



CITY OF  
**PORTLAND, OREGON**

**OFFICIAL  
MINUTES**

A REGULAR MEETING OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PORTLAND, OREGON WAS HELD THIS **10<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF OCTOBER, 2018** AT 9:30 A.M.

THOSE PRESENT WERE: Mayor Wheeler, Presiding; Commissioners Eudaly, Fish, Fritz and Saltzman, 5. Mayor Wheeler left at 11:15 a.m. and Commissioner Saltzman presided.

Commissioner Saltzman arrived at 9:35 a.m.  
Commissioner Eudaly arrived at 9:36 a.m.

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE: Karla Moore-Love, Clerk of the Council; Denis Vannier, Senior Deputy City Attorney; Linly Rees, Chief Deputy City Attorney from 10:40 a.m. to 10:42 a.m.; and Christopher Alvarez and John Paolazzi, Sergeants at Arms.

On a Y-5 roll call, the Consent Agenda was adopted.

<b>COMMUNICATIONS</b>		<b>Disposition:</b>
<b>1041</b>	Request of Crystal Elinski to address Council regarding R.I.P (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>1042</b>	Request of Deon Strommer to address Council regarding positive things going on in our City (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>1043</b>	Request of Nancy Matela to address Council regarding possible decision by the Department of Energy on the Hanford Nuclear Waste (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>1044</b>	Request of Thomas Lande to address Council regarding an idea for a wall of heroes (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>1045</b>	Request of Lightning Super Creativity-Data Attack Dog to address Council regarding the Mozart of trade agreements (Communication)	<b>PLACED ON FILE</b>
<b>TIMES CERTAIN</b>		

October 10-11, 2018

<p><b>1046</b></p>	<p><b>TIME CERTAIN: 9:45 AM</b> – Accept the Digital Equity Action Plan Year-2 Progress Report (Report introduced by Mayor Wheeler) 40 minutes requested</p> <p><b>Motion to accept report:</b> Moved by Fish and seconded by Eudaly. (Y-5)</p>	<p><b>ACCEPTED</b></p>
<p><b>1047</b></p>	<p><b>TIME CERTAIN: 10:40 AM</b> – Consider the proposal of Tim Sotoodeh, Southwest Hills LLC and the recommendation from the Hearings Officer for removal of conditions of approval imposed by prior Comprehensive Plan Map and Zoning Map amendment ordinances for property at 2855 SW Patton Rd (Previous Agenda 998; Findings; Report introduced by Mayor Wheeler; amend Ordinance Nos. 155609 and 160473; LU 18-112666 CP ZC) 5 minutes requested for items 1047 and 1048</p> <p><b>Motion to tentatively adopt Findings:</b> Moved by Fish and seconded by Fritz. (Y-4; N-1 Saltzman)</p>	<p><b>CONTINUED TO OCTOBER 17, 2018 AT 10:35 AM TIME CERTAIN</b></p>
<p><b>1048</b></p>	<p>Remove conditions of approval imposed by prior Comprehensive Plan Map and Zoning Map amendment ordinances for property at 2855 SW Patton Rd, at the request of Tim Sotoodeh, Southwest Hills LLC (Previous Agenda 999; Ordinance introduced by Mayor Wheeler; amend Ordinance Nos. 155609 and 160473; LU 18-112666 CP ZC)</p> <p><b>Motion to amend ordinance to include the new conditions and revised Findings:</b> Moved by Fish and seconded by Fritz. (Y-4; N-1 Saltzman)</p>	<p><b>PASSED TO SECOND READING AS AMENDED OCTOBER 17, 2018 10:35 AM TIME CERTAIN</b></p>
<p><b>CONSENT AGENDA – NO DISCUSSION</b></p>		
<p><b>Mayor Ted Wheeler</b></p>		
<p><b>*1049</b></p>	<p>Authorize application to Bloomberg Philanthropies for the American Cities Climate Challenge for technical assistance and a support package valued at approximately \$2 million to support City progress toward achieving the goals of the Climate Action Plan (Ordinance) (Y-5)</p>	<p><b>189196</b></p>
<p><b>Bureau of Planning &amp; Sustainability</b></p>		
<p><b>1050</b></p>	<p>Amend a grant agreement with Earth Advantage to add \$200,000 to continue work on the Home Energy Score Program (Second Reading Agenda 1030; amend Contract No. 32001607) (Y-5)</p>	<p><b>189197</b></p>
<p><b>Commissioner Chloe Eudaly</b></p>		
<p><b>Bureau of Transportation</b></p>		
<p><b>*1051</b></p>	<p>Authorize Intergovernmental Agreement for funding in the amount of \$110,000 from the City to the State of Oregon for the planning process to develop the Columbia/Lombard Mobility Corridor Plan (Ordinance) (Y-5)</p>	<p><b>189198</b></p>

October 10-11, 2018

<b>1052</b>	Authorize Intergovernmental Agreement with the State of Oregon in the amount of \$300,158 for the design and construction of certain improvements on Glisan St as part of the Fixing Our Streets program (Ordinance)	<b>PASSED TO SECOND READING OCTOBER 17, 2018 AT 9:30 AM</b>
<b>1053</b>	Authorize a contract with Northwest Disability Support for Bike First! bike camp scholarships for students with disabilities who live within Portland city limits or attend a school within Portland city limits for \$30,000 (Second Reading Agenda 1032) (Y-5)	<b>189199</b>
<b>Commissioner Dan Saltzman</b> <b>Portland Fire &amp; Rescue</b>		
<b>*1054</b>	Amend contract with Trauma Intervention Programs Portland/Vancouver Inc. in the amount of \$414,033 to provide emergency emotional crisis intervention services for an additional five years (Ordinance; amend Contract No. 30003584) (Y-5)	<b>189200</b>
<b>REGULAR AGENDA</b>		
<b>1055</b>	Amend the Seismic Design Requirements for Existing Buildings to require placards and tenant notification for unreinforced masonry buildings (Second Reading Agenda 1039; Ordinance introduced by Mayor Wheeler and Commissioner Saltzman; amend Code Chapter 24.85)  (Y-3 Fritz, Saltzman, Wheeler. Eudaly and Fish absent.)	<b>189201</b> <b>AS AMENDED</b>
<b>Mayor Ted Wheeler</b> <b>Office of Management and Finance</b>		
<b>*1056</b>	Authorize a Request for Proposal for a new tax administration software system in the Revenue Division (Ordinance) 15 minutes requested (Y-5)	<b>189202</b>
<b>*1057</b>	Authorize limited tax revenue refunding bonds related to the Portland streetcar system (Ordinance) (Y-5)	<b>189203</b>
<b>1058</b>	Amend ordinances to authorize use of bond proceeds for the payment of interest on bonds during reconstruction and space buildout of the Portland Building (Second Reading Agenda 1035; amend Ordinance Nos. 187924 and 189088) (Y-5)	<b>189204</b>
<b>Commissioner Chloe Eudaly</b> <b>Bureau of Transportation</b>		

October 10-11, 2018

<p><b>*1059</b> Authorize the Bureau of Transportation to acquire certain permanent and temporary rights necessary for construction of the North Rivergate Freight project, through the exercise of the City's Eminent Domain Authority (Ordinance) <b>Motion to accept PBOT revised exhibit package:</b> Moved by Fritz and seconded by Eudaly. (Y-4; Wheeler absent) (Y-4; Wheeler absent)</p>	<p><b>189205</b> AS AMENDED</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Commissioner Amanda Fritz</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Water Bureau</b></p> <p><b>1060</b> Authorize Intergovernmental Agreements and grant agreements in support of the Lead Hazard Reduction Program for five years beginning FY 2019-20 in an amount up to \$425,000 per year and increase the annual not to exceed authorized amount for FY 2018-19 to \$395,000 (Ordinance; amend Ordinance No. 186628) 10 minutes requested</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>PASSED TO SECOND READING OCTOBER 17, 2018 AT 9:30 AM</b></p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Commissioner Nick Fish</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Bureau of Environmental Services</b></p> <p><b>1061</b> Authorize a contract with Century West Engineering Corporation for professional services for the design of the Stark and Buckman East Reconstruction and Green Streets Project No. E10216 for \$1,610,883 (Ordinance) 10 minutes requested</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>PASSED TO SECOND READING OCTOBER 17, 2018 AT 9:30 AM</b></p>

At 11:45 a.m., Council recessed.

October 10-11, 2018

A RECESSED MEETING OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PORTLAND, OREGON WAS HELD THIS **10<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF OCTOBER, 2018** AT 3:30 P.M.

THOSE PRESENT WERE: Mayor Wheeler, Presiding; Commissioners Eudaly, Fish, and Fritz, 4.

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE: Karla Moore-Love, Clerk of the Council; Lauren King, Senior Deputy City Attorney; and Christopher Alvarez and John Paolazzi, Sergeants at Arms.

<b>1062</b> <b>TIME CERTAIN: 2:00 PM</b> – Adopt the Southwest Corridor Light Rail Project Preferred Alternative and direct further actions (Resolution introduced by Commissioner Eudaly) 90 minutes requested	<b>Disposition:</b> <b>RESCHEDULED TO NOVEMBER 1, 2018 AT 2:00 PM TIME CERTAIN</b>
<b>1063</b> <b>TIME CERTAIN: 3:30 PM</b> – Accept the 2018 Portland Historic Landmarks Commission State of the City Preservation Report (Report introduced by Mayor Wheeler) 1 hour requested <b>Motion to accept report:</b> Moved by Fish and seconded by Eudaly. (Y-4)	<b>ACCEPTED</b>

At 4:38 p.m., Council recessed.

October 10-11, 2018

A RECESSED MEETING OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PORTLAND, OREGON WAS HELD THIS **11<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF OCTOBER, 2018** AT 2:00 P.M.

THOSE PRESENT WERE: Mayor Wheeler, Presiding; Commissioners Eudaly, Fish, Fritz and Saltzman, 5.

Commissioner Fritz arrived at 2:04 p.m.

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE: Karla Moore-Love, Clerk of the Council; Lauren King, Deputy City Attorney; and Christopher Alvarez and John Paolazzi, Sergeants at Arms.

<p><b>1064</b>      <b>TIME CERTAIN: 2:00 PM</b> – Accept the 2018 Regional Arts &amp; Culture Council State of the Arts report (Report introduced by Commissioner Eudaly) 1 hour requested</p> <p><b>Motion to accept report:</b> Moved by Fish and seconded by Saltzman. (Y-5)</p>	<p><b>Disposition:</b></p> <p><b>ACCEPTED</b></p>
--	---

At 3:37 p.m., Council adjourned.

**MARY HULL CABALLERO**  
Auditor of the City of Portland



By Karla Moore-Love  
Clerk of the Council

For a discussion of agenda items, please consult the following Closed Caption File.

October 10-11, 2018

## Closed Caption File of Portland City Council Meeting

This file was produced through the closed captioning process for the televised City Council broadcast and should not be considered a verbatim transcript.

Key: \*\*\*\*\* means unidentified speaker.

**October 10, 2018**

**9:30 AM**

**Wheeler:** Good morning everybody this is the Wednesday October 10 morning session of the Portland city council. Karla, please call the roll.

**Eudaly: Fritz: Here Fish: Here. Saltzman:**

**Wheeler:** Here. Colleagues, before we do the legal statement, I just want to make a couple of acknowledgments. First of all, we have a large group of students here today from catlin gabel, is that correct?

**\*\*\*\*\*:** Yeah.

**Wheeler:** Yes. Good. Welcome to Portland city hall. We are glad to have you here. There is a couple of housekeeping items, as well. Due to some quorum issues we are going to be moving around some items that are on the city council agenda, not for today's meeting but for subsequent meetings, and I want to make a couple of announcements in that regard. First of all, item 1062, which is on this afternoon's agenda. It's the southwest corridor light rail project preferred alternative. This is being rescheduled to november 1st at 2:00 p.m. Time certain. Item 1065, which is to accept the Portland design commission 2017 state of the city design report, that is on the Thursday afternoon agenda. That will be moved to October 17, 2:00 p.m. Time certain and item 1066, also on the Thursday afternoon agenda, that's the latin heritage month, and that will be rescheduled as well. We will notice these through the appropriate channels, but I just wanted to give you that heads up today. Good morning.

**Denis Vannier, Deputy City Attorney:** Welcome to the Portland city council. The city council represents all Portlanders and meets to do the city's business. The presiding officer preserves order and decorum during the city council meetings so that everyone can feel welcome, comfortable, respected, and safe. To participate in council meetings, you may sign up in advance with the council clerk's office for communications to speak briefly about any subject. You may also sign up for public testimony on resolutions or the first readings of ordinances. Your testimony should address the matter being considered at the time. When testifying, please state your name for the record, your address is not necessary and please disclose if you are a lobbyist. If you are representing an organization, please identify it. The presiding officer determines the length of testimony. Individuals generally have three minutes to testify unless otherwise stated, when you have 30 seconds left, a yellow light goes on. When your time is done, a red light goes on. If you are in the audience and would like to show your support for something that is said, please feel free to do a thumbs up. If you want to express that you do not support something, please feel free to do a thumb's down. Disruptive conduct such as shouting or interrupting testimony or council deliberations will not be allowed. If there are disruptions, a warning will be given that further disruption may result in the person being ejected for the remainder of the meeting. After being ejected, a person who fails to leave the meeting is subject to arrest for trespass. Thank you for helping your fellow Portlanders to feel welcome, comfortable, respected and safe.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. There was one other housekeeping item I neglected to mention because of the agenda item changes that I announced previously, this afternoon's council

October 10-11, 2018

session, this is Wednesday, October 10, the afternoon council session will not begin until 3:30 p.m. So without it further adieu, Karla communications. First individual, please.

**Item 1041**

**Wheeler:** I do not see Chrystal. Next individual please Karla.

**Item 1042**

**Wheeler:** Good morning. Welcome.

**Deon Strommer:** Thank you. Good morning. My name is deon strommer and I am a small business owner here in the Portland area. Small business name first called mortuary services. I know it's different, but I employ 35 people here in the city. I and my employees have a daily interactions with the Portland police bureau because we have the Multnomah county medical examiner's contract for transporting the decedents to the medical examiner's office from the scene of an unattended deaths. These types deaths require an officer come to secure the scene. We have met hundreds of Portlands police officers, if not thousands through the years from your department and I want to take this opportunity to thank them by letting their leaders know of the great men and women that serve these families in a difficult time. During the most difficult times, these families are having with an unexpected death, these men and women in uniform have shown such compassion, empathy and professionalism to the families that they assist, so my thank you to the Portland police bureau. My second pointed is my business has recently put in the first high temperature aqua cremation unit this side of the Mississippi. This type of flameless cremation uses one-tenth the energy of traditional flame cremation and leaves a 90% less carbon footprint even in our death. Which is, of course, more sustainability. My experience with working with the bureau of development services and the bureau of environmental service was way above my expectations. They helped me through that permitting. They wholeheartedly believed in the project and worked with me to bring this important kind of service to the northwest. This again is my way of taking time out of my day to come to your council meeting to thank your bureaus, your departments, and also personally Glen Laube, Rachel Wall, and Dan Parnell by informing their leaders of the fine men and women that work in those departments. Thank you bds and bes and thank you council members for your service.

**Wheeler:** Mr. strommer, thank you very much so much for coming in. In the two years i've been here you are probably the third person who has come in to thank our employees.

**Fish:** Mayor, since he did not get a chance to finish his testimony, we should invite him next week.

**Wheeler:** Absolutely. Thank you, Mr. Strommer, for coming in. We appreciate that. We will pass that onto the police bureau, bds and bes leadership. Next individual, please.

**Item 1043.**

**Moore-Love:** She let me know she will not be speaking today.

**Wheeler:** Okay, very good, next individual please 1044.

**Item 1044.**

**Wheeler:** Good morning, sir. Thanks for being here.

**Thomas Lande:** I am not giving the public speaking, so I am going to read it.

**Wheeler:** Fine.

**Lande:** I am here to propose a wall of heroes, a place to honor those people who have sacrificed their lives for others. By suggesting that this will incorporate the police, fire, and the civilian heroes. It may only be a wall on a public building, inside or out. The corner of pioneer courthouse square or a patio on a park with a plaque, and a statement that those names are honored heroes. Two men were honored at the hollywood max stop, and that's a good thing. What about so many others who haven't been so honored? As an expense to the city, this would be minimal. It would mean so much to the friends and relatives of those so honored. Thank you for your time.

October 10-11, 2018

**Wheeler:** Thank you, sir. We appreciate that and the last individual, please.

**Item 1045.**

**Lightning Super Creativity-Data Attack Dog:** Yes, my name is lightning I represent lightning super creativity. President donald j. trump, the mozart of trade agreements. What we are going to see between china and usa is going to be something put together that will change the united states in the world itself. He is already going to receive the nobel peace prize for north korea. He will also receive the nobel economic prize for what he does on this trade agreement. Again, for my position, though, I want to see a 7% gdp built between both super powers. As you know china has a population of 1.5 billion. We have a population base of 325 million. We are the small players here. China is the bigger player. They are going to work with us, and we are going to create a 7% gdp, which is my plan between both countries. Again, when you are looking at the per capita income, we're at 57,000. China is around 8,000. They have a lot to improve. Could you play my video now, Karla? Thank you. ¶ ¶ ¶ ¶ ¶ ¶ ¶ ¶ ¶

**Wheeler:** Very good. Thank you. That's always been one of my favorites. Have any items been pulled from the consent agenda? Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Aye. **Fritz:** Aye. **Fish:** Aye. **Saltzman:** Aye.

**Wheeler:** Aye. The consent agenda is adopted. First time certain item, please, item 1046. **Item 1046.**

**Wheeler:** Colleagues, the digital equity plan, or Deap, as it is referred to, is a collaboration of the city of Portland, Multnomah county library, and many community partners from the nonprofit, public, and private sectors. The plan was adopted by the council in April of 2016, and today we are going to hear about the progress during the two-year period of plan implementation. To date the digital equity action plan activities have been purposeful and far reaching across the county. In May of this year, we heard about some of the local activities and partnerships during the digital inclusion network's presentation to council for digital inclusion week, and also at the 2018 digital inclusion summit. Here to present the report on Deap's second year, our community technology program manager Julie Omelchuck and coordinator Rebecca gibbons with the Portland office for community technology. Good morning and welcome. Thanks for being here.

**Julie Omelchuck, Office of Community Technology:** Thank you, mayor wheeler, and good morning commissioners. I am Julie Omelchuck, and I am with the office for community technology. I am here today with Rebecca and county library staff john who are responsible for leading Deap implementation and coordinating and supporting our community partners. We also have a few guests who will assist staff in presenting the year two report, along with some of our partners, who asked to provide testimony in support of the -- of our efforts. I believe that you have a copy of the Deap two progress report in front of you. Digital equity and inclusion have become familiar terms and a topic of discussion for many of us. It has become a priority for the city and the county and for many social service agencies, educators, and businesses, because it intersection so much of what we do, the services we design and deliver, the way that we communicate and engage, and how we grow and prosper. This intersectionality touches every facet of the city's work and makes our leadership and the partnership with the county all the more relevant and important. Just yesterday I was at the smart city steering committee meeting where we heard about metro's new grant program focused on transportation technologies, such as ride hailing, car and bike sharing, ride matching, and micro-transit, and etc. Guess what, most, if not all of these transportation technologies require connectivity to access these services. I also recently attended the grant-makers of Oregon and southwest Washington conference, a regional gathering for the philanthropic community. Funders, along with the city partners, such as the office for community, community and civic life, are gearing up for the 2020 census. This data gathering effort will have significant and long-term implications

October 10-11, 2018

for the city and its residents. Guess what, the census will be conducted online, requiring connectivity to participate. The Deap, backed by staff, dedicated to facilitating and coordinating efforts, both internal and external to the city, has continued to guide the collective community approach for strategies and opportunities to address the digital divide. Rebecca and our other partners will share more specifically what year two has looked like for the Deap.

**Rebecca Gibbons, Office of Community Technology:** Good morning mayor and commissioners. I am Rebecca gibbons, the digital equity program coordinator with the office of community technology. Specifically, in our second year of Deap implementation, we continue to grow our network, leverage existing programs, and infrastructure, and implement initiatives that align with the 17 strategic actions identified under the plan. Throughout the year, we reached out to organizations, both new and old, and across the sectors, to build awareness of the city and the county's focus on the digital divide. As a result the digital inclusion network, or as we call it, the din, continues to meet monthly and bring new members in, for example, Portland youth builders, chick tech, catholic charities, state of Oregon wic program, verizon, and outside the frame are just a few. Because we create space to have discussions and build awareness, the din members are able to place priority on this work. We know this because we have seen our partner organizations hiring new staff to support this work. The library, free geek, and metro east community media all hired new digital inclusion program staff this year. Garnering new funds. The mount hood cable regulatory commission has been a signature funder of digital inclusion programs. The library, open signal, and pacific northwest college of make think code program, where all community technology grant recipients for the projects that set focus on digital literacy or workforce development. Portland public schools is preparing to serve 700 students with home internet service because of a sprint 1 million project award. And we're also seeing our partners designing and implementing new programs. Pnca make think code program is implement stem workshops designed to involve more women and people of color as teachers and learners. The workshops will be video recorded to highlight the diversity of participants engaging in stem skill explorations so young viewers watching from home can see themselves represented in the learning and working community, as a result of this and other project work, we are on track in all of our 17 action areas. Meaning we have an action underway with engaged partner and planned activities. There is a summary chart of the progress in the report before you today, and a more detailed description of activities is available on the website. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Good morning.

**John Morona:** Good morning. Mayor and commissioners. My name id john morona, the director of content strategy at the Multnomah county library. One of our goals under the digital equity action plan is to hold an annual digital inclusion summit, that brings together a broad coalition of people who work to foster digital equity goals across our community. Our 2018 digital inclusion summit was held in May, and we have 120 participants representing 69 organizations, from government, organization, healthcare, from community-based organizations to tech industry. The diversity of the organizations and participants is a reflection of the fact that digital equity is now recognized as a fundamental requirement to serve people, provide education, grow our economy, and have a healthy, thriving and just society. Din members from the office of community technology, Multnomah county, and the library let a dedicated group of din members, volunteers from open signal and the citizens utility board, inten, the state of Oregon, wic, metro east community media and pnca. These people devoted countless hours of their time to help us organize and convene the first summit under the Deap. Mayor wheeler introduced our summit. Thank you. And we featured keynote speeches from the director of libraries, bailey elke, and Multnomah county chair deborah kafoury, as well as a welcome video message from senator ron

October 10-11, 2018

wyden. The theme of our digital inclusion summit was economic development. We hosted three-panel discussions on how digital equity impacts workforce, pipeline development, on the impact of digital exclusion on health outcomes, and on how public policy can drive digital inclusion efforts. We had spirited discussions on all of our panels, and our summit participants, when surveyed after the event expressed excitement and interest in the program. In connecting with other apartments across the industries and finding ways to move the goal of digital equity forward. We would like to thank open signal for streaming our event live and metro east community media for capturing stories and putting together this short video.

### **[Video Played]**

\*\*\*\*: Digital equity and inclusion is really important in the city of Portland. We recognize that we have a lot of underserved and vulnerable populations who don't have access to the internet, don't have affordable devices, and don't have the skills and the training to use those devices effectively.

