



City of Portland, Oregon
Bureau of Development Services
Land Use Services
FROM CONCEPT TO CONSTRUCTION

Chloe Eudaly, Commissioner
Rebecca Esau, Director
Phone: (503) 823-7300
Fax: (503) 823-5630
TTY: (503) 823-6868
www.portlandoregon.gov/bds

MEMORANDUM

Date: March 28, 2018
To: Portland Historic Landmarks Commission
From: Hillary Adam, Land Use Services
Hillary.adam@portlandoregon.gov / 503-823-3581
Re: EA 18-124279 DA – Rothko Pavilion
Design Advice Request Memo April 9, 2018

Attached is a drawing set for the Design Advice Request of a new 3-story primarily glazed structure linking the north and south wings of the Portland Art Museum; both existing buildings are Landmarks, with the south wing listed on the National Register of Historic Places. Public access through the new structure will be allowed most hours of all days to ensure connectivity through the site between SW Park and SW 10th Avenues. Additional work includes a new loading dock and gallery addition at the south end of the complex, accessed from SW Jefferson Street. An Adjustment to allow loading access from SW Jefferson Street would be required, as may an Adjustment to reduce the number of required loading spaces. Other identified Modifications include the following: to allow vehicle area between a building and a street, to (potentially) reduce landscaping along a loading area, to increase the allowed amount of vehicle area along SW Jefferson, to reduce ground floor windows and ground floor active use requirements along SW Jefferson, to (potentially) reduce the required amount of window area above the ground floor, and to reduce the required amount of ecoroof. The primary exterior material is glass.

The review criteria are 33.846.060.G Other approval criteria and the Central City Fundamental Design Guidelines (copies of the guidelines are included with this memo). For Adjustments and Modifications to be requested, the approval criteria are 33.805.040 [Adjustment] Approval criteria and 33.846.070 Modifications Considered During Historic Resource Review, respectively.

Areas for discussion on April 9, 2018:

- **Design Expression.** The proposal shows a glassy modern expression between the two landmarked brick buildings. While large glassy volumes are not always preferred to connect two classically-designed historic masonry structures, staff believes that this may be the right design solution in this instance because this area, a vacated street, has long been an open air through-way used by pedestrians and a glass volume would better maintain this feeling of openness. Staff welcomes Commission comments on the design details and the relationship between the new volume and the two landmarks. Please note that, per the future Central City 2035 code requirements, the new glass pavilion may be required to meet the new Bird-safe window standards and 60% of the roof will be required to be ecoroof.
- **Loading.** The existing loading space is located immediately west of the original 1932 Belluschi building, accessed from SW Park. Because this area is proposed to be redesigned with a new entry sequence and the major addition, the loading access is proposed to be relocated to SW Jefferson Street. This proposal will require a number of deviations from the Code, including:
 - An **Adjustment** to allow loading access from a street designated as a City Bikeway;
 - An **Adjustment** to reduce the number of loading spaces;
 - A **Modification** to allow vehicle area between a building and a street;
 - A **Modification** to increase the amount of allowed vehicle area along a frontage in a Pedestrian District to more than 50%; and

- A potential **Modification** to reduce the amount of required landscaping between a loading space and a street lot line.

PBOT staff has concerns about the relative safety of the proposed loading location and is requesting a detailed loading access study from the applicant to include analysis of all potential alternatives and locations. BDS staff also has concerns about the negative impacts of the proposed loading area on the public realm along SW Jefferson Street as well as to the existing landscape design within this area. Staff encourages the Commission to consider the full two-block campus and determine if the proposed location meets the approval criteria for Adjustments and Modifications or if an alternative location, would be preferable.

