and ask first direction for employers. So when applicable employees would ask if they needed plastic before giving them out. Finally, the policy would go into effect July 1, 2019, with a business and consumer outreach period beginning in January.

**Chism-Winfield:** The proposal would be we would also need to go out and let businesses know about this as well as consumers. Bps is proposing to take a lead on designing a notification and outreach strategy beginning in January. Businesses need to be aware of how they reach compliance. In some situations that means taking away direct customer access to plastic straws and stirrers. For takeout and delivery situations it means that customers need to be asked first before they confirm that they want these things. A lot of folks will go to a fast food place and take that home. They have their condiments and

November 14-15, 2018

utensils at home so may not need it. This would also apply to in person by phone and electronic orders. As I have become familiar with electronic orders they are much highly used now than they were before so we want to make sure to take that into consideration. Then customer awareness we want to make sure that the customers are informed as to why it's important to focus on reduction of these materials and why we're doing this in general. Monitoring and compliance, we currently have a monitoring and compliance strategy for plastic bags and foam packaging. We are proposing this replicate that all businesses will also have access to technical assistance from the sustainability at work program. Bps will be responsible for compliance and intervention based off complaint, so as soon as complaints come in we will respond and investigate. We're seeking a partnership with Multnomah county to explore opportunities to notify and streamline communications between bps and the affected businesses as Multnomah county hilt inspectors are already in all these businesses talking about a myriad of other issues. So finally, the compliance and fees are consistent with the plastic bag ban. Fees are also a measure of last resort. This is never intention that we would have with the other compliance situations, and we really want to engage with the businesses and use fees as an absolute measure of last resort. Then also one final note on the merging and creating a new chapter on prohibitions and restrictions we're excited about this because it creates an opportunity to share the program information with the public and other jurisdictions and be able to really bolster some of our outreach efforts to include a myriad of materials not just the ones that we're introducing but reinforcing the bans we already have in place for foam and plastic bags. And that is our presentation.

**Saltzman:** I guess I want to push back a little bit on exemption of compostable items.

**Chism-Winfield:** Okay.

**Saltzman:** On balance, do we want to have compostable plastics or do we want to have fossil fuel plastics in our daily consumption habits? What's better on balance?

**Chism-Winfield:** On balance you mean taking all the environmental impact? Oregon deq is working on a study looking at the attributes of certain materials and compostable plastics at this point is not looking like a good alternative for a variety of issues including toxicity issues. We have a case from our well informed research squad at the Oregon deq to really take a step back from those materials, not only do they cause issues with compostable facilities, but they do have upstream and toxic components that we're not that excited about. What once was the kind of golden child of sustainability really has turned.

**Saltzman:** Okay. I won't push back any more.

**Chism-Winfield:** It's a good question.

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fritz?

**Fritz:** Normal small business coffee shop in England last summer. Very similar,. [audio not understandable] did you explore requiring small wooden utensils instead of plastic?

**Chism-Winfield:** One of the reasons why we really stepped away from talking about alternatives for a few reasons. The resources that are needed to make wooden product or paper product come from other sources and they have other environmental impacts. So once we go down the pathway of a different material and especially looking at expanding that to a city-wide ordinance you're looking at using a massive amount of resources in a different way. Because those variables are so varied, we felt like focusing on waste prevention and not on alternatives was the best way to go just because we knew that the best, highest and best use every time for climate and for marine debris is going to be waste prevention. So also with reuse, if we're encouraging folks to reuse durable dish wear, that's the second alternative.

**Fritz:** But for single use, something like this to eat a McDonald's sundae, for example, you're not going to be able to do that with your fingers. If you didn't bring your spoon and



November 14-15, 2018

your bag with you, which I have, wouldn't it be better to have a wooden one rather than plastic?

**Chism-Winfield:** That depends on how many trees it takes to make all those wooden utensils. That was a question I would probably ask.

**Fritz:** I would like that to be looked into. Second question, are lids included in this ordinance?

**Chism-Winfield:** They are not.

**Fritz:** So I'm troubled by that. It seems there should be alternatives to plastic lids.

**Chism-Winfield:** Mostly the lack of availability of alternatives for plastic lids. I have read articles about cold drinks having a coffee cup type of top, but right now that's not available on a massive scale. So that wouldn't be something that we would be able to tell 6,000 businesses to be able to do because they wouldn't be able to do it.

**Fritz:** What about businesses already using things like wooden stirrers? Are they going to be allowed to continue to have the stirrers out?

**Chism-Winfield:** The ordinance is proposed to be just about plastic stirrers and straws. Wooden ones would be exempt. [audio not understandable]

**Fritz:** That's not included either.

**Chism-Winfield:** That is not.

**Fritz:** I am happy to hear you say this was a consensus recommendation from the committee, but what we have is a report from the committee so I can't amend that and the code which it wouldn't be appropriate to amend either, what's the certainty? The start date is in the report but no end date come back to council with something more. When we did plastic bags, which my friends would well remember, we had the same argument. There's not enough availability of paper, it's not a good product, it would be too expensive, nobody will do it. And we did it and lo and behold now it's kind of standard and people don't really think about bringing their own shopping bag with them or if necessary taking a paper one. So what's the timeline for coming back with something that says no, seriously, find cardboard alternatives, wood alternatives, we're going to ban single use plastics?

**Rathfelder:** So we haven't really agreed on a follow-up date but we can add that in. I think accountability is important. We would like to keep the council informed as to the progress once this is implemented. Assuming it's implemented, so we could discuss a timeline for something like that, absolutely.

**Fritz:** What would that --

**Walker:** For both plastic bag ban and our include the food curbside program we had a one-year report to come back to council.

**Fritz:** That would certainly I think be a good thing to do since you're not implementing it until july, that would mean a year from july.

**Wheeler:** I actually enjoy talking about this subject. I would be happy to do that as a matter of the record or if you would like to make a formal amendment --

**Fritz:** I can't amend anything.

**Wheeler:** Good point. You can't. Why don't we do this. Let's make it a commitment on the part of the mayor and amy will help me keep that commitment. Let's mark on our calendar one year. I would very much like our partners to continue this work and update the council on how this is doing, assuming it passes, I never take that for granted. That's as funny as I get, by the way. That's my best material. [laughter] two, we don't know what - - we don't know what the technology is going to be. Let's just say this. I am fundamentally committed to single use plastics being as eliminated as possible within reason, and understanding since we have done this differently than other communities and we have the ada community right at the table with us, we don't want to move ahead of them. It's really important that we hold that value in place. But we're all committed I think for the same reasons. We have an invited panel. Nancy nordman from surfrider is here today. Nicole



November 14-15, 2018

shia from the office of equity and human rights. I see nicole. John washtinski and jeff martin from Multnomah county, and greg ashley from the Oregon restaurant and lodging association are all here as part of our invited testimony today. Welcome. Thank you. I forgot my shirt. I'm so disappointed.

**Nancy Nordman, Surfrider:** We have more.

**Wheeler:** I keep mine very clean. It generates a lot of conversation at the gym, I can tell you that. Welcome. I don't know who wants to start.

**Nickole Cheron, Office of Equity and Human Resources:** I will start. I'm Nicole charonne from the office of equity and human rights. I think a lot of us want to think of ourselves as good stewards of the environment. So when an idea comes about that is catching on in other cities, we want to jump on it. So we ban the bag and we want to ban the straw, but as government agencies we need to look at that & ply an equity lens and say, who does this decision impact? And when it most impacts one of our most underserved communities, it really is on us to say we need to move forward in a different way. I am a straw user. There are times when, you know, in a restaurant you'll get a big, heavy glass pint glass. I can't lift that. I need a straw if i'm going to be able to use that. It became very important when we heard that this was happening to connect with the mayor's office in planning and say you have to consider the disability community and that impact. I'm very happy to say that both julia and I were at the table and everyone that first day really heard what we had to say and what those impacts were going to be. And I think people really learned a lot about -- I think we jump on the well, what about just an alternative? What about bringing metal straws. For some people a metal straw is not an option because they have had a stroke or they have to bite the straw when they drink. If it's metal they risk damaging their mouth. I think reduction is the best way to move forward. I hear you, mayor, that you want to keep moving forward and get to a place where we eliminate them, but there has to be a technology that comes about that really makes sure that people whose lives are already so impacted when they are trying to just be out in the community like everyone else and then we take away things that take away from that quality of life.

**Wheeler:** To be clear, nicole, I agree wholeheartedly. We appreciate you being at the table. Thank you. Good afternoon.

**Nordman:** Good afternoon. Thank you so much for having me here. For the record i'm nancy ordman. I'm here representing Portland chapter of surfrider as a volunteer coordinating the ditch the straw pdx program. We're proud of the impact ditch the straw pdx has had over the Portland area. Just over the past year we have had incredible successes working with over 120 businesses ranging from large event spaces like doug fir to neighborhood coffee shops like posey's. Most businesses have really reported the switch away from plastic straws to some alternative, whether it's metal straw with a silicon tip, paper, glass, bamboo, any sort of alternative on request is being easier than they anticipated it to be and many have reported drastic straw reductions, positive customer feedback and cost savings. Just to give a few examples, matt hannah reported 1,000 in cost savings since making the switch in may. Portland spirit, the boat cruise line, estimates between 8 and 10,000 straws have been avoided because of their change to bamboo. New seasons has reported preventing around 100,000 straws by eliminating them from their coffee bars. Por que no has reported they are down to 1,000 straws a month through the change as well. Because of these successes from the businesses we believe that Portland is more than ready for policy change on this issue. As you have heard from these examples, this isn't just an environmental policy that we see it as. It's smart business policy. Hundreds of thousands of straws have been eliminated from the waste stream and we see that businesses are finding that to be a positive change for them. We feel that this policy creates a nice foundation for furthering the effort as you mentioned for

November 14-15, 2018

comprehensive, more comprehensive plastic reduction and strategies. We think it's a great start. We believe there are ways it can be strengthened, and we have provided written testimony with more detail. During the plastic revolution in June we heard a great deal of enthusiasm and excitement around this for leadership and action on development of an aggressive single use plastic reduction strategy, and we recommend that the city may maybe consider using this as an opportunity to lead by example and potentially applying a more comprehensive policy by not allowing single use plastic at city sanctioned events to serve as a role model for businesses to start to show that potential to change. As we continue implementation and innovation in the areas of fast food and takeout we're obviously learning from all of us and continue to refine the strategies that provide the best benefit to business, consumers and the environment. We want to thank the council for the directive and to work on the issue bps staff for all their hard work and our fellow worker members and stakeholders. We look forward to continuing to partner and support implementation of this policy. Thank you so much.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. We appreciate you being here.

**John Wasiutynski, Multnomah County:** Good afternoon. I'm John Washinski. I'm pleased to be here to offer the county support for this initiative. The action that the council is considering is properly understood there's one step in what's been a decades long effort to limit the impact of single use plastic on our environment and our health. It's believing to see that the county and the city working hand in hand on those efforts. In 1989, a long time ago, the city and county passed parallel ordinances restricting use of styrofoam in restaurants. It was sort of like the plastic straw policy of that era. It's worth noting the policy was targeted at health, a health policy. The aim was to limit people's exposure to petrochemicals. It was successful in that regard but it's been incredibly successful in limiting the amount of plastics and styrofoam we see in our water and in our communities. I actually worked in Washington D.C. before moving to Portland, and for the department of the environment there, for the local city government, and my beat was trash in the water. The amount of styrofoam that we pulled out of waterways was staggering. That forward looking policy has made a large difference in sort of the quality of life in Multnomah county but also the environmental impacts of that. Portland has shown time and time again a willingness to reach upstream and implement pollution reduction strategies that will pay dividends in the future. Action by council today would align with another area of collaboration between the city and county namely the climate action plan. In the plan we identify plastic reduction policy and as noted by the previous panel reduction is really the first strategy that we learned about recycling and reuse. As a key area in our materials management framework. The county is working with east county cities to follow your lead, the city, on plastic bag bans and see if we can extend that policy eastward. Today's action by the council builds on an important legacy. The Swedish strategy is a template for cities around the world to follow when conserving natural resources and protecting waterways. The county is here not only to cheer you but also to help. Multnomah county health department looks forward to working with our partners at bps to help restaurants and mobile unit operators understand the ordinance and how they can continue to serve the public best. They provide education through inspections in Multnomah county and almost 5,000 in the city of Portland. This year all facilities will receive information about plastic bags, polystyrene and hopefully next year we will be providing information about the plastic straws as well. It's a great opportunity to have in-person conversations with all business owners that serve food within the city and within Multnomah county and this has offered us an opportunity to work more closely together with bps to help implement this and other existing policies. Thank you very much.

**Saltzman:** Does that include food carts?

**Wasiutynski:** Yes. That includes food carts. Absolutely.

November 14-15, 2018

**Wheeler:** John, thanks. We appreciate you bringing your expertise and partnership to this. It's critically important.

**Wasiutynski:** You're welcome.

**Wheeler:** Good afternoon.

**Gregg Astley, Director of Gov't Affairs Oregon Restaurant & Lodging Assoc:** Good afternoon. I'm Greg Ashley, director of public affairs for the restaurant and lodging association. The restaurant owners and operators in the city of Portland to be a part of the work group and the discussion leading to the proposed ordinance. We appreciate being involved in the beginning part of a conversation from the start to help shape policy that we think works for everyone. As consumers become more aware of the issues of single use disposables in the waste stream, plastic waste reduction and recycling we have responded to these requests. In just the last year two major vendors in the city of Portland restaurant and food service establishments reported significant reductions in the ordering of plastic straws. In one case more than a third fewer straws are being ordered. Some of our members in Portland are already voluntarily reducing usage with their own by request straw policies, replacement of plastic straws with alternatives and by asking customers who are getting takeout whether they need plastic utensils. Hotels are also reducing, many promoting the fact they are a by request restaurant or bar with signage on the tables and the bars. Who safety may be at risk is important too. We have heard from members of the disabled community who need plastic straws for their own well-being and we want to accommodate them. Portland's restaurants, hotels and bars are cornerstones in our community. They give generously to worthy cause, feed the hungry and provide a place where people can meet and break bread together. People are Portlanders too and they care about the environment and they are sensitive to customers' requests and feelings. With so many other challenges facing the people running restaurants, hotels and bars we appreciate the council's support and approval coupled with outreach and education to our customers. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thanks. Appreciate it. Thank you all for being here. We appreciate your testimony. Next up, oral testimony. Do we have people signed up?

**Karla:** We have eight people signed up.

**Wheeler:** Very good.

**Wheeler:** Three minutes, name for the record, don't need your address, and the microphones slide around. Thanks for being here.

**Chanel Hason, Surfrider:** Thank you, mayor, Portland commissioners, for this opportunity to testify today. For the record I'm Chanel Hassan, I am a volunteer as chair and communications coordinator for the Portland chapter of the Surfrider Foundation. A little educational background for me, I got my bachelor's degree in environmental science focusing in rain biology and just got my master's in sustainability education at Portland State. As you heard from Nancy our ditch the straw lead who testified earlier today we have worked on this program to decrease use of plastic straws in the city for over a year. I want to personally thank each of you for your interest and leadership in addressing single use plastic pollution within the city of Portland. There's no doubt that single use plastics including straws have been stamped across headlines all over the globe. It's an environmental crisis and in some third world nations a health and social crisis. Bold political actions have resulted because of this increased publicity and awareness such as the European Union's sweeping ban on many single use plastics by 2021. Plastic pollution is not a Portland problem. This is not an Oregon state problem. Not a national problem. This is a global epidemic. Based on current production and leakage of plastic into the environment it's projected by 2050 the ratio of plastics to fish in our ocean will be one to one. Even though this is an environmental catastrophe that needs policy Surfrider Portland addressed single use plastics and ditch the straw PDX campaign. As a grass roots

November 14-15, 2018

organization we began our work on the ground working personally with over 120 businesses this year to decrease their plastic pollution footprint in Portland. We commend you on leadership that the city is undertaking in policy actions. We provided considerations for strengthening and growing this work and look forward to working with the city further in partnership to reduce single use plastics in the great city of Portland. Thank you very much.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. We appreciate it.

**Sarah Mayer, Surfrider:** Hello, city council members. For the record i'm sarah mayer. I am the secretary for the Portland chapter of the surfrider foundation. While I am actively involved in surfrider, i'm just a volunteer, like most of us here. So my day job is downtown, and I have the privilege of living and working downtown only 15 minute walk for me. But every day during that short walk I see countless plastic on the streets. Straws, coffee cups, coffee lids, food containers, wrappers. Cigarette butts is a whole 'nother issue. Each day I see a new view of plastic and trash on our streets. While most of that trash is plastic that is going to be here forever because it does not biodegrade. So through simple actions and municipal efforts I think that we can turn the tide on plastic pollution. I'm fairly certain most people are aware of the problem as a human race we have created for our oceans. Everyone has seen the sea turtle video where they pulled the plastic straw from its nose. Most people are aware of the great pacific garbage patch, the giant mix of plastics that aggregates in our oceans that harms animals and disrupts the food chains and eco-systems and eventually washes ashore on our beaches. Most people are aware of this, however, still today 8 million metric tons of plastic goes into our oceans each year. So while we are aware, it is still a problem. We do our part in cleaning up by hosting action days, beach cleanups, riverside cleanups, multiple green streets cleanups. Each month. Last month alone we picked up over 60 gallons of trash in our bioswales, and 80% of that litter that we pick up is plastic. So we may have 120 businesses who are already committed to this movement, but the reality is that we need to move entire cities, states and nations if we are going to truly impact this problem of plastic pollution. So I look forward to continuing this leadership with you and I hope that we can further develop this movement here in Portland. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you both. The surfrider foundation has been fantastic throughout this effort. A real inspiration to me and to the policy. I'm just really glad we have local partners like you working with us and helping to advocate more broadly for what we're trying to do. So thank you.

**Hason:** Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Good afternoon.

**Celeste Meiffren-Swango:** Good afternoon. Mayor wheeler, Portland city councilors i'm celeste -- state director for environment Oregon. We're a member funded environment advocacy organization just across the river. I'm here to express environment Oregon's support for prohibition on single use plastics and thank you for bringing it up for consideration. I also want to recognize the surfrider foundation and thank volunteers and staff for your hard work. Educating the public and advocating for reduction of single use plastics is a big part of our work at environment Oregon. We're particularly concerned with the devastating impact that plastics have on wildlife, particularly marine wildlife. And we believe that nothing that we use for ten minutes should pollute our environment for hundreds of years. We hear from members a lot that they are concerned about plastic pollution, especially the plastics that they can't recycle. Many have expressed frustration at how much plastic they interact with in a day. When you go to the grocery store so much is packaged in plastic. If you live in a part of the state without a ban on single use plastic bags your groceries are likely also bagged in plastic. If you want to get something to eat or drink you're often given a plastic clam shell, cutlery, plastic cup and or straw, sometimes



November 14-15, 2018

all of the above. You don't have a real option to opt out. Some of the plastic ends up getting recycled but most of it gets thrown away ending up in landfills and our natural environment. We think this is a really good first step to reducing wasteful plastic use, giving consumers the option of a straw or plastic cutlery can give people space to wonder if they really need a straw or plastic cutlery. Many I believe will opt out. This will result in less plastic waste and changing consumer behavior both of which we need to do if we have any shot at tackling this global problem. Again we see this ordinance as a first step, as many of you have said today, we look forward to signing the impact it can have in the city and see what further reduction strategies we can do in the future.

**Wheeler:** Thanks for being here. Next three, please.

**Wheeler:** Have a seat wherever is convenient. Would you like to start?

**Piper Wyrick:** Sure. Hello, I'm piper wireick, part of the Portland youth climate council, a senior at cleveland high school. I'm supportive of the prohibitions and restrictions on single use plastic though I believe we need to focus on larger sources of pollution on sustainability. Plastics are harmful along their life span. Fossil fuels are used and requires immense amounts of water. Plastic products are also often wrapped in plastic and distributed by fossil fuel powered vehicles. Their toxins can leach into food. In addition once they are dispose of they don't break down but kill wildlife and continue to contribute to climate change by releasing methane and ethylene when exposed to the sun. Polyethylene does the most and plastic takes at least 500 years if they ever break down. That is just what I know. I recognize and respect that plastic straws are necessary for some people to maintain not only their independence but their basic needs to survive. I appreciate the policy's flexibility that it still allows this vital tool to be available to those who need it but I believe it should be stricter only allowing straws to be available to those with a medical need. In addition plastic silverware cannot be an option if Portland is serious about taking care of our earth. Consumers can handle a little inconvenience. Might even learn something from it. We also need to ensure that materials and products still used are actually sustainable. All along their life cycle. Some additional options are brought by plastics or plastics made from carbon dioxide, also increased recycling facilities could be a good investment. In addition as a student I see too many ways in which schools contribute to environmental degradation and climate change. Along with the use of plastic silverware and packaging paper plates, the fact that our recycling is thrown into the garbage. It's important Portland schools are included in any new requirements and schools are helped to reach them as the existing budget is already stretched too thin. This could do so. I appreciate this policy is seen as a stepping stone to greater changes and Portland also needs to focus on larger sources of pollution and ultimately change our consumers' culture and economic reliance on fossil fuels. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Excellent testimony. Good afternoon.