\*\*\*\*: The internet and access to the internet is fundamental at this point. No different than the access to electricity in your home or water. That's the biggest take-away.

\*\*\*\*: Digital inclusion is extremely important because the cost of digital exclusion is great. And as mayor wheeler said this morning, it even undermines our democracy.

\*\*\*\*: You are fighting for democracy because frankly without it addressing this digital divide, without it addressing income disparity, democracy really is not worth that much.

\*\*\*\*: Many of the people do their job on the internet, trying to close the digital divide and to live up to a progressive community.

\*\*\*\*: It's not just a good thing to have a diverse workforce. It's an essential thing for making their business successful. There are people who may be want to sort of join this world, and we need to make sure that they have access and opportunities so that they can succeed.

\*\*\*\*: So it's important to get a lot of diverse opinions and ideas from folks who come from those backgrounds who know that audience. So we can better serve them.

\*\*\*\*: You can't see yourself as something if you don't see it, if you have never seen it, and so you know, giving those people the opportunity and access, you know, access is an important part of this. Show them the work that we're doing today so that they are inspired to do it tomorrow.

\*\*\*\*: The challenge of digital equity for us is an opportunity to meet people where they are and try to, in a limited period of time, show them how these tools can help them to thrive in a modern economy.

\*\*\*\*: Any decision you are making starts with who is benefiting and who is being burdened by this. If we have groups marginalized, that are experiencing major -- marginalization, go back to the Communities and ask, what is it that we are missing. What is it that you need? The only way that we are going to really solve the digital divide is if the whole community engages. If we each take one small step each day, we will make a difference.

### **[Video Ends]**

**Morona:** In a little over two careers since coalescing around the Deap, we have come to realize that digital equity and inclusion is not a discreet area of practice. We have recognized the intersection of needs in various areas that affect residents excluded from digital participation. It's pretty amazing how far we have come from initial discussions and needs assessment to a highly functioning coalition that has positive impacts in areas from public health to housing. As you can tell from our report, all of our actions are on track, but there is more work to be done. Municipal broadband is being explored in the region and members of the digital inclusion network are engaged in this process. For many of our residents who he cannot afford internet access at the rates it currently offered, free access is still a necessary entry point. The din is building capacity for digital literacy training,

October 10-11, 2018

connecting people with computers, through this work we continue to assess and ask who is excluded from digital society and why don't they use the internet. We know that cost, lack of accessible training opportunities in their language at good times and locations, lack with childcare and privacy concerns, can be factors. We are working with our low income housing partners and organizations that serve youth, people of color, immigrants, people with disabilities, people experiencing homelessness, and people in poverty. So we are constantly evolving the services to be responsive to the community needs. Working within these realities, this year the library, free geek and metro east community media taught 59 sessions of the earn a computer program at eight locations, totaling 1,000 training hours 88 laptops were given away to participants. Participants like the central city concern participant from Alaska who needed to get online to get his Texas birth certificate to get an Oregon i.d he hopes to start the construction business. Through the program, he connected with his kids in Alaska and became a central library patron. He has come in for help with the android device and email. Classes like his were available in five languages through translation and native speaking instructors, including Somali, Spanish, Russian, Karen and English, and some participants who spoke English also spoke Arabic, Aramaic, French, Kurumba, Oruma and more. We plan to distribute 150 computers this year through 13 cohorts and a new self-paced pilot with home forward where participants will choose training at their level, location, language, and best time. In the coming year, we are planning to engage the community about their needs to inform future digital equity planning. Now we would like to invite some digital inclusion network members up to share their perspectives.

**Wheeler:** Very good. I show we have Ifany bell and julie Reeder from the wic program, and Nandini Ranganathan from pnca make think code, and Sachi Weerawardena from human solutions community works projects. Did I get that right? Give or take? If not, come up and introduce yourself, and we are glad to have you here. Thank you very much. Good morning.

**Ifany Bell:** Good morning. I guess I will start off.

**Wheeler:** Thank you, sir.

**Bell:** Thank you for allowing us to come here today. My name is Ifany Bell, and I am the expensive producer at open signal labs. We have begun a pretty ambitious project over at open signal. We have started an experimental incubator program that is designed to support african-american film-makers in developing networks, creative networks that support inclusion in our creative film, television, and broadcast industries here in Portland. One of the big challenges for film-makers here locally is not only a technological one, but a social one. The film and television industry is largely dominated by relationships, and sometimes cracking those relationships and getting access to individuals and ideas and the structures necessary to succeed economically in that field. Those are critical barriers. Not only are they technological in educational component to being successful, but those two elements of, you know, being in the right place at the right time, knowing the right people. All those things contribute to how well you are able to progress in this particular industry. So this open signal lab's program is designed to support six film-makers who are local from Portland in advancing their careers in this particular space. The program will last for a year. It is a pilot program that we wish to build on in subsequent years to continue to build a cohort model around this idea to create a pipeline of access and, and opportunity. The program received initial funding from the mount hood regulatory commission, which was very critical in the launch of this program. We have also gotten support from the collins foundation, the Oregon community foundation, the Oregon cultural trust, the advanced broadcast solutions, and the Portland film office. These partners, as well as many others, who we are looking to target to support the program in subsequent years, I look forward very much to working with other partners, Like the Multnomah county library,

October 10-11, 2018

and many other organizations like the Oregon film office and individuals to support this particular initiative. I think that it's very clear how film and television intersects with the digital equity in the sense that a lot of these -- obviously, there are digital applications involved in the process of making films and working in broadcast and dealing with translating creative ideas into this very digital space. This increasingly digital space as we recognize it as most of our access to these stories and ideas are increasingly becoming a part of the internet, and not only do we want access to the end use of these particular stories in this concept, but we want to get people involved in creating these stories and developing content and creativity that is authentic to the experiences of people of color here in the Pacific Northwest. I think that one of the things that we are excited about is that we have the opportunity to work with these film-makers to help promote a perspective of Portland that I think many people here locally and also nationally, internationally don't often -- we don't often get to see. That is personally one of my very important aspects of this program is to begin to share with people outside of this community and within this community these stories and ideas. Lastly, I think that this program is, like I said before, I think I mentioned that this program is a cohort model and we want to make sure that this program is sustainability for years to come.

**Wheeler:** Thank you, Mr. Bell. We appreciate you being here.

**Nandini Ranganathan:** Hello, everybody. I am Nandini Ranganathan I'm the executive director of make think code at pnca, Pacific Northwest College Art, and we run an art technology lab that's open to the community. I am here to speak about the incredibly important work being done by the digital inclusion network. We've been members of the din for the last couple of years and attended the din summit this spring, and as a result of this work, we've been able to build really valuable sort of partnerships and collaborations with the community groups, with educational institutions, with technology groups, as well. I want to highlight a couple of examples of the work that we have done, and are doing, and how the partnership helps. This summer we were really excited to partner with metro east community media to create a week long series of workshops called make think media for youth in east Portland. These workshops included sort of games, electronics, and micro-controllers playing with laser cutter fabrication technologies, virtual reality, and the students were really incredibly excited and to experiment with and play with these technologies, and I think that it's really essential that our students and our youth can see themselves as creators in this industry rather than just users of the end products. Access to spaces, to the resources and education, to the technology is really important throughout their education and we are hoping to continue with this partnership over the years, and I think that I want to really talk about how fluency in these technologies and future emerging technologies is really essential to prepare our community for the careers in the future. Access to not just digital networks, but access to creative tools that allow them to design networks, design technology that is, that is relevant to the community rather than technology designed by the others, that they are allowed to use. Another partnership that I wanted to highlight was we met with Missoula at the din summit, they were one of the sponsors at the summit, and they were really excited about the work that the din was doing and wanted to be more involved. We've been working with them to offer workshops in various kinds of web and network coding, technologies and also creating open source augmented reality web experiences. So an important mission for us as make think codes, but also as a community, I think that the tech community in Portland is really excited about sort of open source technology and democratizing this, and I think din allows us to bring various groups, including the tech industry into work on these things. So one of the things that we're going to do is we're going to be hosting with Moz:lla some of the din partners, a series of technology, civil rights and community events from January 7-20, and likely an annual event, we're going to have workshops and digital privacy for the community group,

October 10-11, 2018

with some data science, creative coding, and also conversations on how we use technology to increase voter participation and engagement, so starting to use data and to start getting the community engagement. And the last thing that we want to do is to start doing wikipedia to make it more inclusive and representative resource for various communities. So a couple of examples, and I know that many of the groups are doing amazing work, but I think that I wanted to point out what the din is doing is creating this impressive eco-system of organizations that provide access to this technology, information, and expertise needed to thrive in this digital network world. We are really grateful and really honored to be part of this group and we are looking forward to seeing what we can do together with this collaborative community.

**Wheeler:** Great. Thank you very much. Appreciate it.

**Sachi Weerawardena:** Good morning. My name is Sachi Weerawardena I'm a web specialist and data supervisor with the community works project, and human solutions. Thank you for this opportunity today. So the community works project is the community works project is a coalition of six nonprofit agencies in Portland, and it's contracted with the department of human services to provide job services to participants in the temporary assistance for needy families program. So we have a career center, and I was invited to the summit in may because the human solutions employee was not able to go, so when I got the invite, I didn't know what I was going to. Digital inclusion network sounded interesting. I was excited. This is at a time when I would come up with impromptu classes for the immigrant participants in our program and try to show people how to log into a windows computer. So being at the summit and being exposed to the panel on education, employment and health disparities, I was fascinated it was the first time that I had seen the mayor ted wheeler in person. It was inspiring to me, so thank you. It's nice to know that we are connected because our day-to-day nonprofit work sometimes -- it's hard to see how me trying to show a woman from Kenya to use a computer or to touch a mouse can connect to the bigger holistic picture of what we are trying to do as a network and community. So I was invited to the din meetings monthly after I was gushing to rebecca about how amazing the summit was for me. I walked away with six pages of notes, which I didn't bring today for this, but I did learn a lot and I think that the important piece for me to share with you today is that the din -- the impact on me as an individual direct service provider to people trying to search for jobs is that we forget the things that we take for granted, and the impact that cannot be measured by the tech experts here in the room because last week I was sitting down with someone and trying to show them how a mouse works, and not to use rosetta stone on the computer, but just when you move it around, the pointer moves. It's something that I don't think about, so the digital equity -- it's hard to explain in words, but I am at the forefront of seeing what we expect of a person to go to work, and then be able to access their pay stub, which employers say you can print your w-2, so I just want to say thank you for this opportunity. Thank you to the din network. I am excited to see what partnerships can come out of this. There are limitless opportunities and potential in being able to know that the people that exist in the community, so I hope that this continues, and thank you very much.

**Wheeler:** Thank you for being here and sharing your experience. We appreciate it.

**Julie Reeder:** Good morning, I am Julie Reeder with the state of Oregon wic program. The wic serves about 40% of all pregnant women in the state of Oregon each year, and about 45 to 50% of all pregnant women nationally. We also serve about one in three children under the age of five each year so we have tremendous reach. I think what's really benefited from being part of the din, one is my being able to bring health angle into that. I think we think about digital inclusion into equity is fun things for kids, but certainly coming from my perspective from the health side of things, you know, digital equity and digital inclusion can really be a life or a death matter if all you think about how you access

October 10-11, 2018

healthcare now, right, it's largely going through your healthcare provider's portal, it's dr. Googling, sometimes to find information. It's also things like a car seat warranty, and differences between if you mail it in, you only get a six-month warranty, and if you get online you get a two-year warranty. That really shouldn't be, should it? And so I think that what really has benefited me is to have all the resources and the information. I would say coming from the healthcare world, there is tons of talk about technology, but there is very little to no talk about digital inclusion and digital equity. I think that's just not even on the radar for most groups and so it has allowed me to say both statewide and nationally hold on, you know. This is a wonderful new gadget, but who are we potentially unintentional pushing behind? In wic, there is an assumption that all families are young, and therefore, they are digital natives, and they already know how to do everything. We don't realize that being smart-phone dependent, which is true for lower income families, not having broadband internet Access at home, really can impact your ability to access the systems that increasingly are moving to these online portals, to do everything, much less if you are not a native English speaker, if you don't have any type of -- if you have limits on your data plan and so forth. So I think that it's just really has been an important piece for us. I always have the latest information to bring forward, to the national wic association and other groups to talk about that we need technology is wonderful, but let's do it with thought and intention to make sure that we are not actually pushing our most vulnerable populations further behind.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Appreciate it. Thank you, all of you, for being here and sharing your experiences, were we appreciate it very much. Colleagues, I will entertain a motion.

**Fish:** So moved.

**Eudaly:** Second.

**Wheeler:** We have a motion from commissioner Fish and a second from commissioner Eudaly to accept the report. Karla please calling the roll.

**Moore-Love:** I think there are some more invited speakers.

**Wheeler:** Did we skip somebody? We had a few more. I apologize. It was not on my program. Please come on up. Sorry for that. Welcome, thank you, sorry for jumping the gun on that.

**Sam Pastrick:** Good morning. For the record my name is Sam Pastrick manager, a reach manager with Oregon citizens utility board. I will make my comments very brief here. All of them related in some way to fostering and-or the promotion of city policy to address the digital inequity. Am I ringing here?

**Wheeler:** If you push the mic a little farther away maybe. It's very sensitive.

**Pastrick:** There we go. The first point that cub is a consistent outside advocate for both digital equity action or deap and also the office for community technology. Representing cub, I have attended the inaugural digital inclusion summit in 2014 and as an early digital inclusion network member, and certainly while not a primary author, I did participate in two of the three community-led strategic planning workshops to create the Deap during the fall of 2015. Since that time, I have testified before council, you all, on several occasions to highlight the work in the city either around digital equity and inclusion or information and communications technology policy more generally. Frequently I have leveraged my time before council to encourage timely and strategic action, city action, not only that addresses the digital and equity but also think and plan more holistically about technology policy by emboldening oct, and this message bears repeating today. Last Tuesday council wisely rejected wholly inappropriate meddling on the part of the communication commission into local government affairs as they relate to negotiations of the wireless carriers in their accessing the public rights of way. The resolution was savvy and timely action certainly and cub is generally pleased to see Portland join with other cities as they confront bad fcc policy. Yet, certain other cities, like san jose in particular, had proactively already

October 10-11, 2018

negotiated robust public benefits packages that included needed funds for digital equity work. To be blunt, while the city's action is laudable, it also does, I think, highlight an absence of proactive and coordinated leadership around information and communications technology planning and oversight. This, I am afraid, is a symptom, a direct symptom of oct, until recently, low level within the city's governance structure. Point being, Portland, city of Portland, not san jose, should really lead the nation in funding digital equity work because frankly, it's much easier to defend settled contracts than bring suit against a federal agency like the sec. So if I can leave you all with one key take-away, it's that advancing digital equity work requires proactive, fast action against the onslaught of disruptive technology that's already on our doorstep today, but also that which is surely headed our way in the coming years. To sort through and usher these really complex public policy implications, Portland needs an emboldened and proactive oct. Cub was and still very much is encouraged by oct's move last month to a more elevated location within the city's governance structure, and we're cautiously optimistic that the move does reflect a new strategic direction on the part of the city, and that oct, with council's support, continues to bolster Portland's reputation as a digital equity leader. Thank you.

**Seth Ring:** Hi there, I am Seth Ring with metro east community media, I'm our he director of education and volunteers. I work at metro east proper in Gresham, but I also work at Rockwood diy, which stands for digital inclusion and youth, which is out in Gresham as well, but on the very fringe. A lot of the video that you saw, the roll was from classes that we give. I think you might have seen me do a wielding some smart phones. Speaking of smart phones, I have a video -- or a picture of me and ted wheeler. I don't know if you remember this.

**Wheeler:** You looked good. You looked good.

**Ring:** This is dia de los muertos and I like to tell people about me and my home boy, ted wheeler, so thanks for that and this does have a point that I will get to later. I have learned a lot of things teaching the welcome to computers class at rockwood diy. That mukulaal means cat in Somali. Spasibo means thank you in Russian am I learned that from our smart-phone through seniors class, which we taught in Russian and I learned that I should understand a somalian mother who doesn't want her kid in our music camp because music was banned for a period of time in somalia. All this, and I thought that I was the teacher. Yesterday I attended a forum on transgender inclusion in the workplace. I learned this type of change starts at the top and this is getting back to the photo. I think that it's really important the work that you guys are doing, and I appreciate it. I want you guys to thank you for understanding that digital inclusion is a real issue that requires financial and political resources and to reaffirm what was said earlier. And that your support goes a long way towards empowering underrepresented groups in Multnomah county. So thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Good morning.

**Nili Yousha:** I'm Nili I am the founder and the executive director of outside frame. We train homeless and marginalized youth on how to make movies. I haven't had coffee yet. We will see what comes out, but what I woke up with today is plastics. My boy plastics. Right. Digital inclusion is the future, as it was in the graduate, as plastics was in the graduate, all those years ago. You give a homeless kid a camera and let them tell their story on their own terms. Get that story out there, and the young person is changed forever, but more importantly, the people that see it are also changed forever. Statistics can't change anybody's mind, but seeing somebody talk to you from the heart will. These are the best tools that we can give these young people to bring them into the fold and make, you know, make them the great citizens that they have the potential and definitely the desire to be. It works not just with homeless youth. I came this morning from an alternative school, alliance at benson where we are teaching a workshop. Day one I was dismayed. 20 kids like staring at me. Staring at their phones, but we're on the last day, they were there early

October 10-11, 2018

to like edit their pieces and finish them. Incredible. This year we have shown that this is not just a personal passion or like I am not the only one that thinks this. We work with Oregon state university and trauma informed Oregon and Portland art museum and some other places I am forgetting who have put these people to work. We got them hooked and now they are continuing to work with our fine, fine institutions. So through digital equity, Portland can be a leader in this as well all the other things that were so progressive and a model to the rest of the nation for and having the -- being able to be part of this digital inclusion network and sit at the table with like the people doing this work, obviously, makes us all more than the sum of our parts. So thanks a lot.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Appreciate you being here. Good morning.

**Tim Goodman:** Good morning, mayor wheeler. My name is Tim Goodman, I am the director of government affairs for comcast for the company, Oregon southwest Washington region. First of all, I would like to commend the city's staff from the office of cable and technology for not just doing a job, but for the passion that they have for closing the digital divide. They go above and beyond its something that they care about, and it shows in all of our interactions, whether it's meetings or one-on-one meetings. I just want to express that gratitude for what they put in and in helping to close the divide. A few quick comments from comcast. We are excited to continue our partnership with the city and the other jurisdictions of the mount hood cable regulatory committee. In closing the [inaudible] divide. One of those means is through our internet essentials program which is a program for low income individuals where we provide low-cost internet, \$9.95 a month. We have now connected over 100,000 Oregonians in the past 7.5 years through that program. We are excited to continue the evolvement of that. Just in the past 60 days we have included low income veterans as eligible participants in that program. We are piloting the program for low income seniors in Seattle. We are also piloting a program for homeless students in a school district in Vancouver where we are working with the district to provide internet for those who don't have a consistent and static place to live and go home to, but they are always connected through our wi-fi network. So that said, I have one little plug, comcast this year is the presenting sponsor of the Portland film festival, which begins on October 22. So if you are available for one of the events, please come out and join all of the other great folks for a great event. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Appreciate you being here. Good morning.

**Hector Dominguez, Bureau of Planning and Sustainability:** Good morning. All right. Good morning mayor, commissioners. My name is Hector Dominguez I am the open data coordinator for the smart cities program in the bureau of planning and sustainability, and I am a proud member of the inclusion network where definitely -- well, I am really proud to be part of the network, and share and learn from all these different organizations. Our open data program is definitely having the benefit of these organized entities. Also for any future initiatives of the work, the open data is constantly having. For instance, right now we are in a journey around privacy and other protection, and we are moving towards having a better, a more community engagement. When we relied on these network and those communities, to get that connection with our different communities in the city. In addition to that, the digital equity action plan has played a critical role on guiding our smart cities priorities framework which is the first cornerstone for our work and the second is privacy. Challenges ahead for our communities are not trivial. Considering the needs for developing the internal capacity and training for what the future work looks like. Digital inclusive network will become an important entity to promote technology in the emergent fields of technology, like data, artificial intelligence, smart devices, clean energy, cloud based manufacturing and other industrial opportunities that rely on the information. The digital inclusion network can play an essential part on bringing those that have been left behind to the front row and take advantage of those opportunities. Just to finish and

October 10-11, 2018

empower an informed society is less vulnerable to all the digital abuse that we have been hearing recently and we can definitely capitalize all together in what technology has to offer. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you very much. Does that complete -- that completes it. Very good. So we have the motion on the table and seconded. Karla, please call the roll. Thank you for your testimony.

**Eudaly:** I want to thank everyone for coming today and thank you for the vital work that you are doing. I want to congratulate you on being on track with 100% of the strategic actions. We don't necessarily hear that all the time at the city council. Your work is very closely aligned with and essentially to the work that we are doing in the office of community and civic life, so we certainly look forward to working with you. I want to agree with Mr. Pastrick that the office of community technology needs to continue to be elevated. They have a standing invitation to join my bureau. Wink. Wink. Nudge. Nudge. I also want to rise to the challenge of meeting or exceeding san jose because I don't like hearing about other cities that are doing a better job than we are in this arena. I am committed to helping to move the digital equity agenda forward through pbot, which is my other bureau, which is obviously, involved in negotiations around our new wireless networks, specifically 5g, and just want to reiterate that the digital inclusion is a moral and economic imperative for Portland. It is a fundamental equity Issue, when I look at the numbers of who participated in the free geek, free computer program, you know, not surprisingly we see communities of color over, overrepresented in this group, but what was especially striking to me is that 43% of the people who participated have no high school education. And how vital it is for that population of people to have free, easy, constant access to the internet where they can access free college programs and also the household income nearly 90% of these individuals are earning less than \$30,000 a year, which we know is about half of what you need to earn to live here comfortably. So we are reaching a really vulnerable underserved group of people. I am really happy to see that. So finally, I will vote aye.

**Fritz:** Thank you mayor. What a great presentation. Thank you to everybody who participated. I am really excited about this work. I started the digital equity inclusion plan, and mayor Sam Adams, commissioner Saltzman was the one who brought it to council and mayor haes. Commissioner Saltzman's long-time chief of staff Brendon Finn and mine, Tim Crail, were both very involved in creating it. Thanks to comcast for funding that plan and making, and in particular for funding the outreach to underrepresented and underserved communities. The plan, itself is, based on what do the people most affected want and need rather than what do we think that they need. So I am really excited for how it is working out. Thank you to the previous director, david olsen, and the deputy director mary beth henry. Mary beth was in the video, and I think that she encapsulated it very well that we cannot afford to now do this. It's too expensive, and I am very grateful that we are working on this. Thanks for metro east for a brilliant video. Thank you. That was really inspiring. Thanks that to open signal for carrying channel 30 every week, and for collectively those two being the community media, nonprofits, that really make, help to make this happen. Thank you to the office for community technology, specifically Julie Omelchuck and Rebecca gibbons for a great presentation. I concur that it needs to be a stand alone bureau, not within any other bureau because it is so important. It's managed well under the previous system, that is going to be a return to the former glory as a stand alone and I am very excited about that. I appreciate Multnomah county and the library district for your partnership and also the mount hood cable regulatory commission. I was struck during the video that there was probably a lot of people watching on channel 30, like my parents in law who live at cherry wood village, hi, mom and dad, and some of whom are remarkably good at technology as are my parents and others like me who need a son or daughter or somebody to tell them, have you tried unplugging it, mum. I have got that

October 10-11, 2018

one now, but I do need help. So unfortunately our catlin gabel students had to leave, but I hope the office of community staff will reach out to that class and invite them to be volunteers. I think the kind of thing that it's not -- I noticed in the video and was writing down step by step, and something goes wrong, and if you are like me it's like no, what do I do. So it will be nice to have more volunteers. There is a lot of time and talent that's available in the community, such great community partnerships, I am sure that others thought, I could help to teach that to call that, I could help fund that, so please call 823-4000 and they will connect you with the office of community technology and volunteer because this is something that is vital for the whole community, and it's a really exciting thing that everybody can benefit from. Aye.