- **Public Access.** The 1968 Ordinance which vacated the portion of SW Madison between the two museum buildings also created an open-air pedestrian sculpture mall that granted public access through the site. A later ordinance in 1984 amended the first ordinance to allow that this area be closed to the public between 11pm and 7am. In December 2017, in anticipation of this proposal, the ordinance was again amended to allow this area to be infilled with a new building but also required that: *“the Pavilion will continue to provide ground level public access and connectivity between SW Park and SW 10th Avenues between the weekday hours of 5:30am to 12:00am, Saturday hours of 7:00am to 12:00am and Sunday hours of 7:00am and 11:00pm year-round. Access will not be blocked in any manner and will be adequately illuminated for use in hours of darkness.”*

In addition, the ordinance requires a public access easement that includes “clear wayfinding with no visual obstruction”. Therefore, Staff suggests that the through connection be designed to communicate the required public accessibility through a combination of pathway paving leading pedestrians up, into, and through the site as well as an open-air design that allows the pavilion to be completely open during the hours noted above in order to meet the requirements for access to not be blocked in any manner and with no visual obstruction. Staff also suggests that the planters along SW 10th Avenue be removed so that the west-facing courtyard is more open to the sidewalk. In order to allow free movement through the pavilion, relocation of the ticketing counter may also be appropriate so as to not block pedestrian movement particularly when special exhibitions are on display and lines may be longer.

- **Major Remodel.** Per Title 33, the definition of a Major Remodel is a project where the cost of remodeling is greater than the assessed value of the existing improvements on the site. For this project the projected project cost is \$43million and the assessed value of the existing improvements on the site (both buildings) is \$532,910. Therefore, the proposal qualifies as a Major Remodel which means that the Ground Floor Windows and Ground Floor Active Use standards must be met across the site or receive approval for a Modification.

For Ground Floor Windows, all ground level street-facing façades that are closer than 20’ to a street lot line must have windows that cover at least 40% of the ground wall area (between 2’ to 10’ above the finished grade). The portions of the buildings subject to this standard include the south façade of the 1932 Belluschi wing as well as the new loading bay, the east projecting entrances of both buildings, the full north façade of the Mark building, and the full west façades of both buildings. Artwork may be used as an alternative to ground floor windows if it is found to meet the purpose of the standard.

For Ground Floor Active Use, 50% of the façade fronting onto the SW Jefferson Street sidewalk must include active uses that are at least 12’ high, at least 25’ deep, must meet ADA, and must include windows and doors. This standard must be met for the portion of the south façade that includes the 1932 Belluschi building and the new loading bay; However, because a loading bay does not qualify as an active use, and because no doors facing SW Jefferson are proposed, this standard will not be met with the proposed design.

Please contact me with any questions or concerns.

Chapter 33.846, Historic Reviews

Purpose of Historic Resource Review

Historic Resource Review ensures the conservation and enhancement of the special characteristics of historic resources.

Historic Resource Review Approval Criteria

Requests for Historic Resource Review will be approved if the review body finds the applicant has shown that all of the approval criteria have been met.

Findings: The site is a designated Historic Landmark. Therefore the proposal requires Historic Resource Review approval. The relevant approval criteria are listed in 33.846.060 G. 1.-10. In addition, because the site is located within the Central City, the relevant approval criteria are the Central City Fundamental Design Guidelines.

G. Other Approval Criteria:

- 1. Historic character.** The historic character of the property will be retained and preserved. Removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that contribute to the property's historic significance will be avoided.
- 2. Record of its time.** The historic resource will remain a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historic development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings will be avoided.
- 3. Historic changes.** Most properties change over time. Those changes that have acquired historic significance will be preserved.
- 4. Historic features.** Generally, deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where practical, in materials. Replacement of missing features must be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 5. Historic materials.** Historic materials will be protected. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
- 6. Archaeological resources.** Significant archaeological resources affected by a proposal will be protected and preserved to the extent practical. When such resources are disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
- 7. Differentiate new from old.** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials that characterize a property. New work will be differentiated from the old.
- 8. Architectural compatibility.** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will be compatible with the resource's massing, size, scale, and architectural features. When retrofitting buildings or sites to improve accessibility for persons with disabilities, design solutions will not compromise the architectural integrity of the historic resource.
- 9. Preserve the form and integrity of historic resources.** New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic resource and its environment would be unimpaired.
- 10. Hierarchy of compatibility.** Exterior alterations and additions will be designed to be compatible primarily with the original resource, secondarily with adjacent properties, and finally, if located within a Historic or Conservation District, with the rest of the district. Where practical, compatibility will be pursued on all three levels.