**Simon Skutes:** Good afternoon. Hi, I'm simon skates. I attend wilson high school as a senior and am a member of Portland climate youth council. I support the reduction of single use plastics in Portland. There's a clear link between single use plastics and climate change. We need to be moving away from materials made from fossil fuels and plastics release methane as they degrade. Single use plastics are not typically recycled causing huge problems in our oceans. This is just one of the many steps that need to be taken toward the goal of creating a sustainable city. While I support the ordinance as soon as possible I would like to see it expanded to ban plastic straws and utensils unless they are medically necessary for customers. I would love it to be implemented in our schools. Although Portland public schools have set goals there are tremendous amounts of plastic and food waste throughout the schools. Although I'm the youngest one here and my peers and I will be dealing with this for years to come so I ask you to pass this ordinance for a cleaner, clearer future.



November 14-15, 2018

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Good afternoon.

**Julia Person, Widmer Bros:** Good afternoon. I'm Julia Person, sustainability director at Widmer Brothers Brewery and Craft Brew Alliance. We wanted to show our support and bring the business perspective as well to the testimony. We need this clean water to brew our delicious beer, craft breweries are part of the Portland fabric so it's so important to keep our watersheds and waterways clean. Also we were the first to pilot the ditch the straw alongside Surfrider. We're very honored to do that so we know firsthand that by preventing this plastic straw waste in the first place it brings cost savings to the business and Nancy provided lots of great examples of that. We wholeheartedly provide our support for this ordinance and work to continue to strengthen banning or preventing single use plastics in Portland. Thank you for the opportunity to talk today.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Thanks to Widmer Brothers for taking the lead on this. Now I'm getting very thirsty.

**Person:** Me too.

**Karla:** There's one more.

**Wheeler:** Very good. Good afternoon.

**Charlie Plybon, Surfrider:** Good afternoon. Thank you, Mayor Wheeler, members of the Council, for this. I'm Charlie Plybon, policy manager for Surfrider Foundation. I appreciate your initiative within the city of Portland and that of the commissioners. I first brought this issue when you were state treasurer. I presented to the state board on marine debris action plan which is a plan to take action on marine debris. One of the things that that action plan recommended was for us to take actions inland areas particularly in high population centers or near water bodies which flow into the ocean. Here we are in Portland today in front of fantastic leaders pushing plastic policy. I'll mention that this was not straightforward policy. Nothing is as simple as it seems. Plastic bag bans are complicated. Portland's a little behind the curve if you look at the most recent type of plastic bag ban. Things evolved, they change. We expect these sorts of plastic pollution and innovation to also change and evolve over time and look forward to continuing to work with you on a process to continue reducing plastics. It sounded like there is no opportunity for amendments at this time on this ordinance. I would make the recommendation on a friendly amendment to 17.103.310, b, basically prescribes that all retail food and beverage establishments and institutional cafeterias where customers may order takeout and delivery shall provide plastic utensils. It's not defined in the definitions. There's a lack of clarity in exactly what we're talking about. My recommendation is that you change that to plastic service wear, defined in the definition.

**Fritz:** Could you tell me the number again, please?

**Plybon:** Yes. 17.103.310. This is the restrictions on single use plastic service wear.

**Wheeler:** Changing it from utensils to service wear?

**Plybon:** Right now utensils is undefined and may be unclear.

**Wheeler:** Good catch. We'll ask staff about that. Thank you.

**Plybon:** In the written testimony we provided other recommendations. We feel comfortable we can address those in time and we appreciate the mayor and the city commissioners putting a date out there in the future for us to come back to this and continue to evolve this to be the best plastic policy in the country that it can be.

**Wheeler:** Thank you so much.

**Plybon:** Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Great seeing you again. Could we just have staff come back up for just one moment to address that issue on its face that seems to be a sensible change. Consider that a scrivener's error because it needs to be consistent unless you tell me otherwise.

November 14-15, 2018

**Heidi Brown:** Mayor, council i'm looking at the definition of plastic service wear. It includes single use plastic straws, stirrers, utensils and condiment packaging so I think if you wanted to have all four of those items -- but in --

**Wheeler:** I see. [speaking simultaneously] in the ordinance? Was it intended to limit it?

**Chism-Winfield:** It was intended to limit it to utensils and packaging. We had a conversation when you order a soda, are you going to have to have that request every single time. Seemed like a no-brainer if you order a soda you have to drink it some way. So we put it in as utensils and condiment packaging. We felt that was the most relevant conversation to have in that fast food interaction. That's one reason we put in utensils and not all service wear.

**Saltzman:** Are school districts exempt from this policy?

**Chism-Winfield:** They are not. They are included in medical institutions, education and government.

**Saltzman:** All these new practices will be applied by our school districts? They haven't asked for a carve-out?

**Chism-Winfield:** I had a conversation with pps staff and they said this wouldn't impact their operations greatly.

**Fritz:** It would or would not?

**Chism-Winfield:** Would not. And they weren't too concerned about it. But that was one staff person. The other staff members might have different opinions.

**Fritz:** Do they currently use plastic forks?

**Chism-Winfield:** So the way that the ordinance would be written, that would be considered a dine-in situation. So in a dine-in situation, according to this ordinance, it would be straws and stirrers that would apply. They only, as far as I understand, from experience, but by secondhand knowledge, provide straws to kids that need them. But then also they talked about juice boxes. They come with straws. That's an issue. That's not specified in this proposal.

**Saltzman:** So there is no exemption for school districts in this proposal?

**Chism-Winfield:** There is not.

**Saltzman:** Ok. Good, good.

**Wheeler:** Very good. Colleagues, unless you have further questions, I will entertain a motion on the report.

**Fritz:** Just --

**Wheeler:** There's two things. We are voting on the report to adopt the report. And the report is the report. And then we will be moving the ordinance to second reading. It's a nonemergency first reading.

**Fritz:** Just to close out the previous conversation, your recommendation is to leave it as utensils even though, so utensils would have the dictionary definition? Is that correct?

**Chism-Winfield:** We could put in a definition for utensils to be more clear about what that means. But it was intentional to write utensils and not service ware. Unless you would like us to reconsider that.

**Brown:** Commissioner Fritz, I was going to say it's common for us to turn to the dictionary definition in, when analyzing legally what something means. And I would think, I can look it up really fast but I would guess that would be covered.

**Fritz:** I don't think we need to change it. Because it was intentional to not have the other pieces in that second part. It's a two-part. This is for straws and stirrers and this is for utensils and condiments.

**Chism-Winfield:** Yeah. The intention was to try to figure out what material was the most relevant for certain situations.

**Fritz:** Yeah. Thank you for raising the question.

**Saltzman:** Move the report

November 14-15, 2018

**Eudaly:** Second.

**Wheeler:** We have a motion from commissioner Saltzman to move the record and a second from commissioner eudaly. Please call the roll.

**Karla:** Eudaly.

**Eudaly:** I think because there are no opponents to this effort, today is notable. 30 years ago I watched my then housemate and some of her friends and colleagues sit around our dining room table and craft would eventually become the styrofoam ban. There was a lot of resistance to that. As a retailer I supported the plastic bag ban. There was also a lot of resistance to that. And i'm happy to support this initiative as well. I was raised by environmentally aware parents, a grandmother who grew up during the depression and was very resourceful and loved recycling. And in rural Oregon where everything you don't recycle you have to haul to the dump yourself. So reduce, reuse, recycle is second nature to me. But as I have strived to reduce my footprint, at different times in my life, I found it really challenging to find and afford alternatives. And I think it is unreasonable and irresponsible to put the onus of that burden on the consumer. We have to set the standards. There are choices that shouldn't be choices. We just shouldn't be allowing industry to manufacture certain materials or use certain chemicals or create more garbage. Honestly I don't know how our entire planet is not completely covered with garbage at this point. With any luck, it won't be. I also want to thank the mayor's office for giving serious consideration to the disability community, to the kind of unique needs and challenges easily overlooked and misunderstood. It's vital that as we make improvements, we're not making life harder for certain populations. So I really appreciate that. And I was going to make a really bad graduate joke. I think the mayor did that last time. Something like, the future might be plastic but there's no future in plastics. Everyone feel free to groan. It's been a long day. I'm happy to vote aye.

**Fritz:** Thank you, pete and the bureau of planning and sustainability, thank you for the mayor's office and cynthia castro in my office for your analysis on this. I greatly appreciate your thoughtful input that you have gathered throughout the work group and the community outreach. For including americans with disabilities advocates and listening to them. Thanks as always to nickole cheron for her leadership on behalf of the office of equity and human rights. Plastics is a serious problem. One of our testifiers mentioned about the great pacific garbage patch, which some people may not be aware of. This is a an accumulation of millions of tons of plastic, three times the size of france. Put another way it's twice the size of texas. Interesting. Some people here might more relate to texas or france. It's a really large thing that is in the north pacific ocean that is loose impacting marine life and leeching harmful chemicals into our note. In addition to the don't take the plastic, please put it in the right place after you are done with it. Put it in the garbage. Plastic bags do not go in the recycling. Straws, as mentioned about the amount of garbage on our city streets. Put it in the garbage. It's not that hard. The plastic tooth picks. A, it's astonishing to me people are picking their teeth in public but, b, tossing it on the floor? Just could we just return to, this is our planet that we don't, as far as we know don't have another one we can to go once this one is full of muck. Let's all look after it. I did appreciate the suggestion we should do something regarding city events in terms of, I don't think we will all that many straws at city events but we do have stirrers that should not be plastic. I'm considering bringing something that would say, we can't use bottled water at city events because I want to drink our wonderful bull run water and we should have the large containers with paper cups. I will be talk to each of my colleagues about that. There are basic common-sense things we can do. There are reasons people will say why are you focusing on straws? It shouldn't be just straws. It should be a lot bigger pieces of plastic. I appreciate your commitment, mayor, to bring this back. And thank you, bruce walker, a year after implementation to give us the next steps. Because I don't want to take

November 14-15, 2018

the foot off the metal. It has been quite a long day. Thank you to burgerville who also sent in testimony as far as their support for this. We know that the so-called compostable plastics aren't. I was a little bit concerned to hear that these lovely wooden implements are because of a european union regulation and wondering if teresa may get spit out of brexit we will have to go back to plastic. I will work on that another time. And I just greatly appreciate the amount of effort that's been put into this. We need to do more. Aye.

**Karla:** Saltzman.

**Saltzman:** I want to appreciate, thank mayor wheeler for his passion on this issue. I also want to recognize bruce walker and pete and you.

**Rathfelder:** Amy.

**Saltzman:** I'm sorry.

**Rathfelder:** That's ok.

**Saltzman:** I was going to sort of call out the older guard of the bureau of planning and sustainability.

**Rathfelder:** That's ok.

**Saltzman:** Because they have, I think they have done a good job on all of the thorny recycling issues, have -- always getting all the cast of characters to sit down at the table at the outset. So here we have -- in this case, you have the disability community, you have the restaurant and lodging association, you have the advocates and you went around the table and I think you have come up with a good common sense first step policy. I think that's been the hallmark of bps on some of the thorny issues of recycling over the years. I do think this is a good step in the right direction. It's for all the reasons we just cited by commissioner Fritz, it's something that we just can't ignore. And I still do my best to recycle every plastic bag I can at fred meyer's. If you can't be recycles curbside, I still want to have a conversation. Why do we still not able to recycle plastic bags in a more, curbside approach? I will have that conversation with you, bruce, before I leave. And I do think we should double-check with the school district. You said you talked to one staff person. The school district has a habit, Portland public schools in particular, of kind of sticking their head in the sand on issues until it's too late and then board members call us and say, what is this all about? So I think you need to loop back in with at least Portland public schools, get a commitment from somebody like the superintendent or the board chair, that they have been briefed on this issue and they are on board with it.

**Chism-Winfield:** Thank you. That's a great suggestion. I did talk with staff that were involved in the purchasing and managing the purchasing at pps. That's a good suggestion.

**Saltzman:** Pps as you know is a big organization. Not always speaking on the same page. So I would really urge you to go higher up on that.

**Chism-Winfield:** Ok.

**Saltzman:** But do I hope they are brought into this because it's a good thing. We need to start modeling good behavior at that level and it would be ridiculous if we set an example, you can have all the straws and plastic silverware you want and graduate and turn 18 and be responsible citizens and sort of the Portland ethic. It's a great idea. Let's make sure it sticks. So I am pleased to support this. Aye.

**Karla:** Wheeler.

**Wheeler:** Well, thank you, bruce and pete and amy for my team, amy in particular, thank you, since you are the one I spend most of the time with for pushing this very, very hard and making sure that we covered all our bases on this. I want to thank everybody who testified today. The Oregon restaurant and lodging association, the surf rider foundation, Multnomah county, great partners to have as always. The office of equity and human rights and nickole cheron, thank you for being at the table and making sure we address the needs of the disability community in an intentional way. The issue of plastics is obviously not a small one. As the planet warms, we're having to deal with the increasingly



November 14-15, 2018

devastating impacts of global warming. And it's imperative that we consider our consumption habits and the ways that we can work to make them more sustainable in the years ahead. Plastics and plastic straws in particular as we heard today, they're one of the top items, one of the top 10 items that are found littering our coastline. In the city of Portland, they're found along our waterfront. They're found on our streets. And they are found in our parks. And as you heard from testimony today, they can have an adverse impact on wildlife and habitats. Straws are particularly hard on marine environments. And because they don't break down or decompose, they pose a very serious threat to animals and wildlife and these habitats as they enter the food streams and the habitation areas. The reduction of single use plastics will result in the city achieving several of its goals simultaneously around the improvement and protection of land and water quality. And I just want to put down a marker. Obviously, I am very happy to bring this ordinance to the council. I think it is timely. I am appreciative that we were thoughtful in terms of bringing the community and our stakeholders with us in a way that we have a consensus. But I want to be clear. Our work is not done. There's much work to be done. And it's a two-pronged approach. On one hand we are going to have to change consumer behavior. And I don't want this to sound like a heavy-handed statement. It's not intended this way. But I want people to really ask themselves, as they get a single-use plastic item, or any packaging for that matter, do they really need it? Do they really need it? And I also, on the supply side, I want our commercial enterprises and I want our manufacturers and I even want our recycling partners to think about, what are the products that they need to manufacture and what do consumers really need? And I have to tell you, as our economy grows, as our population grows, as we start to see companies like amazon become larger and larger in scale globally, this is going to expand way beyond plastic straws or lids or cups or utensils or anything else. It's really going to have to be about packaging of consumer products. We're a long way from there. But we need to start changing the culture today or we will never achieve the climate action goals that were adopted by this council and Multnomah county. I would like us to continue to be aggressive. This is our first line in the sand. I expect we will do very well on this. But I want us to continue to push this ordinance and evolve this ordinance as quickly and as thoughtfully as we possibly can in the months and the years ahead. That's my commitment. And I believe we can all live up to that commitment. I vote aye. The report is adopted. The ordinance is a nonemergency first reading of an ordinance. It moves to second reading. Thank you all.

**Plybon:** Before you move to second reading on that ordinance, I did look up the definition of utensils. It is broader than what I was thinking. I was thinking fork, knives and spoons, if that's what you were thinking. The actual dictionary definition is broader than that. If you want to limit it to knives, forks and spoons, you could put it in, of forks, knives and spoons.

**Fritz:** What was the dictionary definition anythings?

**Plybon:** There's a couple different ones. "for example, common implement or vessel used in a household and especially a kitchen." that's merriam webster. Cambridge university press has "a tool with a particular use especially in a kitchen or house." so it's kind along that. It is much broader than what I was thinking of anyways.

**Fritz:** Maybe you could work with the bureau to figure out whether we need to amend it at second reading next week?

**Plybon:** If you want it to be more narrow, yeah. Happy to do it.

**Wheeler:** Great. Learn something new every day. Thank you. Thank you. Thank you, amy. Thank you, gentlemen. All right. Our next item, 1182, please, Karla.

**Item 1182.**

**Wheeler:** Colleagues, we have a very I think important and i'm even going to go and be so bold and say fun and innovative way to end our long day of council today. I am going to

November 14-15, 2018

kick this over to laura john and she will tell me when to read the proclamation. Good afternoon.

**Laura John, Tribal Relations Director:** Thank you, mayor wheeler. Commissioners. For the record my name is laura john and I am the travel relations director in the office of government relations here in the city. Thank you for this opportunity to bring guests from the native american community here in Portland to speak in support of this proclamation. I was here just recently for native american heritage month proclamation which was really seen as way to educate people about our heritage and our history. Today's proclamation is really a proclamation for the native community here in the city. Rock your mocs was started in 2011 in new mexico. Jay-lynn was inspired to set aside a day for native which she looked at her feet and realized her footwear connected her with native people. She thought how powerful to know people were all making the same small statement about their identity by wearing moccasins on the same day. People from many different tribal backgrounds and cultures who all shared pride in their native heritage. Rock your mocs, once it was started, saw rapid awareness and participation as key national groups began promoting, national indian gaming association, and the national congress of american indians. In addition, this day has been observed by countless k-12 schools, colleges and universities around the country. I am especially proud to share today that the rock your mocs team in new mexico replied the city of Portland is the first to follow in the steps of the city of santa fe as well as the state of new mexico to designate a formal rock your mocs day.

**Wheeler:** Excellent:

**John:** I have a statement from the founder jay lynn.

**John:** Thank you, mayor ted wheeler, laura john, melissa sanchez who was our rock your mocs producer and all those in the Portland native community that made this proclamation happen. I feel extremely honored and ecstatic that Portland supports rock your mocs. I am also very happy, I am also very happy knowledge is being shared about native american heritage. Unity is power. Thank you, city of Portland." I would like to next introduce our speakers. I have isha pertle-wright who is here to speak on behalf the youth voice.

**Eisha Purple Wright, Warm Springs, Klamath:** [speaking in a native language] Hello, my friends and beautiful relatives in the back. I am an enrolled member of the warm springs tribe here in Oregon. Adopted member of the klamath people. I can explain how honored I am to come speak for you all as national rock your mocs day. I am very thankful for jolene and the city of Portland to come speak to my culture and myself. The entire month of november that is national native american heritage month, the one month that represents the 1,000 people who died here. Sorry. Long day at school. Thousands of children and teens who died in the christian boarding schools. They tried to kill the savage indians and make it civil. It represents the men, women, and child after dancing in the ghost dance praying for our land back. It represents the 50 modoc fighters to fight back for our lands in southern Oregon or in california. It also represents the 5,712 indigenous women who are missing or murdered in the united states and both in canada. It represents the generational trauma that as we as indian people have suffered from. I was prepared to speak out for the people who have been silenced and for the people who are scared to speak out. The people who have been raised to stay quiet and not speak up. The people who have been pushed down and treated terribly by the government. There are white people to put lies in history books and in cartoons. My culture is not a costume. My ancestors in my family are not extinct. We are here. I made a promise to an elder as a native youth of this generation to speak out so next generations can learn and we can teach their children. And our ancestors will sit here and watch us make a difference in this world and in this country. I will speak out until I join my ancestors in my beautiful moccasins and I join them and dance in the sky. Until then my voice will be heard by everyone. Thank you.