**Fish:** Well, it's a great report. I and my colleagues learned a lot this morning. Thanks to everyone who joined us. I have one pet peeve, and I start with a compliment. When we talk about removing barriers, one way is we make sure that the reports that we issue are legible to people over the age of 50. In fact, the font used in this, I think, is the correct font, but I will say that on page 1, and on page 5 it defaults to really very small font and I would add a page in lieu of trying to cram everything because the truth is that people over 50 can't read the most important page of your report, which is progress. So with that, psa, I just want to say that it is an outstanding report and today is a day of firsts. For some of you here earlier, we had someone who showed up for council communications that testified that the city was doing something right, so that was a first. We had some during this presentation that took out their smart-phone and showed a picture of ted wheeler, and that's a first. So I think we have got something to build on today.

**Wheeler:** He admitted that in public, no less.

**Eudaly:** Getting the Mozart concerto.

**Fish:** And the Mozart concerto was interesting, and when we get the demand in the mail from the attorneys for the producers of that video asking for royalties, we will take that up with our friend. But this is really good work. I have two kids, one who lives at home, age 14, who is -- and my son is really smart about technology, unlike his dad and whenever I have a problem, he helps me through it. When I have a problem with my phone or my computer, you know, it's extremely frustrating because not only are you disconnected from the internet and from the sources of the information, but you know, for those of us who live busy lives, it's hard to find a time to fix the problem so thinking about a future where we democratize access to technology, and we also make it easier for people to get the training and the support that they need to be effective with technology, is really important. So thank you for your good work, mayor, and for this presentation. I am pleased to vote aye.

**Saltzman:** Well, I want to thank Julie and Rebecca for their leadership on this effort. It's been very impressive that you have developed a plan and then come back, I don't know if it was a year later, but it seems like a year later, and tell us you completed a lot of the items, action items. That's really good. And I think one of those items that has benefited our city and the work of the office for community technology in general is helping our fire bureau to be digitally included. They now, thanks to grants through the mount hood cable regulatory commission, have all the stations fully online, and it often surprises people to know that they did not before. So thank you for your help in that regard and thank you for the good work. Aye.

**Wheeler:** I first want to thank the staff and the guests who made their presentations today. They were great presentations. I think that we heard it very, very good composite of the benefits of this kind of program, and I want to thank you for all your work in year two of Deap. Digital equity means having access to affordable, high-speed internet, a device to connect, And the know how to navigate in a digital world, which is, of course, what we all live in today. As commissioner Eudaly and I recently expressed to the bureau of transportation, the office for community technology and other bureaus, digital inclusion, I

October 10-11, 2018

believe, is a moral and economic imperative for the city of Portland. We recognize this across city bureaus and commissioner's offices in the work that we all do as a city. Evolving and growing our city and adapting how we serve our residents is an ever, in an ever increasing digital society. While many of us understand the value of technology and have the means to access it, there is way too many of our residents and neighbors who do not. And for these residents who often representative some of the most vulnerable populations, I believe that it is really important we come together to identify and how we can best reach and serve them. That's what this program continues to do and what it will continue to do in the future. So thanks to all of you. I vote aye. The report is accepted. Thank you. [gavel pounded] next item, please. Let's go to time certain 1040. If you could read 1047 and 1048 together, please.

**Item 1047.**

**Item 1048.**

**Wheeler:** Colleagues, at the last hearing we tentatively voted to approve the hearings officer recommendation and the applicants final proposal with modifications and additional conditions. We asked staff to come back with the revised findings to reflect those modifications and conditions. So today we need to do two things before we pass both items on for a final vote next week. First of all, we need a motion to tentatively approve the revised findings for item 1047, and then we will take a tentative vote on that motion. Secondly, because this is a comprehensive plan map amendment, our final decision is made by ordinance. We need to amend the ordinance for items, excuse me, for 1048 to include the new conditions and the revised findings. This is a non-emergency ordinance, so we will come back for a final vote on both items next week. Do I have a motion and a second to tentatively approve the revised findings?

**Fish:** So moved.

**Fritz:** Second.

**Wheeler:** A motion from commissioner Fish. We have a second from commissioner Fritz. Karla, please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Aye. **Fritz:** Aye. **Fish:** Aye. **Saltzman:** No.

**Wheeler:** Aye. The motion pass says. Now do I have a motion and second to amend the ordinance including the addition of findings as exhibit a has shown in the amendment documents distributed by the council clerk?

**Fish:** So moved.

**Fritz:** Second.

**Wheeler:** Motion for commissioner Fish, a second from commissioner Fritz.

**Eudaly:** Aye. **Fritz:** Aye. **Fish:** Aye. **Saltzman:** No.

**Wheeler:** Aye. The motion passes. Both items are continued to a final vote on October 17 at 10:35 a.m. As a reminder to those here for this item, the record will remain closed. So we will go to the regular agenda. Item 1055, please, Karla.

**Item 1055.**

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Saltzman.

**Saltzman:** Thank you, mayor. I wanted to make one brief statement. Since our hearing last week, we have heard from Portland public schools that they strongly support the placarding and tenant notification ordinance but have concerns over the timing of getting the placards up by january 1. With the holiday season in full swing at that time and staff members on vacation, this concern is understandable. I believe if the school district notifies all parents of children in an unreinforced masonry school by january 1st, that they have complied with the spirit of the regulation and understand if it takes more time, and I understand, I understand if it takes more, more time to physically get the placards up on the school buildings.

**Fritz:** Commissioner do we have a new deadline to get the placards up?

October 10-11, 2018

**Saltzman:** You know, the bureau of development services is in charge of making sure that all entities comply with us. I think that they will employ some discretion with Portland public schools in particular, but the school district has assured us that they do intend to get them up. They cannot do it by January 1.

**Fritz:** Hopefully by spring break?

**Saltzman:** Yeah.

**Wheeler:** So this is a second reading of a non-emergency ordinance. We have taken testimony. We have heard presentations, so we get to vote. Karla please call the roll.

**Fritz:** And then there were three. Thank you commissioner Saltzman for your assistance on this and thank you mayor Wheeler for your support. Thanks to my colleagues on the council for supporting the amendment I proposed regarding placarding and educational materials that are accessible to all community members, including those with disabilities and those who speak languages other than English. I think that this is an essential component of the placarding requirement, which is education. What are your choices and what are your responsibilities if you choose to enter these buildings, and thank you Jonna Papaefthimiou and the staff at the bureau of emergency management for your willingness to partner with the city bureau and office of equity and human rights to make sure that this information is accessible. I recognize that there are many community members who have concerns about this. I asked the fire chief to get me the information on the 'u' marked buildings, which we heard about last week, which those buildings are so unsafe that it is unsafe for firefighters to enter in the event of an emergency, unless there is -- it is weighing on the balance the risk to the firefighters and the risk to the building occupants. And many of those are still occupied and in use, and others have been turned over to new uses. This afternoon we are going to hear about the historic resources, the Portland historic landmarks commission, and their recommendation to do a historic resources inventory. I will be supporting this budget request because we need to look at which of these unreinforced masonry buildings are, indeed, signature, and we should all be involved in finding ways to save them and which ones actually would probably be better in a higher and better use to be redeveloped. So that's something that I think that we, another question. I appreciate the church leaders who came in and pointed out the challenges of nonprofits. Many of those challenges are shared by the city and other public entities like Portland public schools. We will not benefit from property tax, breaks or other mechanisms. I was cheered yesterday to meet with Elizabeth Edwards, the office of government relations director, who is working with the legislators to put together a proposal for funding in the 2019 legislature. I think it's clear that this was on -- a top priority of the league of Oregon cities whose board I sit on, that everywhere in the state people are recognizing that time is ticking, and the big one is coming, and we are living on borrowed time. If we want to save the buildings, we need to get going on it. I believe this placard thing will not affect the profits. I know that that's not a view shared by the property owners, and that they are very disappointed by this vote. I just don't think that we can continue to kick the can down the road and not do anything and that's one of the reasons I'm supporting this. Thanks to Claire Adamsick on my staff and everybody involved. Aye.

**Saltzman:** I want to thank my colleagues for their support and listening last week to a long hearing and making a decision today. I do think that, you know, one of the requirements of our office is to, you know, really take seriously the issues of life safety for Portlanders, all Portlanders and that's been driven home to me as fire commissioner for the last six years. This is life safety, earthquakes is our most likely disaster, it's the event we train the most for. All our training scenarios center around earthquake response and preparation. Over years the city has gathered the information on unreinforced masonry buildings, which are the most at risk of collapse under major earthquakes. We have this information, and for transparency sake, it is our obligation to provide Portlanders this information through

October 10-11, 2018

tenant notifications and the placards and to respect their ability to make informed decisions and also to make them be aware of their surroundings. And as I said last week, it's really to me, and I really believe this, this is really an obligation to today's 10-year-olds, people who are not at the table during any of these discussions, but these are the people that will be living in unreinforced masonry buildings for the next 20 years before our tougher seismic standards kick in. So giving Portlanders the placards and the tenant notification language helps to build awareness of seismic risk. I can't help but to think that a tenant that walks in and out of their building every day and sees that placard is going to be better prepared if an earthquake hits. They are going to have thought about it. What do I need to do in the event of an earthquake? And also be aware of their surroundings. So I do think that this works to help to improve, as I said, the life and safety of Portlanders. And I think this is why the building owners are opposed to it, it will build the market demand for seismic improvements to our buildings. I understand this is no easy task to building owners, but earthquakes, are not produced by the city. They are produced by an act of god or a natural disaster. We are trying to do what we can do and that is to protect Portlanders. We certainly, you know, we cannot do anything about the seismic risk that we face, and I don't think that it is the city's obligation, while we can go to the legislature and seek funding and other things, it's really not our obligation to fund the seismic improvements that building owners face. I sympathize, but it's not our responsibility. It's their responsibility. So in closing, I want to thank the Portland bureau of emergency management, the bureau of development services, for all of their long, hard work on these issues, toiling in the trenches every day. I wanted to also thank matt grumm from my office for his help in getting this to the finish line, and I believe that this is a, an action that we will be proud of, and we will be glad that we did. Aye.

**Wheeler:** I vote aye. The ordinance is adopted. [gavel pounded] next item. 1056.

**Item 1056.**

**Wheeler:** I am stalling for a minute because I realize this is an emergency item, and I need a fourth. Legal counsel, can I begin with three? It's the vote that requires four, is that correct?

**Denis Vannier, Senior Deputy City Attorney:** Correct.

**Wheeler:** Very good. Colleagues the revenue system replacement is needed. Our current systems are aging. They don't meet modern day expectations, and they are rapidly approaching the end of their useful life. We anticipate being out of support within three years. The integrated tax system project is a top priority for the office of management and finance, omf, and aligns with omf three-year strategic plan specifically with the goal to quote, "adopt 21st century business solutions," unquote. This project aligns with the goals in both the citywide i.t. Strategic plan as well as the Portland plan. The largest benefits are improved customer service on multiple fronts, more modern and less risky support structures, and increased revenue collection for the general fund. The revenue system replacement is needed. Systems are aging. Don't meet modern day expectations and are rapidly approaching the end of their useful life. We anticipate -- I already read that paragraph. That's clever. Authorizing the ordinance allows us to issue the rfp. This will enable the revenue to gather more -- will allow revenue to gather more information and continue planning this critical project, and I am sorry for my sloppy editing skills. Thank you, and welcome for being here.

**Thomas Lannon, Director, Revenue Division:** Thank you very much mayor wheeler. I am Thomas Lannon, the director of the revenue division of the bureau of financial services and joining me is Rachele Gorseger, our integrated tax system project manager. So I am going to talk a bit about the history, about how we got here, and then Rachele will walk you through a very brief power point slide presentation to kind of let you know where we are going in terms of this rfp. So for the past three years, revenue has had a pretty good run in

October 10-11, 2018

terms of home grown, home maintained custom solutions for our tax administration, in 1985, we had a main frame application called vax, and that was used to track very limited and basic taxpayer information. In 1998, we replaced vax with a current business license information system and this platform, which is 20 years old, is reaching the end of its life and going out of support in as little as three years. In 2012 the revenue division received approval from the irs to receive federal taxpayer information. Following several years of planning and follow-on work with the irs to gain additional approvals, we received our first federal taxpayer information in 2015. So for the first time in the history of the program, this gave us a real insight into local taxpayers, individuals and businesses in terms of what they were reporting to the irs, and we use this to administer our local taxes, and in particular to locate the taxpayers who have either not paid their taxes to Portland or Multnomah county, or have underpaid them. While we have federal taxpayer information, and we are using it to identify taxpayers or using it very inefficiently because of the intensive physical and i.t. Security requirements that the irs has regarding safeguarding fti. So to put a number on it, only six of our current 70 employees have access to federal taxpayer information, and really all of them could benefit from using that information. So we are using fti, but we are using it very inefficiently. Access to fti has exposed weaknesses in our homegrown solutions around scalability and effectiveness, and these issues are leading to the loss of revenue because we cannot fully utilize the fti with our current systems. To address these shortcomings and others we requested and received city council approval in fiscal year 2017-2018 to launch the integrated tax system project or again, itf, to explore the replacement of our databases, and this would not just be the business license information system that I spoke of, but all of our platforms, the transient lodging tax, the hotel and motel tax, the arts tax, and other applications all would be replaced with one sweeping commercial off the shelf solution. I would remind the council that those applications -- those programs in sum are the transient lodging, business license tax, total amount of \$435 million of revenue to the city of Portland and Multnomah county every year. Just this side of 50% of our general fund is accounted through these systems that we are contemplating replacing. So we have reached a critical milestone in the project, and we are here before you today to gain your approval to issue an rfp to seek proposals from qualified vendors, and Rachele is here to walk you through the power point and give you a little more information about that.

**Rachele Gorsegner, Office of Management and Finance:** Hi, good morning. Is the power point available right now? Great, thank you. A brief overview, just recapping the items that Thomas said about the integrated tax system. This is a new single tax system that is replacing a portfolio of legacy systems. They are soon expected to go out of support. Thus far we have two rolls, which were created by council's approval of the 17/18 budget. The its project manager role, which is mine as well as the business analysts, and we are working together to research the market, confirm our requirements, and pull this all together into a request for proposals from marketplace vendors. The its project, in terms of the magnitude of this project, we refer to this as a large-scale, multi-year modernization effort. So as Thomas said, we are handling over \$400 million in annual revenue as well as we have over 600,000 active taxpayer accounts that will be impacted by this core system replacement.

**Fritz:** Will the office of community technology -- noticed the Asterix that includes the office of community technology. Will they also be part of this system regardless of whether they, where they end up in the city?

**Gorsegner:** I will defer to you.

**Lannon:** We are exploring that right now. Part of the answer lies in organizationally where oct sit, oct is currently using the city's ebs, or sap system for collections, and so right now

October 10-11, 2018

we have had conversations about having this oct program in the rfp. But it remains to be seen whether or not ultimately they will be implemented there.

**Fritz:** I guess for them and others it makes the new and improved version that's costing a lot of money, it would be good to have as many as possible and have access to it. I am sorry to interrupt you.

**Gorsegner:** Oh, no. Absolutely. So in terms of scope of the project, again as we referenced there is the desire to replace a portfolio of multiple systems with one new single system. The systems we are talking about retiring as a part of this project, bliss, arts, castle which is our application for enhanced services districts, regis which is our application for business permitting and transient lodging, as well as what we call the fatima application. That application does not do core text administration work, however is the application we use to manage federal taxpayer information. In addition to these six core applications, we also have the myriad of smaller applications, which although they don't do the core tax processing work, they handle data that supports that work, such as the mail room application. This full universe of tax applications is currently supported by two individuals, and both of them are nearing retirement. When we started this project, just common sense told us that this time line would be coming up soon. Now that we have gotten into this project a bit, one of the people is going to be retiring in the next year, and the other one has signaled not to, not too long after that he will be looking at retirement. In the scope of this new system, not only are we replacing the existing functionality that we are able to do with our current applications, but we also hope to add on new functionality that will bring us to a more modernized customer service level. Two of those items, the first two on this list, e-filing so right now city of Portland taxpayer can go to [Portlandoregon.gov](http://Portlandoregon.gov) and file a single return, and they can visit multiple times, and each time file a single return, but we do not have the ability to submit your city of Portland tax return with common tax return software packages. Right now if you are using one of those packages and you hit submit and you are filing your federal and state return, you then have to either use paper or visit the Portland website to do the city of Portland return. Modernized e-filing means that we will be able to accept returns through that common tax preparation software package. We also hope to have a more modern tax payer program, right now the city of Portland taxpayer does not have the ability to go to their Portland and see a list of payments they have made to the city or other common customer self service functions, so we are hoping to bring that capability to the city of Portland taxpayer. We also hope to realize improved data analytic functions as well as tom explained about fti integration and how it's limited today. The six people that have access we store the fti in a locked room separate from the main operations of our floor. If we can bring that data out on to our floor and into our daily operations there are so many missed opportunities right now for collection of revenue that we would be able to realize. So with all of those items that I have just discussed, all those come together to bring us increased revenues to the city of Portland. Moving on to cost and schedule, I have explained to you about the scope of the project. In terms of timing and price tag we are currently expecting this project to be roughly 20 to \$30 million. This figure is our all-in figure, it is our payment to the primary vendor. It's payment to supplemental vendors such as quality assurance, change management, those vendors which we have not yet scoped, but we know that some of that will be on the horizon. It's our infrastructure hardware network costs. It is our staff ramp-up cost. This number was determined by talking to other jurisdictions. We have been interacting with them a lot at conferences or reaching out by word of mouth, in terms of oh, they just implemented the system, why don't you go talk to them. So taking those data points of price tags from other jurisdictions and looking at their budgets we extrapolated it to this for our forecast for our budget. For schedule we hope to receive your approval to issue the rfp this month, which would then result in a notice of intent to award

October 10-11, 2018

approximately february of next calendar year and if those fall into place then depending on how long our contracting phase takes, we hope to actually begin the project in the summer of 2019 and move on to rolling out our business tax on the new platform in 2020, arts in 221, and then the smaller taxes we have they will either fit into one of those two releases or be in a third release as well as any other enhancements. You might notice a lot of question marks around these dates and that is because at this point we're making our best guess but when the vendor would actually come on site, one first alertable we requested in the rfp is they produce that project plan and so that is when we would have a lot more clarity on our committed timeline. Moving on to stakeholders, now that I have described to you a little bit about what the parameters are for the project I want to talk a little bit about who stands to have a stake in the project. The first three bullet points I think are fairly self-explanatory. They are the core members of the tax world, if you will. Taxpayers as well as exempt filers. So for instance every single person who pays an arts tax will have their account migrated from the old to the new system. If they pay online or file their exemption they will be interacting with this new system. Tax preparers and cpas, the professional community that supports taxpayers, software vendors of common tax preparation, packages, other stakeholders I'm just going to read down them, but I'm happy to answer questions. City council, any bureaus that benefit from the general fund, revenue employees we're talking about profoundly changing the the way we do business in the revenue division. So, this will changing the nature of the work for several of our revenue employees and that's why also we also have the labor management committee listed as a stakeholder. Technology oversight committee I actually presented to the technology oversight committee in September to introduce this project to them. They have our rfp right now it's currently under their review. So they have been introduced to this project and we expect to be referred to them for oversight by the cto. Additional parties such as Multnomah county or travel Portland, other groups that we collect revenue for, obviously will be stakeholders of this. Arts over eight committee, short term rental platform such as Airbnb also will be interacting with the system. Any questions about the stakeholders? So moving on --

**Wheeler:** I apologize. I'm going to have to leave council early and I have two emergency ones. Can you just hit the main bullet points so that cause I have to be here to vote for some of these.

**Gorsegner:** Sure.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Gorsegner:** Today's ask of council is we're asking you to approve an authorizing ordinance allowing us to issue the rfp. We have talked the risks that we have in terms of continuing as is with our limited resource pool. I would also like to discuss briefly the reputation and integrity risk in terms of if our systems break at some point in the future which we expect would happen with our current status quo there will be a significant loss of public confidence, quality risks, making the decisions in a bad space. Also at risk then lost revenue.

**Fish:** You made a very compelling case for this. Thomas how do we pay for it?

**Lannon:** We need to the get responses back from the rfp so we fully understand the timing of the ask. We don't anticipate the entire 20 to \$30 million in the first year, it'd be spread over multiple years. In terms of the structure we don't have that yet. It would be a general fund ask and then after that how it's financed we don't have that information yet. That would be a subsequent ask. So we're not asking council to weigh in on the budget or the timing of that today.

**Wheeler:** Is there any public testimony on this item? I'm going to shorten testimony to two minutes please. I won't do that to you ordinarily. I apologize.

October 10-11, 2018

**Charles Bridgecrane Johnson:** Understandable. Good morning commissioners Charles bridge crane johnson for the record. He didn't get to tell you about wonderful benefits based funding options that might be available as we move to this. I was glad -- it was not in the two pages of pdf, but it was good to see the technology oversight committee has been briefed and met even though I only have two minutes I'm going to talk about how important this is, it fills our little matrix. We have now used every possible combination of cto, toc, and oct on this project.

**Fish:** Touche.

**Johnson:** One thing sometimes large vendors sap who we already deal with are there -- as you personal interface with members of the technology oversight committee an other tech workers look for ways that this can be docked to certified professionals who may come from a less white, less male background but have the proper certifications to do this type of work on oracle, subcontractors to sap. Definitely we need to move this forward although the end of support usually just means something else could be paid for for a few more years but that would not be a wise investment. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you, sir. Appreciate it. Karla please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** This is great. I encourage you not to let your software go out of support cause that would be terrible. I'm also happy to hear that it will include the arts tax. I personally have had some frustration trying to pay the arts tax online. It doesn't seem to work across all platforms. It's led to me having to pay fees and I think it's probably fueling some of the frustration in the community around that tax. I vote aye.

**Fritz:** I don't often quote former British prime minister Margaret thatcher but in this case there is no alternative. Thank you for your work. Aye.

**Fish:** Thanks for the presentation. We had a work session yesterday when we looked at some of the future costs that we haven't budgeted for and I don't remember this being on the power point, but I think it's important that you talk to tom, our cao and make sure that this 20 to \$30 million ask is in the grid because we have asked for a specific road map for how we can budget for all of the known costs that are going to be hitting the general fund over the next five years. Aye.