Central City Fundamental Design Guidelines

These guidelines provide the constitutional framework for all design review areas in the Central City.

The Central City Fundamental Design Guidelines and the River District Design Guidelines focus on four general categories. **(A) Portland Personality**, addresses design issues and elements that reinforce and enhance Portland's character. **(B) Pedestrian Emphasis**, addresses design issues and elements that contribute to a successful pedestrian environment. **(C) Project Design**, addresses specific building characteristics and their relationships to the public environment. **(D) Special Areas**, provides design guidelines for the four special areas of the Central City.

Central City Plan Design Goals

This set of goals are those developed to guide development throughout the Central City. They apply within the River District as well as to the other seven Central City policy areas. The nine goals for design review within the Central City are as follows:

1. Encourage urban design excellence in the Central City;
 2. Integrate urban design and preservation of our heritage into the development process;
 3. Enhance the character of the Central City's districts;
 4. Promote the development of diversity and areas of special character within the Central City;
 5. Establish an urban design relationship between the Central City's districts and the Central City as a whole;
 6. Provide for a pleasant, rich and diverse pedestrian experience for pedestrians;
 7. Provide for the humanization of the Central City through promotion of the arts;
 8. Assist in creating a 24-hour Central City which is safe, humane and prosperous;
 9. Ensure that new development is at a human scale and that it relates to the scale and desired character of its setting and the Central City as a whole.
-
- A1. Integrate the River.** Orient architectural and landscape elements including, but not limited to, lobbies, entries, balconies, terraces, and outdoor areas to the Willamette River and greenway. Develop accessways for pedestrians that provide connections to the Willamette River and greenway.
 - A2. Emphasize Portland Themes.** When provided, integrate Portland-related themes with the development's overall design concept.
 - A3. Respect the Portland Block Structures.** Maintain and extend the traditional 200-foot block pattern to preserve the Central City's ratio of open space to built space. Where superblock exist, locate public and/or private rights-of-way in a manner that reflects the 200-foot block pattern, and include landscaping and seating to enhance the pedestrian environment.
 - A4. Use Unifying Elements.** Integrate unifying elements and/or develop new features that help unify and connect individual buildings and different areas.
 - A5. Enhance, Embellish, and Identify Areas.** Enhance an area by reflecting the local character within the right-of-way. Embellish an area by integrating elements in new development that build on the area's character. Identify an area's special features or qualities by integrating them into new development.
 - A6. Reuse/Rehabilitate/Restore Buildings.** Where practical, reuse, rehabilitate, and restore buildings and/or building elements.
 - A7. Establish and Maintain a Sense of Urban Enclosure.** Define public rights-of-way by creating and maintaining a sense of urban enclosure.
 - A8. Contribute to a Vibrant Streetscape.** Integrate building setbacks with adjacent sidewalks to increase the space for potential public use. Develop visual and physical connections into buildings' active interior spaces from adjacent sidewalks. Use architectural elements such as atriums, grand entries and large ground-level windows to reveal important interior spaces and activities.