November 14-15, 2018

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Fritz:** Beautiful. Thank you. [applause]

**Shaleen Joseph, Montana/Alaskan:** Hello. Good evening. My name is shaylean joseph and I am a descendant and from montana and from alaska. I am also a very recent graduate of the university of california los angeles, ucla, with my master's in american indian studies. And I also work for a nonprofit here in Oregon, the native wellness institute. And underneath that we have started a project, the indigenous 20 somethings project. A lot of it is about healing a generation and changing the narrative. So I will read what I wrote today. I have been very fortunate to grow a family that taught me to value where I come from, the people, the land, and the teachings that have been passed down from generation to generation. They have shown me these teaches through action. In front of me right here are accumulated years of work and love that have been put in each one of those moccasins. From family members gifted to a child, myself, as they come into this world. I have been rocking my mocs since I was a baby and before I could walk. My family is an example of decolonizing and indigenizing our world view. Being raised with values that helped to guide me through my life. We have been connected to these lands through generations of stories and intergenerational responsibilities. The land sustains us and some believe our moccasins keep us grounded and connected to these lands. The rock your mocs, native american heritage month, and missing and murdered indigenous girls and women, this proclamation is important in showing your understanding. It allows our community to come together to show our pride, be visible in a city where we feel invisible. Rock your mocs is a movement. There's a time in our very recent history where it would be illegal for us to wear moccasins or any other traditional regalia. There was a policy that outlawed our people from being the kind human beings were born to be. We cannot speak our tribal languages or participate in our ceremonies. We could not live as our ancestors lived. Those policies left a lasting impact on our people today and act for many challenges in our communities. They're community members who are not here today because they have no mocs to rock or carry the shame in their bodies for being native and having cultural confusion about where they belong or fit in. With that we battle against erasure, cultural appropriation and rewriting our own history based on facts. We walk softly. We hold our heads high with dignity. We bring forth our teachings of our ancestors. I will continue to rock my mocs and I will continue to uphold my traditions and value systems. And even if I am wearing my nikes or my boots, in my mind I would always wear my mocs and they will guide me in every step. We are being seen in these spaces here in city hall, and universities and now even in congress. Times are continuing to change for the better. So thank you, mayor, and the city councilors, for agreeing to this proclamation and for being supportive of committing acts of decolonization and allowing the people of this land a few more moments to public celebration of our culture. Lastly, thank you to Laura John to allowing me to speak and be here and participating in writing a new history.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Judy Bluehorse Skelton, Nez Perce Cherokee:** Good afternoon. I'm Judy Bluehorse Nelson. A Nez Perce. I think these young women have said it all today. Their families have given an incredible gift in bringing that next generation right into the halls of city hall and the congress. I am humbled to be sitting amongst them at Portland State University, Rock Your Mocs, the students have hosted that last year as part of our Native Wellness Week, making that connection to decolonization, native youth suicide prevention, healthy lifestyles, empowering the community and themselves, overcoming historical trauma, recognizing that part of our identity is forever linked to our ancestors and into the 21st century and beyond in how we present, how we carry ourselves and bring these things forward. I too am grateful to Laura for your work bringing us together and for the two young women here who speak and all of those who cannot be here today for different reasons

November 14-15, 2018

but are here in spirit. A reminder how important on so many levels the moccasin is for us. It was just out at cully park today. We are trying to figure out how to get that dance and gathering area smooth so we can have our moccasins out on the land again without shredding them on the gravel. So again how important that is. To be able to be in the city, to be in the communities, to be in the land. And connection to identity and future generations. Thank you for your consideration and all the work you are doing, missing and murdered women, just tonight we are going to be having an indigenous women's leadership panel at psu. And i'm happy to say shalean will be joining us tonight to share more of this. Thank you for your work on this. [speaking a native language]

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**John:** Last I wanted to bring in a song. As native people, we bring in song for everything that we do. This isn't a prayer song. It's a social song. So we don't need to stand. But I felt that it was appropriate to bring in song as oftentimes as native people, when we do have our mocs on it's when we are dancing. I would like to introduce carlos mcnaair who is a fairly new employee in Portland parks and recreation.

**Wheeler:** Thanks, Karla. [drumming and singing]

**John:** Thank you very much. [applause]

**Wheeler:** Thank you. It's now my honor to read the proclamation. Carlos, I hope you saw the young timbers fan behind you there. He was very much enjoying your performance. So thank you very much. I think that was probably the best television we've had in this chamber in a long time. It was really a beautiful shot and I hope you will go back and watch this on cable television. Thank you, all, for sharing your testimony. Again, thank you. I know you put a lot of heart and soul in your testimony. You put a lot of hard work into it. Somebody said something in the chamber in a different context a week or two ago which came to mind. They said, we shouldn't have to constantly explain ourselves. And I was thinking about really the effort that you are making to be here, in a manner of speaking, you are explaining yourselves. And I want to acknowledge the work and the effort and even the sacrifice, the personal sacrifice that goes into it. I think it's been very valuable. And the proclamations that we've had here in our chamber since laura got here have been very meaningful. For the community. And I hope you feel that same sense of purpose and a accomplishment that I feel as we read this proclamation. I feel every time we do this, every time we do an event together, every time we share a new idea, we share more of the stories, more of the history, I feel like as a community we are actually coming closer together. So I want to acknowledge the sacrifice and thank you for it. Whereas #rockyourmocs is a worldwide native american and indigenous peoples movement, and is a day held annually and concurrently with november's national native american heritage month in the united states, and whereas the #rockyourmocs movement was founded by jessica of the pueblo of laguna, new mexico, in 2011 is a day for native american solidarity, and whereas this day serves as a day of honor and acknowledgment of native american people and their significant contributions to the world, and whereas this day is a reminder that native american people are not provided space to wear their traditional dress and footwear in daily life, and whereas #rockyourmocs provides an opportunity for native people to celebrate and share pride in their culture through the expression of footwear, and whereas a person may celebrate #rockyourmocs day by wearing moccasins or by wearing a turquoise awareness ribbon, and whereas the Portland city council in an act of solidarity encourages all Portlanders to celebrate this day in a manner that is culturally appropriate and respectful and now therefore i, ted wheeler, the mayor of the city of Portland, Oregon, the city of roses, do here by proclaim november 16th, 2018, to be #rockyourmocs day in Portland and encourage all residents to observe this day. Thank you. [applause]

**Fritz:** I have a question.

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fritz.



November 14-15, 2018

**Fritz:** One of the many, many -- thank you for your presentations. Thank you for your wise words. And for honoring us in this chamber. And I have a question. I really appreciate our tribal director Laura John because I get to ask you dumb questions. And if I have a dumb question, then I think others might want to know the answers, too. So the proclamation said that it's an opportunity for native people to celebrate and share pride in their culture through the wearing of footwear and also that we encourage all Portlanders to celebrate this day in a manner that's culturally appropriate and respectful. Could you tell me what that means?

**John:** Absolutely. Oftentimes, native culture is taken and misappropriated. You see that quite frequently during the Halloween holiday. And you will oftentimes see replicas of items that are made that are for sale that have not been made by a native person. They are commercially made, oftentimes overseas and are not reflective of the true look of regalia. So cultural appropriate meaning that these items are made by a native person or someone who has been gifted that right to make moccasins. You may have been gifted moccasins by a native person to a nonnative person. That would be appropriate. There are, again, there's replicas out there that wouldn't be appropriate for this day. For those that do not have moccasins, I'm wearing a turquoise ribbon today. I also have stickers for our city employees that also are a way to show solidarity on Friday.

**Fritz:** Thank you. So there are authentic moccasins, it's ok for a nonnative person to wear them?

**John:** Yes.

**Fritz:** For the rest of us a ribbon and a sticker would be a better display of solidarity?

**John:** That's correct.

**Fritz:** Thank you so much.

**Wheeler:** Very good. Laura, I don't know if you want to do a photo or not.

**John:** I think we could.

**Wheeler:** Why don't we come down here. We will pull up those ropes. Since this is our last item, Karla, I will go ahead and adjourn us and take our photo. We are adjourned.

**Council recessed at 4:07 p.m.**

**This file was produced through the closed captioning process for the televised City Council broadcast and should not be considered a verbatim transcript.**

**Key: \*\*\*\*\* means unidentified speaker.**

**November 15, 2018 2:00 p.m.**

**Saltzman:** This is the November 15 afternoon session of the city council. Karla, please call the roll.

**Fritz:** Here. **Fish:** Here. **Saltzman:** Here. **Wheeler:** Here.

**Saltzman:** Okay, please read the two items on our agenda together, please? 1183 and 1184.

**Karla:** Council rules first?

**Fish:** He's new at this. [laughter]

**Robert Taylor, Chief Deputy City Attorney:** Welcome to Portland city council. The city council represents all Portlanders and meets to do the city's business. The presiding officer preserves order and decorum during coining meetings so everyone can feel welcome, comfortable, respected and safe to. Participate in council meetings you may sign up in advance with the clerk's office for communications to briefly speak about any subject. You may also sign up for public testimony on resolutions or first readings of ordinances. Your testimony should address the matter being considered at the time. When testifying please state your name for the record. Your address is not necessary. Please disclose if you're a lobbyist. If you're representing an organization, please identify it. The presiding officer determines length of testimony. Individuals generally have three minutes to testify unless otherwise stated. When you have 30 left a yellow light goes on. When your time is done a red light goes on. If you are in the audience and would like to show support for something said, please feel free to do a thumbs up. If you want to express that you do not support something, please feel free to do thumbs down. Disruptive conduct such as shouting or interrupting testimony or council deliberations will not be allowed. If there are disruptions a warning will be given that further disruption may result in the person being ejected for the remainder of the meeting. After being ejected a person who fails to leave the meeting is subject to arrest for trespass. Thank you for helping your fellow Portlanders feel welcome, comfortable, respected and safe.

**Saltzman:** Thank you, Robert. Karla, could you read 1183 and 1184, please.

**Items 1183 and 1184.**

**Saltzman:** Commissioner Eudaly.

**Eudaly:** Thank you, president. Thank you for being here today, everyone. Our central city is growing with a new jobs and households but our streets are not getting any wider and with any luck they won't. While carpooling to city hall this morning between the joint policy advisory committee on transportation and work session this morning, I was stuck in traffic on the Hawthorne bridge next to a TriMet bus, and it felt -- it just felt like a very apropos experience given what we're here to talk about today. It's clear we have major problems now, and if all the new residents and commuters we can expect to live and work in the central city get around as we do today, the result would be a 47% increase in car trips. Our struggling street network would cease to function if that happens. The plan today spells out how to prevent that from occurring. Building off the work of the central city 2035 plan pb0t has worked for two years identifying investments that will help avoid gridlock and make transit, biking and walking safer. It's the product of extensive engagement. The project team has engaged with over 9,000 Portlanders via advisory committees, workshops, bike rides, surveys and people with disabilities as well as interactive online open houses.

November 14-15, 2018

Central city in motion is out 18 key projects specifically designed to make transit faster, more reliable, increase access to jobs and services by bike by creating a connected network and ensuring our city has safe and accessible crossings. Projects will increase the capacity of streets so it they can move more people helping accommodate growth. I want to take a moment to say even though mayor is not here to thank him again for assigning PBOT to me. I really had no idea how fascinating transportation was. [laughter] just how big of a nerd I could become about it. I really am loving it, love the team. Love the community advocates, transportation is something that touches all our lives and we should all have a say in it. Not only do we need to balance current need with future demand, I want to make it clear that I see very clearly that we need to encourage through incentives, disincentives and improvements to the overall system people to change their deeply ingrained behavior and cherished traditions namely owning and driving a single occupant vehicle. This effort is modeled on east Portland in motion. Pbot's sister implementation strategy focused on investments in east Portland active transportation needs to which over 255 million has been allocated to date. This represents over 3.5 times more than the 72 million of projects proposed in central city in motion. I want to take a moment to briefly address concerns that I have heard which is that we shouldn't be investing in our central city when we have so much to do in east Portland. First of all, there are budgets maps on our website. I think on the budget office website where you can see how we're investing our dollars whether it's transportation or housing or other dollars. You will see a significant increase in investment in east county. In fact, we're currently overinvesting in east county relative to estimated population growth in order to make up for historic underinvestment. I have repeatedly demonstrated through my efforts and initiatives, my commitment to east Portland, and in fact this plan will also benefit east Portland. How could that be you may be asking yourself. That is because the congestion in our central city and the fact that our public transportation hub is downtown impacts every person trying to take a bus across our entire city and throughout a lot of the region. If you live in east Portland and never take the bus even if you live in east Portland and never take the bus downtown all transit riders should want us to invest in central city bus lanes to ensure buses are not delayed trying to cross the river during rush hour every day, which seems to be almost round the clock at this point if I'm being honest. While every change to our central city streets involves tradeoffs, these projects were selected to ensure we can achieve out comes with a fewest possible impacts. It's becoming increasingly clear doing nothing is not an option. For climate, air quality, vision zero, transit reliability we cannot afford to delay these investments. Adopting central city in motion does not set street designs in stone. It sets directions for where to make investments in the bus lines, protected bike lanes and safer crossings we need that will allow pbot to begin to design these critical projects ensuring block by block needs are considered and accommodated. The accompanying parking strategies also area of controversy in the community that report provides a range of options for managing change in at the central east side recognizing that many of us still rely on cars to get around and many local businesses rely on on-street parking for their customers but again, none of is it carved in stone. We are not allocating public funds to new parking structures with this report and if any new parking structure is ever developed it should be adaptable to other uses if current parking trends change. Which in case that wasn't clear because I just stumbled over my words we should be designing parking structures with second life in mind when we are not so reliant on single occupant vehicles, when we do not need the level of parking we currently need and we certainly have better uses for our developable properties. I will direct staff to move forward immediately with strategies that will support businesses and employees with tools like the transportation wallet program and partnering with omsi and other owners of surface existing surface parking lots that could be better utilized and take some pressure off our parking. I'm

November 14-15, 2018

directing PBOT staff to convene a working group to monitor implementation of this plan. I will charge that group with reconciling any issues that come up at today's hearing as well as ensure that projects are producing intended outcomes. I provided a charter of the working group to council members and there should be copies available for the public. I didn't notice on my way in. I'm sure someone on my staff is listening to me and taking care of that issue at this moment. We urgently need to get to work. That's why I'm asking my colleagues to vote today. It's taken six years to develop this plan and there will be plenty of opportunity to debate the specifics of individual projects as they are designed and built. We need to adopt this plan today to move forward on any of them. So at this time we would like to invite Gabe Graff and Art Pearce from PBOT to present the plan. Welcome, gentlemen.

**Art Pearce, Bureau of Transportation:** Thank you. I'm art Pearce. Policy planning and projects manager for the bureau of transportation. Excited to be with you today offering the product of considerable work and considerable amount of time. In 2012 when we applied for funding for this endeavor, we realized that we needed a large comprehensive plan, a solution at a larger scale, to match the scale of growth and change in the central city and understanding that we needed money for more planning work as well as the first range of capital investments. We framed this to hopefully build momentum to make change coming out of the process. As commissioner already relayed, a major driver of this discussion is around growth. Around continuing to be a competitive decide as Portland grows, and knowing that if we want the central city to continue to be that hub that it is today and to be a competitive with cities around the country if not the globe we need to continue to help the city evolve and make better space of the roadways that we have to be able to provide the mobility that we think everyone deserves. We're not alone facing these charges. There are cities throughout the country that are endeavoring in these types of efforts really working to take the growth that is a factor of success and try to continue to pave the way towards being a competitive city. So, a couple of examples, one is very nearby to us, Seattle, really serves as both an example of success, also cautionary tale. They have made major investments in bus lanes and bikeways and are seeing great responses to that but that investment and the timeliness did not keep pace with development and Seattle therefore has earned a reputation for its congestion as part of what it is known, part of the Seattle brand is the congestion its residents and visitors endure on a daily basis. The department of transportation has told the public they are in a period of maximum constraint meaning traffic will get worse before it gets better based on timing of their response. That's a fate that we want to avoid. We want to get ahead of the scale of problems and challenges before we reach that moment where we are at the level of critical inflexion. Calgary, which is Canada's fastest growing city, has worked on piloting over the course of one year a downtown grid of protected bikeways. They have seen remarkable success, a 30% jump in bike trips, increases in percentage of women bike riders and radical reduction in sidewalk riding which is an issue for this council as well. In Denver as part of Denver moves the city's multimodal plan to connect their downtown area, constituent has built more than 12 miles of downtown bikeways and they have seen an 81% increase in bike commuters and 34% drop in crashes involving bicycles. In Vancouver also nearby, the city is investing in bus lanes and protected cycle tracks to accommodate residents. We have heard from the Vancouver business association that their major chamber of commerce that they stated we want all customers to be able to get to our businesses regardless of age and ability. These improvements do that. Our employers want to attract employees. The work force is changing, and we need to embrace the needs of that changing work force. It's also a moment that it's incumbent on me to remind us that we're always changing the city. The city is changing on a daily basis and part of our role as public is to intervene and direct that into a direction that we can be proud of. I think it's also important to remember that streets



November 14-15, 2018

in the public realm are in our care and our representation of our values. So, if you're looking at these historic slides this was a time in which we had a postcard if you look at the bottom right that tells you to be careful crossing the streets in Portland. So, this is what was how Portland was selling itself through the globe in the 1950's and '60s.

**Eudaly:** Still relevant. [laughter]

**Pearce:** Very true. But we're looking at what is now pioneer square as storage for public parking. If we're looking at the direction, we can take this conversation one of the other cautionary tales in there is as we were looking at growing remember Steve dodder who teaches history, he has a slide talking about moving building faces. They actually put the building faces on casters to slide them back to widen west Burnside. That's why we have narrow blocks there. You think of the scale of what it would take instead of looking at using our space more efficiently to focus on widening our streets. It would be without end and without end of consequences. We have great examples from a not too distant history of where this city council and region took a very progressive and aggressive choice to buck the trend at the time. Waterfront park, pioneer square and transit mall are all examples that we tell when we talk about the heroic efforts of Portlanders past. We feel this is an opportunity for us to continue to emphasize that our streets and public spaces are for people of Portland. It is incredibly cost effective to reuse our streets to move people more effectively. As we understood from the cautionary tales from cities like Seattle, this challenge will not get easier if we wait or delay this decision. We are already experiencing increased congestion in our central city at an alarming rate and the proposed solutions before you today are a major step in the right direction of curbing that tide. Really what we're bringing to council is an opportunity for your leadership helping us choose amongst all the ways that we might change the central city on the most targeted and prioritized details with property owners along those ways. Pass it along to Gabe.

**Gabe Graff, Bureau of Transportation:** Thank you. Thank you for having me. I'm Gabe Graff, project manager with the privilege of managing this central city in motion project for the last couple of years. A little bit about the central city, it's a special place for our city, our region, our state. It's the densest concentration of people and jobs in Oregon. Just 3% of the city's land area, home to cultural institutions, major employers, half the city's affordable housing stock, key central services. Our city is growing, and we expect to absorb 30% of population growth. 130,000 jobs. By 2035 we expect 180,000 jobs. And as commissioner Eudaly noted, the central city is the right place for this growth, but we must invest in our transportation system to serve all the new trips that growth entails. Our central city streets are already congested. All Portlanders have a stake in reliable transportation system even if they don't live or work here. It's not just transit riders stuck in in traffic. This is likely familiar. Commuters stuck in traffic waiting to cross the Hawthorne bridge regardless of how they travel. Congestion impacts not just commuters but reliable freight movement. Commute trips by car and shopping as well. If the central city continues to grow as we expect all these new residents and commuters get around as we do, as commissioner Eudaly noted, the result will be thousands of additional cars on central city streets. Imagine more cars trying to squeeze into this picture. Then think about every block on our city with additional vehicles. PBOT is committed to avoiding this future and central city in motion as a key part of our managing for growth strategy to address. While we can't make our existing streets wider without exception of an expense we can increase the capacity of our streets to move more people by ensuring dedicated space for everyone especially space efficient vehicles like buses and bikes. Southwest Madison and Hawthorne bridge can carry more people if we add a bus lane approaching them. The capacity of the bun side bridge increases 145%. As art mentioned fast-growing cities are all investing in these solutions because they work. One of fastest growing cities in the country, Seattle, has made these robust investments and pedestrian safety, bike lanes and dedicated bus lanes.

November 14-15, 2018

Seattle has added 60,000 jobs in their downtown core yet 4500 fewer people drove to work. Smart investments meant all the new commute trips were accommodated by transit, ride sharing, walking and biking. We can do the same. 39% of our central city is already streets and sidewalks. Knocking down buildings to build the new roads doesn't make sense but by carefully selecting a few of the roads and dedicating a portion of the space on them to biking and buses we can make travel easier for everyone regardless of how they get around. The 18 projects in central city in motion will allocate an additional 1% of right of way to buses, 1% of right of way to bikes bringing the total roadway space dedicated to transit and biking in our city to just 6%. But these methods of travel are so space can be efficient. The small percentage of increase increases the people moving capacity of the respective streets by 60%. So what is in this plan? Stemming from a metro grant proved by council in 2013 central city in motion was designed to look holistically at our transportation system to address these key issues. Safety, 45% of high crash intersections in our city are in the central city for people walking or biking. Clarity. Central city stakeholders have asked pbot to delay investments until completion of the 2035 plan and comprehensive study was completed. This is that study. Climate and air quality. These projects will help meet our climate action goals and the recent climate challenge and of course growth which I previously detailed. It's an implementation plan focused on five to ten years. It's focused on investments in bus lanes and bikeways and accessible and safer crossings. We took a something level look at all the needs and potential projects in our central city and worked with the public on where to prioritize investments. We began with a central city 2035 plan updating traffic classifications on all our central city streets and out to Portlanders through a series of engagements for additional ideas. We have engaged over 9,000 Portlanders in this effort using all of the above strategy including terrific sounding board and our advisory committee, focus groups, monthly meeting, targeted surveys, interactive and friendly open houses and design presentations to many folks in this room. We were transparent in daylighting the tradeoffs in these changes. We ended up looking at the central city in a variety of lenses. I'll detail them quickly. First transit. We're seeking to leverage the resources the central city already has, and robust transit service is one but it's getting increasingly slower and less reliable due to congestion so we focused on where investments could improve travel time and reliability. TriMet, metro, multnomah county have been tremendous collaborative partners. You'll see that in this map here. For biking unlike our transit network the bike lane network is disconnected and in red is our existing and funded low stress network there are thousands of jobs and destinations that Portlanders can't access comfortably by bike. We looked at the options outlined? The central city 2035 plan in yellow and focused on those routes shown in teal we propose as future backbone of our low stress bike lane network. For people rocking and rolls while the sidewalk network is largely complete there are many missing or substandard crossings. We identified those needs setting the stage for the future green loop.