**Saltzman:** Thank you. Aye.

**Wheeler:** Yes, this is supercritical. I appreciate the hard work you're putting into this to get all the pieces in order. It's daunting, its large, its complex and as commissioner Fritz noted it's absolutely necessary. I vote aye. The ordinance is accepted. Next item, please.

**Item 1057.**

**Wheeler:** Good morning.

**Matt Gierach, Office of Management and Finance:** Good morning. Matt Gierach from debt management. This ordinance authorizes the city to refinance the limited tax revenue refunding bonds 2009 series a. The 2009 series a bonds were originally issued or refinanced to limited tax revenue bonds 1999 series a, which funded the central city streetcar project. The 2009 series a bonds have option to refinance without penalty on April 1, 2019. Current borrowing rates are below the interest rates requirements of the 2009 series a bond providing opportunity to realize debt savings through the bond maturity of April 1, 2024. Upon authorization the city's debt management division would execute refinancing in january of 2019.

**Wheeler:** Very succinct, thank you. Any questions? Any public testimony on this item?

**Moore-Love:** Two people. Charles bridge crane johnson and Shedrick wilkins.

**Wheeler:** One minute each, please. Good morning. Thank you.

**Charles Bridgecrane Johnson:** Good morning, commissioners thank you again. Charles bridge crane johnson. Just one thing I note, Portland street car ink is independent but since we are involved in their financing here and it looks like from the paperwork this could create as much as maybe a \$300,000 savings, I just want to make sure you people can

October 10-11, 2018

get their voice heard by Portland street car about what is the best way for this change in their revenue funding picture. Does it enable them to fund another driver, maybe improve services on Sunday or something like that. It's not really the scope of the bond committee or you're here to get the best financing deal but it dock into the general budget for Portland street car and I hope we'll be looking for ways that can be quality felt improvements for riders from this financing improvement.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Good morning.

**Shedrick Wilkins:** I'm Shedrick wilkins. I love the eastside street cars. It proves that the intersection of the streetcars going north and south would not slam into traffic. The petroleum bridge is like the golden gate bridge from omsi. I like taking the streetcar from downtown Portland across the trillium bridge to omsi. Going back to city team ministries I read they were rebuilding the track. Streetcars are smaller than light-rail. Then it passes by the Multnomah county. Omsi represents Oregon, not Portland science and then it goes to Lloyd center. It's just great. Whether it crosses the Broadway bridge, maybe they should make more golden gate bridges. It's a great experiment on the east side and demonstrates science in Oregon regardless of what we do here in Portland.

**Wheeler:** Thank you, sir. Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Aye. **Fritz:** Aye. **Fish:** Aye. **Saltzman:** Aye.

**Wheeler:** Aye. The ordinance is adopted. Item 1058, second reading.

**Item 1058.**

**Wheeler:** Colleagues this is the second reading of a nonemergency ordinance, we have already heard a presentation and we have taken testimony on this item. Karla, please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Aye.

**Fritz:** For both this and the previous one I really thank our bond staffing, really outstanding work making sure taxpayers get as much money or save as much money as we possibly can. Aye.

**Fish:** Aye. **Saltzman:** Aye.

**Wheeler:** Bonding is one of those rare issues that nobody pays attention to because it sounds boring when you hear you're going to be talking about bonds, but as we heard on the previous item if you're really smart and tactical in how you use those bonds you can actually save a lot of money and make the public's taxpayers go a lot farther as we saw with the streetcar and the bonding capacity is tremendously important when it comes to capital improvement issues that are weighty in this city. I second what commissioner Fritz said, I think we get top notch advice. I say that not just as mayor but former state treasurer where I always said bonds are sexy. Nothing I have heard today changes my view on that. I vote aye. The ordinance is adopted. Thank you gentlemen, at this point i'm going to turn the gavel over to commissioner Saltzman. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Our next item is 1059, if you could read that Karla please.

**Item 1059.**

**Saltzman:** Commissioner Eudaly.

**Eudaly:** This is a project that will reduce freight congestion caused by train traffic in north Portland. I would like to introduce what I hope I have the name right Marty maloney. Yeah, Right of way specialist to explain the project and answer any questions. Welcome.

**Marty Maloney, Portland Bureau of transportation:** So first I need to actually amend the exhibits that were attached to the ordinance, I'll give that to Karla as well.

**Fish:** Can you move the mic a little closer to you.

**Fritz:** What are the amendments.

**Maloney:** There were a couple. One property we did actually acquire 5.5 extra square footage of property for sidewalk connection. Then on the port property we needed to acquire a small amount more of temporary construction easement as well.

October 10-11, 2018

**Fritz:** Have the property owners been notified of this change?

**Maloney:** Correct.

**Fritz:** Move the amendment.

**Eudaly:** Second.

**Maloney:** Good morning, commissioners. My name is Marty Maloney with pbob right of way. The agenda item in front of you is to authorize eminent domain authority as well as to offer just compensation to property owners. The project will design and construct a roadway over crossing to elevate north river gate boulevard over the existing union pacific railroad tracks between north tunnel and north pearl guard. As part of the project a frontage will be created on the north end to connect the two property owners on the north side of the project. All affected property owners have been notified of the need for the property and have been invited to listen to the agenda hearing -- being read. If you have any other questions I would be happy to answer.

**Fritz:** Have there been any objections?

**Maloney:** Not that I know of, no.

**Saltzman:** Thank you very much. Is there anyone signed up to testify, Karla, or anyone wish to testify?

**Moore-Love:** No one signed up.

**Saltzman:** This is an emergency ordinance. Please call the roll.

**Moore-Love:** Is this on amendments first?

**Saltzman:** Okay. Yes on the amendments first.

**Eudaly:** Aye. **Fritz:** Aye. **Fish:** Aye.

**Saltzman:** Aye. Amendments passed. Now on the main ordinance.

**Eudaly:** Thank you for being here Mr. Maloney. I vote aye.

**Fritz:** This is an important project I also ask are the property owners okay with this. Obviously the city has to be very careful exercising eminent domain and making sure people have been notified and have the opportunity to object. I think it will benefit these properties and I'm assuming that's why they are not objecting. Sometimes there are tax benefits going the condemnation route rather than the sale, so I understand that. Aye.

**Fish:** Aye.

**Saltzman:** Aye. The ordinance is adopted. Karla if you could read 1060, please.

**Item 1060.**

**Saltzman:** Commissioner Fritz.

**Fritz:** Thank you, president Saltzman. As the new commissioner in charge of the water bureau this is a fascinating topic. Thank you, and thank you commissioner Fish, for your excellent stewardship over the water bureau over the last five-plus years. Lead in the water is something we're all concerned about that we want to make sure we have safe drinking water and as we know the source drinking water in the Bull run and in grand water is lead free. What's interesting there's many interesting things about this and I'll get to the presentation shortly. I hope everyone else will be interested too. In 1960 the acceptable level of lead exposure was 60. I forget what the units are on that, but in 2010 it dropped to eight and it's now zero. As we have become more aware of the issues it's become even more crucial that all of us are aware of lead hazards and what we can do to reduce them and something I have learned is all users in Portland may be at risk for this, so all of us need to take universal precautions. So with that I will turn it over to Scott Bradway Bradway, the program manager of the water quality division and Gabe Solmer the deputy director.

**Gabe Solmer, Portland Water Bureau:** Thank you so much commissioner Fritz I'm Gabe Solmer the deputy director of the water bureau and with me is Scott Bradway, who is our water quality information program manager and although this is just reauthorization of a contract we thought we would take the time to give you more information about the

October 10-11, 2018

program and how it's been built over the years and how it's changing in the future. I'll turn it over to Scott.

**Scott Bradway, Portland Water Bureau:** Thank you, Gabe. Thank you, commissioners. Scott Bradway with the Portland water bureau. First to put this ordinance in context I would start with background on lead particularly here in Portland, so here in Portland we're fortunate we never used lead service lines. This is generally a source of lead in drinking water we hear about throughout the country in the news, in the media. We did however use for a period of time short lead pipes called pigtailed or goose necks. We removed all those known pigtailed back in the '90s. So that leaves us as the main source of lead in drinking water in Portland to be copper pipes that were joined with lead solder in our homes. This is most commonly found in homes in our area built between 1970 and 1985. In addition to the lead solder you occasionally find that home plumbing fixtures installed prior to 1985 can also be a source of lead in drinking water. The important part is the greatest source of exposure to lead in our community is from lead paint. Lead paint was commonly used on homes up until 1978 when it was banned. Throughout the years Portland water bureau has been working to remove lead from our system. We worked with the state of Oregon in 1985 to pass the Oregon lead ban which was about a year ahead of the federal regulations. As I mentioned, in the '90s we worked to identify and remove all of the pigtailed from our system and then in the 2000s we realized that some of these large meters in our system, these older large meters, had lead components to them so we made it a priority to identify, remove and replace these meters that served our populations that are at highest risk. That would be schools, community centers, daycares, large apartment buildings and hospitals. So when it comes to lead in drinking water there was a federal regulation of the lead and copper rule passed in 1992 this requires drinking water systems to provide corrosion control treatment to reduce levels of lead and copper in drinking water. In 1994 the Portland water bureau completed an optimized treatment study. Recommendations of that study were to increase the pH of our drinking water to 9.0 and to begin treating for addition of alkalinity to as our optimized treatment. However this would have required the construction of expensive new treatment facility and considering what was believed at the time that lead in paint was the greatest source of exposure and contributing to childhood lead poisoning city council directed water bureau to investigate alternatives for a comprehensive approach to addressing exposure to lead. In 1997 the water bureau proposed comprehensive lead hazard reduction program that approved by the state has optimized corrosion control treatment and has served as our compliance approach to this regulation since that time. The lead hazard reduction program is a four-part program. It includes water treatment and monitoring, education and testing for lead in water, public education and community outreach for all sources of lead in the community, and the funds for that public education outreach are used as matching dollars for a housing bureau grant from housing and urban development to mitigate lead paint hazards in low income residents. This graph here demonstrates results of our regulatory monitoring that we complete twice each year. As you can see in the yellow bars on the left of the graph that is before we began treating our drinking water since treating the blue bars you can see we had significant reduction of lead in drinking water more than 60% levels of lead. So we have had some success with our own drinking water. The red line that you can see across there represents the action level that was established by federal regulations for lead in drinking water and that we're occasionally over that action level. These results are not results from the average home in our community. These are from homes that we know they have lead solder and the lead solder was put in the last two years before lead solder was banned and that these samples are collected after minimum of six hour stagnation time, so they are indeed the worst of the worst of the worst conditions for collecting samples and are meant as a way to track effectiveness of treatment and not represent the

October 10-11, 2018

lead in water levels in the community as a whole. The other part of our program is our education and testing about lead in water. We provide any customer that requested a free test kit to see if they are exposed to lead in water. As you can see from this graph in 2015 and 2016 when lead and water was in the news because of flint and was going on with Portland public schools the number of requests from our customers skyrocketed. Since then we have continued to do extra outreach and education to our customers and what those levels of request have come down. We're still seeing a much higher level of requests than normal. In addition to providing free testing for customers we also do education, we also do freight testing for schools. We have tested all our city-owned facilities and we're providing free testing at child cares to meet the new state mandated regulations for child care testing. We inform outreach to our customers. We educate our customers on how simple steps they can reduce their exposure to lead. We reach out to who is most at risk, those children and pregnant people and people who live in homes between 1970 and 1985, again the are homes most likely to have lead solder in their plumbing. We have been doing outreach to multifamily units as they don't normally receive a bill from the water bureau. Each year we include a message on our bills and insert a brochure in each of the bills to educate people about lead in water and we include information in our annual water quality report sent to every home in the city. Other outreach we do to try to reach out to underserved communities. We attend community events, such as a fix it fairs, Sunday parkways, home buyer fairs, jade market and good in the hood. This shows a summary of results of the home testing that we have performed. As you can see when you're looking at all homes across the city the average lead content in lead drinking water level and again these are worst case tests first thing in the morning after the water has been sitting in the pipes all night, the average water level is two parts per billion only about 2% of homes exceed that federal action level. When we look at what we've identified as our high risk homes those built between 1970 and 85, you can see they are at increased risk but that's sometime about an 8% of those homes that exceed the lead action level.

**Fritz:** Just pause right there cause I want to point out to my colleagues and people watching at home even if your home was built before 1970 or after '85 your risk is not zero. For those of you like me who thought my home was built after that, i'm good, we do need to pay attention to things like cleaning the aerators in the faucets and looking to see if we have brass fittings cause there's lead in brass, those kinds of things.

**Bradway:** Exactly. Until 2014 you could still have to 8% lead in brass components. What I considered lead free it was still present. The third component of our lead hazard reduction program is our community education and outreach, this is a multifaceted approach to educate our citizens and customers about all the sources of lead exposure. This includes since 2004 it was a list of accomplishments of things we've done, outreach to tenants, attending workshops, landlord outreach, soil testing, information to new and expecting mothers, blood level testing, it's a wide ranging broad program. For this coming year or current year fiscal year 2018-19, we have awarded grants to the community alliance of tenants for outreach to tenants about the hazards of lead and how they can work with their landlords to remediate the hazards, community energy project provided workshops to the community on reducing exposure to lead, fair housing council to provide outreach to landlords about their responsibilities for lead exposure, growing gardens to perform testing in soils for gardeners, Multnomah county health department they manage the lead line, which is an information referral service for all sources of lead as well as intaking of many of our lead and water tests request. They also perform education, they perform community blood lead level testing and home investigations when there's an elevated blood lead level case in a child and we provide funding are to Portland public schools for paint stabilization projects in those schools that serve children under six and early education facilities. As commissioner Fritz mentioned, the kind of level of concern for blood lead levels has been

October 10-11, 2018

coming down over the years. In the '90s when this program at hrp was developed and put into place that level of concern was around 10 milligrams per deciliter and since then we have learned there's no safe level of exposure to lead in water or any sources of lead. As a result we realized there's an increased health benefit to further reduce the levels of lead in drinking water so in 2014 we began a water quality corrosion study. The outcomes of that study had several recommendations. Those included doing some interim lead reduction actions to further increase the ph of our drinking water to 8.2, which is the highest we can currently go with our existing facilities. That we should perform a corrosion control pilot study to look at further increasing our treatment and construction of treatment facilities to further reduce lead in water and we entered into a compliance schedule for that improved corrosion controlled treatment that should be in place no later than April of 2022. Earlier this year we completed that corrosion pilot study the recommendations from that study were to further adjust the ph in drinking water and begin adding alkalinity adjustment to stabilize that ph throughout our system. That ph adjustment recommendation was to increase it to 8.5 and to add an alkalinity level of 25 milligrams per liter. This will be done by the addition of soda ash as well as carbon dioxide. These treatment facilities will be constructed outside of sandy. Finally until those facilities are in place, we'll be doing an interim lead reduction plan these are extra actions to try to further protect the public from exposure to lead in drinking water. As mentioned we have increased our ph to 8.2. We're performing targeted flushing in areas of poor water quality to maintain higher levels of quality and reduce corrosion. We're increasing our unidirectional flushing program significantly to flush built up sediments in our system that will help reduction of lead in water.

**Fritz:** Can you explain what unidirectional flushing is.

**Bradway:** As an unfiltered system, water looks clear, there are fine sediments that come into our system and over the years they settle into the pipes. These sediments as they build can affect the water quality in areas where the water sits for extended periods of time, it can decrease the ph making it slightly more corrosive. So by going in and doing what we call unidirectional flushing and that's where you adjust the valves in the system to increase the flow velocity of a pipe to throw water out through hydrants you can actually clear the built-up sediments out its kind like a pressure washing of the inside of our pipes, so it clears out those built-up sediments that have been in our system for a long period of time. We're also doing some enhanced education and outreach as I mentioned we're reaching out to multifamily units, we have begun sending an insert to any customer that moves to Portland, opens a new account or moved into a new home within Portland informing about the hazards of lead in drinking water and what you can do to decrease your exposure and request a test. Of course we're going to be continuing our lead hazard reduction program as our compliance into our treatment is in place. With that, if you have any questions.

**Saltzman:** No questions? Anyone signed up to testify?

**Moore-Love:** One person. Shedrick J Wilkins.

**Shedrick Wilkins:** I believe lead is very toxic and we should get to the point where we don't -- lead comes from an ore. One thing I know about lead is that it's good to protect from radiation like x-rays, lead vests. Mrs emit radiation and so I think if we do get this lead pipe and stuff like that, we should encourage maybe a Portland entrepreneur to make lead vests. When you get this lead make sure you know where it's at. That's one thing about lead pipes, no one knows where it's at. You have to get into the wall, find it, and stuff like that and that it's not necessarily -- it's a toxic material that can be used for good things. I'm not the one that runs out of the room when I get a dental x-ray and I have on the little dealey bob, but it's important to know where it's at and I also know that it's very bad for children to drink lead or toxic materials. The federal government has some good solutions.

October 10-11, 2018

If you're on food stamps and you're a child you can get bottled water. I can buy bottled water on food stamps sometimes. It's a little thing. I go around when I get food stamps I see what I can buy and can't buy. I can't buy alcohol. Children on low income, which means they're probably in a house that's rented or house with lead pipes, to please drink water from food stamps. Then when they go to school, target the schools because schools are also where kids drink the water. So i'm just giving you a federal solution. You can also buy candy on food stamps. But anyway which means you go to dentist with the lead vest. Children also have a smaller body mass. Their system is not well developed to get rid of the lead out of their body. That's why it causes mental retardation. Our bodies are much larger so help the children first. Please drink bottled water whether it's free or not.

**Fish:** If I could ask a question of Scott, that prompts a question. What we learned a few years ago is that the water fountains in our school districts were the greatest at risk because of the plumbing features. Am I correct that I read somewhere at least Portland public schools have completed replacing all the at-risk water fountains?

**Bradway:** They are working through all of them. Most are back online or I believe every school that's accessible to children is back in service and available. They are back drinking tap water, no longer drinking bottled water provided by the schools.

**Fish:** The second question I have, one of the charts you gave us showed the spike when flint happened and there was a lot of press about water safety but the bar showed that we tested much fewer than the requested. How do you explain the delta?

**Bradway:** We mail out a test to anyone who requests it and it up to the customer to actually complete and return that test.

**Fish:** So they had 14,000 or whatever requested but of those who then submitted we did all the tests for people that submitted.

**Bradway:** Correct. We test any sample that gets returned back to us. Assuming it's collected in the proper manner. We see a 50, 60% return on our test kits we send out.

**Fish:** Well also colleagues we had a presentation over the summer about project search and our efforts to create opportunities for people with intellectual and developmental disabilities. There was a young woman from that program who was responsible for packaging all the materials that we send to people including the testing kit. She really did a great job and I think on some days got more than 100 of the packages fully stuffed and ready to go. It's an example of where taking something that we do in a bureau, carving it out, creating a work opportunity for someone with a disability results in a win-win. Thank you for an excellent report.

**Bradway:** Welcome.

**Saltzman:** Thank you. This moves to second reading next week.

**Fritz:** before you move on could I make some comments? Thank you very much. I want to stress that there are things we can all do to reduce lead hazards and that once you do those things, the water is entirely safe to drink. I would not waste your food stamps on buying bottled water besides which it tastes nasty and our Portland water doesn't. Learn other things that you can do, there are various grants available through as was listed community alliance of tenants and others. I personally am going to be doing more diligent flushing of my pipes in the morning, cleaning out my faucets, which has not been done in at least 30 years. So back in the old days when I did my nurse's training we didn't always wear gloves when working with patients. What we termed universal precautions came in, that you don't know what you don't know so you wear gloves when doing patient care. Similarly we need universal precautions in our drinking water and despite the fact it's safe to drink in most instances as long as you do what you're supposed to do. I do also want to thank the water bureau for those grants including \$50,000 a year for five years to Portland parks and recreation to help with their remediation efforts. I noted in an email last week that all of the paint, even the paint that's covered up in playground equipment in the

October 10-11, 2018

Portland parks and recreation system has now been removed if it ever had lead in it and that's a great accomplishment. We do learn by the mistakes of the past at least we should. I appreciate what you have taught me over the last month.

**Eudaly:** I would like to make a comment. As we move forward with considering mandatory inspections for rental properties I just want to put on the record that we should certainly include lead testing, especially for the multifamily developments which as we have heard typically won't receive a water bill and get a lot less information and notice about the issue.

**Fritz:** Thank you, I'm glad you mentioned that. It was on my list of things to say because we're looking into that. And unfortunately what happens now with point of sale is that because there might be lead in any structure, sellers check the box that there might be, which isn't that helpful and we're looking into how could we get to those homes that are most at risk and make sure that not only new homeowners, also renters, are notified at the point of lease and not just with a checked box there may be lead in this thing. Obviously we're thinking along the same lines. Thank you.

**Saltzman:** Great. We'll move on to our last item this morning. 1061.

#### **Item 1061**

**Saltzman:** Commissioner Fish.

**Fish:** Thank you, Mr. President. Colleagues this project is the latest part of the neighborhood to river program that as you know combines great infrastructure such as sewer pipes with green solutions such as green streets. The project will address about 18,000 feet of sewer pipes in the areas in serious need of upgrade and it will install 94 green street planters. With us today are Kerry Rubin, principal engineer, Brandon Wilson, principal engineer, both from the bureau of environmental services, with a brief presentation, welcome.

**Kerry Rubin, Bureau of Environmental Services:** Thank you, commissioner. My name is Kerry Rubin with the bureau of environmental services I'm joined by Brandon Wilson. We're here today seeking authorization for professional design services for our project that would address undersize and aging sewer pipes. What I will do is give you some background on the project as commissioner Fish mentioned this is part of our neighborhood to the river program. The authorization focuses on the pipes and the green street portions of this program, but it's important to note that those elements work in concert with our work with private residences on stormwater management. Many times in the form of residential rain gardens. It also works with our tree planting efforts, our outreach and education efforts for residents and community partners. Many times through our neighborhood projects focused on improving native vegetation. So while we'll be talking about pipes and green streets it's important to know all of these things package together in this area ultimately for clean rivers. With that I will hand it over to Brandon.

**Brandon Wilson, Bureau of Environmental Services:** Thank you, Kerry. Brandon Wilson, engineer at bes. The project location that we'll discuss today is comprised of two areas, inner east side Portland roughly bound by 14th to the west, 32nd to the east, Everett to the north and Hawthorne to the south. The anticipated mwesb participation rate exceeds the public goal of 20% for subcontractors. This is a primarily a capacity driven project aimed to resolve risk of street flooding like the street flooding shown in the pictures coming out of the manholes as well as basement sewer backups. We anticipate upsizing pipes for capacity and replacing those in poor condition. We also plan to install several new sewer extension mains as well as green streets as mentioned. Our public involvement representative for bes is debbie casselton. We anticipate several meetings and mailings with neighbors and businesses. We anticipate a smooth public involvement process as we have been working in this basin for some time, for several years, including basin wide stormwater education as part of the neighborhood to the river program Kerry was

October 10-11, 2018

discussing. Again with your approval today we'll authorize a contract to begin design with our selected consultant. Other key information is on the screen. Are there any questions?

**Saltzman:** No questions apparently. Very good. Anyone signed up to testify or wish to testify on this?

**Moore-Love:** No one signed up.

**Saltzman:** This is also a nonemergency so it will move to second reading next week and we are adjourned until 3:30 p.m.