- A9. Strengthen Gateways.** Develop and/or strengthen gateway locations.
- B1. Reinforce and Enhance the Pedestrian System.** Maintain a convenient access route for pedestrian travel where a public right-of-way exists or has existed. Develop and define the different zones of a sidewalk: building frontage zone, street furniture zone, movement zone, and the curb. Develop pedestrian access routes to supplement the public right-of-way system through superblocks or other large blocks.
- B2. Protect the Pedestrian.** Protect the pedestrian environment from vehicular movement. Develop integrated identification, sign, and sidewalk-oriented night-lighting systems that offer safety, interest, and diversity to the pedestrian. Incorporate building equipment, mechanical exhaust routing systems, and/or service areas in a manner that does not detract from the pedestrian environment.
- B3. Bridge Pedestrian Obstacles.** Bridge across barriers and obstacles to pedestrian movement by connecting the pedestrian system with innovative, well-marked crossings and consistent sidewalk designs.
- B4. Provide Stopping and Viewing Places.** Provide safe, comfortable places where people can stop, view, socialize and rest. Ensure that these places do not conflict with other sidewalk uses.
- B5. Make Plazas, Parks and Open Space Successful.** Orient building elements such as main entries, lobbies, windows, and balconies to face public parks, plazas, and open spaces. Where provided, integrate water features and/or public art to enhance the public open space. Develop locally oriented pocket parks that incorporate amenities for nearby patrons.
- B6. Develop Weather Protection.** Develop integrated weather protection systems at the sidewalk-level of buildings to mitigate the effects of rain, wind, glare, shadow, reflection, and sunlight on the pedestrian environment.
- B7. Integrate Barrier-Free Design.** Integrate access systems for all people with the building's overall design concept.
- C1. Enhance View Opportunities.** Orient windows, entrances, balconies and other building elements to surrounding points of interest and activity. Size and place new buildings to protect existing views and view corridors. Develop building façades that create visual connections to adjacent public spaces.
- C2. Promote Quality and Permanence in Development.** Use design principles and building materials that promote quality and permanence.
- C3. Respect Architectural Integrity.** Respect the original character of an existing building when modifying its exterior. Develop vertical and horizontal additions that are compatible with the existing building, to enhance the overall proposal's architectural integrity.
- C4. Complement the Context of Existing Buildings.** Complement the context of existing buildings by using and adding to the local design vocabulary.
- C5. Design for Coherency.** Integrate the different building and design elements including, but not limited to, construction materials, roofs, entrances, as well as window, door, sign, and lighting systems, to achieve a coherent composition.
- C6. Develop Transitions between Buildings and Public Spaces.** Develop transitions between private development and public open space. Use site design features such as movement zones, landscape element, gathering places, and seating opportunities to develop transition areas where private development directly abuts a dedicated public open space.