**Fritz:** Before you move from that last slide there are some places where there isn't connected sidewalk particularly along naito next to waterfront park. I don't see that on there. Is there a plan to provide sidewalks where there aren't any?

**Graff:** There is and I'll get to that.

**Fritz:** Thank you.

**Graff:** Another lens that emerged during early stage of the process was the importance of ensuring safe, reliable access for freight, particularly on the central east side. We partnered on a great study for the district gathering data about free portals and adjusting our plans to ensure that we're compatible with the freight operations in the district. We identified tradeoffs calculating curb zones that may be impacted as we deliver these projects. All this work informed our design process. Bus lanes proposed on southeast belmont were scrapped after reviewing traffic impacts. Bikeway proposed adjacent to

November 14-15, 2018

France was reconsidered and transit mall set aside as impacts to traffic circulation, building access, transit operations and existing parking structures were too great. At the end the result is 18 key multimodal projects that are before you today. We went over hundreds of ideas, made choices about where to focus, where changes to the street design could have the most benefit and least impacts. At a system level these 18 projects will provide dedicated bus lanes approaching the steel, Burnside and Hawthorne bridges improving the commutes of 86,000 transit riders, 49 key social services via connected low stress bike network including some of the highest crash intersections for vulnerable users in our city. They will increase the people moving capacity of their respective streets by 60% helping manage this growth. I'll quickly highlight a few of these projects not just the most popular but also some of the more controversial ones and underscore that as we move forward with design implementation of these projects we're committed to working with all partners to make sure they are a success. First west Burnside, called project 1, this would implement an eastbound bus lane from the park blocks on the west side of the river all the way to 12th on the east side. Includes a series of pedestrian safety improvements on west Burnside street and protected bike lanes across the Burnside bridge. Project 2, this provides the major spine for north-south bikeway through downtown enhancing the existing bikeway on Southwest Broadway and creating a new northbound couplet on Southwest 4th serving destinations south of 405 as well as Portland State University. Project number 3, on the center east side we looked at options for locating improving bus service, improves pedestrian safety, locating the green loop and providing a north-south loop for people cycling. We identified different streets for different needs. Milk and Grand were identified to have bus lanes and freight lanes. Southeast 6th was identified for improved pedestrian crossings to benefit the green loop. Southeast 7th will benefit from protected bike lanes. 5 we looked at Southwest Jefferson, Columbia and Madison. Southwest Madison which I previously mentioned will benefit from a new bus lane approaching the Hawthorne bridge. Jefferson and Columbia will be reconfigured to deconflict busing and bicycles, smooth vehicular traffic, and really prioritize those streets as key east-west transit corridor in our central city. Number 7, a short stretch of Northwest Everett providing a bus lane for all busses that cross the steel bridge providing dedicated space and priority as they approach that important bridge crossing. Last but not least, Southwest Naito. This project has evolved over the course of our process. Our current proposal is to dedicate one of the northbound travel lanes to people biking essentially making what is the seasonal better Naito project a permanent fixture of our central city. To phase in the sidewalk infill on the west side of the curb as the trees reach the end of their life. A lot of public feedback we received was about maintaining the trees. To make this work well for all users Naito Parkway regardless of how they get around we're proposing to upgrade signals along the corridor so they can detect vehicular queuing and adjust the timing to make sure people trying to access I-5 off the Morrison bridge are not stuck in long delays. Those are a number of the hottest of our 18 projects.

**Fritz:** Where would people be able to find out the others if they want to? I appreciate you just giving us a selected version, to find out more --

**Graff:** Our full report and details are available at our website.  
[Portlandoregon.gov/transportation/ccin](http://Portlandoregon.gov/transportation/ccin).

**Fritz:** Thank you.

**Graff:** In addition to the freight study we completed this parking supply and demand management report which commissioner Eudaly mentioned to explore ocean options for mitigating parking impacts inherent in most projects. Staff identified a range of strategies, six of which we consider recommended strategies for handling these parking impacts and that we think we can fully mitigate the loss of on-street parking with. They include enhanced transportation demand management, transportation program, shared off street

November 14-15, 2018

parking now allowed under the central city 2035 plan. On street parking operational improvements, working block by block to ensure we have the curb zone programmed in the best way. Our recent scooter pilot has shown new technology can really change the way people get around and data from our scooter users shows they do reduce driving. Off street pay station pilot. If you're in an existing surface lot that's not currently public parking we could partner with you to open that up when you're not using it. We looked at the request of stakeholders capacity and operational improvements and off street parking investment fund where the bureau would partner with another developer who is a building structured parking to allow some of it to be available for the public. Finally, we asked Portlanders to weigh in on all 18 of these and which we should deliver first to help prioritize our work. In red here you'll see those projects that appear on our one to five-year project list, sliced and diced. Some key project, Burnside project, Broadway and 4th, northeast-southeast 7th connecting to the new Sullivan's bridge. Southwest Madison which we discussed. Northwest Everett are on this one to five-year list. We have also identified a six to ten-year list of recommended projects, projects that did not meet that highest level of priority or need more work to -- additional work on the design to make sure we have a project that will work for everybody. I'll say finally, I would like to thank the northeast coalition of neighbors, southeast uplift, business for better Portland, street trust, downtown neighborhood association, lyft, go lloyd, Portland street car, omsi, elliott neighborhood association, byrd, Portland state university among others and acknowledge the Portland business alliance, central east side industrial committee and Portland freight committee for their constructive feedback. We look forward to continuing to work with everyone trying to make these a success.

**Fish:** Commissioner eudaly, do you have panels we're going to hear from? You also have an elected official. Let's take questions first of council then turn it over to the first panel.

**Fritz:** Thank you, mr. Acting president. Just getting back to the project 17 in the report that we have it just says continuous sidewalk is desirable and could be implemented in phases as trees near the natural ends of their life cycle. My life cycle will end before theirs. Given that we're dedicating money for a bikeway, why are we not making sure that we have a pedestrian way? As many pedestrians and rolling needs as there are bike needs.

**Graff:** Sure. Just as the naito pilot allows for pedestrian and bike access in the summers when it's implemented, this plan would allow for people to walk or roll or bike in the facility that we construct with the idea that eventually continuous sidewalk would be constructed.

**Pearce:** One thing I would add, part of what we're trying to do with the naito project is reduce the conflicts along the waterfront and so I think it allows us to further direct cyclists away from the waterfront and to stay on naito and to provide a more pleasant walking experience through the park itself. It's a tradeoff.

**Fritz:** I have concerns about that because there should be a sidewalk along naito.. Not having to send pedestrians and those using mobility devices into the park. Certainly i'm not going to be walking where people are going superfast. What will you do in areas that we're getting protected bikeways to make sure that pedestrians have a pedestrian environment that is free of bikes?

**Graff:** We -- i'm sorry I didn't include a slide of this, we developed a decal for our sidewalks so as projects are implemented will direct cyclists and scooter users to use the facilities and not ride on the sidewalk.

**Fritz:** There will be actual signage that says --

**Pearce:** We're proposing so. I don't know that we have gone through the full vetting process with our commissioners so I don't want to surprise you.

**Fritz:** That's on my bucket list. Could you just -- I know we're going to get testimony on why protected bikeways on 4th and Broadway rather than 5th and 6th. Could you elaborate about why you didn't do 5th and 6th?



November 14-15, 2018

**Graff:** Sure. There are a host of reasons. When we're looking at all projects we're looking at how can we get the benefits of protected bikeways and bus lanes with the least impacts. That was the lens that we used for the north-south major north-south bikeway route through the downtown. There's a section of the transit mall if you think around pioneer square where just walking around you could see how it would work well as a bikeway, a car-free transit mall. But if you spends some time as we did on our project team thinking through all the details of connecting all the way down to 405 and psu at the southern end to the Broadway bridge at the northern end the challenges include access, so there's a number -- the Hilton valet zone, parking structure, the only access is off the mall. There's many landlocked buildings on the mall so their garbage service is on the mall. There's on-street parking that would need to be removed particularly the southern mall. The Wells Fargo drive-through. In the south downtown because of the superblock nature of that neighborhood vehicular access is critical to accessing other buildings. Access from 6th to Harrison is the only way some of those buildings can get service. Be it delivery or freight. It was very technically challenging and the other component is the property owners who are paying in still will be paying in until 2030 for the lid that constructed the mall the key selling point was continual vehicular access.

**Fritz:** And we should keep our promise. That was a helpful answer. My last question, central east side parking you said there were going to be some mitigation. Could you just explain more about what you have been working on recently about central east side parking?

**Graff:** Yes. Omsi I think we included in the packet has expressed commitment to ways of sharing surface lots. The central east side industrial council operates a shuttle that gets people from surface parking to their sites of employment. We also have a transportation wallet program. So if you are an employee on the central east side you can get a parking permit. If you forego that permit we will give you a pass that includes transit benefits, streetcar benefits and bike town benefits and there are 600 employees to date have taken us up on that offer. Part of our strategy would be to work directly with employers along routes where we're making improvements to provide them even better transit benefits for their employees.

**Fritz:** Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Any other questions?

**Fish:** First start with the commissioner charge. When I got my briefing in my office a few weeks ago on this proposal, it was obviously rich with detail. It's a report, so not everything in the report is going to end up being implemented. What is your plan in terms of taking high priority projects, implementing them over the next five years, what would council's role be in shaping the implementation strategy?

**Eudaly:** That's a good question. I think we briefly discussed that and I'm going to hand this back to Gabe.

**Graff:** If you look at the resolution we have proposed an annual report back to council to report on our progress in implementing the projects and their performance then as commissioner Eudaly proposed at the beginning of the session there's been an amendment to include a working group to monitor progress as well.

**Fish:** That's helpful. Can I get an email copy of that excellent power point?

**Graff:** Oh, sure.

**Fish:** It had some of the best of from your underlying report.

**Graff:** Right.

**Fish:** It's a good cheat sheet for those of you who need to have facts at our fingertips.

**Graff:** For sure.

**Fish:** At lunch I took a Lyft up to OHSU. When I came back I took a radio cab. It's not lost on me since I live and work downtown that our roads are becoming increasingly clogged with

November 14-15, 2018

tncs. San Francisco recently did a report and the impact of tncs on congestion. I don't want to be overly provocative but to what extent does the success of this plan depend on further regulations involving things like cabs or numbers of tncs allowed on downtown streets?

**Graff:** I do think it's a part of the solution. That's other departments within the bureau are working on deepening the partnership with those different tnc providers. A lot of it is -- as each of them are able to bring more and more efficient use of even their own vehicles so you riding alone in a tnc is the same as you driving alone but if we're able to direct people more towards the sharing platforms for those organizations you then end up with three or four people using that same amount of space. That's producing more and more efficiency of our roadway use. Not as much as we may get from a trimet bus but more than we're getting now. A lot of it is working with those providers to push them more towards the sharing end of their platform notice and rewarding the delivery of that end of the program.

**Fish:** Thank you. Is venture Portland at the table with you as a spokesperson for the small businesses in some of these business districts?

**Graff:** I don't know the degree to which they have.

**Fish:** May I just ask that they be part of the team or consulted?

**Graff:** Of course.

**Fish:** We have found them particularly helpful dealing with some conflicts you're likely to encounter when you go from your plan to actually implementation.

**Graff:** For sure.

**Fish:** They have in the past said they are more useful to us if we engage them upstream.

**Graff:** Absolutely.

**Eudaly:** That's how most people feel. Commissioner Fish very timely questioned about the tncs. We raised it over lunch with a lobbyist representing one of those groups. While in the past they have been resistant to the idea of limiting the number of permits or drivers on the road at any given time it's becoming undeniable to the public and to them that they are impacting our streets negatively as far as congestion, adding to pollution, and the reality is oversaturation of drivers means it's hard for anyone to make a decent living. So I am hopeful that there they will be more receptive to that conversation moving forward. It's something that I'm keenly interested in. Gabe, would it be possible to go back to the slide where it shows the percentage of our streets dedicated to vehicles versus other modes?

**Pearce:** Absolutely.

**Eudaly:** This stood out to me for a couple of reasons. One, for people who -- all these changes to bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure are relatively new. So like other ways the city has changed it's a little bit shocking and stressful to some people and you hear complaints that we are privileging cyclists and pedestrians, that we're overinvesting in the infrastructure at the expense of car drivers. So I think it's notable to see that actually only 4% of the space on our streets is dedicated to bicycle transportation mobility, buses and max and after this plan it will only be 6%, which for me makes me wonder if we're doing enough. Certainly everyone in the city is a pedestrian unless they are absolutely house bound or have a jet pack and just directly shoot into the space from their vehicle to wherever their destination is. More and more of us are riding bikes and we want more and more of us to ride public transportation. Do you want to wade into that or -- just leave it there?

**Graff:** I would say just -- one of the things that is just true about buses or biking or pedestrians in terms of transportation is they are so space efficient that half of our right of way doesn't need to be dedicated to them for our city to function. I looked at the statistics for Copenhagen, which has some of the highest bike commuting in the world. 62% of trips are by bike. They have dedicated 7% of their roadways to biking. 7% carries 62% of their trips.

November 14-15, 2018

**Eudaly:** Wow. That's fascinating. All right. Thank you. Unless we have further questions i'm going to invite the first panel up. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** We have at this point 42 people signed up under public testimony so i'm going to limit testimony to two minutes each when we get to that point.

**Eudaly:** First invited panel. Welcome, everybody. If you could also make your testimony concise so we can hear from as many community members as possible that would be great.

**Mayor Mark Gamba, City of Milwaukie:** Good afternoon, everyone. I'm mark gamba, mayor of milwaukie. I'm mostly here to cheer you on. We have a similar program that we're rolling out in milwaukie over the next nine years we'll be spending around \$50 million building bike-pedestrian transit 5:00 set throughout our city and we're doing this for a number of reasons. Climate is obviously a big one but we recognize that you don't build your way out of congestion. You don't build road miles to solve congestion. You also don't reduce the number of people sitting and waiting in cars by building more parking. It's incumbent on us I think the ipcc report made it really clear we have a very short clock in which to start changing the way our society functions. And doing the very smart things in this plan that will increase mode share for bicycles, pedestrians and for transit is one of the fastest ways we get there. It's one of the most important things we do. So you can make those three modes safer, more efficient, and mostly that, safer and more efficient. Biking is already more effective. I myself biked here today. I bike to most of my meetings in the central Portland area because it's faster. I can get almost anywhere and park faster than most people can in a car. So it is already the more effective way if we can make it the more safe way that would radically increase our mode share and decrease car pollution. It's a great plan. I'm really excited to see it. Thanks.

**Saltzman:** Let me congratulate you on your reelection. I think you had 96% of the vote?

**Gamba:** 95%.

**Eudaly:** Wow: [laughter]

**Fish:** Do you have the names and addresses of the 5%?

**Gamba:** I do not.

**Bernie Bottomly, TriMet** Bernie bottomly from trimet, happy to be here today to fully support the central city in motion plan. We're pleased with the work done and very appreciative of the city's support for helping us improve service not only in downtown but across the region. I want to acknowledge a couple of folks who have been behind this effort for a long time. Former commissioner steve novick first approached us at trimet about securing some mtip funding which is the 5 million that has gone into the engineering and planning for a number of projects on the -- in the plan and also similar projects around the region to speed up transit service. Art pearce, who has been a stalwart. Margie, who before she moved to metro and also at metro has been a significant factor in this idea of moving forward. Gabe, leah treat, former director of pbot, as well. All have helped germinate and grow this idea to this point. So we're very supportive as I mentioned. I wanted to just touch on an issue that commissioner eudaly mentioned which is the positive impact of the implementation of this plan not only on bus service in downtown but across the region. Just the big three projects we call them the big three, madison, everett and burnside, those will help us with 13 bus routes. That represents about 85,000 trips every day. So we're not just improving service downtown but across the region. The delay that we have in our service and getting off schedule downtown ripples across the region particularly into east Portland where they feel the biggest brunt of the delay in getting downtown. We're very interested in seeing a number of these projects move forward as quickly as we can. One of the reasons that there's funding to do some of these projects through the mtip funding is that the city approached trimet and asked us if we would borrow money to make those funds available now as opposed to a couple of years from

November 14-15, 2018

now when federal funds actually start to flow. The \$5 million you may have heard about as part of the enhanced transit program is actually money that trimet borrowed in anticipation of federal money that will be coming later from metro in the jpac process. It's important we follow through on our commitment to try to accelerate this process. The other reason is that metro is leading a conversation in the region about a regional transportation funding measure. We think that these enhanced transit corridor concepts in addition to things like southwest corridor light-rail are really fundamental to making sure that the transit system works in this increasingly congested and growing region. These strategic investments are not developing a whole corridor from end to end necessarily but taking a couple of intersections where we lose the most time, where we have the most riders sitting in that traffic if we can fix those intersections and give the bus some priority it really has a tremendous impact on improving the entire system. So we would like to see some of these projects move quickly so we can demonstrate to the region to voters that this is an investment that makes sense in a regional funding measure. So with that I will just close and say that we very much appreciate the partnership with the city. We look forward to continuing to work with you and with metro to see these projects move forward. Thank you.

**Margi Bradway, Metro:** Hi. I'm margi bradway, deputy director of the planning and development department at metro. Good to see you. I note that my metro councilors will be here but they are also meeting now and in particular councilor stacey sends his regards. He's been a big champion of this project. Like the mayor i'm here to cheer you on. Metro has been a steadfast supporter starting in 2013 when we allocated regional flex funds, funds that bernie was talking about, to this project and at that time there was significant active transportation components. We have since also provided technical support for the transit components bernie was talking about. In those five years metro has also done a lot of planning work. We completed an active transportation plan. We also created our safety vision zero plan and we recently updated our regional transportation plan which commits to reducing greenhouse gases by 40%. The central city program is central to those plans. We have been talking about it, planning for it. We're ready to do it. We're ready to see this implemented on the ground. We think it's key to meeting some of our regional goals around transportation efficiency, climate and safety. Like trimet we're ready to do what you need to get this going. So thank you.

**Gamba:** Margi reminded me of something. I had been surprised when I read the plan or portion of the plan I got to read that 20 of the 40 worst intersections in your vision zero are in this plan. You're solving half of your city's worst intersections for bikes and pedestrians in this plan. That was impressive. That's a big hit really fast. So that's particularly cool. I would point out to the folks with businesses on these streets that you can park a whole lot more bikes in front of your business than you can cars in front of your business. The streets that have changed to more bike intensive streets have seen an not just an up tick, a strong surge in their business. These been our experience as well.

**Eudaly:** I agree. I have been pushing back on the parking issue as someone who owned a business in downtown Portland for 17 years and found it increasingly difficult to get customers, local residents, to cross the river and come downtown because they hate driving down and parking downtown. I believe that making it easier to get here by bike, on foot or wheels, not cars, obviously, and by bus makes more sense than investing in more parking. Thank you, everyone. Thank you, mayor. I'm going to invite our next panel up. Ian cannon welcome, everyone. Please say your name for the record. Go in whatever order you would like.

**Ian Cannon, Multnomah County Transportation Director:** Good afternoon, commissioners. I'm ian cannon, transportation director for Multnomah county. I'm here to support the central city in motion project. Multnomah county maintains and operates the hawthorne morrison burnside and Broadway bridges. These bridges are critical links in the



November 14-15, 2018

transportation net wore and serve thousands of trips each day for central city commuters and residents whether it be by car, bus, bike or on foot. We're very pleased by the collaboration with our partners at the city and trimet as our agencies have worked creatively together to get the most out of the bridges to make them safer and to support more users as our region grows. The central city in motion project includes a number of improvements for transit, pedestrian and bicycling facilities on and approaching the bridges. Projects such as the bus lane across the burnside bridge, connections to hawthorne, better connections to the morrison bridge multiuse path and safety improvements to the broadway bridge will leverage these assets to serve more users more safely into the future. We support the central city in motion project as a significant step in keeping Portland moving. Thank you.

**Eudaly:** Thank you.

**Reza Farhoodi, Pearl Neighborhood Association:** Good afternoon, commissioners. I'm here on behalf of the -- we support the package of projects proposed in central city in motion and urge you to adopt the plan presented before you. We have many regional destinations including parks, breweries, powell books and mixed income neighborhood so over 60% of residents are renters and nearly a quarter of housing is affordable. Many need to access social services. Nearly half have access to a vehicle which means they rely on other ways to get around. With the amount of growth forecasted it quickly becomes an issue of geometry. We don't have enough space on our roads and vibrancy and livability of our neighborhood depends on having a transportation system that's efficient and safe to get around. More transportation choices and creates a safer system for all users and I want to bring up sidewalks specifically because I get a lot of complaints from people in my neighborhood about scooters, bike riding. Anecdotally I notice when there's a bike lane people use it. If we want to create safer sidewalks passing this plan is pertinent to doing so. So I want to thank pbot for including us in this process. They have been very responsive. They came to a number of our community meetings and we felt included in the process. We look forward to working with them to implement these projects in the future.