**At 11:45 a.m. Council recessed.**

October 10-11, 2018  
**Closed Caption File of Portland City Council Meeting**

This file was produced through the closed captioning process for the televised City Council broadcast and should not be considered a verbatim transcript.

Key: \*\*\*\*\* means unidentified speaker.

**October 10, 2018 3:30 pm**

**Wheeler:** Good afternoon we are in session this is the Wednesday afternoon, October 10, 2018 session of Portland city council. Karla, please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Here **Fritz:** Here **Fish:** Here. **Saltzman:** **Wheeler:** Here.

**Lauren King, Deputy City Attorney:** Hi. Welcome to Portland city council. The city council represents all Portlanders and meets do the city's business. The presiding officer preserves order and decorum during city council meetings so everyone can feel welcome, comfortable, respected and safe. To participate in council meetings you may sign up in advance with the clerk's office for communications to speak briefly about any subject. You may also sign up for public testimony on resolutions or first readings of ordinances. Your testimony should address the matter being considered at the time. When testifying state your name for the record, your address is not necessary. Please disclose if you're a lobbyist. If you're representing an organization please identify it. The presiding officer determines length of testimony. Individuals generally have three minutes to testify unless otherwise stated. When you have 30 seconds left a yellow light goes on. When your time is done a red light will go on. If you're in the audience and would like to show your support for something that is said please feel free to do a thumbs up. If you wish to express that you do not support something please feel free to do a thumbs down. Disruptive conduct such as shouting or interrupting testimony or council deliberations will not be allowed. If there are disruptions a warning will be given that further disruption may result in the person being ejected for the remainder of the meeting. After being ejected a person who fails to leave the meeting is subject arrest for trespass. Thank you for helping your fellow Portlanders feel welcome, comfortable, respected and safe.

**Wheeler:** Thank you and I just want to remind people if there's anyone waiting for 1062, the southwest corridor light-rail project preferred alternative, that's been rescheduled to November 1st at 2:00 p.m. Time certain. Karla can you please read our one item for this afternoon, item 1063.

**Item 1063.**

**Wheeler:** I would like to remind people this is a report. There will be invited testimony but there's not open public testimony given that it is a report. It's a pleasure to introduce the 2018 Portland historic landmark commission state of the city preservation report. The first item of business today, of course, is to thank our dedicated volunteers who serve on the commission. This commission is a significant time commitment. It meets twice a month and they review land using cases and provide design and policy advice. They are dedicated, hard working group of people that include kirk ranzetta, kristin minor, Maya Foty, matthew roman, wendy chung, annie mahoney and Ernestina Fuenmayor I probably didn't pronounce that right. Close enough? Thank you. Could you possibly just stand up so that we can recognize you and I would like to suspend the rules for just a moment. Thank you. [applause] thank you for your service. I also understand that former commission chair Ranzetta will be presenting today recently retired after eight years of service on this commission and I want to acknowledge his dedication to the city. This commission will be presenting their seventh report before the city council, but they have been operating in the city of Portland since about 1969, providing leadership and expertise on maintaining and

October 10-11, 2018

enhancing Portland's historic and architectural heritage. This report comes at a very important time when the city is under pressure for increasing building density in the desire to maintain Portland's unique character and they are often seen as being in conflict with one another. These neighborhoods deserve the appropriate protection and predictability of quality infill that meets our density goals and inevitable growth while also meeting our goals for historic preservation. I look forward to hearing more today from the commission members and invited testifiers and am committed to supporting the commission in all of its efforts. Former commission chair Kirk Ranzetta and Kristin Minor, if you want to come forward, I believe you are going to kick off our presentation.

**Kirk Ranzetta:** Thank you commissioners for the opportunity to present the 2018 state of the city report for the Portland historic landmarks commission. I am the outgoing chair and Kristin Minor who I hope will be here in a few minutes is going to be the presiding chair for hopefully the very long future of the commissioner. There she is right now.

**Wheeler:** Perfect timing.

**Fritz:** Magnificent entry.

**Kristin Minor:** Sorry

**Ranzetta:** As the state of the city is really meant to provide a summary of the previous year in terms of the accomplishments and some of the challenges that the landmarks commission has undertaken. I would like to also thank my fellow commissioners for the service that they have been providing and the support they provided they chair over the years as they have really -- it's been a team effort in terms of pulling the report together and to working on various issues that have faced the city's historic resources. But just to kind of back up for a second and explain a little bit of what we do, the landmarks commission reviews type 3 alterations, demolitions and new construction in historic districts. We make recommendations to city council particularly in adoption of new guidelines and districts. Type 4 demolition reviews. There we go. We also provide advice on historic preservation matters where we serve essentially as advocates for the city's historical resources and we work very closely with the design commission, the hearings officer, planning and sustainability commission, Portland development commission, Portland city council, city bureaus and other committees. We also assist in establishing removing or recommend landmark designations, we review national register nominations to forward to the state advisory commission. We initiate and coordinate preservation outreach programs within, outside the city and we could not do that without some very dedicated staff members and I would like to just also thank Hilary Adam and Spencer -- sorry, Brandon Spencer-Hartle sorry I always want to say his last name first. For all their help over the past several years that they have been supporting the commission. In terms of what we're seeking from the city council for the upcoming year, it's to let the landmarks commission be a part of the solution to some of the city's most pressing problems and we can affirmatively state we're not an enemy of increased density or affordable housing. What we're really after I think is development that is sustainable but also is compatible with the existing city fabric. We also really when looking at the urm ordinance we do think that the mandatory requirement is important but we definitely are looking for the for incentives in terms of helping property owners comply with this new regulation. This will be I think the eighth year that I can remember that we have asked city council to fund the hri. As you can see on the map on the right, the lents neighborhood, lents is one of the -- has had some of the highest level of demolitions that have occurred over the past ten to 15 years, and it's one of the least represented communities in our hri.

**Fritz:** Could you tell people what hri stand for?

**Ranzetta:** Sure it's the historic resources inventory. The inventory was first done in 1984 and has not been touched since then. So it's approaching over 30 years old that the city is essentially making planning decisions on data that is ancient in some ways. Historical in an

October 10-11, 2018

of itself. We're also asking to really have city council's backing when we really try to serve as advocates for Portland's unique places. We see that the residential infill project and what's bhbd?

**Minor:** Better housing by design.

**Ranzetta:** Thank you. I forget the acronyms. It should allow for new development to reflect, but it should reflect the existing character in which it's built. Our main priority is to encourage rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of the existing built fabric. We find significant value and affordability in resources that we already have.

**Minor:** I'm going to just briefly talk a little bit about what we have accomplished in this past year as a commission and as staff, I'm including them as well. So advocacy recommendations and those go to all sorts of legislative projects. We have held 21 public hearings and that includes type 3, some appeals, nominations, et cetera, and staff also performed 54 type 1, 40 type x and 93 type 3s. We all participate in various subcommittees, so those are doing sort of work to forward various legislative projects typically or to serve on other bodies that might be making decisions for the city. We collaborate with the design commission in review. Sometimes sitting together at the dais, sometimes just providing recommendations to each other in writing. We also provide advice and input on various bureau or agency projects and that includes like the upcoming southwest corridor transit project, which is going to be really exciting, and we'll take some careful look from all sorts of bodies including ours and the Burnside bridge project, which we actually saw just a couple hearings ago. Then we also do work with various bodies outside of the city such as collaborating with u of o to create a studio for graduate students in architecture looking at work in an historic district. There's a couple of projects I wanted to highlight for you. One of those is the project at the top here by allied works. This is a replacement for an historic building on northwest 23rd that you might recall was impacted severely impacted by that gas explosion. This building had a very easy path to approval and the reason is that it fits into its context very well and I would like you to kind of note its relatively contemporary design, but the reason it fits into its context so well is that it has a very ordered expression on its façade, it uses extremely high quality materials and detailing, and it celebrates the street level much as the historic buildings in this district do. Then the project below it is a project not in our purview at all and I'm highlighting this just because we also serve as advocates, and try to connect people to make projects like this happen when we can. This is an internal conversion to a multi unit project. I have to say not a lot of neighborhoods can scrape together the funding to save this from the wrecking ball, which is what happened in this case, but we would love to see more incentives overall to allow projects like this to happen. In the coming year, the commission has talked about having several overarching priorities and goals. These are listed as a, b, c, d, and just to go through them briefly, the first one is to ensure that historic preservation benefits all citizens and we really need to recognize and protect important places for various communities that live in Portland and by important places, that doesn't mean the most richly detailed or the most beautiful even of buildings. It means the places that are important to communities. So we need to look at what is most vulnerable because those are being lost.

**Fritz:** By citizens you mean people who live in the city rather than those who are eligible to vote.

**Minor:** Exactly. The second one is to really engage with our community, to reach out to listen and also conversely to educate. There seem to be some myths about preservation but conversely we can always learn about what developers are up against. We would like to be part of those conversations. Next is to advocate again for local and state incentives. We need to support rehabilitation and adaptive reuse in order to save buildings, and we keep saying preservation is important for sustainability, for quality of life, but sometimes

October 10-11, 2018

buildings really have to adapt in order to be saved, and we're behind that 100%. Finally, really supporting Portland's unique places. In many cases developer driven and development driven solutions by themselves are not working. The photograph at the bottom is a fairly typical scene of a new single family residence which replaced a much smaller one in its original location and developers do want to maximize profits. One way they do that is by kind of maximizing efficiency so they have a certain design that they know they can sell, and they will put it in various neighborhoods regardless of the original design context of that neighborhood. I also want to note that the average house size has increased by over 1,000 square feet since 1972, and probably more since before that, but that's when they first started keeping track of that number in the census. In our report we looked at four facets of livability and affordability so I'm going to go through those quickly for you. The first is by preserving historic multifamily housing we support sustainability, we support affordability, and economic diversity. I just want to say on at affordability note new construction almost always costs more than existing and then also support character and livability. Second looking at gentrification. Those places that are more affordable are going to be more vulnerable. The photograph at the bottom of this slide is showing north northeast Portland, the Albina area. This is a photo taken in 1963. It was the clearing for i-5, and as you know this neighborhood has been impacted not only by i-5 but by legacy emanuel, by memorial coliseum and a lot of projects that have already caused that community to lose not only a lot of housing but a lot of cohesion and important places. So this is still happening. We do see a profound decrease in affordability, and the city's own study of displacement has illustrated that. Then third, we looked at equity and inclusion and that kind of builds on gentrification, that the city needs to engage the most deeply affected populations and those typically are communities of color. I illustrated this by a 1936 map and this is just one of a whole series of maps that were done in 1936 showing patterns of racial distribution across the city. As horrifying as that is to notice that the city spent time actually mapping where racial distributions occurred in the city, at the same time we can look at some of those maps and say, how were these populations affected and how can we find those places that are still being lost that we don't know about, and engage those communities to help us. Let's see. The photograph at the bottom is -- it's from the internal conversion study that the city did I believe just two years ago. So historic preservation can increase density. There are barriers to that, but there are ways that we can overcome that. Historically many large houses across the city were rooming houses or boarding houses. It's been done before and we can do it again.

**Ranzetta:** This is the final pitch that we would like to make for updating the historic resources inventory. I may have mentioned this story before, but when I served as architectural historian in southern Maryland in a small rural county of under 100,000 people over about a seven-year period the community spent approximately \$250,000 to do an update of their inventory back in the 1990s. Ever since then that community has harnessed its history to the greatest extent as you possibly could. It was a community undergoing change. The population increased by almost 100%. They felt that the agricultural component of the community was being undermined by the tobacco buyout, and so it too was a community that was facing quite a significant amount of change in terms of character, in terms of the people who were there and everything. They spent a fairly significant amount of money to update their inventory because they really cared about their history. I think as Portland moves into the end of the 20 teens there's a real opportunity here for this city to take more of a leadership role in its inventory. There have been I think some positive movements in that direction. We have seen some funding over the years to develop plans to get this survey started, but we really need is a more substantial commitment from city council because it's really difficult I think to plan for the city's historical resources without the most up-to-date information possible and there are

October 10-11, 2018

several cities across the west coast that have jumped on the preservation bandwagon including Los Angeles and Seattle, San Francisco, Denver. There's an endless number of cities within the past ten years that have spent a significant amount of money even as they experience a significant amount of change as well. So I thought I would conclude our presentation on that note and open it up to questions for myself and Kristin on anything within our state of the city. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fritz.

**Fritz:** Thank you very much for all of your work. Thank you for this clear presentation and the report. You caught my attention in many places. Particularly throughout the report the emphasis on equity and who pays, who benefits, who is burdened and who particularly needs attention at this time. I applaud the way you presented that as well as the thinking on that. The question I have, though, is on the southwest corridor and I'm wondering how much assessment have you done. I know one property owner that wrote to me and said they had an historic property that might be impacted by the barber alignment. Did you look -- what did you do on the southwest corridor?

**Minor:** We have had two briefings so far. It's such a large project that it needs to go -- it needs to be seen by pretty much everyone in the city of Portland and further out than that even. So the process isn't quickly moving, but they have identified, and there's a table of properties that would be affected under various scenarios. They are still deciding on, you know, which exact route they are going to be looking at, and part of that equation has to do with the number of affected historic properties but there's also many other factors that come into play. So we have seen a preliminary list, but we don't yet know which properties for sure are going to be affected.

**Fritz:** You haven't given any advice on this route would be better than that route based on the identified historic properties is that correct?

**Minor:** We have given advice based on the least number of historic properties affected, but we also acknowledge that there are many other factors.

**Fritz:** Plus the inventory is out of date so we're not sure as yet -- if you could forward to me, if staff could forward to me the recommendation on the southwest corridor, we'll be hearing that on November 1st, and I appreciate your advice. Thank you.

**Fish:** Mayor.

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fish.

**Fish:** Thank you for an outstanding report and power point. Couple questions. First, the historic resource inventory update ask. The \$80,000 would go to whom to do what?

**Minor:** I might need to bring Brandon Spencer-Hartle, if he's willing to speak about that just a little bit. The \$80,000 ask was from the last fiscal cycle. So I'm not sure that that even would be the ask for this coming year.

**Fish:** Are you contemplating it going to the bureau of development services or to some third party? Or to your commission?

**Minor:** No, it definitely wouldn't be for our commission. It would be for the bureau of planning and sustainability.

**Fish:** Okay, that makes sense. I think actually we owe it to you this year to take action on that request.

**Minor:** Thank you.

**Fish:** I'll just speak for myself. I think you made a persuasive case. What we'll be looking for when we get our first numbers from the budget office is how much of that one-time money do we have because this is a classic one-time ask. I appreciate you framing that. You know, I was looking at your report. It has beautiful pictures in it and you have the project of the year. I'm constantly being accused by my children of being clueless and missing things and growing old without gracefully, and I was looking at this picture and I thought I cannot believe this is my neighborhood and I have never taken in this beautiful

October 10-11, 2018

building. Then I was relieved to see it hasn't actually been built. [laughter] it was actually, I think, a food cart or chocolate stand but it's to be built. I agree with you, I think allied works does superb work. Can I go to page 25 and 26 of your written report for a second?

**Minor:** Sure.

**Fish:** I'm very pleased you highlighted Washington high school which got your highest award, the Art DeMuro award, and it really is an extraordinary conversion. Who knows, someday there may be affordable housing and a parks facility adjacent so we'll see, but on page 26, you have a photograph of 734 east Burnside, which I take it is the Le Pigeon restaurant and their new annex? But it's not identified in the text. It is the point that there's just been some historic -- that the storefront have been brought back and they have expanded the restaurant space but done so in an historically sensitive way?

**Minor:** Exactly. I think the point of this photograph was to make you think of a really iconic place in Portland, and certainly all of those insets along Burnside where you have the arcaded facade, that is something that is unique in Portland. It's just an example of historic preservation and how we need to save those unique places.

**Fish:** Finally, I want to say that in your narrative on the urm, unreinforced masonry ordinance, which will potentially come back to us in a year the. As you know, council is very unsettled on this. I think I know where the trade winds are blowing, but I appreciate the analysis, and I appreciate this idea of admonishing us or challenging us to think about ways of incentivizing conversions, not demolitions. I'm very concerned that our current thinking, which I think is a short-term play, is likely to result in a substantial number of demolitions at the very least I think our policies will make it extremely difficult for people to refinance their properties, to get the money out they need to make improvements. And I think over time they could lead to demolitions and I have been very clear on the record that I can't support that approach. We'll be looking -- you're the incoming chair, so in the next year when this comes back to us following more staff work, I think it's very important that you're at the table helping us understand with people like walt, who submitted testimony that is superb, very helpful, going right in my urm file, in terms of having the right mix on incentives. If we don't get it right we're going to lose a lot of buildings and we're not going to get them back. I don't support that approach. I appreciate the thoughtful text. It's as usual a nice report. Thank you for your work.

**Minor:** Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Commissioner eudaly.

**Eudaly:** So I just want to thank you for the report, say that I share all of your priorities and goals. I'm especially heartened to see the focus on equity and inclusion because I think there is a really kind of delicate balance to be struck between preserving historic structures and not preserving historic inequities in our neighborhoods. So I'm really excited about the conversations about how we can achieve greater density, but preserve all these beautiful buildings and neighborhoods cause I believe it can be done and I would love to help with engaging the community in this conversation however I can. I think at this point Portlanders are so shell shocked by the rate of change they are really digging their feet in, not open to more change, even if it's going to be for the greater good. So I had one more thing to mention, but -- I think that sneeze wiped out my brain. I'll pass it back to you.

**Wheeler:** There you have it.

**Eudaly:** Oh, I support the new historic resource inventory. I wanted to say that.

**Wheeler:** Add that to your list.

**Eudaly:** Yes.

**Wheeler:** You have other testimony, is that correct?

**Ranzetta:** Yes, we have invited several individuals to testify as well.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Fritz:** So who's next? We have a third chair if anyone else is intended to speak

October 10-11, 2018

**Wheeler:** Good afternoon.

**Peggy Moretti:** Good afternoon. I think I'm sitting low. Oh, well. I'm Peggy Moretti. I'm here representing restore Oregon and was very honored to be invited to share some thoughts. On behalf of the members and volunteers and board of directors of restore Oregon I'm urging city council to thoroughly digest and act upon this incredibly thorough and spot on state of the city report by the landmarks commission. This is really an extraordinarily in depth effort by a group of volunteers who have very busy professional lives and we're in their debt. Restore Oregon agrees with everything this report says and we note it's longer and more detailed than in past years because to many of us it appears the city is backing away from its responsibility to steward the historic fabric that makes Portland Portland. Recent evidence concerning to us is found in refusal to provide even the token funding for the historic resources inventory in the last budget, the contradiction of city policy and public policy regarding spot zoning of incompatible heights in the japantown chinatown historic district and the outsized influence of developers in the central city plan. As Portland wrestles to grow without sprawling and increase the amount of affordable housing I want to seize reiterate that preservation and density go hand in hand. I think you all know and have heard us say many times that historic neighborhoods are already dense and can be made even more so. The key is compatibility and incentives for retention of the existing buildings. We also believe that preservation is essential will the war on homelessness. Historic buildings are a major source of affordable housing. Just ask organizations like innovative housing, inc., and the central city concern among here's who have adapted historic buildings for that purpose and I would just say very succinctly the most affordable home is one already standing. What city has ever built their way to affordability while demolishing hundreds of modest priced homes and replacing them with more expensive ones? If unfederated market rate building actually reduced prices the, the san francisco bay area's average home price wouldn't be well north of \$1 million. Portland's historic buildings are multi billion dollar asset embodying our identity, culture, struggles and aspirations, providing housing, incubating businesses and attracting tourism if only we knew where they all were like a shopkeeper who has only a vague idea of the inventory in his warehouse Portland only has a vague idea of our historic assets. So how can we manage and make effective decisions about them? There's no excuse why a city of our stature should not make a modest annual investments of 80 to \$100,000 to update our historic resources inventory. I want to acknowledge there's been a lot of push back recently about neighborhoods seeking historic designation. This has little to do with exclusivity and everything to do with people grasping for the only tool at their disposal to thwart an ongoing demolition epidemic chewing up their neighborhood character and making it more expensive. There's also been an uproar over loss of iconic buildings like the united workman temple and lotus cafe with no public process or public voice in it. Both scenarios point out that Oregon's process for historic designation and protection is broken and completely out of sync with the rest of the united states. Restore Oregon is working with the coalition of organizations to bring forward legislation in the 2019 session that would change that by instituting a more transparent, democratic, flexible and locally driven process for historic decision nation and protection and bypassing a state tax credit for rehabilitation and seismic upgrades that would incentivize more preservation. We look forward to sharing our legislative concept in the near future and I hope we will have the city's support. Restore Oregon appreciates the complex problems council is dealing with, we really do and it may be tempting to brush aside preservation of our historic places as a lower priority, but these places matter a great deal to our cultural, economic and environmental health. Once they are gone they are gone forever. So I would just like to close by repeating again, the most affordable home is the one already standing. The most affordable home is the one already standing. Thank you.

October 10-11, 2018

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Jessica Engeman:** Thank you, commissioners. My name is Jessica Engeman and I'm a former landmarks commissioner and I'm here to show my support for the wonderful report that was put out this year. Specifically I wanted to talk to the point of incentives and the great need for incentives that we have. Several of you I know knew my long time mentor, art DeMuro I worked for venerable properties for 15 years. I live and breathe incentives. Most of my time is spent working with other developers and owners helping them find ways to make historic preservation projects happen and it is not easy. It's not easy to reuse old buildings. It's not easy to reuse old buildings in Portland. I know that there are other jurisdictions that are difficult but it is difficult here in particular. I consult in Vancouver, I consult in Redmond, I consult in Salem, and my most challenging projects are here in Portland. There are also a lot of projects that come before me that don't actually ever happen. I also know this firsthand working for a developer that there are projects that we just can't make happen because they don't pencil because we don't have the tools that we need because the land values are too high, because the tenants can't afford to pay the rent that would be required to justify the code required upgrades to those buildings, seismic upgrades and other life safety upgrades. So I can say with a great amount of experience how much we need a better tool kit of incentives. I think that that really starts with something that would be at the state level, whether its historic tax credit, whether that's a urm tax credit, whether it's tied to true designation or not, we need something that really helps in a meaningful way start to make the pro forma make more sense for these projects. There is, of course, a 20% historic tax rate at the federal level that was weakened with the last tax reform act. It's still there, projects are still using it. We, Oregon, we should be leveraging the value of that federal tax credit with a state tax credit. So that would be certainly the first priority. I think we also need better zoning incentives. We have some zoning incentives and I believe there actually might be something in the works that makes this process a bit easier, but we need the flexibility to reuse historic buildings and we need to be able to do so without an onerous multi step land use process. I have several clients that are contemplating becoming a local landmark then going through a second type 3 review to use a preservation incentive then going through yet another land use review for their design alterations. Many months, many thousands of dollars. We need to make conversions easier. We should look for ways where do historic fourplexes really need to use the commercial building code that is so onerous. I have a client whose project was nearly stalled out because of the cost increases that came with having to comply with the commercial building code for a fourplex. We need a more predictable and streamlined far transfer process. Ideally we would like more building code flexibility and other jurisdictions the code official can make exceptions, reasonable exceptions to historic buildings to balance retention of fabric with making important code upgrades, and that process in my perspective is more onerous and less flexible in Portland. So, I hope if there's anything that you can do to create a stronger tool kit and make it more feasible it would certainly go a long way in keeping more of our wonderful buildings standing.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Fritz:** Just wanted to let you know I'm working on the floor area ratio piece of that. You have a long list and I appreciate all the suggestions. That's the piece I'm trying to help with.