- C7. Design Corners that Build Active Intersections.** Use design elements including, but not limited to, varying building heights, changes in façade plane, large windows, awnings, canopies, marquees, signs and pedestrian entrances to highlight building corners. Locate flexible sidewalk-level retail opportunities at building corners. Locate stairs, elevators, and other upper floor building access points toward the middle of the block.
- C8. Differentiate the Sidewalk-Level of Buildings.** Differentiate the sidewalk-level of the building from the middle and top by using elements including, but not limited to, different exterior materials, awnings, signs, and large windows.
- C9. Develop Flexible Sidewalk-Level Spaces.** Develop flexible spaces at the sidewalk-level of buildings to accommodate a variety of active uses.
- C10. Integrate Encroachments.** Size and place encroachments in the public right-of-way to visually and physically enhance the pedestrian environment. Locate permitted skybridges toward the middle of the block, and where they will be physically unobtrusive. Design skybridges to be visually level and transparent.
- C11. Integrate Roofs and Use Rooftops.** Integrate roof function, shape, surface materials, and colors with the building's overall design concept. Size and place rooftop mechanical equipment, penthouses, other components, and related screening elements to enhance views of the Central City's skyline, as well as views from other buildings or vantage points. Develop rooftop terraces, gardens, and associated landscaped areas to be effective stormwater management tools.
- C12. Integrate Exterior Lighting.** Integrate exterior lighting and its staging or structural components with the building's overall design concept. Use exterior lighting to highlight the building's architecture, being sensitive to its impacts on the skyline at night.
- C13. Integrate Signs.** Integrate signs and their associated structural components with the building's overall design concept. Size, place, design, and light signs to not dominate the skyline. Signs should have only a minimal presence in the Portland skyline.
- D1. Park Blocks.** Orient building entrances, lobbies, balconies, terraces, windows, and active use areas to the Park Blocks. In the South Park Blocks, strengthen the area's emphasis on history, education, and the arts by integrating special building elements, such as water features or public art. In the Midtown Park Blocks, strengthen the connection between the North and South Park Blocks by using a related system of right-of-way elements, materials, and patterns. In the North Park Blocks, strengthen the area's role as a binding element between New China/Japantown and the Pearl District.
- D2. South Waterfront Area.** Develop a pedestrian circulation system that includes good connections to adjacent parts of the city and facilitates movement within and through the area. Size and place development to create a diverse mixture of active areas. Graduate building heights from the western boundary down to the waterfront. Strengthen connections to North Macadam by utilizing a related system of right-of-way elements, materials, and patterns.
- D3. Broadway Unique Sign District.** Provide opportunities for the development of large, vertically oriented, bright, and flamboyant signs that add to the unique character of this Broadway environment. Size and place signs and their structural support systems so that significant architectural or historical features of the building are not concealed or disfigured. Ensure that all signs receive proper maintenance.
- D4. New China/Japantown Unique Sign District.** Provide opportunities for the development of suitably ornate signs, using motifs, symbols, bright colors, and celebrative forms that add to the atmosphere and character of New China/Japantown. Size and place signs and their structural support systems so that significant architectural or historical features of the building are not concealed or disfigured. Ensure that all signs receive proper maintenance.

33.846.070 Modifications Considered During Historic Resource Review

The review body may consider modification of site-related development standards, including the sign standards of Chapters 32.32 and 32.34 of the Sign Code, as part of the historic resource review process. These modifications are done as part of historic resource review and are not required to go through the adjustment process. Adjustments to use-related development standards (such as floor area ratios, intensity of use, size of the use, number of units, or concentration of uses) are required to go through the adjustment process. Modifications that are denied through historic resource review may be requested as an adjustment through the adjustment process. The review body will approve requested modifications if it finds that the applicant has shown that the following approval criteria are met:

- A. **Better meets historic resource review approval criteria.** The resulting development will better meet the approval criteria for historic resource review than would a design that meets the standard being modified; and
 - B. **Purpose of the standard.**
 - 1. The resulting development will meet the purpose of the standard being modified; or
 - 2. The preservation of the character of the historic resource is more important than meeting the purpose of the standard for which a modification has been requested.
-

33.805.040 [Adjustment] Approval Criteria

The approval criteria for signs are stated in Title 32. All other adjustment requests will be approved if the review body finds that the applicant has shown that either approval criteria A. through F. or approval criteria G. through I., below, have been met. Adjustments to the ground floor window requirements of this Title must also meet the additional requirements stated in the ground floor window sections in the base zones.

- A. Granting the adjustment will equally or better meet the purpose of the regulation to be modified; and
- B. If in a residential zone, the proposal will not significantly detract from the livability or appearance of the residential area, or if in an OS, C, E, or I zone, the proposal will be consistent with the classifications of the adjacent streets and the desired character of the area; and
- C. If more than one adjustment is being requested, the cumulative effect of the adjustments results in a project which is still consistent with the overall purpose of the zone; and
- D. City-designated scenic resources and historic resources are preserved; and
- E. Any impacts resulting from the adjustment are mitigated to the extent practical; and
- F. If in an environmental zone, the proposal has as few significant detrimental environmental impacts on the resource and resource values as is practicable; or
- G. Application of the regulation in question would preclude all reasonable economic use of the site; and
- H. Granting the adjustment is the minimum necessary to allow the use of the site; and
- I. Any impacts resulting from the adjustment are mitigated to the extent practical.