**Emily Barratt, AWS Elemental:** Hi. Thank you. I'm emily barratt. While I do work in high-tech just a couple blocks away i'm here not in that role today but as a board member for the street trust. I just joined the board because of the importance of biking transit and walking. I moved to Portland 16 years ago. The reputation of Portland as a place I can enjoy without relying on a car as I had to do in my home state of montana was a big reason why. Today i'm a homeowner. Still am a car owner although it doesn't get very many miles on it. I choose to live in inner north Portland for the ability to walk, bike and bus to my office, to my church, to most of my shopping and for entertainment t. I stopped driving for my work commute six years ago because of the increase in traffic and frankly it was just causing me to come home really angry and upset. So I began taking transit at first, line 44. I have slowly added more bike commuting and now I have a two-year-old so as a household with two working parents getting our son to and from daycare is really important every day. It's important to do it safely but also really important to do it predictably and on time to that our careers don't get dinged by that. So we and a lot of people at our daycare and in my office rely on safely biking in and around the central city to be efficient, as family, as employees and to know we're making a pro environment choice. Biking is the best option now due to traffic impacting transit for me. We do it no matter the weather. Transit is the second choice and my car a distant third. I'm urging your support to make biking to daycare and to school and to work available to more Portlanders. I think more people of my gender, age and demographic will make this choice when they can be safe and efficient. I loaned my bicycle to a colleague this summer while I was on a trip. She rode it three days but was too scared to commute. She has a seven-year-old to get to school and to activities and to office it just didn't feel safe for her.

November 14-15, 2018

Frequently i'm told by other mothers at my daycare I would never bike with my two-year-old. It's too dangerous. They don't want to be a brave choice. I don't like being one of the few women in my office to bike. I urge you to adopt this today. Thank you.

**Eudaly:** I guess they are not with us.

**Saltzman:** Jo ann, do you want to fill in for the street trust board member?

**Eudaly:** Welcome.

**Saltzman:** They were in the other room.

**Eudaly:** I forgot about the overflow. Sorry about that.

**Serenity Ebert:** Hi. My name is serenity ebert. I lived downtown for ten years. I'm here today to urge you to approve pbot's central city in motion plan and to make better naito -- I feel that the central city in motion plan would make streets safer for everyone. I depend on public transit to navigate the city. I use a walker or a trike to get around. I feel like -- is the important distinction because whichever one i'm using I don't have the benefit of the other. That means all year ronde, not just during the summer. Central city in motion would make it much safer and more comfortable for me and everyone else to get around downtown. Sorry. I believe that everyone deserves to safely move around. I have gotten much more comfortable cycling through downtown than I used to be, but I think many more people would bike and take transit if they felt safe. I love the better protected bike lane on naito because it's the most direct route to the steel bridge. I don't have to go -- on the waterfront path. As it is now, the unprotected bike lane on naito is ridiculous and not wide enough for a trike. I very much enjoy being protected from the fast-moving traffic on naito. This should be a city where people of all ages and abilities feel like they can safely and comfortably move through downtown. We need the projects recommended in central city in motion plan.

**Eudaly:** Thank you.

**Karen Lickteig, Nossa Familia Coffee:** Hi. I'm karen lickteig. I'm here representing nossa familia coffee, a locally owned coffee roasting business and we also have four physical locations in Portland including main street and northwest industrial, a coffee shop in the pearl district and two east side coffee shops. Two of those cafes are in the central city in motion region. We're a small business that encourages our employees and our customers to use alternative forms of transportation besides single passenger vehicles to get to work and to visit our coffee shops. We just think it's better for the climate, better for people's health and better for creating a more livable community. So with our locations in the central city districts in particular we run against a lot of issues around accessibility and getting to us. We get a lot of complaints sometimes about, oh, I tried to visit and I couldn't find parking. But we respond with why don't you try biking or walking or taking transit. We also are a member of the central east side industrial council, but unlike the official statement from the ceic, which is expressing some opposition to the plans that would remove parking we actually are in agreement that more people can get to our business when we actually give preference to modes that can transport more people and less space. Buses and more bike parking so we're in favor of ideas that can help more people access our businesses. We think that the central city in motion plan is great for making it easier, safer and ultimately more enjoyable to get to our businesses. I visited our central east side location this morning actually around 7:00 a.m. And the streets were lined with cars which were clearly of people working in the building who were probably going to look at the two-hour parking which is not needed and move their car around to try to avoid getting a ticket. I think some of the projects would benefit small businesses in getting more people to visit us and we really look forward to some of the projects for that. Thanks.

**Phil Richman, Street Trust Board:** I'm phil richman. I'm here on behalf of the street trust. Appreciate you listening to the testimony. I actually called jillian about an hour ago kind of fretting over a letter that I had written for this testimony and decided that i'll just get up and

November 14-15, 2018

be myself. So I think everyone here has kind of stated what needs to be stated. Commissioner Eudaly, I appreciate the fact that you're taking the traffic and transportation class as I did a few years ago. I think it is a true education on how mobility has worked in the past, and of course we none of us could have anticipated we would be seeing scooters all over. If you look at news around the globe, they are not showing any signs of going away, and we need to accommodate more and more people in smaller and smaller spaces. Anecdotally I work downtown. I overlook Pioneer Square so I get to see the human activity that takes place every day around the square. It's a hub of people coming from all over the world in many cases, and when they come to Portland, that's what they experience is the activity around there. So what's happening is a lot of things. You have max, bus, light-rail, bike town stations, scooters. I commute every day from southwest Portland by bike but this morning I drove my daughter from southwest Portland to downtown because she is too afraid to cross the street. She's been stuck in traffic for hours trying to take the bus to and from school. It's increasingly unreliable. So I like to think that she and her peers and future generations will have more options. I'm lucky in that I'm privileged and able to ride a bicycle but feel very sad for our community when I ride on Broadway and either in a hotel door zone or potentially getting right hooked on Jefferson. I wouldn't expect any of you to do that, but I know that were the roads designed in a different way maybe all of you could, or maybe my daughter, her friends could. So similar thing on 4th. 4th has two rows of parking and three lanes of traffic. I find riding in the middle of the roadway to be the safest option. That's ridiculous. We need to accommodate more and more people and smaller and smaller spaces and that's why I urge you to pass the plan and why the street trust urges you to pass the plan. Thank you.

**Eudaly:** Thank you. Our next panel. I'm looking forward to learning how to pronounce all your names. [laughter]

**Ady, Business for a Better Portland:** Thank you. I'm Ady, here on behalf of business for a better Portland. As a volunteer I have been leading this project as well as efforts to promote better communication between Pbot and our members. We believe the economic opportunities that are made possible by Portland's growth should be accessible to all and one of the ways for this to happen is to make sure that the transportation system of the central city is safe, modern and efficient. Cities across the continent as Gabe mentioned Seattle, Denver, Austin, Calgary, Toronto are moving quickly to improve their infrastructure. To retain Portland's reputation as a center for creativity and innovation we would be wise to follow suit. BBPdx is strongly supportive of the goals. Our members recognize the connection between well designed infrastructure and economic vibrance. We recognize the terrible social and economic costs if Portland fails to meet its climate goals. For these reasons we must deliver a comprehensive multimodal transportation network both in central city and underserved parts of Portland that BBPdx has advocated for in the past. BBPdx believes it will help our businesses thrive. Our members who will be impacted in various and significant ways when the streets are reconfigured are paying close attention. Pbot's efforts to engage the community on this project are moving in the right direction and we're committed to continuing to work with them to ensure that a truly constructive collaborative relationship is established with business leaders. One thing the current implementation plan fails to adequately address is how success will be defined. As this project moves from concept to design it's critical Pbot establish clear and robust performance metrics to establish a baseline and assess the effectiveness of these new designs. We realize that full performance benefits may not be realized until the entire network is built but there that has to be a more effective way to assess tradeoffs and define success. People have a basic and understandable fear of change. Traffic modeling, data collection and studying best practices are a way to help make the conversation less about what is unknown and more about the great things that are possible.

November 14-15, 2018

**Saltzman:** Thank you.

**Rithy Khut, Bicycle Advisory Committee Chair:** I'm rithy khut, chair of the Portland bicycle advisory committee. Thank you for the opportunity to testify on behalf of the bicycle advisory committee. The committee has submitted written testimony and I'll touch on some points in my testimony. I'll include some personal anecdotes as well. Our committee is highly supportive and strongly urge you to adopt it as it is presented to council. Additionally, we would encourage you to fully implement all 18 projects not in ten years but within the first one to five-year phase. One of the reasons I was asked to be a member of the Portland bicycle advisory committee is because I was born in Portland, I'm a second-generation Portlander. My parents immigrated from Cambodia searching for the American dream which included doing well in school, buying a good car, and buying a good home. So, when I bought a bicycle in high school, I wanted to bike from my parents' house to northwest 23<sup>rd</sup> or I also wanted to go to the central library. My mom was horrified. She told me it's too dangerous, not safe. For the most part at that age I didn't feel safe because there wasn't a bicycle network. Lincoln and ladd were great but downtown I had to hopscotch between the waterfront, sidewalk -- sorry, commissioner Fritz, and riding in traffic. This plan if implemented is what I would have wanted traveling downtown. It builds a safe, accessible transportation network encouraging thousands of Portlanders like my teenage self to bicycle. Afterwards I went to college in eugene. Community collaboration numbers and data speak to me. The committee and I would like to thank staff for all the work and countless hours reaching out to the community and stakeholders. Statewide planning goal one is public involvement. They did a great job. That's why you have so many letters and testimony in support as presented to council. From interest groups like the street trust, business of better Portland to neighborhood coalitions like southeast uplift and neighborhood coalition for northeast Portland. This is Portland. Collaboration, coalitions and consensus. Looking at the numbers with the estimate doubling of households and 25% more people working in the central city by 2035 we have to figure out how to accommodate all that growth. Seattle has shown it can be done without an increase in single occupancy vehicle trips. Even today as shown in the downtown Portland business census and survey compared to last year more people are choosing to bicycle. While at the same time fewer people are choosing to drive into the central city. This will only increase as new housing opportunities open within the central east side and inner Portland neighborhoods. I leave you with this. As I think about my future kids and when they become teenagers, will they feel safe cycling downtown? Will I be like my mother and worry about their safety? As they become adults will they want to live in the central city that is safe for them? Ultimately by building this network now you'll build a network for future children of Portland. Thank you for your time and the bicycle advisory committee looks forward to continuing to work on meeting and making Portland a safe place to cycle and an everyday part of people's lives.

**Ryan Hashagen, BetterBlock PDX:** Hello. Thank you for your time. I'm ryan hashagen. I'm on the leadership committee of betterblock pdx. Central city in motion project recognizes Portland has an urgent need to update and optimize the use of one of our most valuable resources, the public right of way. A commitment to creating a safer, more equitable and efficient transportation network for all. We strongly support this but feel the vision, faster, more reliable transit and safer network force places to stroll and roll is needed immediately. Better block pdx believes pbot should move to immediately implement projects within the first two years as proof of concept. A growing number of examples from across the nation, around the globe prove build a connected low cost and flexible projects that achieve immediate, quantifiable results. Project designs have much more flexibility and also help better inform future design details and implementation. This eliminates scenario where big investments lock us into designs that don't work as



November 14-15, 2018

theorized. We ask you to approve the central city in motion project and create an interim and immediate network implementation plan that includes a robust performance evaluation from. Show return on our civic investment. Implementing this as a network will provide a benefit and Portland has opportunity to be a global example by continuing to innovate in product division, design and delivery. Thank you so much.

**Eudaly:** Thank you. Next up.

**Tara Mather, OHSU:** I'm a campus planner at ohsu. I have had the privilege of serving on the sounding board.

**Karla:** Could you move closer to the mike?

**Mather:** Yes.

**Eudaly:** Not too close, though.

**Mather:** How is this? I have had the privilege of serving on the central city in motion sounding board to provide input at various stages of the planning process and I believe that the project team's recommendations respond to the growing need for safe and efficient transportation options. Ohsu is encouraged by efforts lookic this one. As an academic health center, patient care, research and education are at the core of our mission. Ohsu has 16,000 employees, thousands of students and sees 3,000 patients per day serving more medicaid patients than any other hospital in the state. People traveling to our campuses come from all over the city often traveling through the central city. Ohsu has implemented various programs and policies designed to get people out of their cars and choose other modes of transportation including incentivizing daily walking and biking trips and heavily subsidizing annual transit passes. We're very excited about these transportation improvements and look forward to the positive impact on the the ohsu community.

**Eudaly:** Thank you.

**Kevin Neely, PSU:** Good afternoon. Kevin neely, executive vice president for government relations at Portland state university. Thank you for having us. We too are here to cheer you on. Unlike those in front of me we actually have cheerleaders, but we left them on campus today. We really appreciate your consideration of the central city in motion proposal. Portland state university strongly endorses it. I'm here on behalf of the president. I had to bring my wingman to help with any questions. Frankly i'm not here on behalf of the president but of 27,000 students that come to our campus every day, on behalf of 7500 employees that come on our campus every day. We're 50 acres in the downtown Portland core and this project is vital to Portland state university. Most of those students we only have housing for 2,000 on our campus so they are coming on to campus every day from outside generally the central city core. Every aspect of this plan is important to us. Clint will talk about the work we're doing to try to make sure those folks are using multimodal transportation when they get here. I think we have a great story to tell. There will be substantially enhanced by the plan you have in front of you today. I want to close by talking also about the impact beyond the actual core of psu. I'm relatively new to Portland state and i'm always surprised by the impact we have both on the downtown core and beyond. 175,000 alumni from Portland state university and 110,000 of those alumni are working and living right here in the Portland metro area. So this doesn't just impact our campus community. It impacts our larger campus community. For Portland citizens in the region in general psu is a pathway to prosperity but that's a figurative pathway. We actually need a literal pathway to get that prosperity moving forward. This is a wonderful project to help on that front and with that i'll let clint actually talk about the details in the plan that are most important to Portland state university.

**Clint Cullpepper, PSU & Sounding Board:** Thank you for having us today to hear our concerns and our support. The majority of trips to Portland state are made by alternative modes of transportation and I'll use air quotes there because for many it's not an

November 14-15, 2018

alternative transportation, it's our primary form of transportation. Less than 25% of our student trips are by car and over half are by transit. By far the most popular way to get to psu. There's still room for improvement as students and employees report better facilities and shorter travel times would encourage them to take transit more often. The priority given to transit in these projects will have a significant impact to the reliability of our transit network and will have immediate benefits for psu's transit users. psu has been a leader in the promotion of bicycling, piloting the city's first protected bike lane on southwest Broadway in 2009. We have learned a great deal from this collaboration with the bureau of transportation. Notably that physical barriers are needed for bike lanes in high traffic areas. We feel that an improved permanent facility is long overdue as a recent reduction in students riding to campus is partially driven by an increase in traffic and lower levels of comfort and safety that bicycle riders feel in the central city. With this said, it is extremely important to Portland state as we advocate for the safety of our students and employees, we have been advocates for these safety improvements for many years and feel that this project cannot move forward without them for an your bonn campus, improvements to pedestrian safety aren't just about commuting but about getting to class, the library and services on campus, these projects would bring significant safety improvements to the crossings of major streets, passing through our campus and improvements -- for our students, their safety is our number one priority. A decade of effort to improve conditions for our students and employees as they travel to campus. Improving the travel options that we provide for them is a corner stone of the university's climate action plan and these projects will help us to expand those options. Please move forward with these projects, and we strongly recommend moving all projects into the one to five-year time line. Thank you for your time today and thank you for all the work that's been done on this plan.

**Eudaly:** We have our final panel now. Either of you can begin, and perhaps.

**Katie Gould, BikeLoud PDX:** I'm katie gould, thank you, commissioners for being here, i'm going to read excerpts of our testimony we submitted yesterday. We strongly support the central city in motion plan, and we urge council to adopt it. For too many years, Portlanders have seen cities around them initiate bold plans for public transit while we rest on our accomplishments from previous decades, our bicycle mode share is stuck at 6 percent, the same as 2011 and our transit ridership continues to fall. Our policies and plans are still visionary, but we have not matched our words with action. And now we have a chance to change that. The ccim plan alone will not solve all these issues, but it's a strong step forward to being the city we want to live in. One that acts decisively in the face of climate change that has clean air and safe streets in every neighborhood. And that moves people efficiently to, from and around the central city. Pbot's estimate shows with this plan, the number of people walking, biking and taking transit will increase to 60 from 40 percent by 2035, which would make stub anxious progress to our 80 percent goal. The world of transportation is changing really quickly. The e scooter pilot has led to 640,000 trips in the last four months. When biketown became dockless and free in may 2018, just earlier this year, riders traveled 162,000 miles more than doubling usage from may the year before. The pent-up demand for safe and efficient transportation alternatives, we met bold action by the city can lead to meaningful and immediate results, making better roadways for these devices and the ones coming in the future is of the utmost urgency. We support the recommendation by the bicycle advisory committee to him implement these projects within five years. And during that implementation phase, we feel like the best approach is to put these designs in the street as quickly as possible with temporary measures. So that both residents and businesses can experience the benefits of these places. We would challenge pbot to a one-year time line. With that sort of implementation strategy, not only would the network be useable very soon, but would be able to make adjustment and trial the designs in real time. We agree that the details really matter and

November 14-15, 2018

we look forward to working with excellent staff at pbot on getting the details right for every one of these projects. You have the opportunity today to show your unanimous support for Portland values. Today we can begin a new era of Portland leadership in green and efficient transportation.

**Eudaly:** Thank you.

**David Bouchard, Bus Lane Project:** Good afternoon, commissioners, i'm david bouchard. I am testifying on behalf of the Portland bus lane project. I am a transit -- i'm a bus rider myself, and I live in oldtown, so I have the privilege of taking the -- any number of bus lines from my apartment really just about anywhere in the city and the region from that point. And I can speak from personal experience on the issues that our buses are facing as they are attempting to get into and out of our downtown, which is really on all sides pretty much surrounded by various choke points. You've got bridges, you've got the hills, you've got, you know, the railyards and the major institutions to our south that basically kind of define the -- you know, ingress and egress into this part of the city. It's very important that the buses are the most space efficient vehicles for carrying people long distances are able to get into and out of this part of city. So I really want to thank you guys for supporting the corridor proposal so far and on madison and burnside, grand, really do appreciate -- we really appreciate the support there and are looking forward to future support of any projects that are going to increase bus lane access. And also, we are really excited about the potential bus lanes -- the bus lane on burnside, would be a huge benefit to bus commuters coming -- in downtown, the 12, 19 and 20 connect downtown to the inner east side before they fan out to go east and northeast throughout the city. So burnside is a really, really important place to have a dedicated bus lane. So that those folks can get out of downtown with a very high frequency of service. Also, I use the steel bridge quite a lot, for bus service, it would be great to be able to approach that bridge faster from downtown, from 5th avenue especially. We need to have that priority there so the buses aren't getting stuck as they approach the bridge. Once they're out of downtown, for the most part, they move pretty well. So it's creating those bus lanes in downtown is going to make a huge amount of difference for the rest of the region, as was mentioned earlier. And, you know, there's not a whole lot of miles that need to be striped, but it's going to make a huge difference. The other thing that we are concerned about is the emphasis, there's still a lot of emphasis on parking. We understand that there are a lot of needs that would need to be met, deliveries, you know, access, special access to buildings that aren't always feasible by walking in transit, I understand that. But we really need to cut down aggressively on the amount of street parking that we have because our curbs are some of our most valuable street space in the century with bike lanes and bus lanes and, you know, potential ride share zones. We really need to be very conscious, intentional in how we are manning the curbs so that we're moving the maximum amount of people possible through our streets. Let's just remember, it's about moving people over all else, and the hierarchy, we have a -- pedestrians and, cyclists and transit users, they all come at the top, above anyone who is driving a two-ton piece of metal. Thank you, again, for your support, especially thank you commissioner eudaly for your strong language around this. And we look forward to future bus lane improvements, so that transit is the mode of choice for the entire region.