**Engeman:** Thank you so much for that.

**Wheeler:** Good afternoon.

**Dan Koch:** Good afternoon. I'm dan cook with allied works architecture and I'm here with my colleague who is sitting in the back row. We're the architects for the project at the corner of northwest 23rd and glisan where the historic brickard building once stood and was unfortunately destroyed in the well known 2016 gas explosion. Last week we were

October 10-11, 2018

delighted to hear from Hilary Adam with design and historic resources our building was awarded historic project of the year. We're honored to receive such recognition, and we would like to speak briefly to how the historic design review process informed our design. This was our first project that we presented to the commission. We honestly didn't have a strong sense of what to expect. We heard that the process could be arduous, and so we focused a great deal of effort and time towards proposing thoughtful solutions through a clear and deliberate presentation. We took the commission's design guidelines and goals seriously and studied the neighborhood's existing fabric to register important characteristics of building scale, materiality and order. We were pleasantly surprised at our dar presentation by the commission's receptiveness to our ideas. They provided a great deal of positive feedback along with thoughtful criticism or critical input that we heard and responded to with our subsequent design review presentation. The process did push us in directions we probably would otherwise not pursue, and the building's design is definitely better for it. It's our intention that the building complement the neighborhood, that it feels like it belongs while being a product of today. Again, we're honored for the commission's accolades and we take them as a testament to the power of thoughtful design. Upon its completion we hope that this building proves out our deliberate choices and does all that it can to heal this prominent corner of our city and become a true asset to its northwest neighbors. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Appreciate it. And do we have one more person who is part of the panel? Is that correct? Very good. Thank you. While that individual is coming up, just a couple of quick announcements, item 1065, the design commission 2017 state of the city design report, which was scheduled for tomorrow afternoon, Thursday afternoon, has been rescheduled to October 17th at 2:00 p.m. Time certain. Item 1066, the latinx heritage proclamation, which was scheduled for tomorrow afternoon as well, has also been rescheduled to October 17 at 3:00 p.m. Time certain. Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Good afternoon, sir.

**Walt McMonies:** Walt McMonies not sitting in that chair last week I ended up on the floor. I stupidly pulled the wrong lever. Hopefully I rise above my past problems. I was asked yesterday by Brian emmrick an architect I work with to give his talk or give a talk for him today. So I scrambled and there's a 27-page outline for a three-minute talk. Couple of pictures at the back. You have those. The pictures are of the first one is of the -- upgrade on pretty much close to life safety. That's the -- very proud of that building. We did it for only a million one. Behind that is a picture of my grandfather's store in what was called the lab block in 1884 he moved in there and had a saddlery business, then became golf bag business McCullun saddle business. This building unfortunately was demolished in 1948. That's the reason I brought the picture. We lost something in that period, in late '40s, early '50s. We lost laden tilden bank, we lost the ledbetter house, we lost the Portland hotel. Just any number of great buildings that would be wonderful to still have that we weren't sensitive at the time and they went down. I have done some renovation of historic properties in my lengthy written testimony I can't recite them all. I have done four buildings, have brought them to current earthquake code and they were expensive to do, and we're lucky we were able to pull it off. I want to give kudos to all volunteer landmarks commission for the great work they do. I served on the finance and policy committee, and I appreciate their strong support for the mandatory urm upgrade. I'm a proponent of mandatory upgrade even though I am an owner and find it to be extremely expensive too, but we have to do it. There will be a huge earthquake and we can't just put our heads in the sand and ignore it. Apartment buildings are my thing. They are important and there are some beautiful apartment buildings in Portland. The Oregonian ran an article recently on the 20 outstanding apartment buildings and I had a couple of them on there. I was proud of that, but we really do have beautiful buildings and unfortunately they all have to be seismically

October 10-11, 2018

upgraded at enormous cost and some of the buildings hopefully don't get demolished because they are so beautiful chances are they will be preserved by someone if not the current owner. In terms of financial assistance and I balk at the word incentive. To me incentives is giving a polar bear a side of salmon saying why don't you go over to that side of your cage. These aren't incentives these are essential financing assistance that's needed by these buildings. Again some take incentives to be nonpejorative but to me incentive is something you see people ought to do this any way, but we're giving them an incentive to do it. People that don't have the ability to do it themselves they need the financial assistance only the city and state can give. You did a great job passing sb311 in the last legislative session that's the dollar for dollar reduction of property taxes for seismic work which hopefully will get implemented and we definitely need the historic seismic renovation tax credit at the state level. It works wonderfully. The federal one has been gutted a little bit but it's still there and its enormous incentive for someone like me to do a renovation. Again, with a mandate has to come down but it's going to threaten some of the marginal properties with demolition. So again we need those incentives, in quotes. The inventory is essential as well. There mid century modern houses that we're all now thinking are wonderful were not even mentioned in the original inventory. There wasn't any furor about it, people didn't know they were being valued. They are completely absent from the inventory. Things like that and the inventory there are many changes that have occurred to the buildings. They have been renovated or demolished or whatever. We need a current inventory. That's pretty much my testimony. Thank you so much for putting up with me.

**Fish:** Walter I have a question.

**McMonies:** Sure.

**Fish:** Thank you for your written testimony. It's very, very thoughtful as usual. I'm curious, you have some of the most storied historic properties in the city and yes, couple of them were featured in the Oregonian profile. Yet you're able to keep your rents some of them as low as \$2 a square foot -- \$2 a foot versus new construction at 4.50 or more.

**McMonies:** Correct.

**Fish:** I'm just curious what's your formula?

**McMonies:** My formula is buying the building for about a million and it's now worth about \$13 million. You're not getting a complete return -- it's really a \$13 million property which is what the county assessor says it is, its real market value. If we were gonna have proper return on that value we would be charging rents that were twice as high as they are but we need enough money to pay the bills and have certain money come out for us every month but we don't need -- we probably couldn't rent the apartments for \$4.50 a square foot anyway. It's the low basis in the property and the fact we have these tax incentives. I have a tremendous management company does a wonderful job getting things done for half the money people say they are going to cost, not by cutting corners but by approaching things in a different way realizing you can accomplish the same result spending less money. For instance hardening and strengthening the perimeter walls for the apartments we did what you did with the city at the train station and what was did at the Crystal ballroom. They got oil drilling rigs and drilled the walls top to bottom and inserted rebar and concrete in the holes. Now you have a stiff load bearing wall that's resistant to lateral force. That's not standard by the book engineering approach I wouldn't say cutting edge, but again, the city is the one implemented it at union station, so to your credit that you did. Worked really well there.

**Fish:** Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thanks for coming in. We appreciate it.

**McMonies:** Sure.

October 10-11, 2018

**Wheeler:** Very good. That completes our testimony. Any further discussion or I'll entertain a motion?

**Fish:** Mayor I move to accept the report.

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fish moves the report.

[audio not understandable]

**Wheeler:** I'm sorry we can't. But I will do this. Is it possible that you have your remarks written down, and if not I would be happy to meet with you right after this meeting and I'll hear what you have to say.

[audio not understandable]

**Wheeler:** Your handwriting couldn't be any worse than mine. I'll be happy to sit down with you. If one other -- my colleagues -- we can't have more than --

[audio not understandable]

**Wheeler:** Perfect.

[audio not understandable]

**Wheeler:** I have made the offer. You can --

[audio not understandable]

**Wheeler:** I understand. This is a report, so we have explicitly through legislation requested that this commission come back and present to us on a regular basis. It's not really a question that's open for public discussion. This is a mandate.

[audio not understandable]

**Wheeler:** Okay. And excuse me. I'm the presiding officer and I have told you what I have decided to do. We have a motion and second.

**Moore-Love:** Who seconded.

**Wheeler:** Eudaly seconded, please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Well, I have recovered my thought process and I'm muted again. I just wanted to say that I'm particularly excited about you highlighting the need to identify and advocate for historic resources and underrepresented communities, which are not necessarily big, beautiful, architecturally significant buildings but they are culturally significant and something near and dear to my heart. Again, if I can -- my office or perhaps civic life can be of any assistance doing outreach to some of these communities, I just would love to participate in that. I think that's just really exciting conversation. Aye.

**Fritz:** We often do give superlatives when reports come in. This is one of my favorites, I think this is a spectacular report. It's really outstanding. It says not only the common sense things but the unexpected things, and in particular calling out where the city council in your opinion has made progress and where we have made maybe mistakes and I appreciate that as a report from a community commission that's exactly what I hope that you continue to do. So thank you. It's a brilliant report and I'm very grateful for the emphasis on equity as I mentioned earlier for the specifics of what we need to be doing, and I do hope that we can get that historic resource inventory funded and started this year because time is running out. Thank you to Hilary Adam and Kara Fioravanti and Brandon spencer-hartle, its your work supporting the commission, you make a really good team. Thanks to Claire Adamsick on my staff. I grew up in England, got married in a church started in the 900s. So I'm ever mindful if we don't preserve old properties we won't have any in future and there won't be these beautiful places like city hall where every day I feel blessed that I'm working in this amazing architectural and historic building. As commissioner Eudaly just said, there are other places that may not be as spectacular as city hall, but are nevertheless significant and need to be saved. As Peggy Moretti said several times, thank you, the most affordable building is the one already built. We need to be looking at reuse rather than zoning and other changes that are going to encourage even more demolitions. Aye.

October 10-11, 2018

**Fish:** Well, I want to begin by thanking Kirk and Kristin for the presentation and the outstanding written report. I think if I'm counting correctly we have the votes to cover the historic resource inventory, at least two of the three we need. The next thing is to keep a sharp eye out for the forecast that we get just to see how much one time and ongoing money, but I think you've made a compelling case that we should fund it this year. I would prefer you don't have to come back next year and make the same case. We'll see what we can do on that and I appreciate just the quality of the report and the conversation. Peggy, I also think we got the final vote wrong at old town chinatown and I thought unfortunate because it was the final action of a lot of really good work, and it sort of overshadowed -- that's a bad pun. It had the effect of displacing the moment where I thought a lot of good work had gone into the other things we took up, but I regretted that vote. I voted against it and I thought we made a mistake. We do that from time to time, but we also it's a democracy, and reasonable people can agree and disagree. I just think we got it wrong. I appreciate that both you and the landmarks commission will stay involved in the urm discussion. Walt, there's a line in your testimony that you submitted that I'm going to read for the record. You say "I have been able to do voluntary seismic retrofits without enormous difficulty" and you explained why both in terms of your background, your experience, the financial strength of your buildings and your cash flow. But you go on to say "the same cannot be said of small mom and pop owners who often lack financial experience or access to lenders, they need targeted assistance". I fully concur in that. Unless we come up with the right package of targeted assistance I don't think it's fair to put mom and pop owners in a situation where their only recourse is to sell. So we have a lot of work to do in the next year. Peggy, you didn't mention it, but I want to just acknowledge that we have an historic carousel we're trying to find a home for.

**Eudaly:** Waterfront.

**Fish:** I hear some lobbying on the dais, maybe someone here has an idea. The parks bureau stands ready to fully engage. There's also a lot of interesting development that's in the works. Incredible vision for the new Albina district. There's a plan for the post office site, there's the zidell site, there's innovation quadrant. Four corners of that downtown corridor plus other opportunities. So I have a hunch with your perseverance and the opportunities coming up we'll find a home for that historic carousel. Thank you for taking on that fight. Like commissioner Fritz I really look forward to this presentation every year. We didn't get some things right, but obviously some things are happening in our community we can also celebrate. Congratulations to allied for the design of the newest building. Just two blocks from where I live so I look forward to seeing it when completed. Thank you all for your work and your service and the testimony and the presentation. Aye.

**Wheeler:** Well, I'm going to continue to -- there's a lot of issues going on here. The panel raised really interesting and provocative questions. In some cases you have offered some really good ideas where I think we're in alignment and we should be fighting together. You mentioned, for example, historic preservation tax credit. That is on our legislative agenda, its been for some time. Rather than simply passively putting it on the agenda I think there's an opportunity for us to work with our state legislators when we have them here for our annual legislative breakfast, and I'm confident my colleagues and I would like to seek a commitment from our legislative leadership and our legislative representatives cause I heard some degree of unanimity in that regard. I'm also going to put out a request for help and here's how it's shaped. I hear as mayor about very specific issues, overwhelmingly. It will not surprise anyone in this room. I hear a lot about housing affordability and access to housing in this community and making sure that we are a real community where people who are in the arts or the culture or the maker space or teachers or firefighters or whatever else have access to housing. I taken a principled stand with regard to height and density within the urban growth boundary because we have chosen to have an urban growth

October 10-11, 2018

boundary. People from all over the country, we just had a delegation from Denver here saying how do we replicate that and what are the tradeoffs. I was sure to tell them that one of the tradeoffs is if you create any scenario where you are protecting wilderness and natural lands outside the boundary you are therefore accepting a commitment to increased height and density inside that boundary and I'm going to continue to be on that side of the equation. I want us to be able to be an accessible, affordable community. I want us to continue to support height and density where that height and density is appropriate and that means very touch and politically unpopular stands around residential infill, around density, around height, but you are a check and balance against reckless infill or reckless use or appropriation of height and density, but I just want to reiterate there are real tradeoffs. There are no right or wrong answers. Really we each have to come to that conclusion on our own. You're there as sort of a check and balance, a rational community-based response to what it is we're trying to do. I want to continue to use you in that regard. You may not always agree with me. At the end of the day we may not be on the same side of aye or a nay vote but I continue to respect your experience and your approach to these issues. A lot of talk about budgets. I try not to commit to anything in advance of the budget process because we are going to have way more budget asks than we'll actually be able to deliver on, but I want to reflect on something I heard both commissioners Fish and Fritz say, which is this has been a very credible ask repeatedly made over a long period of time, and I think a minimum today I can sit here and say I think we need to commit to what this looks like going forward. I didn't hear a specific ask. I think I heard \$89,000 then \$89,000 annually. I really want to see the proposal before I commit to anything and I want to kick the tires hard and have some feedback from you as well. Maybe the ask isn't the final ask. Maybe there's something else we should be looking at with more depth or breadth or maybe some different partners in the room. I'm open. Let's have that conversation. That was more longwinded than I wanted. I vote aye. The report is adopted. Thanks for your volunteer leadership and support. We're adjourned.

**At 4:38 p.m. Council recessed.**

October 10-11, 2018

## Closed Caption File of Portland City Council Meeting

This file was produced through the closed captioning process for the televised City Council broadcast and should not be considered a verbatim transcript.

Key: \*\*\*\*\* means unidentified speaker.

**October 11, 2018 2:00 pm**

**Wheeler:** Good afternoon. This is the afternoon session October 11, Portland city council. Welcome, everybody. Please call the roll.

**Eudaly:** Here **Fritz:** **Fish:** Here. **Saltzman:** Here

**Wheeler:** Here. Couple of housekeeping items due to item 1065 to accept Portland design commission's 2017 state of the city design report which was originally scheduled for this afternoon has been rescheduled to October 17th at 2:00 p.m., time certain. Item 1066, to proclaim September 15th through October 15th to be latin x heritage month has also been rescheduled to October 17, at 3:00 p.m. Time certain. We only have one item for today. Karla, please read the item.

### **Item 1064**

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Eudaly.

**Eudaly:** Thank you, mayor. It's my pleasure to introduce this report and to introduce Mike Golub, who is going to come to the table. Mike is president of business for the Portland timbers and Portland thorns and has more than 25 years of experience in professional sports marketing and management including a wealth of experience in Portland and the Pacific Northwest. His professional background locally includes executive leadership positions with Nike, the Portland Trail Blazers, New York Rangers, Memphis Grizzlies and I'm just realizing those are not local -- [laughter] I mean I'm not a sports fan but even I know -- Memphis Grizzlies are not in Portland. And the National Basketball Association and he is a theater lover and champion for the arts. He has served on the RACC board for six years including two as chair and is now chair emeritus. Welcome, Mike.

**Mark Golub:** Thank you Commissioner Eudaly and thank you to the council for having us here today. It's truly been an honor to have served as regional arts and culture council board president last two years. Most the report will be delivered by our incoming board chair Linda McGeady and our interim executive director Jeff Hawthorne, but I wanted to say a few words up top, perhaps most importantly thank each of you and your respective staff for all that you do on behalf of our amazing arts community, many of whom are here today, and for putting your faith in RACC to be good stewards of your arts and culture investments. I joined the RACC board about seven years ago and at the time RACC had just partnered with Americans for the Arts to commission an economic impact study of the arts in our region. This year we commissioned that study again. The results, in 2017 the arts accounted for an annual economic impact of \$330 million. That's \$80 million more than 2010, 30% growth. The arts today account for 11,500 full-time jobs, up 35% from 2010. So in addition to the myriad of benefits that the arts provides our community, they are inarguably an economic engine and RACC has been a catalyst for much of that growth. In RACC's 23 years of history, the organization has provided over \$50 million in grants to artists, nonprofit organizations and schools. As you may know we manage an internationally acclaimed public art program of more than 2,000 artworks. In the last 12 years, RACC has also raised more than \$8.5 million for local arts organizations through our workplace giving campaign. Through our Right Brain initiative we have integrated the arts into the curriculum of more than 27,000 K through 8 students every year. Like all good

October 10-11, 2018

organizations, racc strives to get better. We continue to evolve and we recognize the need to change and that's the spirit and substance of the report that Linda and Jeff will give today. We're at an exciting inflexion point, we're very close at naming a new executive director. Linda will have more in a minute, but we're hopeful to have an announcement on that soon. Want to publicly thank Jeff Hawthorne. Jeff has been with racc more than 16 years. He served as our executive director interim executive director the last year and Jeff is just a wonderful asset to the community. On behalf of all of us, Jeff, thank you for your service. [applause] and Linda incoming board chair is a wonderful person, I know all of you will enjoy working with her. Commissioner Eudaly, we look forward to working with you as the new arts commissioner. To our outgoing arts commissioner I want to personally thank nick Fish on behalf of all of us at racc and the nearly 200 arts organizations that racc help support, a heartfelt thank you for your superb leadership over the last six years. Truly a champion of the arts, nick and we're so glad you're in our corner. So we understand nick last year attended a performance at Portland playhouse, an organization we help fund, a performance of scarlet. Apparently, nick, you were very taken by the performance and by one young performer in particular, so we thought we would bring her today to perform for you. It's my pleasure to introduce the incomparable rainbows, who will be singing, oh, papa, a song from the Portland playoff's production of scarlet. Rainbow, the stage is yours. [applause]

**Rainbows:** I'm really excited and proud to be here today. So thank you, everyone.

[singing]

[audio not understandable] ♪ can't you see ♪ oh, papa, won't you hear me when I cry at night ♪ oh, papa ♪ oh, papa ♪ oh, papa, won't you see ♪ oh, papa ♪ won't you hear me when I cry at night ♪ oh, papa ♪ oh, papa ♪ [applause]

**Fish:** Thank you so much, rainbows. That was beautiful.

**Rainbows:** Thank you.

**Fish:** We're so glad you're here. You came with your parents, right?

**Rainbows:** Yes, and a friend of mine.

**Fish:** Thank you for making it very special.

**Wheeler:** Where are your parents?

**Rainbows:** My parents are right here.

**Wheeler:** Wow: Excellent: [applause] that's a lot of talent. I feel sorry for whoever has to follow you.

\*\*\*\*: That would be me, mayor.

**Fish:** Thank you, honey. Thank you very much.

**Rainbows:** Thank you so much.

**Linda McGeady:** Thank you Rainbows I think there's not a dry eye in the house after that. Good afternoon, mayor, commissioners, My name is Linda McGeady, I took the reins from mike golub og board chair of racc in July. I'm first generation American born at Belfast, northern Ireland. I immigrated here in the late '90s after eight years working in London as a lobbyist and policy advisor on energy conservation and climate change, far from the arts. I have now lived in Portland longer than anywhere else and my kids were born here. I was introduced to racc by former e.d. Eloise Damrosch, but a year after we joined the art committee of the Randall children's hospital at legacy Emanuel. I previously served on the board of pica for six years and focused on school volunteering when my kids were little and so I was delighted and honored and not a little intimidated to join the board of such a key arts organization. Four years later I feel like the frog in the cold water. The public arts committee led to leadership development committee and the executive committee then the first search committee, then the second search committee. It has been an honor and a stretch in the best ways and I am endlessly challenged to think about the impact of this work on the city I love and the many communities it contains. The staff at racc are a well

October 10-11, 2018

spring of knowledge, experience and creative thinking and they and the new e.d. and the community volunteer board I chair are hungry to help showcase Portland as a city where art and culture are part of everyday life, are part of creative problem solving, and are a revenue generating attraction for residents and visitors alike.

**Jeff Hathorne:** And my name is Jeff Hawthorne, I am the interim executive director of racc, good afternoon. As many of you know we usually deliver our state of the arts report in the spring but I must say it's very nice to have this talk when we aren't in the middle of budget season and fortuitously October is national arts and humanities month, so it's a great time for us to tell you about all the things we're doing at the regional arts and culture council and let's talk together about some of the challenges and opportunities we're observing across Portland's arts community. I wanted to start by reminding you of our mission, posted on the screen, as well as our vision and values. These are basically remained unchanged since racc was first spun off into an independent organization 501c3 organization in 1995. Racc's mission is broad to enrich our communities through arts and culture, which is allowed racc to explore ways of using arts and culture not just as consumable products but as powerful tools for addressing a wide variety of community challenges and concerns. I also want you to know that the staff and board have latched on to a very important value statement which has been in existence since 1995. We value a community in which everyone can participate in the arts and has access to cultural experiences and this I believe represents the most important thing we are called to do as your local arts council. We'll return to this theme in has moment. First we wanted to quickly brief you on some of the latest developments at racc including our search for a new executive director.

**McGeady:** As you know this is phase 2 of an 18-month process. We offered the position of e.d. to an outstanding candidate back in the spring but that candidate's family circumstances changed and they were not able to accept our offer. The decision was made by the board to continue the search and last month we brought three strong new candidates to Portland for final interviews with board, staff and community including commissioners Eudaly and Fish, and Susan Gibson Harnett in the office of management and finance. Almost everyone who participated in the phase 1 interviews returned to meet the new candidates and we're grateful to the 20 stakeholders whose insightful and challenging questions put the candidates through their paces and were an invaluable part of the process. I'm also grateful to the board, former board and community members who made up the first search committee and I am grateful to the current search committee who have given countless hours to this process. The level of interest, participation and passion around this appointment speak to the arts community's expectations for the role of racc and its new leader in forging a new identity and a place for the arts. The search committee delivered its recommendation to the board on Tuesday of this week and the board has voted to accept that recommendation. I am now looking forward with great excitement to an announcement being made before the end of the month if not sooner.