OTHER APPROVAL CRITERIA		PROJECT NAME: Rothko Pavilion		EA 18-124279 DA	
DATE		PROJECT ARCHITECT: Tim Eddy		PROJECT VALUE \$43 million	
CHAPTER 33.846.060.G - OTHER APPROVAL CRITERIA	STAFF		COMMISSION		
	+ / -	Comments	+ / -	Comments	
1. Historic Character		Generally met			
2. Record of it time		Generally met			
3. Historic Changes		Generally met			
4. Historic Features		Generally met			
5. Historic Materials		Generally met			
6. Archaeological Resources		Generally met			
7. Differentiate new from old		Met			
8. Architecural Compatibility		Debatable			
9. Preserve the form and integrity of historic resources.		Generally met, except along Jefferson			
10. Hierarchy of compatibility		Debatable			



CENTRAL CITY FDG (2003)

PROJECT NAME: *Rothko Pavilion*

EA 18-124279 DA

DATE April 9, 2018

PROJECT ARCHITECT: *Tim Eddy*

PROJECT VALUE \$43 mil

COMPATIBILITY	STAFF		COMMISSION	
	+ / -	Comments	+ / -	Comments
A1: Integrate the River		N/A		
A2: Emphasize Portland Themes		N/A		
A3: Respect the Portland Block Structures		Met IF the pavilion is open air with no barriers during specific hours		
A5: Enhance, Embellish & Identify Areas		TBD		
A6: Re-use, Rehabilitate, Restore Buildings		Met		
A9: Strengthen Gateways		N/A		
C1: Enhance View Opportunities		Met IF the pavilion is open air with no barriers during specific hours		
C4: Complement the Context of Existing Buildings		Debatable		
D1: Park Blocks		Met		
D2: South Waterfront Area		N/A		
D3. Broadway Unique Sign District		N/A		
D4. New China/Japantown Unique Sign District		N/A		
QUALITY & PERMANENCE	STAFF		COMMISSION	
	+ / -	Comments	+ / -	Comments
C2: Promote Permanence & Quality in Design		May be met; though concerns along SW Jefferson		
C3: Respect Architectural Integrity		May be met; though concerns along SW Jefferson		
C5: Design for Coherency		May be met; though concerns along SW Jefferson		

PUBLIC REALM	STAFF		COMMISSION	
	+ / -	Comments	+ / -	Comments
A4: Use Unifying Elements		Met, If paving leads one through the building		
A7: Establish and Maintain a Sense of Urban Enclosure		N/A		
A8: Contribute to a Vibrant Streetscape		Met, If Pavilion feels more open		
B1: Reinforce and Enhance the Pedestrian System		Met IF the pavilion is open air with no barriers during specific hours		
B2: Protect the Pedestrian		Not met along SW Jefferson at loading area		
B3: Bridge Pedestrian Obstacles		Met, If paving leads one through the building		
B4: Provide Stopping and Viewing Places		TBD		
B5: Make Plazas, Parks & Open Space Successful		West plaza needs to be more open to sidewalk		
B6: Develop Weather Protection		TBD		
B7: Integrate Barrier-Free Design		Met IF the pavilion is open air with no barriers during specific hours		
C6: Develop Transitions Between Buildings & Public Spaces		Met IF the pavilion is open air with no barriers during specific hours		
C7: Design Corners that Build Active Intersections		Not met along SW Jefferson at loading area		
C8: Differentiate the Sidewalk Level of Buildings		May not be appropriate with this design		
C9: Develop Flexible Sidewalk Level Spaces		Met IF the pavilion is open air with no barriers during specific hours		
C10: Integrate Encroachments		N/A		
C11: Integrate Roofs and Use Rooftops		Not met; must meet ecoroof standard		
C12: Integrate Exterior Lighting		TBD		
C13: Integrate Signs		TBD		