**Gary Cobb, Central City Concern:** Good afternoon, councilmember, i'm Gary cobb, I'm the community outreach coordinator at central city concern, I should start by saying, I haven't heard any feedback from our legal team about the use of our first and middle name on this project, so it's -- i'd say that in jest, but that you for reaching out to us. I say that also because when this project was presented to have us participate, I had to kind of do some extra explaining to some of our residents that wanted to participate in the focus groups about -- this isn't really a central city concern project, but it's part of the city, now

November 14-15, 2018

that I got out there to make sure everybody is on board with language. Where we're at, we're excited that we were asked to participate. We had two focus groups with Gabe and his team, and I think the one thing that we are excited about is that conversation we had around the safety around Burnside -- west Burnside, we had two focus groups at our downtown clinic with about 40 people over the course of these two meetings. What came out of that was clear that these are folks that are using Burnside with mobility devices, going to and from our clinic, they're walking, very few had bicycles, and pretty much no one drove. So what is important about this process was that Gabe and his team reached out to us, which said that they want to hear feedback from folks that are generally marginalized out of these conversations. So the process in this is really important to us at central city concern, and it should be a value throughout any projects that we have in this city, involving folks that are basically living at the poverty level, who are using our streets on a constant basis to get to and from the grocery store, to 12-step meetings, to wherever they may be going. So, we had some pretty -- I would say enlightening and enriching discussions that shed light on this, and what was really cool, that feedback came back, that was given in the first meeting, back in the second meeting, those folks were heard. So these processes are important, you know. Of course, the projects are -- that's what we're here to recommend that you support, but as we go through this, we always got to think about how we're getting this information and think about our citizens with their health care and I want to bring up another point. It came up in our discussions that what about first responders, how do we make space for them to get to key areas in the city. Haven't heard that mentioned today. Came up in our meetings with our residents and folks that use our oldtown clinic at the two focus groups. I felt really encouraged as the outreach coordinator that our residents and clients of our clinic sat down with Gabe and his team and provided some pretty important information. And so we encourage the council to certainly move forward on adopting this. These projects, particularly we have an interest in the Burnside downtown where these meetings were held just as a reminder that downtown clinic is a primary care home for 6,000 patients, and in and around that four-block area, we have about 600 residents and not to mention several hundred employees. So that particular area of Burnside is pretty important to us for safety and maneuverability. Also, I would like to take the moment to think about the future here. We ask the council, PBOT and ccim to think about the east side at 122 and Burnside, we'll be opening up another primary care clinic home to about 3,000 patients, we'll have 175 units of housing there and right down the street around the corner at 126th and stark, we'll have another 150-some units of housing there. So as we kind of move through, thinking about livability and moving around, let's don't forget about our citizens that are living at the poverty level, and will be using the streets mainly walking around. So, thank you for letting us testify today.

**Saltzman:** Thank you, good news about central city concern and their plans. That completes the panel.

**Eudaly:** It does.

**Saltzman:** We'll move to public testimony. As is our custom, we will ask for people with disabilities or people with young children present to come up first. I thought I heard a young child somewhere in the audience. There she is. Okay.

**Saltzman:** If you'll just give us your name and you each have two minutes. There's a clock on the table in front of you. Start with you, ma'am.

**Claire Valch:** I'm Claire, this is Chloe. And I'm here to testify on behalf of Oregon walks, which is Oregon's pedestrian advocacy organization. Oregon walks supports central city in motion, and we urge city council to approve the plan as a whole. Cutting out projects to preserve car lanes or parking will hurt people who cannot afford to own a car and people using more environmentally friendly forms of transportation. We specifically want to call out support for a project 17, year-round, which will provide separate and safer facilities for



November 14-15, 2018

pedestrians and bicycles, we support enhanced demand management and strategies for more efficient use of existing parking spaces. But we are opposed to using public funds to create new parking. Walking is the number one form of transportation used in the central city. Therefore, walking should feel both safe and comfortable. As the projects and the plan are developed. We urge the city to consider that sidewalks should include shade trees and pedestrian oriented street lights. This is especially important for pedestrians with hearing and mobility impediments and we're thinking here especially about the design that was submitted for the division bus lane, division of bus shelters. Central city in motion will improve conditions for people walking, biking and taking transit. And we'll reduce reliance on private cars. This is an important goal given the realities of global climate change as well as to move increasing numbers of people in Portland. Please approve this project.

**Fritz:** Thank you. How old is she.

**Vlach:** She's just about three months.

**Fritz:** Thank you for coming today.

**Vlach:** Thank you.

**Pia Welch:** Thank you for your time. My name is pia welch the chair of the Portland freight committee. We recognize one of the goals of the ccim plan is to encourage increase bicycle and transit use to reduce pressure on the existing transportation system in the central east side industrial district. It serves as its historical role a key wholesale and wholesale distribution center and delivery services for central city businesses. As such, we feel the need to ask how the project's being proposed in the ccim plan will enhance the nature of the industrial area and the businesses it serves and over the following comments. We have been persistently requesting that 7th avenue be taken off the list for bike path and put it onto 6th avenue for safety concerns. And also, because we have been notified that the green loop will be on 6th avenue. It seems as though for long term logical strategy while a freight compatibility analysis was prepared for this area, it was very general in nature, did not delve into the specifics, whether certain size trucks would be impeded from turning onto streets that currently allow access. If trucks are enabled to make turns, especially in the caid area, neither can buses or emergency vehicles. Which -- this can create potential safety issues is more high density buildings are constructed. This area is difficult to move around, there's not much information on what to do with the future, let alone the bottle neck areas. More over, we continue to ask for more in depth analysis of the truck traffic in this area.

**Eudaly:** I just want to respond to miss welch. I hear you, and I agree with you on many of these issues and I want to assure you, we're going to be continuing communicating with those that have similar concerns. It's a really unique area of the city. It is a former industrial sanctuary but with more and more residential units, retails byes, restaurants. There's a lot of refinement to do on each individual project.

**Fritz:** Just to clarify, the bikeway could move from 7th to 6th, for example.

**Eudaly:** I'm not prepared to respond to the individual requests, just that this is ongoing conversation.

**Welch:** My understanding it's being looked at.

**Fritz:** I just wanted to clarify. Thank you.

**Terry Parker:** Congestion the number one transportation issue, just 2 percent of the respondents wanted more bike lanes, among other things, only 45 percent think Portland metro region is going in the right direction. While 42 percent think the region is off track and people are losing faith in the region. So just how does taking away motor vehicle capacity. It doesn't. It's catering to special interests, reducing the number of motor vehicle lanes create more city-initiated congestion, not less. This is especially true if done on 11th and 12th avenues on the east side. More congestion adds engine idling which in turn increases fuel consumption and emissions, as an example, the changes on foster increase

November 14-15, 2018

emissions by 1180 hours per day. Car trips in the Portland area are expected to increase by 49 percent, regardless of how much mass transit service is added. Even in the southwest corridor, traffic congestion is expected to significantly increase. The city needs to make more room for cars, not less. A full and complete environmental impact statement is needed before any decision is made to reduce motor vehicle capacity. Moreover, you wouldn't plan a new development without the financial investors at the table. Motorists are the primary funding stakeholders for tsp projects, must have proportional motorist specific representation on all committees, without such representation, discrimination exists. Given the results of the survey, any project that would replace car lanes with bike lanes is ignoring the majority will of the people. A much better route for bikes would be 9th and park avenues. An alternate route to 11th and 12th avenue should be found. If the central city motion project moves forward, equity requires adult bicyclists must start paying license or user fees to cover the costs of their privileged street space. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** You have two minutes.

**Ted Buehler, BikeLoud PDX:** Ted buehler. Thank you, commissioner Saltzman and eudaly for bringing it to pbob and having pbob reach out to us to come up with a very good plan, I think. I am a fan of bicycling, I like to ride any bicycle in all sorts of places. I like to hear why people bicycle. I've been a person riding a bicycle for a long time. I'm a planner of the city of Portland's master plan passed in february 2010. This plan includes all sorts of things, like a map, which includes all the downtown sections. That are in the ccim. But also has very inspirational words. Way want to read you a passage. This is Portland in the year 2030. Bicycles is now a fundamental pillar of port will not fully integrated transportation system with more than a quarter of all daily trips taken by bicycle in the world-renowned biking network. Residents and visitors know they can easily find a low stress, efficient and comfortable facility to get from where they are to where they want to go. And that's the Portland that i've been pushing for in my ten years of residency here. I'm a little sad because eight years ago, there were roughly 6 percent of people choosing though bicycle to work and there's only 6 percent, we are falling behind on page whatever it says, by the year 2020, 15 percent of trips should be made by bicycle. And we are still at 6. We're falling behind, we had funding for the downtown separated bikeway system in 2013 thanks to pbob and you folks and haven't spent it yet. I encourage you to pass this, to engineer it and to build it and get us caught up to where we should be, to enable more people to ride their bicycles downtown and have fewer people driving their cars on the roadway. Thank you very much.

**Doug Klotz:** Hi, commissioners, i'm doug klotz. I support the central city in motion plan and urge its adoption. As -- our bike mode chair is struck at 6 percent and transit is falling. We need to have bold plans, ccim will be a good start. We need to get going. I bike to work in the central east side for 17 years, and would o welcome better bike and transit trails there. I did ride on 7th avenue in the bike lane there, which makes sense because 7th has a 10-foot wider right-of-way than any of the streets in the central east side except for king and grant. There's a reason 7th has a bike lane, it has more room. The other day I rode downtown, I do a lot of shopping and business downtown, and I found myself riding on southwest 4th from harrison down to oak, which I often do, because I do business at the 1900 building on southwest 4th. And there's no bike facilities there. I find myself riding in the middle of the lane, which I can do, I don't think a lot of people would want to bike there. So I would welcome the facility on 4th. I also ride on 5th and 6th. That's -- we heard the reasons for that. And I also shop downtown, I rode from first was riding to Powell's grow, from Powell's over to director park, parked my bike and walked to three different stores before I found a sweater. Yeah, biking and walking. Along with better box, I hope for early, temporary and -- implementation of these projects to get the pattern set while we get the permanent structures in place, thank you.

November 14-15, 2018

**Tim Davis:** Hi, city council, this is Tim Davis, and I'm addicted to numbers, I'll try to limit them, and I'll start with one. 40 percent of the central city's street space has the second highest percentage in the u.s., even Salt Lake City has a lower percentage devoted to streets. Feel free to ask me why afterwards.

**Eudaly:** Who is no. 1?

**Davis:** Austin, Texas, san Francisco easy 25 percent. 1 percent to bikes and 1 percent to buses, leaving Portland with still way more room for cars than almost any other city in the u.s. And it's by far the least space efficient form of transportation ever invented. After transportation, including transit gets much more efficient when more people travel this way. And the price tag for ccim is less than 1/20th the cost of the i5 rose corridor project. Its impacts are all positive, unlike the ridiculous freeway project. And ccim needs to be finished quickly. Ten years is just way too long. We need to create a couple of projects right away, such as 4th and Broadway, so that people can experience the joy of traveling safely downtown by bike, this would have a dramatic impact on the interested but concerned, which is the overwhelming majority of the population. And that area -- that population is just stalled because they don't feel safe at all. And everything in ccim falls other policies passed by city council long ago. And even if all 18 prones are fully funded and built right away, they will still collective pail compared to what vancouver already has or manhattan, any number of other cities, we can't let Portland just collect dust while other cities embrace the 21st century. They expect Portland to be a leader. Two words, climate change. Full stop.

**Saltzman:** Next three, please.

**Chris Mathieu, Elephants Deli:** Chris mathieu, representing elephant delicatessen. We are concerned with the loss of parking lane and especially truck loading zone on southeast 7th. Elephant's deli has 25 years at 7th and clay. 40,000 square feet between two buildings, over 200 employees just on southeast 7th, we are heavily invested, on long-term leases, offices and production space serve our operation all over Portland. On the east side of 7th we use about 100 feet of truck loading zone and on the west side we have the equivalent of about 150-foot zone as large vehicles are able to occupy the parking lane and only block the approach to our own small parking lot. We use every inch of this space. Between the two sides of the street on a typical day, our delivery team uses a combination of street parking, loading zones, small lot and the critical parking lane in front of our lot to make over 100 trips to the central kitchen, in addition, in an average week, we are visited commercial trucks around 100 times for product deliveries and services. Around 80 percent of those vehicles are too large to safely back up to our tiny loading dock without obstructing the sidewalk, bike lane or more. They typically use the parking lane in the front of commercial lot. Using much of the parking lanes and loading zones would be devastating and the results at businesses like ours and ours would be one commercial trucks using the turning center lane to unload, which is a safety issue due to obstruction. Two, vendors maybe attempted to block bike or traffic lanes and three, best case scenario, vendors would have to push shipments to some places. Beyond safety concerns, it's an enormous hardship to our operation and businesses like ours. We require solutions to mitigate the impact on businesses like ours and like to work with project decision-makers to that end.

**Terri Treat:** I'm Terri treat, cotton cloud futons on 7th and Broadway. I have manufactured all my products in my store for 37 years. And i've been on Broadway for 25 of them, 15 on 7th and Broadway. And I have 20 employees, which seems very small comparatively. But only five of us drive, and the rest use public transportation because there is no parking, and there are big issues in our city around stagnant incomes and cost of living, a lot of people live out. It takes away people's livelihood to spend so much time traveling into the city. If things go through with the way things are, it would impact my business very

November 14-15, 2018

strongly. To move my business out or somewhere else would completely -- I probably would not be in business because I use loading zones and we have trucks come. On 7th, that's where the fire trucks use that lane all the time. So like I sat here and listen, there's so many incredible things we are doing, but there's some impacts on businesses and people, people's livelihood, so the projects that would really affect us that are -- do not really work in my mind are 3, 13, 18, and we are asking for outreach, more outreach for us, especially Broadway. To make that one-lane street just makes it so that I know that I don't go to other streets that have one lane now because I can't get there or won't be able to park or won't be able to do all those things. Let me finish here. And we did do the -- on 2016 we did the better Broadway project, and that did not work, even giving us a look at what making Broadway narrow would do. So I just really I would encourage that. There would be more stuff looked into and really all of us taking it into consideration.

**Fritz:** Where is your business located, 7th and Broadway northeast. Les Schwaab is right next to me, there's another whole warehouse where Blue Star Donuts is. There's big delivery trucks all day long.

**Fritz:** This is similar to Mr. Mathieu's concern.

**Treat:** He's further down from me.

**Mathieu:** Closer to Hawthorne.

**Fritz:** I think that they've got it. Thank you.

**Dane Fredericks:** I'm Dane Fredericks, I am here representing the Northeast Broadway Business Association, and I want to say thank you to Terri for coming down here, most of the business owners are small businesses like hers, most of them don't get down here this often, don't serve on committees, and frankly, don't frequently have the ability to understand these projects ahead of time, advise, implementation of those projects. As Terri mentioned, there are three projects that touch on Northeast Broadway and many of the businesses I speak about have many concerns about the aspects of the projects, Terri also mentioned Better Blocks, the project in 2016, I can tell you I frequently hear from businesses about the kind of disastrous side effects on their business, on safety. As you know, poorly implemented projects like these poison the well for the next group of projects. Which is why we are asking for a Broadway specific business impact study. I was strongly recommend doing individualized outreach to those small businesses that don't come down here and serve on committees. I forgot to thank you for your time. You've done a lot of hard work and we really appreciate that. Congestion impacts all of us, so thank you, Commissioners, thank you, Terri for coming down here and waiting for 3 hours, our board submitted a letter to each of the Commissioners, and to Pbot, I hope you will peruse that.

**Eudaly:** Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Welcome.

**Rina Jimmerson, CEIC:** I'm Jimmerson. I'm representing Brad who had to leave. Basically the central east side is an important center for Portland's manufacturing and is a designated freight district. The largest sector in our district comprising over 1/3 of C-ID businesses. The CCI is an active participant in the Southeast Quadrant Plan and strives to attain the density goals outlined in this plan. We do support a lot of the central city in motion projects. When modified to mitigate the loss of 250 parking spaces and loading zones that would occur if all of these projects were implemented. We do appreciate that Pbot has involved us in the planning process. Our repeated concerns and comments we feel are not currently reflected in the plan that is being presented. Among some of our concerns, some of them they have said, I will repeat. The project on 7th Avenue, would remove 100 parking spaces at once, which is in the C-ID, a major disruption in our parking system and loading zones. Little outreach has been done to the business along 7th, which is a host to many distribution and manufacturing facilities, as Elephant's just mentioned, Pbot hasn't provided adequate information with how businesses with loading zones would



November 14-15, 2018

be affected. Combining freight with the protected bikeway for all ages, suggested on 11th, 12th and 7th, is unsafe. This is echoed by the freight committee. Inadequate consideration has been given to the using 6th avenue as an alternative for protected bike lanes, 6th already being designated for the green move so protected -- would be redundant. Let me end by saying, we feel this program needs to remember the jobs, the freight, the loading zones, lack of parking that the cid has to deal with every day.

**Saltzman:** Thank you.

**Mike Bolliger, Chair Parking Committee CEIC:** Good afternoon, council. My name is michael bolliger, i'm the chair of the transportation and parking advisory committee. From the central east side. We are partnering with pbot on that endeavor. We worked very hard to maximize our street parking inventory, which is about 7500 space as we speak right now. And we're implementing meters as we can. We'll be closer to 500 after the last group. We agree with the lion's share of this program and its goals, but we do have our concerns. The parking spots to do away, currently we support our 7500 spaces over 20,000 jobs, an increasing block of residential members i'm told are going to be approaching 5,000, a growing number of customers trying to access our growing retail. So 250 loss of parking spots to many people might not seem too bad. When you only have 7500 and there's a huge amount of frustration for people not finding adequate parking already. That's a little concern to us. The second part was, again, 7th avenue, we have recommended 6th, I think it can be modified to accommodate the green group which has proposed to have pedestrians there and also work out how the bicycle traffic can go as well. Leave 7th alone where we have, again, a large amount of trucks and loading docks to deal with. Thank you.

**Michael Christy:** Thank you for allowing the time today to spring in front of you, my name is michael christy. Speaking on behalf of a bans on central east side, i've come before you today to show my support for the central city in motion but with concessions and concerns with project 3. Modern times is an employee owned company which supported the community for a long time. Our core values include quality and environmental sustainability. Having strong bike infrastructure achieves both those goals, we have partnered with organizations that specifically promote every day riding and have advocated for improved biking infrastructure. At our location on 7th and belmont, we are witness to a number of traffic accidents involving bikes and appreciate this solution to increase safety. However, as a business operating in the area, we need to ensure that our ability to survive is not impacted by the proposed plan. We need assurances there will be access to driveways and loading zones along the path. We rely on freight trucks for the day-to-day operations, our access to load and unload into the brewery will be blocked, we want to ensure access to we can continue to thrive as part of the Portland community. Overall, modern times supports Portland's plan with pike safety. With some assurances it won't incapacity tate the businesses that thrive along this route.

**Fritz:** Would switching the bike from 7th to 6th help your business?

**Christy:** We operate on 6th and 7th. It basically boxes us in. We wouldn't be able to get anything in or out of our building.

**Fritz:** If we moved to opposite.

**Saltzman:** If it was on 6th.

**Christy:** We have roll ups on both sides, depending on which way it would go, it would affect us no matter what.

**Fritz:** Greenway on 6th, then the proposal on 7th, that would shut out of your business?

**Christy:** Uh-huh.

**Saltzman:** Thank you, thank you all. Name for the record.

**Paul Frazier:** I'm paul frazier, I want to tell you my experience, and opportunity. I'm a husband, proud father of one of Portland's youngest resident. I want to tell you about my bike ride here today, I came down rosa parks on the new protected bike lane, thank you,

November 14-15, 2018

pbot, to the bike highway of vancouver. Then I hit broadway and gone is the relatively low stress of vancouver and white lanes on both sides and I begin the exciting, terrifying gauntlet through the trucks loading, blocking the lane, then the door zone extravaganza of the hotels and finally the right hook risk throughout downtown. Then I hit madison which doesn't have a bike lane, can I honestly tell you on my way today, I almost witnessed a right hook. The only reason i'm here and not giving a police report is because the biker yielded to the aggressive car cutting him off in the bike lane, are we going to act now and prevent a death or act after the next biker dies. We need improvements today, not tomorrow, not five years from now. I've been blessed to travel around the world and my wife and I have enjoyed biking in pairs in Vancouver, both cities that have invested in their bike networks, my wife won't ride here. She doesn't feel safe biking in our own town. We will continue to patronize you, businesses, other cities have done this and business has survived. We'll find a way to make it work. Change is always scary. The key is network, right now we have a piecemeal hodgepodge of bike lanes, we need a network, if we build it, they will come. We've seen this, bridge pedal, Sunday parkways, they flood the streets with bikes, walker just let's make this our daily reality. They ran a piece today about how great the proposal could be. The one critique, are we going to do it fast enough. Let's do this in 0 to 5 years, we chuckle at a year, but why? They can be deployed tonight, we could have an amazing network tomorrow, the only thing that we don't know if we have is the courage and will to do this. I urge you to act decisively for your legacy, our city's legacy and for the future of my 2-month-old daughter.