**Wheeler:** Oh, you tease.

**McGeady:** I would love mayor to have been able to announce today, but alas, the timing was not quite right.

**Eudaly:** They won't even tell me if it makes you feel any better.

**Wheeler:** Mildly.

**McGeady:** I won't tell anybody. In addition, we have been working through several of the issues that were raised in the auditor's report earlier this year. Jeff has launched phase 1 of racc's strategic planning process working with a consultant to develop our planning goals, process and timeline. We suspect the entire process will take about a year to complete. We've enjoyed our initial conversations with our new arts commissioner, commissioner Eudaly and we will be working together on a recommendation how the city

October 10-11, 2018

might go about updating its vision and its strategic plan for arts and culture. Our community will surely benefit from such an exercise and racc stands ready to partner with you all on these important conversations that will help us prepare for Portland's future. We have also very much enjoyed working with Susan Gibson Hartnett in the office of management and finance as we work to rewrite the racc contract and are looking forward to a new relationship with the city arts project manager soon to be hired. We have great confidence in the city's process and we can already see how advantageous it will be to have this additional and dedicated relationship at the city. So thank you for making it happen. So much else has happened since the last time we officially presented to you but it's all in the written report so I'll leave it at that for now and I'll ask Jeff to talk for a moment about racc's finances and services.

**Hathorne:** Thank you, Linda. Throughout this presentation you'll be seeing some wonderful illustrations by Alex Chiu, who has designed a state of the arts zine for us and will also be speaking later, but I wanted to acknowledge him, thank you, alex. Racc by design is a regional arts service agency that provides grants and services for artists, nonprofit organizations and schools in Clackamas, Multnomah and Washington county and within this large metro area it will come as no surprise for you to hear that vast majority of arts activity happens in Multnomah county and specifically in Portland. In fact, last year's economic impact study that mike talked about that we conducted with americans for the arts revealed that Portland accounts for 90% of the total attendance of all nonprofit arts events in the try county area and Portland businesses, of course, benefit from all the arts related spending that happens at restaurants, hotels, parking lots and retail stores. There's more detail in your report as appendix one, but let's flag that 90% of all arts activity is a remarkable percentage when you consider Multnomah county accounts for only 45% of the region's population and only 68% of racc's budget. Indeed the city of Portland is racc's largest funding source and our service agreement with you is much more comprehensive than any other contract we have. You can see on this slide the 68% that comes from the city of Portland in orange, that's a total of \$6.5 million and of that total broken out in the rust colored bar underneath you can see that just over \$4 million or 62% came from the general fund, \$2.1 million or 32% came from the arts tax, and \$406,000 came from the 2% for art ordinance. I should note here that all of our fiscal year '18 financial statements are currently being reviewed by an independent firm and we look forward to sharing our audited financial statements with you this winter as we do every year. Also in this slide in teal that racc earns 14% of our revenue through other local government agencies including Multnomah county, Clackamas county, Washington county and metro. Those are revenue streams that we are always working to grow but frankly it's a challenging case to make when you see the disparity of the location of arts activity that we talked about a moment ago and frankly many counties across the united states and here in the state of Oregon simply do not invest in arts and culture the way that cities do. The pink slice represents \$843,000 we raise every year in contributions from the private sector and the green slice shows our earned income, almost \$900,000 last year through fees for service including public art consultation services nationwide. So in terms of program delivery and expenses, we invested nearly \$5.8 million or 57% of our total budget as grants and services for artists and nonprofit organizations. We'll share some examples of these grants in a moment, but in terms of examples of technical assistance services we provide, those would include workshops on a wide variety of topics, personal assistance assembly a grant application and art of leadership, which is a board training program. 15% of our total budget last year was spent on public art. As you know racc commissions and maintains a growing public art collection on behalf of the city of Portland and for Multnomah county. There are now more than 2200 artworks in the collection thanks in large part to the 2% for art ordinances that exist in the city and the county. Of course we all know that students do better in school

October 10-11, 2018

when the arts are part of the curriculum, and racc is working to ensure that every student in the region has access to arts education. We invested approximately 12% of our budget in these efforts last year and as I discussed earlier it's incumbent upon us to ensure that everyone has access to the arts and have ways to express their creativity. Our advocacy and community engagement activities represent 5% of our total budget and there's still much more work to do before we can confidently say everyone in our community has access to the arts. We'll talk more about our progress in a minute. So here's a recap. Racc's expenses are broken out in this chart red for grants, green for public art, the darker blue for arts education, purple for advocacy. Note here that racc's overhead costs are 11%. the irs defines overhead as management and general expenses plus fund-raising expenses, shown in orange. Racc's audited financial statements for ten years verified that our overhead costs have ranged between 9 and 12% every year, which is an exceptional ratio by any definition. We credit our director of operations Cindy Knapp and her team for both the commitment to low overhead costs and for keeping flawless financial records.

**McGeady:** Starting on page 28 of your report you'll see a complete list of every grant we awarded in the fiscal year ending June 30, 2018. More than \$4.9 million over all. While every grant has an impact on artist or community members there are few examples to highlight. Racc awarded \$6500 to right to survive for their ambassador project posting writing and artwork shops for housed and houseless people to create together culminating in the second annual light the heart festival. The 2018 immigrant and refugee youth music camp received \$5250 so that young people age 13 to 17 could express themselves by creating original music, culminating in a live community performance at franklin high school. Myles De Bastion founder and president of CymaSpace received a project grant to support the northwest deaf arts festival, an inclusive, innovative experience for deaf and hearing allies at Mississippi studio's. Myles is with us today and I would like to invite him up now to tell us more about his grant and the impact his festival had in the community.

**Myles de Bastion (through interpreter):** Hello, it's nice to meet you all. My name is Myles de Bastion, I'm the artistic director and founder of cymaspace, which makes art into visual lights and vibrations. My organization is a nonprofit and our mission is to make art and cultural events inclusive for the deaf and hard of hearing community through a technology, education and collaboration. We recently had a large project here called the northwest deaf arts festival, which was in June earlier this summer. It was an incredible event which we were able to bring in acclaimed deaf artists, poets and dancers for the community here in Portland. That includes the deaf and hearing community. This is the first time we were able to host this event. There's been nothing like this in the city of Portland before that created full access for the deaf and hard of hearing community. We had a variety of talents who were able to perform and showcase their skills and their success. This event was so incredibly important because it showed what accessibility looked like and that wouldn't have been possible without the grant that we received from racc. Accessibility can be expensive. I'll give you an example. Accessibility can mean having sign language interpreters, tactile interpreters for the deaf blind, captioning and other accommodations which can be very expensive. So with racc's financial support we were able to accommodate a large spectrum of disabilities that wouldn't have been possible otherwise. And our goal is to create equal access for everyone, for every event for every art project here in the city of Portland that's lacking. And access is not just providing interpreters. It's thinking about all of the needs of the disabled community and it's not cheap. So that's why Portland needs to make accessibility and inclusiveness a priority. We can work together to problem solve to make that a reality and I think through collaboration with the state and the city and the artists here in Portland we can make that happen and I imagine Portland becoming a hub for deaf and disabled artists. Currently we don't have anything that exists where people can come together to network and get support for their

October 10-11, 2018

art and projects. Most artists rely on grass roots organizations at the moment, and I would like to change that and provide more support so we can see the growth of artists within our community and if we create a central space here in Portland, I think that would be a big game changer. Many artists unfortunately due to the cost of living, gentrification and rising rent are not able to afford a space to practice their art. Many end up moving away, so I would like to create a central location where the voices, you could say, the hands of the artists can come together in one space. So I want to offer the perspective of what does accessibility mean and what does it look like for a myriad of people and how can we expand our understanding to be inclusive of more people within our community? So I'm sure Ted remembers coming to our event, and I hope you enjoyed yourself and gained from a different perspective and that experience. I want to thank you for your time in having me here today, and I look forward to working together.

**Wheeler:** If I could just add, it was an excellent event, and I had the opportunity to speak with people who came from all over the region to participate and I had two thoughts. My first thought was that we need to do more to encourage accessibility to the arts and that people were hungering for those kinds of opportunities. As I say, people were coming from all over the region to participate in your event. The second thought I had was that I was just really proud that we were doing this in the city of Portland. That the folks at Mississippi studios were supportive and that you had community engagement from community partners, and I want to personally thank you for your vision. It was really an incredible and excellent event. I had a great time. Thank you.

**de Bastion (through interpreter):** Thank you.

**Hathorne:** Thank you, Myles. So suffice it to say that RACC is changing some of the ways we distribute funds to ensure the more culturally specific organizations and other historically underserved residents throughout the city ultimately benefit. Our grants team led by Helen Dalton is doing excellent work to gather information about how other communities across the country are addressing similar issues and they are listening to the local community and responding to the needs. We continue to appreciate the many, many ways that large arts organizations contribute to our economy and our quality of life including the distribution of more than 12,000 tickets at \$5 each to low income Oregonians through the arts for all program. This is a photo of the current and very excellent production of the color purple at Portland Center Stage. We acknowledge that we don't have enough resources to continue investing in the same groups at the same levels while also investing in all of the smaller organizations and emerging artists in our city. That is why it is so important that we work with all of you to clearly understand and articulate the city's priorities for arts and culture and to collaborate on generating new revenue sources.

**McGeady:** Well, after four years of serving in the public arts committee I'm still learning about this fascinating and highest visibility program. Public art collector Kristin Calhoun and her team of specialists work miracles with a small budget to enhance the urban art landscape in Portland. Many of our parks are graced and enhanced by beautiful and quirky and humorous installations. We have been working closely with Portland Parks and Recreation and this year completed public art projects at Dawson, Luuwit View, Gateway Discovery Park and Spring Garden Park. This image shows Mauricio Robalino's beautiful piece Camaro Bird at Luuwit View Park. Thank you, Commissioner Fritz, for your tremendous support of these projects. RACC also maintains and when necessary repairs the public art collection which now stands at over 2200 pieces including large scale sculptures, outdoor and indoor murals, smaller three-dimensional pieces and framed art in every size and medium. This is the Horatio Law's new sculpture and Horatio himself, it's called the fifth wind and it's at Gateway Discovery Park. Horatio developed this in part through a workshop to do butterfly, origami folding paper with the community at the park site before construction even began. We have added, we continue to add to the collection every year,

October 10-11, 2018

and this year we added 31 new artworks mostly using funds generated by the city's percent for art ordinance. This is where 2% of budgets for publicly funded capital construction and improvement project must be spent on purchase and maintenance of public art. Your report includes a complete list of all projects completed or underway in 2018. In collaboration with the bureaus, this allocation can be spent on art not directly associated with the project and we're currently preparing a report with recommendations on how we might direct more public artworks to neighborhoods that have not previously benefited from them. A high profile project currently under way that generates 2% for art is renovation of the Portland building. 582 artworks including racc's public art that's in storage have been moved during the extensive renovations. Among many upgrades to the building will be the creation of a large window looking on to 4th avenue where a garage entrance used to be. Artists Rafik Anadol, a Turkish born media, artist director and designer currently based in l.a., will be creating a large cutting edge 3-d printed artwork whose final shape will be taken from data collected along with data collected from the city bureaus who's offices are going to be in the building, along with data collected from the community possibly using social media. In line with the spirit of innovation of the building itself this piece represents a new generation of cutting edge creators and I hope that you will all be there when the installation is dedicated in about a year's time. It will be spectacular. Another important way in which the public art committee works with the city is through the design review process. A member of the volunteer design review commission sits on the public art committee and together we work with developers and artists to embed art in buildings that do not conform to zoning code or design guidelines. In this case, for example, it was a ground floor window mitigation. An artist damien gilley is creating a beautiful gate to mask the utility meters on the new broadstone reveal apartments on northwest 14th and quimby. Another public art program very dear to my heart is the murals program overseen by Peggy Kendellen. Portland has a spectacular range of stunning murals and we have benefited from the dedication and passion of internationally renowned muralists and home-grown artists alike. Racc collaborated with prosper Portland to develop two large scale murals at the Alberta commons development in the king neighborhood. Artist Arvie smith and Mehran Heard created two vivid community inspired designs that honor the northeast Portland community and its rich african-american history. This is Arvie smith's powerful work still we rise. Because mural art is such a growing and dynamic field racc established the fresh paint program specifically to nurture local talent and give artists the opportunity to learn how to work on a large scale. The wall of open signal media arts center on northeast martin luther king jr boulevard have become a gallery for new murals that stay up for six months and are then painted over for the next aspiring muralist. The first artist to participate in this program is here today. This is his daughter bouncing on the bed, which brought a smile to my face every time I saw it. It's my great pleasure to introduce Alex Chiu. [applause]

**Alex Chiu:** Hello, everyone. Thank you for letting me speak here today. It's an honor. My name is Alex Chiu, I'm connected with racc in my participation in the selection committee for the Portland visual chronicle and I am currently a muralist featured on the racc public mural roster. Last year I participated in racc's pilot year of fresh paint a temporary mural program for emerging artists of color in collaboration with open signal. Participating in public art projects in Portland has given me a new perspective on the role that art plays in society. In my background as practicing artist part of my role is to produce artwork that's able to sell and look nice on people's walls. Unfortunately a lot of this artwork has little or no social value. It is typically meant to be decorative and colorful with ornate designs and patterns. Working with racc and in public art has given me insight into what it means to create artwork with social and cultural significance. I can see how artwork can be used as documentary with the purpose of preserving and illustrating the history of a place. I can

October 10-11, 2018

see how we use artwork to educate the next generation about the culture, experiences, and legacy of the people that came before them. I can see how artwork can instill a sense of unity and pride in the community. It's important to see artwork that gives us pride in who we are and where we come from. Racc is instrumental in recognizing funding and giving life to this type of artwork. Artwork and projects that have social and cultural significance in Portland. As a practicing artist and Portland citizen I'm thankful for their work. In this time of rapid growth and constant change in Portland it becomes even more important to preserve the history of this place so we can really know and understand how the city came to be what it is. So it's important to maintain racc with your continued financial and legislative support. So thanks and thanks for letting me have a chance to speak here.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Hathorne:** Thanks, Alex. So racc is also working to bolster arts education in public schools by integrating the arts into the teaching practice of k through 8 classroom teachers and by providing support and coordination services for the k through 5 arts specialists in Portland who are funded by the city arts tax. Our arts education work is led by Marna Stalcup who recently testified in front of a congressional committee on education and the work force in Washington d.c. at the invitation of congresswoman Suzanne bonamici, who is a huge advocate for steam education, science, technology, engineering, arts and math. Under Marna's leadership the right brain has become a national model for addressing the nation's education and work force development challenges. The right brain initiative is now in its 11th year of integrating the arts into k through 8 classrooms, improving student performance as a result. This year we will be serving 29,716 students in eight school districts and in the city of Portland that includes Portland public, park rose, and reynolds. Racc provided professional development offerings for 734 classroom teachers and art specialists this past year and again that includes the 72 art, music and dance teachers funded by the arts tax. As one example of the support we provide for these teachers, racc hosted a full day professional development workshop on cultural responsive teaching with breakout sessions specifically designed for visual and performing arts teachers. We're also working with schools and arts organizations to map our collective arts education assets and services and then to assess the gaps. To tell us a little bit more about the ways that students benefit from a well rounded education that includes the arts, it is my pleasure to introduce to you the new superintendent of park rose school district, Michael lopes.

**Wheeler:** Welcome. Thanks for being here.

**Michael Lopes:** Thanks for having me. It's an honor to -- my name is Michael lopes-Serrao is my full last name. I'm the new superintendent, it's an honor to represent the park rose school district, kids, the families and staff. It's my pleasure. I first want to echo the great work of Marna Stalcup, she's been a champion and really has done great work for not only for our school district but school districts across the region. I would start by the opportunities that teachers receive when they can see how the arts can be integrated into the school day is a prime opportunity. I think the key is having the opportunity to learn from artists of how you can integrate into the curriculum versus having to particularly for our most vulnerable underrepresented families to go to after school programs or participate in clubs when we're able to help teachers learn that integration it's much more effective. We have one school in our district that is honored to be part of the right brain initiative and just in a year's time not only do you see the art of the students that are out in the hallways, but art has just become more part of the conversation and the curriculum. Teachers are finding ways when they are learning about concepts, whether through reading, mathematics, to bring art into their work, into their expression, into their thinking. You know, an interesting coincidence Alex actually painted a mural at prescott elementary for the parents and the kids of the school. So it's just a beautiful way to see how our kids see artists out in the

October 10-11, 2018

community and we need to have more of those opportunities. Just five years ago prior to the arts tax we had one music teacher for over 1200 kids. Now today we have a music teacher at every elementary school in the park rose school district and we have the challenge of not having enough music teachers at the middle school because so many kids want to elect to take choir, elect to take band. It's a good problem to have but it's clear evidence to show that when we invest in arts education, the students come their interest rises. I want to continue that and I emphasize that our district, I know our partner districts, have benefited a great deal from racc's support. I would like to multiply the professional development ten times that we're able to offer teachers because it's really truly the artists that can help the educators understand where they can find the opportunities for our students to express their thinking and creativity. Schools have a lot of rigor, a lot of work, but I believe that we have work to do to help our kids be creative and connect to the community of artists that we have. So I just on behalf of the park rose school district want to thank racc for their support and you have a champion in me to cheer you on and to continue the support. So thanks for having me.

**Wheeler:** Thank you so much for being here. Thanks for your great work.

**Hathorne:** Thank you, Michael. One other quick arts education note, this fall we are collaborating with Portland public schools, Portland centers for the arts, the Oregon jewish museum and Portland center stage to bring Wilson Reads the project to 2400 6th through 12th graders helping them learn history and the significance of the holocaust through the inspiring true story of a young jewish musician and her struggle for survival. This project has been completely funded by private donations to racc. Racc continues to build strong support for arts and culture and the entire community and our stellar community engagement team of Humberto Marquez Mendez and Ella Marra-Ketelaar have developed a new plan to prioritize authentic engagements with marginalized communities by actively collaborating with some of the populations in Portland that have been underserved by racc in the past. We have a new art empower conversation series that centers the experiences of artists from historically marginalized communities and they touch on topics such as cultural appropriation, code switching and artist activism. Also more than 500 people attended art spark this past year, which is our quarterly networking event at rotating venues designed to help local artists and makers connect with each other. Racc also conducts a workplace giving campaign and distributes the proceeds to more than 100 arts organizations in our community including Oregon ballet theater shown here engaging with employees at McDonald Jacobs. Our top workplace giving campaign last year was at the standard. This is a company that continues to make significant investments in our local arts community. In fact just last week the standard received a national award from americans for the arts honoring the company's exceptional commitment to the arts through grants, local partnerships, volunteer programs, matching gifts, sponsorships and several board memberships. Remember all those public artworks we told you were displaced in renovation of the Portland building. The standard gave us a great deal on some temporary storage space and are displaying Portlandia related items in its mezzanine across the street from the Portland building, we appreciate their partnership very much. With that workplace giving campaign 1,308 donors contributed a total of \$665,000. As you know the city has eliminated its annual matching challenge incentive of \$200,000 for this program which will mean a smaller total next year, but we are working to regroup and reinvent the program. In august racc retired the work for art brand and introduced a new arts impact fund and this is a broader appeal to donors beyond the workplace to support arts and culture organizations in our community. We would like to thank city employees for giving generously to our campaign every year and a special shout out to Alison bailey on our staff and the advocacy team at racc for all the work being done to build a strong network of support for the arts in the future.

October 10-11, 2018

**McGeady:** Let's talk about the challenges and opportunities that lie ahead. Change is certainly afoot with a new arts commissioner appointed last month and a new executive director starting very soon. All of us have our work cut out to tackle tough issues including the persistent problem of rising costs, pricing many artists and arts organizations out of the city and potentially jeopardizing Portland's reputation as a center of creativity. Your written report includes an update on tasks assigned to racc as part of the city plan to preserve and expand art space in Portland and we would love to get started on the mapping project in particular if we can find a way to pay for it. Equity, diversity and inclusion continues to be a priority for racc and we have developed four new goals in alignment with the city office of equity and human rights so that we can be more intentional in our work and more accountable for our progress. Our focus remains on racial equity partly because that's what our contract performance measures are focused on but we're also expanding our understanding of and engagement with other marginalized communities. When it comes to racial diversity at racc I am pleased to report that we have made progress over the last eight years and today 42% of the board and 37% of the staff identify as people of color. A full 50% of our grant panelists this past year and 52% of our public art selection panelists also identified as people of color. This year we added a racial equity lens based on examples from other organizations leading the way. This lens helps guide the decisions we make as an organization. Our equity work is not a closed process. There's no end point and we're committed to continual improvement with help from our community partners.

**Hawthorne:** A couple of recommendations. First and foremost, we want you to know that racc is ready and eager to collaborate with the city to develop a clear vision and goals for arts and culture in the city of Portland as recommended by the auditor this spring. We have done this work before with act for art in 2009, and we look forward to working with commissioner Eudaly and the mayor to determine the best approach for a new plan. Based on our experience and other examples from across the country we estimate the cost to be between \$10,000 and \$75,000 depending how much research and public process are involved. By the way, that report act for art was so popular in 2009 that a year later parts of it were copied word for word by Sacramento mayor Kevin Johnson. [laughter] you could say racc has done cultural planning work in Portland and Sacramento.

**Fritz:** Did they credit us?

**Hawthorne:** No.

**Wheeler:** Let's give them a little credit. They are both smart and frugal. [laughter] to copy the work we did.

**Hawthorne:** They got us a couple times in the nba though.

**Wheeler:** Well at the end of they day they're still Sacramento. Sorry to all my friends from Sacramento.

**Hawthorne:** Shall I change the subject? Recommendation number 2. We would like to build an online map and searchable database of the city's arts venues and creative spaces an investment of \$30,000 would allow racc to partner with fractured atlas in New York and a team of local artists and arts administrators to develop space finder Portland, this is a platform that exists in many communities including Seattle. Racc assessed the mapping options with commissioner Fish's office last spring and we believe this is the most cost effective and sustainable solution. We have already tested the resource to make sure it will work for us, but we'll need additional funds to populate the database, promote it to the community and integrate it with other web based mapping resources.

**McGeady:** As Jeff noted at the beginning October is national arts and humanities month, a coast to coast celebration of the importance of culture in america. We invite you, our elected officials, come see us in galleries and theaters, community centers and parks across the city. There are so many amazing events to choose from and we welcome your active participation in Portland's vibrant arts community. In closing, much has changed at

October 10-11, 2018

racc in the four years since I joined the board. In fact change is something of a normal state for us these days. Staff and board alike are excited at the many possibilities for racc to be a catalyst of change in the wider community and as consumers, creators and patrons ourselves we are all committed to the idea that having an organization like racc is a focal point for arts funding and leadership is an essential element to maintaining and growing a healthy arts eco-system. Thank you for your attention.

**Wheeler:** Excellent.

**Hawthorne:** We're certainly grateful for your support not only for supporting the arts but for understanding that culture, creativity and the arts are powerful tools for addressing a wide variety of community issues. The arts are an essential part of our children's education. Artists and arts organizations are collaborating with doctors and scientists to improve people's health and well-being. The august wilson red door project and Portland police bureau are tapping into the power of theater to make Portland a safer place for all of us. Cultural tourism and the arts are a driver of Portland's economy supporting more than 11,000 jobs in the region and artists continue to play an extremely critical role in our pursuit of social justice. We're proud to be a regional arts and culture council and we thank you for the opportunity to share our thoughts on the state of the art in our community. I thank the incredible staff at racc they are truly an amazing lot and I'm grateful to the board for their time and talent as well as the opportunity to steward the organization during this interim period. When we talk about the arts we know it's important to hear from other voices as well. I wanted you to know we have asked four artists, arts administrators and creatives to share their thoughts on the state of the arts in our changing city. I encourage you to visit our website to read their essays that we published today and get a glimpse of the cultural landscape through their eyes. We have also assembled a panel of community representatives, three representatives who can briefly reflect on racc's report and share their observations with you today and then Linda and I will be happy to answer any questions you have. Today's testimonials are from Subanshini Ganesan, Maya vivas and Victor Maldonado.