**Saltzman:** Thank you.

**Nathaniel Brown, PBA:** Good afternoon, commissioners, i'm nathaniel bronn. We support a number of the projects and have recommendations for others. We have been fortunate to maintain an active dialogue between our members and pbot throughout the process, we fully acknowledge with more than 40 percent increase in dogs downtown, these investments are smart and they're needed. We are very supportive of investments in public transit which allows the bus system to be more efficient and reliable. The alliance is in support of improvements on sidewalks and cross walks as well as protected bike lanes that provide more robust north, south and east connection. Through downtown. In october we sent a letter outlining the various positions on the specific projects impacting the central business district. We are supporting of of many of these projects, i'd like to use my time to outline the valid concerns about producing the capacity, project 17, 4th avenue, collectively project 2. These are major arterials that commuters, businesses and customers rely on every day. We believe the concept of two new protected bike lanes should be further explored, I know it was explored at the beginning, we believe several of the tradeoffs of that also apply to broadway and 4th. We would like to see further consideration for protected bike lane through or adjacent to the park and we are supportive of the proposed sidewalk which we believe indicates the possibility of a north-south bike lane. We believe it would be very beneficial to the downtown business community if the bureau agreed to work with us and convene a strategic group to evaluate these alternatives, we are not here to poe broadway and 4th but ask that alternatives be compared and further studied along with those. We are absolutely committed to having two north-south bicycle connections through the central city, which is why we are supporting that option. We believe that the alternatives proposed prove -- if they prove to be un-feasible, we will respect that. We are hoping for a fair evaluation of a protected bike lane and waterfront park and car free transit mall. We would like to reiterate our support for this undertaking. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Thank you.

**Iain MacKenzie:** My name is iain mackenzie. I'm here to support central city in motion. Over the past few years this council has worked hard on plan which builds on the progressive legacy of our famous 1972 and 1988 plans. 2035 plan on the five guiding

November 14-15, 2018

principals of economic prosperity, human health, environmental health, equity and resilience. I believe the central city in motion helps achieve all five principles but I would like to talk about economic prosperity. We have made a decision to place 30 percent in the central city. This means 38,000 new households and 51,000 new jobs and just 3 percent of the city's land. The capacity we have created is good for the economy, we need to think how we can move all these people through the city. We could build more highway capacity, but even aside from the environmental impact, I doubt there's any appetite on this council for an inquiring hundreds of parcels to eminent domain for wide and unused streets, we could and maybe one day will build a subway system. That's a decade or two out and will cost billions. What we can do, relatively cheaply and quickly, is what's being proposed here today, protected by bus only lanes, can move more people through our system. That makes it possible to achieve the jobs and housing growth we have committed to what's holding us back right now, there are lots of people that would like to travel by other means than car for some of their trips. That's because they don't feel safe or the bus is too slow. Central city in motion gives people new, good options. We know from other cities, including seattle and vancouver, when given good options, people will choose them. I urge the council to continue the sustainable economic development and vote yes.

**Saltzman:** Thank you all. Next three. Name in the record and two minutes each. Start with you sir.

**Keith Jones, Co-Director Friends of the Green Loop:** I'm keith jones, i'm the codirector of the friends of the green loop. Just it's our first time testifying publicly, our community-led organization responsible for advocating for partnering with -- partnering green partnerships and raising money to build the green loop. We see the green loop as a private-public partnership. And so we look at central city in motion, there are a number of projects that provide connection points for the parks that we want to build. We are very much in support of central city in motion moving forward. In fact, we encourage you to move these projects from the 6 to 10 year column over to 1 to 5. We are very interested in the lloyd projects especially. I'm also on the lloyd community association, and I happen to know that we are very excited to get this moving. We have a number of private interests who are already ready to engage and building part of the green loop, just did block 216 a couple of weeks ago, there's a couple of others, these things moving forward are very important. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Thank you.

**Kiel Johnson:** I'm kyle johnson and also one of the cochairs of the friends of a green loop. I'm recovering from a cold so my voice is weird. Last week we testified at the block 216, at design review, and one of the things that came up, we have a lot of developers who are really interested in participating in the green loop and making it happen on the street level. Without sort of guidance from the city yet, they don't really know how that's going to fit in and these developers are looking to spend money on the streetscape because they're realizing the importance of the streetscape to sort of enhance their buildings. And so I think that's important that we move quickly to sort of come up with a plan for what the green loop is going to look like. I think there's also some confusion, I heard here today as well about sort of what the purpose of the green loop is, is it another sort of part of the bike network where it's for commuters going quickly and it's just another bike lane, or is it more of a park space and something that's sort of inspires and enhances the -- so I think that coming up with and investing money in the plan for the green loop as quickly as possible is going to be really important to clearing that up. I'm first also started the bike ballet at the bottom of the al tram. When the al tram first went in, they only planned for 12 bike parking spots. This year during the summer, we got up to almost 500 people just parking in the bike valet. This will make our job more difficult. We'll have a lot more bikes to park and find

November 14-15, 2018

room to park them all, but thankfully, we can park about 500 park bikes in the space you can park 20 cars, thank you very much.

**Eudaly:** I thought you said bike ballet. It sounds wonderful too. PBOT staff, write that down, bike ballet.

**Fritz:** Are all the bike parkers taking the tram or going to OHSU in south waterfront, have any idea?

**Johnson:** I would say most people are riding the tram. There hasn't been a lot of development sort of around there yet, and I think the zidell yards get activated, we'll see it being used for other people going around. But it's free for anybody to use, and we have a lot of people that use the daycare actually, that have like cargo bikes and like bike trailers, and they can park that securely at the bike value a, that's really helpful.

**Suvi Wesa, Day Wireless Systems:** I'm suvi wesa. We install communications devices in emergency responder vehicles, fire trucks, police, we do cell tower communication as our primary operations. We have some buildings that we own in the pearl. We've been -- we've lost our loading zone and relocated out of there because we can't operate anymore, and receive the shipments we need, so we've gone to the east side, and we also have buildings that we're building and renovating, seismic upgrade and creating energy efficiency for tenants like modern times brewery on 6th and Belmont and we are working with pbot, thanks, guys, but we are spending quite a bit of money on the infrastructure improvements for the sidewalks, and into the right-of-ways on a lot of our building upgrades, and the biggest concern is our tenants stay viable businesses, they're paying the costs that we are incurring through rents, which then trickle down to the rest of the economy. To our renters in the area, all the way down to serving the homeless population, which we have been paying and bearing the burden of the cost, the 1 percent new construction tax that's funding some of these projects, our concern is that we make sure we are really looking at the freight and impact to the businesses. If the businesses get charged more, they either aren't viable, don't have viable streets where we have places for pedestrians to go, and we do want pedestrian traffic to our businesses, but the we need to make sure we are serving them and their economic needs to stay viable. And we're kind of late to the game, I would appreciate if we could get more connection with the stakeholders in some of these areas, so that we can have a voice and the dollars that we are putting in through special assessments and the fees and new construction property assessments that we are paying.

**Eudaly:** Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Thank you all.

**Saltzman:** You have two minutes, name for the record, and we'll start with you, sir, over here.

**Terry Dublinski-Milton:** Okay. Hello, i'm dublinski-milton. We voted unanimously to endorse the goals of the ccim plan and pbot should build as many of the projects as possible, there were a significant number of extensions, most of them because they didn't feel the dedicated busway went far enough. But the addition of grand and mlk to the project list will alleviate a lot of those concerns. We were focused on the discussion was about climate change and safety the two biggest things. And that this is the gap in the network. If you look at the improvements that you've made, pbot has made recently in clinton and lincoln, they'll dump you on the underneath side and you have an unprotected network. I go down sandy to 7th. I was almost right hooked on 7th on the way to the madison right turn to the point where I could have kicked his rear quarter panel. That was my opinion. But other -- there are projects that are critical is completing the southeast salmon greenway for families what want to ride to the waterfront and don't like the fast-moving bike lanes. Saloman is a great alternative. Dedicated busways on burnside and hawthorne. So now I want to make a couple of personal comments from being a 20-year



November 14-15, 2018

resident of cycling in Portland. I agree that it's critical. I'm confident in it, most people are not. And I had the same concerns with sidewalks, what we need in naito is for the sidewalk is a assessment, others are oaks that will live for 400 years, we need to build a sidewalk around them. If we do the tree assessment, your concerns will be fixed. I have 3 seconds left, thank you for your time. I think this is a wonderful plan and thumbs up.

**Saltzman:** Thank you for being concise, too.

**Jessica Engelman:** I'll jump in and go next, i'm jessica engelman, I am a residents at southeast 10th in the central east side. So this project is very near and dear to me, so I could talk in response to some comments that people have said. First, I have a printout of the plans that Portland city council has previously endorsed, this really would be perfect for climate action plan, transportation -- the 2035tsp, these conversations all happen, then, whoever is saying there has not been increase public outreach between the plans, the tsp, the tsp again and this plan has been living under a rock, i'm sorry. So, let's see, 6th, not 7th, again, in terms of living under a rock, 6th will be a completely different type of facility than 7th will. It will end up with the same problems we have on the east bank with fast bikes and walkers and people trying to walk their dogs and just hanging out. All shoved into the same space because we don't have enough space for nonautomotive uses. I actually agree with what terri parker said at the beginning, we need more proportional representation. 6 percent bike shower and 12 percent transit system, I would like to see the equivalent amount of asphalt on our roads dedicated to those boats if we think only 6 percent only deserve 6 percent of our roads, yeah, let's double it. That's equity. Let's see. The loss of parking in the central east side, other than the central east side, there's a lot that could be done, I park my car for free in front of my house all year round. These are things that are not being address titled could be addressed to free up parking. And finally, the businesses on broadway, I don't shop there because it's a terrifying street. Maybe if you made it more terrifying you'd get more business and wouldn't have to close, those are my comments. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Thank you.

**Jim Kogler:** Jim kogler, I have worked with pdx, but i'd like to talk about climate change exclusively. So in these projects, I see 18 buckets. If you recall, we would all gather as a town and form a fire brigade. When you form a fire brigade, when you want a bucket, doesn't matter what color it is, doesn't matter what shape it is, if there's a handle, i'm in favor of handles, on the record stating that. But there's no perfect bucket, and it's not important right now, do they hold water? Yes, I am pro bucket. And I ask for a yes vote from this council, thank you.

**Saltzman:** Thank you. Welcome, you have two minutes. Give us your name.

**Emily Guise:** I'm emily geiss although i'm an employee of dks associates, one of the subconsultants that worked on the plan, today i'm speaking here of the cochair of bike lab pdx. I've been sick all week, but I got myself downtown, and I took the afternoon off work because I wanted to come tell you why I support central city in motion so strongly. It's a plan that would give a lot of bang for the buck. By shifting just 2 percent of our street space to dedicated bike or bus lanes, we could increase the people moving capacity of those streets by 60 percent. It's amazing. According to metro association of city transportation officials, and it will only cost 72 million. That's the same as one mile of urban freeway. It's a crazy bargain. It's the kind of investment that would help downtown workers like myself. So I work on southwest broadway, and I need bike or I take transit to work every day. I rarely feel safe biking around in the central city, especially on southwest broadway. Frequently the bikeway is blocked by freight, unloading, uber drivers parked there to drop off passengers. Im forced to swerve into oncoming traffic to avoid them, which is terrifying. So i've -- both while crossing the street on broadway and biking along it. So having a protected bike lane, that would force people to drive more slowly, I would be -- would be

November 14-15, 2018

amazing. It would allow me to get to work and my other destinations more easily and safely. So, again, I ask you to vote yes on this crucial plan, thank you.

**Saltzman:** Thank you.

**Jillian Detweiler, Executive Director The Street Trust:** I'm Gillian Detweiler, the executive director of the street trust. Thank you for bringing the central city in motion plan forward, we urge your adoption today. The piece I thought I could add is that the street trust has three program areas, education, encouragement and advocacy. Today you've experienced some of our advocacy. But tomorrow I want you to experience some of our encouragement programs, we want to be your partner, to assure that if these facilities are built, that they are used and loved. We have programs like women bike where we met Serenity Ebert, we have programs like access to cycling. Where we connect with cultural organizations around the district. We want to help people beat the habit of driving and open up the opportunity of getting where they need to go. Walking, biking and taking transit when it is safe and convenient. We are very excited about the changes that this plan can bring, and we want to make sure we are tapping every part of the market that will be opened up when you make it safe and convenient for people to do so.

**Alex Zimmerman, The Street Trust:** Thank you for your time, I'm Alex Zimmerman, I'm here today for a board member for the street trust. As someone who does not own a car, I rely on our city's transit, and transit network every single day to get me to where I need to go. Living without a personal vehicle has freed me in a lot of ways, it gives me the flexibility to afford an apartment in the central city. It keeps me healthy, lets me engage with my community at the street level. I love my city, but I feel increasingly unsafe walking to do errands, riding my bicycle to work. Travel delays impact my day and make it difficult to arrive on time. It seems like every other day I hear similar frustrations and stories from friends, coworkers and even the stranger sitting next to me on the bus, for too long now, Portland has rested on our achievements, it's become increasingly clear we can't ignore, we have fallen behind on climate and vision zero goals and pushed Portlanders to the edges of reliable transit service. We can change this today. If you adopt the central city in motion plan and invest in the list of proposed projects, we can increase capacity for those in our transportation network by over 60 percent, using just a mere 2 percent of the street space dedicated to non-auto trips. We need these improvements today to provide safe, efficient and functional travel. I urge you to adopt this plan so we can begin the work to move Portland together to a more sustainable future for all. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Thank you all. You have two minutes, name for the record, start with you, Tony.

**Tony Jordan:** I'm Tony Jordan, I'm for Portlanders for parking reform. I want to support central city in motion, I echo the testimony of all the people who supported it, those who want a fast and quick and cheap implementation. But I'm here to really speak about the second item, which came pretty quickly. I've been on a lot of parking committees and seen a lot of parking policy planning, I'm surprised this was done so quickly. It usually takes six months in the public process and six months to get a vote. To see it come in a month or two was surprising, I think the policy -- if there were a committee, I would have said this policy is redundant. We have a lot of good policy we've come up in the last several years, it's been developed with things like CCIM in mind, a lot of it is taking place and isn't on the ground yet, there's also a lot of parking actually still being built in the central east side supply, like at 7 Southeast Stark Avenue where a large 6-story parking garage has been built. I think it undermines our current policy in this project by building the supply that will bring in additional car trips into the central city and muddies the water and makes our current policy more confusing. I think that the parking policy is not without risk. Prosper Portland is rumored to be looking for a place to build parking, I think it's risky as to whether or not this plan to build parking in a future. Any money saved by the central east side industrial council like to build a parking garage or is spent on things that hope a parking

November 14-15, 2018

garage will be better -- a great part of that plan, item 1, strategy 1. Please pass ccim and let's have a better private parking part.

**Mary Vogel, Plan Green:** I'm mary vogel with my own business, plan green, i'm a pedestrian and urban cyclist, and i've been a cyclist for over 45 years, an urban cyclist. As a member of several of the organizations that have already testified in favor of this proposal, i'm a strong supporter. However, i'm wondering if some of my various open houses regarding street trees can be better included as we implement the plan. I've long contended street trees are one of the most important parts of the transportation infrastructure for both cyclists and especially for pedestrians. For example, walking up the treeless asphalt desert with five lanes devoted to cars on southwest 12th avenue, when it's 105-degrees and smoky, is nearly impossible for most people with any health impairment. While I love protected bike lanes and i've recently come back from vancouver, bc, write had the opportunity to ride on far more of them than I do in Portland, I find that both cities dot's tend to forget about trees as part of their cycling infrastructure. I'm excited to ask that council approve this concept with pbot and also instruct them to coordinate with urban forestry to assure that as many street trees as possible are both saved where already existing and planted where they are not, including on bus lines. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Thank you.

**Brad Baker:** I'm brad baker. I want to echo the support for ccim. I'm sure you are aware the governmental panel on climate change said 12 years to take urgent and unprecedented action on climate change. 12 years, these projects are going to take 10 years to finish, we'll be a step in the direction towards dramatic action, but won't be fully dramatic action, I urge you to adopt them and think what else to adopt to push the needle further. So along with that, the funding with the parking management package, there is potential funding for additional off-street parking. Any construction or funding of offstreet -- parking will encourage more -- so I ask you to really strongly consider voting against the parking policy in front of you. Finally, I live in elliott, our neighborhood association was strongly in favor of ccim, previously project 18, addressing broadway in northeast. Most of the people who live in our neighborhood will not travel by foot or by bike to broadway, it's very -- you go there and it feels like you're walking along a freeway, hard to cross a road, hard to bike along the road, all auto dealerships and car oriented designs. So I urge you to move that project forward quickly to make it more welcoming for more people.

**Saltzman:** Thank you all. We are getting to the end. Name for the record, two minutes and start with you, sir.

**Bernard Sanders, Cloud Bolt Software:** I'm bernard sanders, i'm the cofounder and chief technology officer of cloud bolt software, we founded it 7 years ago, nearing 50 full-time employees with 10 in our Portland inner southeast office. With demand for our product growing, we'll be growing to 35 employees by the end of 2019. The city's biking and transit infrastructure is a big reason I moved here and the reason these 10, soon to be 35 jobs were created here. Before I moved to Portland 12 years ago, I fell in love with the city when I was biking around, taking the max from the airport, and seeing that it was one of the few places I could live in our country without needing to use a car a lot. I chose to move here and cloud bolt's engineering teams came to be built here because of the city's prior investment in multi modal transit and infrastructure. About half my employees' bike to work, one or two use transit. It's not a scale to accommodate the kind of growth Portland will see in the coming years, we stand at a crossroads and have to figure out how to make alternative transportation the most appealing choice. This plan accomplishes that, and we need it as soon as possible. Ideally, i'd like to see it completed in 2013. That would be the maximum benefit to my employees, it's going to directly help my employees and keep Portland the kind of city I fell in love with. I urge you support it. And thank you for your hard work.

November 14-15, 2018

**Laurie Schmidt, Grand Central Bakery:** My name is Laura Schmitt. I work for Grand Central Bakery, I'm here to represent all the people that work there that bike to work, including all of the owners, we are all bike advocates and would like to see more of our employees bike, I bike to work five days a week, 13 miles one way, I like to see my commute become safer because in the last few years, I've seen bikers and streets become increasingly more dangerous due to an increase of drivers on these streets, I choose to commute to work by bike since I moved here 7 years ago. Over the past 7 years my biking has changed. Varied in location, routes and mileage due to me moving and my work location is changing. One thing that has not changed in the 7 years, there are more and more drivers on the road and biking routes are becoming more dangerous and less accessible due to the increase in traffic. More and more cars are now taking the side streets to avoid the busier main streets to reduce their own drive times due to traffic congestion. These drivers are in a hurry and driving ways that put bike commuters at risk, also pedestrians, I've seen many -- many reasons I bike to work, to stay in shape, a bike racer. I also bike because it saves me money, I don't have to put maintenance into my car, I don't have to put gas in my gas tank, and I also find it as a great way to relieve stress. When I drive work, I am much more stressed out because I'm sitting in traffic. I also like knowing it reduces the carbon footprint. Grand Central Bakery promotes and parts participate in the bike more challenge. I like to encourage my coworkers to ride, and bike to work, and the number one reason they don't do it and tell me they can't is because it's dangerous and they're afraid to. So I'd really like to advocate that we make our streets safer and to please vote and adopt the central city in motion plan to keep Portland moving in the right direction.

**Saltzman:** Thank you.

**D'Arcy Owen:** I'm Darcy Owen, I'm the owner of the Portland English Language Academy, which is -- we teach international schools, teach English, international schools, we've been in downtown Portland since 1989. The bike map and the transportation map for Portland is something we literally hold up in front of our students around the world. Saying, this is why you should come to Portland. Portland is easy to live in without a car. It's good for the local economy. There's about five programs in the Portland area that are similar to ours, and I'm not here speaking for them, I did a calculation, probably about \$35 million a year to the local economy and home stays, and business expenses and payroll. To hold that up as a reason you come to Portland is a very strong draw for Portland. I'm also a daily car commuter, it takes most of my commute to drive from Lloyd Center to I-5. Now Portland is starting to feel a little bit like no one would want to go to Seattle for, when you leave your work, you don't know how long it's going to take you to get where you're going, Portland will not be quickly becoming like that. I have employees who don't want to take available afternoon classes because they don't want to deal with the drive home. I have employees, including me, who are pushing to leave by 4:00, it's lost productivity and productivity is this number you read about in the magazines and newspapers, that's a real thing that's happening on the third floor of the Lloyd Center. So for my employees, as well as the students, Portland is getting to be an expensive place to live and we need to do what we can to make it so they don't live -- so they don't need a car to live in Portland. So that is why we are -- I encourage you guys to pass this, to set Portland up for the next 20-plus years and for us to be able to hold it up, the map of Portland and say, this is a world class city and show that it has the reputation it deserves.

**Saltzman:** Thank you all.

**Saltzman:** If you want to testify and didn't sign up, this is your time.

**Chris Rall:** I'm Chris Rall, I'm a resident of Southeast Portland. I want to encourage you to move this plan forward, as fast as you can in a cost-effective way so you can do more faster. A couple of quick anecdotes, just a personal anecdote. Recently, my family, we



November 14-15, 2018

converted our family bike to electric, to make it easier, and it opened my eyes to the possibilities in terms of where you can get to, hauling kids, I'm seeing more and more electric bikes out there. So there's -- I throw that in with scooters, our bike infrastructure is -- there's a whole bunch of potential of new uses, so there's a lot of opportunity for that to really fill out and so we need to complete the network. The other thing is that in my day job, I go to Seattle a lot and see what they're doing. They have grown the number of jobs in which downtown since 60,000 jobs in since 2010. They reduced the drive alone rate from that time to 25 percent. Over the last 17 years they reduced to 25 percent. You take the long view, how are you going to fit more jobs in the central city, you're not going to do it by having the same number of people in the same proportion of people coming by car. They're not going to fit. They need to come by other modes. So give these handouts out. I encourage you to move this plan forward, move it forward quickly, be cost effective about it so you can do more faster. Thanks.

**Saltzman:** Thank you. Okay, that completes public testimony. We want to have staff come back up.

**Fritz:** Yes, please. Thank you very much, everybody, for testifying, it has been extremely helpful. There's a lot of support for the plan in general, maybe a couple of details, particularly to address the issues for the central east side industrial district. Project 3 in particular says that there will be loss of parking and loading zones on 6th or 7th. So how much flexibility is -- what is the plan for business that relies on being able to make -- pickups and deliveries.

**Graff:** Yeah. So as was mentioned previously, the reason that we have landed on 7th as a bikeway, its connection to the crossing bridge, bike pedestrian and emergency response, just provided a continuous non-meandering route. The other reason, 7th is a wider roadway and has current bike lanes that can be improved. We are not proposing to remove all the loading or parking on 7th avenue. We heard early on in our public engagement that preserving the central turn lane was important for freight mobility and access, that's what our current plan shows, but if it does turn out that preserving parking on both sides of the street is more important, then some sections, we are totally open to that. We -- in no case will we be removing all the parking and loading on any block face. Along the entire street.

**Fritz:** I did hear concerns about other areas that we have specific policies about the central east side industrial district in that we call it the industrial sanctuary and it's not ended to be the next pearl. I've been very concerned titled it's not supposed to be lots of residences, lots of trendy businesses, lots of nonindustrial activity. So I'm very concerned that we're kind at the crunch point here. Saying we're going to prioritize through traffic of bikes over these vibrant businesses that provide good, friendly wage jobs.

**Pearce:** I think one other important piece of context, earlier we were looking at routes and actually southeast 9th was the preferred -- that was what was in the bike plan for 2030. Through feedback from freight users, we actually -- that was part of what pushed us to designating 7th as the priority route. In part, based on trying to preserve the important freight uses happening in that area, 7th is actually the street within the central east side that has commercial zoning in it. It is actually the place in which we expect to have more variety of uses. We continue to think that it's the best location for this through route. Specific to the loading and parking issues, this is what the next stage of the process does. Once we know the routes we're working on, you go deeper into specific clipboard-based understanding of each business's parking and loading needs and trying to understand if there's creative solutions to them. The specific concerns for elephant's, that's exactly the type of work that staff would be doing next, understanding exactly what are the functions that they're needing to operate in.

November 14-15, 2018

**Fritz:** So would you be comfortable with another be it further resolve that would say be it further resolved the project design must ensure freight access and convenient loading zones for businesses in the central east side industrial district?

**Pearce:** I think so, yes.

**Saltzman:** Second that.

**Fritz:** Thank you.

**Eudaly:** I wasn't here, if memory serves me correctly, past council pretty significantly changed the zoning in what was referred to as the industrial sanctuary and the reason I am so painfully aware of that, it impacted a nonprofit I cofound titled occupied a building that had been zoned for light industrial and was changed to retail, and their rent was tripled. So can someone tell me what the current status of that zoning is?

**Pearce:** The best attempt at that, as I recall, council, members have more details, their personal experience of it is, overall, in the central east side, in industrial, industrial employment overlay was added to the base zone. And then I don't believe there was that much changing to the zone along the main corridors, but it was already there at present as an entitlement. It's my recollection.

**Fritz:** It was a subject of huge debate. Paralyzed the central east side. I wasn't prepared to come with the comprehensive plan policies on the central district, but I know there are a lot of them. Saying this is one of our key jobs areas.

**Pearce:** Absolutely. What came out of the central southeast quadrant plan and incorporated into the 2035 plan was a confirmation of the importance essentially for freight uses and industrial uses in the central east side, particularly for that consolidation function that warehousing and consolidation distribution function. Our solids and sandwiches coming from elephants, that's the type of activity we continue to believe is really appropriate there. But I guess I very much feel that there are design solutions that through sort of creative work together, we can come up with design solutions that continue to help the brewery that i've not yet visited but it's now on my list.

**Fritz:** I notice you taking notes about Broadway and the other areas. I'm just focusing on the central east side because of its designation as a sanctuary.

**Eudaly:** I'm happy to support that amendment, although I believe that we would be taking those concerns into consideration, and there has been a little fear in the community about this plan, an assumption we are done with the outreach and all these plans are carved in stone where we are just down from hundreds of potential projects to 18, and then the next step is further outreach involvement design.

**Pearce:** They're not without challenging compromises needing to be made, this is what we do.

**Fritz:** You will need to come back to council with each project to get agreement on specifically what we're going to do in the contract for it.

**Pearce:** I think the contract scales probably through a clustering of contracts is what I would guess. We probably wouldn't contract each of them as separate, we'd have a package that one contractor.

**Fritz:** Something will come to council where people could come to council and say -- that they had to move from the pearl because they lost their loading zone, I don't want that to be an outcome from this, I know you don't either. Thank you, I appreciate that. The question then is, what about the issue of first responders and how they get through zoning one through lane, for instance on Naito, how are cars supposed to move over to let the first responders move through?

**Graff:** We have a technical advisory committee that helped us deal with a lot of these issues, one of the exciting things about dedicating spaces to transit vehicles, those lanes that work well for prioritizing buses also provide --

November 14-15, 2018

**Fritz:** That's clear. Right now it's a temporary presume to be a truck could -- once you make it permanent, that's not going to be the case. How would you --

**Pearce:** I haven't looked at the details of the design, that would be part of what we would be incorporating the ability for the emergency response vehicles to use that space still. That you may have gone deeper into it.

**Don Russ, Fire and Rescue:** Commissioners, good evening, i'll just preface -- before I talk about naito, I was brought in as a technical advisory committee member of the initiative, and I will say that I had every opportunity to look at every design, all the bundled items they presented to us, they overlaid the concepts over the secondary emergency routes. I actually had to look at hard copies of them, with regards to naito, I personally looked at that one. The issue, better naito worked because we don't need to respond, it's southbound is the route that we -- that is imperative. Station one pulls out of there and head south and access the morrison bridge and access all the major routes that get into the upper west side. So they use that route just to come home, basically, back to the fire station, we have a rear entrance on 1st, behind the station so we don't have to back into the station, it didn't affect us that much. They can use the burnside bridge to access to get across the river to the east side where they don't need to use the steel. The steel's not a good option for station one anymore because it's been converted to one lane eastbound, so there really was an impact, I personally talked. I don't see an impact with that. Some of the designs, they did propose, and in moving them into the park, correct, on some of them? Which you are not, for obviously, but with that, I didn't see a negative impact on naito at all and the emergency response routes.

**Fritz:** If there is a health incident or something incident in the waterfront park, that you would have to go -- you would be coming from fire station one, and going down. You would not be able to get across into the park, would you?

**Russ:** We still have the access at the -- oh, shoot, what's the park, where they can head south and turn at main. We would have access into the area right there. But really, we can't drive to a lot of aspects into the park because of the grass. The heavy rigs, and we do have to go on foot for the medical events that occur on there, the cyclists that you know, have accidents.

**Fritz:** If there was a fire, you would park across the street?

**Russ:** Yes. And there is not a lot of structures in the park, itself.

**Fritz:** During the festivals.

**Russ:** During the large festivals, I review the medical plans, and he we usually have dedicated Services. I require first aid tents, a communication plan, a medical plan, for the larger events require medical standby of an als ambulance, from a private company. They stage themselves on main and naito.

**Fritz:** Thank you. That's very helpful. And thank you for staying throughout this hearing.

**Russ:** Glad I did stay. I had a feeling I might get that question. It happened to be at the very end.

**Fritz:** Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Anything else? Any other questions?

**Eudaly:** I do have a courtesy to ask, I think, alan kessler was out of the room when his name was called. If he could possibly be allowed to give -- we only have two minutes. Is that acceptable?

**Saltzman:** Sure.

**Eudaly:** And full disclosure, clint, tony, and alan are all in the transportation class with me, and I think, you know, just all came to cheer me on today. Thanks, guys. Can't wait to hear your presentation.

**Saltzman:** Do you have class tonight?

**Eudaly:** Yes, a 13-hour day.

November 14-15, 2018

**Saltzman:** Give us your name.

**Alan Kessler:** I am alan kessler with the Portland bus lane project, and I want to thank you very much for your words at the intro to this. It was fantastic. And you said most of what I would, I would have wanted to so I will keep it short. My biggest concern is that we are spending a bunch of money, and we need to make sure that money is spent in line with our goals, with vision zero and the modal hierarchy. When I was lobbying before, for changes to main during the last project, the paving project, there was a lot of talk about needs to do public outreach and traffic modeling. Traffic modeling is at the bottom of the pyramid and buses are up top, so I don't think that we should spend our time and our money on figuring out how cars are going to get around the block. Let's just do it. Let's do them as pilot projects, let's do them quick and see what happens. That's in line with our goals anyway, and we know that induced demand is a thing that exists and not representative of the models, so let's do it fast and try to get it within a year to five years and get it funded. And let's fix the city before the oceans boil. Thanks.

**Eudaly:** Thank you.

**Saltzman:** I appreciate the discussion that we just had about the central east side, but I guess that I was also concerned about the issues raised around northeast 7th and Broadway and Broadway, itself. And I don't want to -- I don't need any explanations at this point, but I want to make sure that those issues are addressed, too, because those are small Businesses, and we need to make sure that they prosper. Okay. So we will -- we have one amendment, and that's to, I guess you remember 1183. There is no further discussion, call the roll on commissioner Fritz's amendment.

**Fritz:** It's to insert after the first, and, and be it further resolved, the project design must ensure and convenient loading zones in the industrial district. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Okay. Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Well, I want to thank everyone who came here today to testify, and especially those of you including my colleagues who stuck it out to the bitter end. I feel like we should have cookies and juice for her in my office. Sadly, we don't. I think that they are all gone, and I don't have my badge. So I want to thank a few people. I want to thank serenity for coming today and bringing her trike and giving us a really visual reminder of challenges that people face who have mobility issues. I have a son in a wheelchair, and lots of people that have no experience navigating the city with mobility challenges like to give me lots of advice and opinions about the decisions I have made for my family, about my transportation. What they don't seem to understand is yes, I can put my son in a bicycle cart and haul him around. He weighs 100 pounds, I have got nowhere to put him at the other End of the trip if I don't have his wheelchair. Serenity I don't think can take her trike on public transportation, so she is choosing the trike. She's not on the bus. If she is taking the bus or using a walker, she does not have her strikes, so as you know accessibility and inclusion are major issues for me, and I know that we are going to make a signature improvement in that realm. And I am thankful for that. And I want to thank Jessica Angleman for the handy cheat sheet she made. I've only been here two years. This is so helpful. I will be reading back through it. It's just a reminder of how vital it is that community holds us accountable for promises that we made, because you know people this is item 1,183 that we have heard this year. It is almost inevitable that as we move along and commissioners change and staff changes that things can fall through the cracks, and we need every -- we need help. I want to thank pbot staff, although they continue to ignore my request for feasibility studies on water slides, numeric tubes and jet packs, I still love you guys. You are a great team to work with. People who testified, you couldn't see but staff was sitting behind you nodding their heads and taking copious notes as we have said repeatedly, this is not carved in stone. We are picking 18 projects. And the next step is more engagement, more input before we design and build them. I want to thank former



November 14-15, 2018

commissioner steve novick for starting this process. I think to thank commissioner Saltzman for his leadership of the bureau. And I want to thank bicycle and pedestrian activists. I've been cycling in Portland for over 30 years. Although I bike less than I did in the past, I know that it's easier and it's safer, although we do have a lot of work to do. I think about this quote from dan fermoso, an industrial designer, and I am paraphrasing, it's when we understand and address the needs of the extremes, the middle will take care of itself. We have done for too long, only been addressing one end of the spectrum, which are car drivers. While neglecting the other end until relatively recently. So if it seems like we are devoting a lot of time and resources and money to bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure, we are, and it's completely warrant and had necessary. It's only been 100 years since streets began to be thought of as strictly conduits for cars, but for millennia before the combustible engine, streets served a multitude of purposes in a variety of users and modes of transportation, mostly horse, carts, and people on foot. We all own the streets. Critical mass had a slogan, we are the traffic. When once a month massive people would gather on bicycles and take over the streets, and we Are pretty vigorously, and sometimes violently opposed, I have a motto for people who are single occupant vehicle drivers, frustrated and stuck in traffic, which every once in a while I am one of them, although I almost am never driving alone. You are the congestion. It's imperative for the climate change, public health and safety, equity, and our collective quality of life that we deeply invest in pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure and greatly improve public transit. We can't please all the people all time but we can do the most good for the most people. We need better education on how to share the road for all users and I am switching gears because this is what I do. I just jot down random notes and post-it notes and try to put them in some kind of coherent order. We can improve our efforts on the local level, and I am specifically thinking educating drivers and cyclists on how to share the road, but it's really a state issue as well. We need that Oregon driver, manual to reflect changes on our streets that have happened over the last 30 years. It's clear we have more work to do on the central east side and 7th avenue, and I just want, if anyone is left in the room, who gave testimony on that, I am very committed to working those issues out. I was a small business owner for 22 years, and we don't want to put people out of business or chase them out, I was a small business owner for 22 years. We just want to make it safer for everyone and reach our climate change goals. I have heard other legitimate criticisms today, parking, for instance, and I am also committing to do kind of additional outreach on that. Please, everyone, know the change is coming. You are going to see more construction on the streets next year, than we have ever seen in the history of our city, and I am sure that our phones will be ringing. That change, change is going -- change, change is coming for better or for worse, but we are really determined to get out ahead of it as far as the population growth and climate change make up for lost time. I am going to put one pitch out here before my vote. Does anybody know what a Dutch reach is? Okay. So I want to suggest that we start promoting dutch reach, which is simply when you are parking on the street, especially if there is an adjacent bike lane, you open the door with your office at hand, which necessitates a turn of your head, a check in your mirror to make sure that there is not a cyclist coming up that you are going to door. It's a really dangerous situation on the streets out there. Dutch reach could also suggest we aspire to be more like, overall, with our bicycle infrastructure. I will leave it at that. Thank you everybody. This was great. A heated topic.

**Saltzman:** That was your statement on the amendment. [laughter] do you have a statement on the resolution, too? Oh, okay.

**Eudaly:** Have you been sitting here smirking the whole time?

**Fritz:** I was thinking how can I make this gracious when I just say aye.

November 14-15, 2018

**Eudaly:** I wanted to catch as many of you still left as possible. I vote aye on the amendment, and I will have very little to say on the next two items.

**Fritz:** Commissioner I love your enthusiasm especially for transportation. It's absolutely delightful, and I appreciate you accept my amendment, aye.

**Saltzman:** Aye. Now on the main resolution. 1183.

**Fritz:** Oh, here we go again.

**Eudaly:** You did throw me off on my final closing sentence, but I need to have dinner before class, so I will just happily vote aye.

**Fritz:** Thank you for this presentation and to art pearce and dave and the briefing you gave me and the explanations, they continued. The continued discussions and furthering my amendment which I know you will take to heart. I am a property owner. I co-own a condo in 8th and flanders, which is by effected project 16, and they are proposing to close flanders between park and 8th. And my son is a cyclist and my Daughter-in-law are supportive, and I put that on the record so that the rest of the condo owners can't say that I slid it under the rug, so there it is. This is really important. I am a huge pedestrian and transit advocate, and because my son is a cyclist and because of the many benefits for those who are, and I am also an avid cycling advocate even though I will never be on a bike. Regardless of what the improvements are because I like walking much more and to look around and talk to people and etc. Thank you to commissioner Saltzman who was the commissioner for lots of the time that this work was being done. These things, as was mentioned, don't come just overnight, and this one has been in the progress for a really long time. As was evidenced from tri-met thanking Leah Treat the former director and commissioner Novick, and now commissioner Eudaly, thank you for bring it in for the landing. Delightful enthusiasm. And.

**Eudaly:** Delight is my middle name.

**Fritz:** I remember that.

**Fritz:** I got this just in case. We've been in council for a very long time so I will shut up. Aye.

**Saltzman:** Well, I want to thank commissioner Eudaly and the bureau of transportation and all of the stakeholders that are here today. This was something that needs to happen, but I guess I also want to just express a couple of cautionary notes. We talk a lot about, and we hear the horror stories from cyclists all the time about the right hand hooks and everything else, and I think that we have to realize that motorists increasingly driving from Gresham -- he had a young woman here who bicycles so Gresham every day and back. With housing prices being what they are, we have more and more people, ordinary people who work in places like the central east side industrial district. They usually have to be to work at an incredibly early hour. 8:00 is late in the central east side, you know. A lot of them get to work at 6:00, 7:00. When people are worried about finding a parking space, worried about the congestion in, that's when they -- and when they are talking on their phones and texting on top of that, that's when these things happen. So there is almost a blind spot to this discussion. It's an intentional blind spot that PBOT doesn't like to talk about, and that is we need to rigorously enforce our traffic laws. So I think that it's a blind spot in part because it's another bureau's responsibility. It's also a blind spot in part because it rubs people the wrong way on discussions about racial profiling. I think we sort of need to get over that and realize that for these strategies to be successful, you need to have good enforcement of traffic laws, bicycle laws, pedestrian, jaywalking, everything. It needs to be enforced, otherwise we are going to continue to have these tragedies despite what we do. I like protected bike lanes a lot. That's a real important measure to get people like me and all the people we heard testify today whose spouses won't ride because they are too afraid. That's me, too. I won't ride because I'm too afraid. There is a lot of people like that. We need to, you know, if we are going to be successful in getting our commute rates up in

November 14-15, 2018

the bicycle category, we need to overcome that, and particularly w. Women as I have heard us told many times before. That is not going to come by engineering and design, it has to have enforcement, and we cannot be afraid to not talk about enforcement of our traffic laws. We are on another race for our pedestrian deaths this year. Distracted driving is as bad as it has ever been, just by casual observations. Nobody pays attention to the laws around distracted driving. Unless we do that these strategies will all look good, but they are not going to reduce the numbers that we are hoping they are going to, so I hope that we will get serious about that, as well. Again, good work, everybody. Aye. So the resolution, is 183 -- 1183 passes. Now 1184.

**Eudaly:** Good thing there is One more item because I forgot some thank yous. I want to thank congressman blumenauer for kind of setting us on this path of bicycle and pedestrian advocacy, and I think that the quote was he wanted Portland to be the best european, european city in the united states.

**Saltzman:** That was charlie hill. That was charlie hill, yes.

**Eudaly:** Are you sure?

**Saltzman:** Yes, I am sure. You have got two people here.

**Eudaly:** Okay. Well, congressman blumenauer did speak to our class a couple weeks ago and he used that quote, so bad news, we are not quite when yet. I want to thank mayor adam for his advocacy around bicycling and bicycling infrastructure and I want to thank the two terries, terry parker and terry [inaudible] milton, who couldn't be more diametrically opposed, but are almost always guaranteed to weigh in on these issues, and I appreciate you. I vote aye.

**Fritz:** Like commissioner eudaly, I am glad to have another vote. I really thank nissan quam on my staff who did a lot of the analysis, and I appreciate that. This is the vote on the parking supply, I appreciate you working with the central east side industrial district, in particular, on the parking strategies. I also want to remember that transit doesn't run very much at night, so if you are a swing shift worker, you are going to need to park, and that means you Probably are going to need to park around 3:00 in the afternoon, which needs to be taken into account because when I worked at ohsu, I worked to midnight, it would have taken me two hours to get home on transit. And that included a mile walk at the end because the buses stop at 10:00. It's important to remember for low income workers, parking can be the difference between being able to, as was mentioned, pick up your child from daycare and various other needs of life, so you can -- or so you can get to your second job. Aye.

**Saltzman:** The resolution is adopted. Aye. That is our last order of business, the next meeting is november 28 at 9:30 in the morning. So did I get that right? November 28?

**Moore-Love:** We are meeting next wednesday, the 21st. We are.

**Saltzman:** Oh, we are? Okay. I was going to wish Portlanders a happy thanksgiving, but I can wait until next week to do that. Okay. I didn't realize. Okay. We are adjourned until Wednesday, November 21.

**At 5:27 p.m. Council adjourned**