**Wheeler:** Welcome.

**Subanshini Ganesan:** My name is Subanshini Ganesan and I'm the creative laureate of Portland. Good afternoon, mayor, city commissioners, leaders of racc and every single Portland arts and culture community member present in chambers today. On January 16, 2018, I was appointed as creative laureate in these chambers with a mandate to be an ambassador for local arts and culture community. I forged ahead in the last nine months to fulfill my commitment and spend countless hours speaking, strategizing, thinking and communing with artists, leaders of arts organizations, representatives of local granting foundations, larger community leaders and corporate representatives. Some of my findings, the state of the arts in our city is complex, nuanced, and there is constant concern that arts and culture might not be a priority at city hall. Independent multidisciplinary artists speak about how racc is currently their only source of grant money and desperately concerned for their sustainability. Though forums, events and gathering all across our city and try counties amplifying visibility for diverse artistic voices rather than providing platforms for the usual go-to's for voices of the arts and culture scene of Portland in the last decade or so. There are genuine discussions and invitations in our city to break the norms of how arts and culture gets collected and rather invest in real artistic exchanges and experiences. They are genuine invitations to communally strategize rather than hierarchically instruct how wealth, resources and other sustainable tools can be distributed amongst the artistic community. There's much work to be done and there are many voices that need to be heard and be at the table if you will. I end my time with three voices from those who responded to my questionnaire on affordable art spaces in Portland whose statistical findings will be published by mid-November. Portland has been fortunate in its

October 10-11, 2018

ability to draw young talent for a few decades but without affordable housing and studio space there are very few reasons for young professional artists to live here. I'm a professor at pnca and many of my students used to hang out for years around Portland running galleries in warehouses, basements and garages around the core of the city. In recent years many of the most talented and driven students leave immediately after graduation to cities with more to offer them as cultural workers. Where they can get paid and gain access to robust professional networks. Another artist says there aren't many affordable spaces for black arts, especially things with a hip-hop edge to them. Despite this community being on the cutting edge of so much of what makes the city special and I end with the last quote. "If your goal is to keep artists in Portland I feel that talks about affordable art space have to include talks about affordable housing, living wages, and affordability and utilities of other necessities. Nondiverse arts dependent businesses and nonprofits also need to examine the ways in which they exclude people from historically marginalized groups and commit to inclusion". Thank you.

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Maya vivas:** Hi my name is Maya vivas. I'm a sculptor, performance artist, activist, a board member for the contemporary art council at the art museum and co-owner of Ori gallery an art space in northeast Portland dedicated to uplifting the voices of queer and trans artists of color, its an honor to speak with you all today. It's no secret that artists and small art organizations struggle to sustain themselves, through increased displacement, rising cost of housing and affordable studio spaces I'm witnessing the squelching of creative communities. Artists are the creatives of culture, to push them out is to do our city a disservice. What gives me hope is the continual creation of diy spaces that fight to make space for creatives. We support each other by listening and doing the work. Doing the work means being on the ground. Engaging directly with artists gives you a way to understand our needs and leaves no room for assumption of what do they need. Doing this work is ongoing and transformative and I would like to use the rest of my time to highlight some more quotes taken by suba's questionnaire. Their quotes directly from artists. "We need more affordable studios, galleries and performance spaces throughout inner Portland neighborhoods where all the artists have been pushed out. Not all artists' needs are the same, it's important to have a variety of voices talking about affordability. Artists have also spearheaded gentrification processes and it's important to avoid that". I personally feel strongly about not being instrumentalized as an artist in the kind of urban development causing displacement in the city. I hope that the city can continue to work with organizations like racc to continue to support artists here in Portland. Thanks.

**Wheeler:** Thank you. Appreciate you being here.

**Vivas:** Thank you.

**Victor Maldonado:** Thank you all so much for having me here, thank you for inviting me. Thank you commissioners for making time to hear from us. I know how many voices you have to listen too so I take this opportunity to really use my time as much as possible. I wasn't born here. I was not from Oregon, but this is where I'm from. I'm originally from Mexico and I emigrated as a very early child and was part of a Mexican migrant family that went from Mexico to California. I didn't know there was a difference between Mexico and the united states until later in life when I realized that very long commute wasn't normal. So for me I see a bond in americas for our people. About 18 years ago I came here and didn't know that Portland was going to be my home. I was lucky enough to be connected with the old guard of the Portland art world so I received mentorship and help to get where I am. 18 years later I have been teaching at pnc since 2007, so 11 years. In 2010 I became the college's first inclusion specialist when I realized our white dominant art school and our white dominant culture in art needed somebody to really dismantle that and face it head on and confront the issues that keep people of color, transgender, queer people, people of

October 10-11, 2018

color from art. What I learned is over the last seven years is you can't do that work alone. So I'm so proud to be sitting here with Maya and suba to do this work. You're not alone work. Racc is not alone. We're here together and like Maya said doing the work means being on the ground with us all the time, not just when there's a photo-op or when it benefits the displacement of people as gentrification. As artists we're aware of the role we play in the displacement of people and we need your help to really contend with those forces. We can't do it alone. I served both as public art advisor committee, I have served on the murals committee for racc, I've served on various election committees for trimet. I got to say we keep using the same systems and structures to invite people to do this work, and we keep being surprised that new people don't come in the door. So I really need your help to think about how do we navigate these systems and structures that preclude a lot of us and then how do we begin to undo the insidious history of racism and white supremacy in our city by centering on our stories. I think this is where public art has a vital role to play. So, instead of history we must strive to center on our stories. There's not one way to do that. but it does begin it showing up and interacting with us. The way that I have seen you in our community I see you at events. You don't know it's me because I'm wearing a Mexican wrestling mask, but I can see you. Over the last 18 years I have come to see Portland be a place that welcomes artists, makes a place for them. It's difficult to move beyond being emerging artist. There's only so many portfolio building and resume building opportunities that young artists can take. I got to say as a mid career artist this constant reinvention is exhausting. Portland's let me build success in the face of all that uncertainty. Enough to where in my late 30s I became a citizen here. Now the place I use to go to renew my green card is where I go to help our community liberate themselves from ignorance and fixed mindsets. I would say over the last 18 years I have learned if we truly want to get to a more diverse, inclusive and equitable Portland we must tend to social justice. We have erased so many voices from the past that we can't get there. I look at the work we're doing here in city hall, the work that we're doing at the art schools, at college, at the schools k through 12 is being vital for our citizenry to understand how to do that work of telling our stories. No longer do we need representatives to speak for us and no longer do we need to center on the art that we make. I'm looking at your help, Chloe, to really do this paradigm shift where we have gotten use to thinking about art as a object that we collect and we take care of the stewards but in the last 100 years we have shifted away from that and I think really we keep asking for affordable housing, affordable food, affordable transportation, is that for us to make things that look like art and culture we need to thrive first. Really, I want to ask you to not make us suffer for help first. Don't put us through bureaucracy to prove we need resources. So many of us are not interested in making anything that looks like something you can quantify and sell so we realize that you're taking a big risk on the innovation that we have to offer you but we invite you to this joyful and urgent labor of facing uncertainty because the state of the arts is that urgent is the new normal. We live in an age of broken communication, breaks Manship and environment degradation. We're no longer waiting for people to save us. As leaders in our community, as transformative leaders we expect the people in this room to model the behavior they want to see in our community. I want to invite you with the minute I have left to join us, to our openings, to our talks, to the lectures that we hold. Don't make an appointment, just show up we're open all the time and we would like human to human connection with you to invite you into this deeper heavier work that we're doing. We need your help and we thank each of you for the time and commitment you have put into this work. We invite you to share not just that burden with the community but realize a lot of us are not waiting for white saviors any more and we're ready to have a lot of uncomfortable and direct conversations about power. I think that's what racc was intended to do, like arts

October 10-11, 2018

commission was meant to do, for us to really look at the world that's in front of us and have more difficult dialogs about the work at hand. Thank you for your time. [applause]

**Wheeler:** Thank you.

**Eudaly:** Colleagues, any questions or comments you would like to share?

**Wheeler:** I just have one comment because that was a really provocative statement and I appreciate it. In many respects I think it was a courageous statement as well. This has been on my mind. So I'm glad that you surfaced it here today. There's no -- I started my day I'll give you the mindset that I'm coming from at the moment, with dr. Rahul Gandhi, who is here visiting city hall. He's the grandson of mahatma Gandhi and he's come back to Portland and he's going to be I believe at Madison high school, he's going to be at first Vancouver Baptist church, and he's going to be talking to a couple of other groups. His visit is really about the question of how do we -- how do we reengage as people? How do we put -- not put our differences aside but how do we engage thoughtfully and intentionally those differences in a way that's respectful and brings us together as a community. We're different but we're part of a community and how do we really celebrate that reality? As I was listening to some of the conversations about accessibility to the arts and the northwest deaf arts festival that took place in June, red door was mentioned and I know a number of us have gone to I'll call it the sequel to hands up. It's not truly a sequel but it fits nicely with hands up, which was last year. This year it's called cop out and it was a very, very provocative performance that I had the opportunity to see this weekend and there was a community dialogue afterwards, and I realized that art can actually bring that conversation in a way that politics can't. Right now people are just -- they are wearing a red or blue shirt and you're either with me or against me and it's become silly to the point of becoming dangerous. So we have to look for other ways to communicate and come together and express as you said really eloquently our stories, not just the history, but the stories. Who are we as a community, where do we share, where do we differ, what are our different traditions, histories, backgrounds, lived experiences and why are we who we are? In many respects I think we're in the right place at the right time to have this conversation. I just want to applaud the comments that you all made on that. In that regard and thank you. That really is what was on my mind. Thank you.

**Fish:** I think we probably all have some comments, so why don't I make a motion to adopt the report and in accepting the report we can all take a turn. I move the report.

**Saltzman:** Second.

**Wheeler:** Commissioner Fish moves adoption of the report, commissioner Saltzman seconds the report and Karla, as a courtesy I would like commissioner Eudaly to please cast the last vote.

**Moore-Love:** Okay.

**Fritz:** Ten years ago the racc presentation was not like this. It was not nearly as inclusive in any way, shape or form. So kudos to you who have worked so hard to make that. I have been focused on the racial equity plan and all of the grants that have gone to not to the usual suspects although I like to call the usual suspects the long time community stalwarts who we still need to support. It's not the case of either/or, it's both and all of us together. I'm glad that you're not waiting for white savior leadership because that has not worked so well for the last 150 years or so, but I was thinking during your comments I didn't choose to become a citizen until I had been in Portland five years. Not for seven years before that I had no wish to become an american citizen when I got here. This is home. So thank you to all of you who have created this home where art is not necessarily something that's bought and sold or given or a thing to hold on to or put on the wall. It's a state of mind and a culture that we have here. I appreciate that. I don't really understand it, especially neither my daughter nor my husband are living in my house, I have less of the artist side even though they are both scientists as well. But it's important work and thank you very much.

October 10-11, 2018

Thank you for your comments on including accessibility as well as racial equity. The two I believe must go hand in hand, and I'm looking at how can we invigorate the office of equity and human rights to be a better partner to communities, I'm glad they helped and partnered with you in your racial equity plan. There's so much more for all of us to do. It takes all of us to do it, another reason I'm glad you're not waiting for any particular leadership. We can't do it by ourselves. It takes all of us. So that's why we fund the arts, and that's why we put millions of taxpayer dollars into racc and let's be clear that is going to continue to happen and it happened throughout the recession when it was really, really hard to prioritize that and we did. We'll continue doing that. I do believe that we need to make the arts tax in particular less regressive and more progressive. I think there's many things we could do with that. That's a case of I don't think we should go back to voters to ask permission for something which we don't have to ask permission for. We could just do it. So that's something that I kind of challenge you to look at. There's so much more to do. It does take funding because starving artists should not be starving. I think I say that every year it's a profession and vocation like many other worthy causes. Thank you for all of your work. Keep it up. Aye.

**Fish:** Well, commissioner Fritz just said that this report is fundamentally different than one we would have had ten years ago. Commissioner Eudaly has been on the job for a month and I would say it's the best report we ever had. I want to congratulate everyone who had a hand in this, but I want to begin by thanking mike Golub for his tenure on the board, his leadership. It was a pleasure to work with him. Linda, you've picked up the baton and moved forward and it's been a pleasure working with you and we look forward to building on that relationship. Congratulations on the search that you oversaw. You know, I'm confident based on the candidates that we had a chance to meet that we're in good hands. However you make that call, so congratulations. To Jeff Hawthorne, you've done a magnificent job keeping the organization moving and sometimes interim leaders are just caretakers. You have not been a caretaker. You have moved the organization forward and for that we owe you a debt of gratitude. Thank you for your work. I have to say that when I asked a number of months ago if it was possible if this remarkable judge woman could join us and perform I didn't know it was possible, but I think we were all blown away by this nine-year-old. When I saw her at Portland playhouse stand in front of the audience and she sang a number of songs but she sang this song it deeply moved me. She's a remarkable young person. I think it's worth noting according to your report that Portland playhouse this past year received \$26,000 in general operating support. So when people ask where is the art tax go, where does the public investment go, \$26,000 is a good start to one of our many distinguished neighborhood based arts organizations. I want to thank both of our creative laureates for being here. We have had two creative laureates in our history. We started with Julie keefe. Julie, would you stand and take a bow because we owe you a debt of gratitude. [applause] Julie was our first and now suba is our second and suba you have brought a unique perspective and energy and dynamism to this job and we look forward to the continued partnership, thank you for your work. [applause] I want to thank two people on my team Jamie Dunphy and Asena lawrence, who are working on the arts. They are passionate about a lot of things including arts affordability. We have a lot of work to do but that report was a solid product. Work that was developed with the community, and it actually gives us a set of recommendations to implement on an annual basis. I'm cautiously optimistic we'll make progress on affordable art spaces and there are some things in the pipeline that I think are pretty exciting. I want to thank the racc leadership for in the report embracing a number of things including the recommendations of the audit. I thought the audit over all was a very healthy exercise. It was the first audit ever of racc and whether you agree, whether one agrees or disagrees with all the recommendations I think it's a healthy exercise to have an outside independent body come

October 10-11, 2018

in and say here are some things to think about. I think there's a unique opportunity for your new leader to work with the community on a new strategic plan. I think we heard from all the voices today that the community is dying to step up and help shape that new vision for how we approach the arts the next 25 years and what a perfect platform for the new leader to come in and lead that of the. We're very excited about that. Finally, I think what you're going to hear today is broad support on this council. Support on this side of the dais means we continue to fund you at robust levels, that we don't get satisfied with existing funding that is new resources become available we invest in what racc is doing. We can talk about the fact Portland provides disproportionate share of resources and we can strategize about how to bring Clackamas county and Washington more robustly into the mix, but the truth is no matter what you call racc, Portland is still going to be the leader in providing funding and we're going to be the leader in providing support for your mission. We should take pride in that. I'm confident as long as Chloe continues in this role and with the support she has for me and other on the council we'll continue to be a council that proudly prioritizes arts and culture. Watch us closely because those are decisions that have to be made at budget time and also when you make asks but what I'm hearing today is very encouraging and I think this report has gone a long way to making the case for why you've earned not only our support at the current levels of funding, but over time we should be continuing to invest in your good work. Thank you to all of the people who joined us today. I'm very proud today as my -- I won't call it my last official act because we have already passed the baton over but I'm very proud to support and accept this report. Aye.

**Saltzman:** I too want to thank Jeff Hawthorne and Mike Golub for their outstanding leadership. Jeff, you have always been available to bring me up to speed on arts issues, which usually occurs around election time when I'm being interviewed by the arts pack, so thank you for that and Mike, you're a great guy. I'm a big supporter of the arts, but I do want to say, you know, this will be my last arts report and my admonition to you and to my colleagues is don't play too coy with your arts tax because you're going to push voters over the brink. We're already I'm sure shortly after I leave there will be an effort to increase the administrative expense limit for the arts tax that voters didn't mean 5% when they adopted a measure that said a 5% administrative cap. It's going to be increased because we don't have to go back to voters. Commissioner Fritz, you alluded to another major change from the voter intent. The voters said \$35 per resident, they said nothing about despite the merits of a progressive tax they said nothing about that. So you're coming across to a lot of people as being afraid of the public that, wow, we barely won that. You won it quite handily and I supported it but you're acting like you barely won it. We don't dare trust the public with another vote on this because frankly we're scared. People are fed up, anyone who listens to talk shows, talk news, radio shows, knows that people are more fed up -- the thing that angers them the most is the notion that government is deciding what's best for them. Whether it's in your womb or your tax book, your checkbook. So I would urge you to really stop playing these games because it may backfire. It may not backfire on arts tax but may on the next city affordable housing bond measure or the next iteration of the children's levy where voters feel so frustrated that what they say in writing doesn't seem to be reflected in what happens in fact and they take it out on us. So that's my admonition to you is don't be afraid of voters. They have been quite generous to all of us over the years. I think they know what's best. So again, thank you to all of you for your great work. Aye.

**Wheeler:** I want to thank everybody who was part of today's presentation. I found it provocative, I found it interesting and believe it or not I even found it fun. So thank you for that. I'll be very brief. There's many ways that we can help support the arts and one obvious way to continue to support racc, to continue to provide the strategic guidance we provide as the city partner, and I know commissioner Eudaly will continue the fantastic work that commissioner Fish has been engaged in for a number of years and I'm looking

October 10-11, 2018

forward to learning who the new director is and I'm sure that individual will continue to do a fantastic job on behalf of racc, but let's keep pushing forward together on the bigger issues that a number of people who testified also raised the question of inclusion, not just for the artists but the public as well. Are there people that we are either structurally or historically or unintentionally excluding from participating in what arts and culture has to offer in our community. The second area I'll just make it second and third and combine the two things because they are closely related which is affordable housing and affordable art space. While we didn't really talk about our housing strategy or the work we're doing around affordable and work force housing, that obviously is critical to this. We saw that lesson from our friends down in san francisco that as the cost of housing swamped their supply at a much faster rate than what's happened even in Portland we saw their arts and culture and even their hospitality, their restaurant culture, their culinary culture, all those things came under significant stress as a result of the housing crisis they experienced there. That's one of the reasons we're approaching it so broadly and with such a sense of urgency. I think there's other ways we can work together beyond sort of the traditional confines of the regional arts and culture council. Without further ado I just want to say aye. I support the report and I thank you for doing that. Commissioner Eudaly, thank you for orchestrate what I thought was really a terrific and enjoyable event today.

**Eudaly:** Well, I am somewhat regretting my request to go last right about now because my colleagues have said so much of what I intended to say, but I do think it's important for everyone to hear from them from me and not just second all of what they have said. I want to thank the panelists this panelist, thank our interim director Jeff Hawthorne, our outgoing chair mike golub, our incoming chair Linda McGeady. I would acknowledge Linda's work with Andrew holt and their leadership on co-chairing the search committee for the new executive director. I can't wait to find out who was selected. I want to say that even in this interim period which can often bring instability and inaction racc has been doing excellent work under the direction of Jeff Hawthorne and he and the entire staff and board deserve credit for that. So can we give them a round of applause? [applause] my final thanks to do commissioner Fish for his advocacy and leadership as previous arts commissioner and I look forward to continuing your excellent work and to our continued partnership in celebrating and supporting the arts in Portland. I would say that the baton has officially been passed now. From dead moon night to george thorn day to the nat turner project book release to the Chrigilchin tube and throat singers, I bet you're sorry you missed that, it was one of the most incredible things I have ever seen in this building, my office has produced numerous events to highlight and celebrate our diverse arts community and welcome the public into city hall. My newly named arts liaison Pollyanne faith Birge, who is here with us today -- [cheers and applause] already has a few fans in this room I see and my executive assistant robyn mullins are both long standing contributors to the Portland arts community, and they have been instrumental in producing these events. I want to thank them for their dedication and enthusiasm. They are a dream team and I'm so grateful they are both here with me to make the most of this new opportunity. It's an honor to be entrusted with our city's arts portfolio, the arts have always been an essential part of my life and I'm genuinely excited to take on this role. In these particularly turbulent times the roles of art and artists is critical. Art is not just an outlet for creative self-expression but an opportunity to learn and deepen understanding and connections as well as a vehicle for social change, but we know that not all artists have the same opportunities and advantages. This report shows that racc's commitment to equity has expanded whose voices get heard and I appreciate their thoughtful and equity focused distribution of resources. I also as a side note want to say I do agree with the focus on racial equity because if we're achieving racial equity we are achieving other types of equity by default, but I also want to note that disability inclusion will not be captured through racial equity as

October 10-11, 2018

we heard in the presentation today, and as I personally know people with disabilities, artists with disabilities, arts connoisseurs with disabilities have unique needs and challenges that are not being well met and aren't currently entirely understood. So I just want to encourage that focus as well. I know that oehr and civic life are ready to aid and abet that process. Also thankful to the auditor's office. I'm a bit of an auditor fan girl for the racc audit. I try to embrace every audit of bureaus in my portfolio, some more painful than others. I'm in general agreement with the conclusions. I'm pleased with the progress that the city and racc has made towards addressing many of the issues that were flagged and I look forward to continuing this vital work, but I do want to raise one issue as a point of clarity that came up today and I think its important to highlight. Racc spends 11% of its budget on what would be considered overhead or internal expenses, not 33% as suggested in the report, but 33% included service delivery which shouldn't have been included. This is an important distinction and its evidence that racc is in fact spending public dollars wisely even without clear directives from council also noted in the audit. So I'm looking forward to working with racc, with the community and with my colleagues on better defining goals and priorities moving forward. I also want to acknowledge the public for their support of the arts education and access fund, a/k/a the arts tax, as well as their frustration. We hear you. The city needs to do a better job explaining the purpose of the tax, sharing the outcomes and making it as easy as possible to pay. I also agree that ideally it would not be regressive tax and strongly feel that we should not be burdening households already struggling to keep a roof over their heads with an additional tax. So all of these efforts are under way and I look forward to many vigorous debates about it. I'm particularly delighted by the potential of our new partnership with space finder, which will awe racc to create a much needed map and inventory of creative spaces, a critical component of our arts affordability strategy. This is a conversation I have been involved in for at least a decade and it is an issue that's personally impacted my life as any person who spent more than two decades working in the arts and culture field. Similarly to focusing on racial equity I think if we focus on arts affordability and we achieve this shared vision of an environment in which arts and culture flourish and prosper that everyone will flourish and prosper. So I'm going to stick this on my bulletin board. It's an exciting time to take over this portfolio. I'm thrilled to work with racc and our soon to be announced new executive director as well as arts access education fund, Portland five centers for the arts and our creative laureate suba Ganesan to propel Portland's arts policy into the future and protect, develop and grow our arts and culture landscape. Thank you again, everyone. I vote aye.

**Wheeler:** The report is adopted and we're adjourned. [cheers and applause]

**At 3:37 p.m. Council adjourned.**